

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

2016年1月20日

上午10時01分恢復聆訊

出席人士：石永泰資深大律師、許偉強大律師及鄭欣琪大律師，為外聘律師，代表食水含鉛超標調查委員會

楊明悌大律師及李健宏大律師，由趙、司徒、鄭律師事務所延聘，代表何標記建築工程有限公司

Mr. Ian Pennicott 資深大律師及林定韻大律師，由孖士打律師行延聘，代表中國建築工程（香港）有限公司

林國輝大律師，由孖士打律師行延聘，代表瑞安承建有限公司

王鳴峰資深大律師、陳樂信大律師及羅頌明大律師，由律政司延聘，代表水務署署長

殷志明大律師，由羅夏信律師事務所延聘，代表香港房屋委員會

許佐賓大律師，由的近律師行延聘，代表保華建築營造有限公司

杜慧燃大律師，由顧增海律師行延聘，代表有利建築有限公司、明合有限公司及伍克明

主席：梁先生，你記得你上個禮拜嚟嘅時候曾經宣過誓嘅，記唔記得？

梁偉健：係。

主席：記得呵？咁你嗰個繼續有效，你記得喇吓，咁唔使再宣誓。

梁偉健：Okay。

何標記建築工程有限公司（“何標記”）（中國建築（啟晴邨）及瑞安（葵聯邨第二期）的分判商）的第五證人：梁偉健（何標記項目經理（葵聯邨

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

第二期的地盤主管)) (重召) 宣誓繼續作供  
石先生盤問

問：梁先生，我仲有一、兩個跟進嘅問題問一問你，我就問完㗎嘞。

答：係。

問：我想你諗番就係，我哋上個禮拜講到就有啲內地嘅預製組件，有啲係內地造嘅。

答：係。

問：你記得係--啟晴邨就係即係唯一一條邨，就係嗰啲有關嘅喉係係內地造嘅，你知道嘅，係咪呀？

答：係，係。

問：係。啲焊料我嘅理解，就係佢哋會即係中央地就由啟晴嗰個地盤接收，然後先至出車運上內地，係咪呀？

答：呢個我唔清楚，因為嗰陣時我都仲未落去。

問：哦，okay。

答：係。

問：即係你對焊料接收咗之後，如何係運上內地呢一個工序，你係唔清楚嘅，...

答：呢個我唔知。

問：...即係邊個統籌，邊個決定擺邊啲上去，呢個你係唔清楚？

答：呢個唔清楚。

問：唔清楚，okay。

答：係呀。

問：你等一等。如果係咁嘅話，我未必有問題會問你。好，唔該晒，梁先生，咁我有問題問你，唔該。但係其他嘅代表律師可能有問題會問你。

答：係，係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

林先生盤問

問：梁生，我有啲問題係想同你跟進嘅。首先，你就係呢個葵聯--我係代表瑞安嘅。

答：係。

問：你係葵聯嘅，可唔可以講係 Project Manager?

答：可以。

問：即係黃貴雄就會係我哋叫做打埋人，就係 Site Supervisor，可唔可以咁講？

答：係。

問：即係換句話講，你係葵聯嘅 Project Manager，即係譬如瑞安有啲咩嘢會直接同你接洽嘅，係咪？可唔可以咁講？

答：局部喇，其實都係。

問：即係--或者咁樣講，當然响 site 裏面，有啲咩嘢直接嘅需要黃貴雄知道嘅，當然响 site 同佢講，係咪？

答：係。

問：但係如果再高少少層次，有咩嘢要通知你嘅，去通知，因為你係代表何標記嘍嘛，係咪？

答：係，係。

問：咁就會通知你，係咪--可唔可以咁講？

答：可以。

問：換句話講，你係對瑞安嘅一個直接嘅接洽人，可唔可以咁講？

主席：其...

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：如果佢有搵我嗰剎那就係囉。

問：冇錯。我就想問你，你就已經係講過關於 H1, 122 嗰個 e-mail，或者你再睇一睇。你已經畀咗口供，就話你呢個係資訊性嘅，你就自己就有點樣處理，可唔可以咁樣總結呢？你嘅意思係咪咁？

答：係。

問：即係換句話講，我係咪可以講話，你自己係冇同黃貴雄先生講關於呢一個咁樣嘅資訊？

答：冇。

問：你亦都有同公司嘅採購部，無論係趙小姐又好、黃小姐又好，關於呢一個咁樣嘅資訊或者資料，係咪咁--可唔可以咁講？

答：冇同佢哋講過。

問：係。我想問呢一個文件，你哋有冇將佢擺咗落去葵聯邨，我知道你有個 site office 㗎嘛，係咪？

答：係。

問：你會唔會將呢個資訊亦都擺咗响 office 裏面，等啲人需要睇嘅時候可以睇得到呢？有冇咁做到？

答：冇嘅，...

問：亦都有咁做到？

答：...連地盤電腦都冇嘅。

問：唔。即係換句話講，你自己有收咗個資訊之後，就有再做任何跟進嘅，係咪？

答：係，冇錯。

問：唔。但係你會同意我嘅講法，咁瑞安嘅文先生畀咗你，係希望你哋自己响呢個何標記裏面有自己有跟進嘅行動㗎嘛，可唔可以咁講？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係。

問：係。我想--反而想請問你一樣嘢，我見到嗰個 e-mail 呢係寫住  
"hbkleung@yahoo.com.hk"，係咪？

答：係。

問：你哋何標記嗰個係另外一個 navigator，"hbconstruct"咁樣㗎  
嘛，係唔係--呢個係特別你自己嘅一個 e-mail，係咪？

答：係，冇錯。

問：即係換句話講，一係你要主動去畀文生話「你聯絡我就係用呢個咁嘅  
e-mail，因為你可以直接聯絡到我關於任何事情。」就唔係一個好  
general 嘅何標記嘅 e-mail 㗎㗎嘛，啱唔啱？可唔可以咁講？

答：可以咁講。

問：唔。如果你自己從來冇任--做任何跟進嘅行動，至少關於呢一個  
sample 嘅 approval，係响你哋何標記，除咗畀你之外，係冇其他  
人知道個啲，如果係咁嘅情況之下，可唔可以咁講？

答：唔可以咁講，可能...

主席：Kevin Kwong 囉。

林先生：吓？

主席：Kevin Kwong 咪知囉。

林先生：Sorry，係。

問：除咗 Kevin Kwong 佢擺去 sample 嗰個人，即係你以下其他嘅，例  
如根據你講黃貴雄、採購部嘅同事係冇人知道，除咗 Kevin Kwong，  
係咪？可唔可以咁講？

答：係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：唔。你可唔可以話到畀我聽，點解响 6 月 3 號知道咗呢一個嘅 sample approval 之後，6 月 4 號你哋公司有同事去落咗二十網嘅無鉛錫線呢？如果你睇睇 S1, 102, 點解會咁巧合，3 號你知道有 approval, 突然之間有同事--當然，我哋知道一係你可以落，一係黃貴雄可以落，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔係你做嘅，就係黃貴雄做㗎喇，係咪？

答：係。

問：你又可唔可以解釋咁巧合，點解你收到呢一個咁嘅文件之後，6 月 4 號就已經有人會响你哋公司落 order 係二十網嘅“FRY”呢？二十卷--二十網嘅無鉛錫線呢？

答：呢個真係唔知，我有落單。

問：唔知。又係巧合？

答：唔知係咪巧合，但係我唔知。

問：唔知係咪巧合，但係--咁唯一--因為如果黃貴雄--因為你公司好奇--好簡單咋嘛，係得黃貴雄可以落，同理你可以落，係咪？落 order。

答：係。

問：我哋聽到 Prosperity 周生就話「你唔講錫線，唔講錫條，我唔理你嘅，你--因為你擺隻平嘅，我唔會畀隻貴嘅你；你要隻貴嘅，我唔會畀隻平你㗎嘛。」即係佢就咁講，我唔知你琴日喺唔喺度。

答：係。

問：好簡單，即係一定係有人講--同 Prosperity 講「我要二十網或者二十卷錫線，我又要 165 磅錫條。」先至會有人响 6 月 4 號有咁嘅 order 啫，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：係囉。首先，係咪你自己做？你又記唔記得 6 月 4 號收咗呢個 e-mail 之後？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：我唔記得，印象中就應該冇落過，我。

問：印象中唔係你落？

答：係。

問：你一定有同你啲同事講過，例如黃貴雄要落料嘅，佢知道原來可以用呢隻料，佢先至可以落，因為如果周生講嘅係啱，你一定有講係錫線，佢先至會落二十綑㗎嘛，你又同唔同意個講法？

答：可以咁講。

問：即係換句話講，唔知點解黃貴雄突然間知道，原來呢隻料係“FRY” approve 㗎，就係所以落咗呢隻料嘅，又可唔可以咁講？

答：唔夠膽肯定。

問：唔夠膽肯定。咁我...

答：因為始終唔係我落，我都唔知。

問：係，咁我會問佢㗎。但係你而家嘅講法，就係「站在我個立場，就咩嘢都有做嘅，總之我唔知佢點解會知道。」係咪咁講？

答：係。

問：咁其實好奇怪㗎，阿健哥。

主席：呢個 submission 講，嘎。

林先生：Sorry，好。

問：我想問一問你，石資深大律師都問過，你其實當年就係跟黃貴雄，我唔好講出身喇，即係跟過佢做--學嘢嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：收靚你就去到做咗--即係高級過佢，係咪？

B

B

C

答：可以咁講。

C

D

問：我想反而問，當時你跟緊黃貴雄嘅時候，係响呢個--係响邊個 site 話？當時識唔識陳小華？

D

E

答：唔識。

E

F

問：跟黃貴雄嘅時候，黃貴雄自己，你就知唔知道佢識唔識陳小華？

F

G

答：呢個唔清楚。

G

H

問：唔清楚？

H

I

答：佢哋真係唔清楚。

I

J

問：唔。你就話你當時就已經係好多--即係講緊啟晴嘅時候，陳小華做打埋人嘅時候，你就已經高級咗，係咪？即係你就已經管其他嘅唔同嘅地盤，係咪？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：換句話講，你都有見到陳小華佢嘅工作嘅情況，係咪？關於啟晴，啱唔啱？

L

M

答：會落去了解。

M

N

問：冇錯。你會落去了解進度，佢會話你聽「我嘅進度係點樣樣」。會唔會講下物料夠唔夠，點樣嘅情況，會唔會有咁嘅商談？

N

O

答：其實最多叫佢跟好啲料，同理其餘嘅就係講番地盤現有嘅進度情況啲啲啲咋啲。

O

P

Q

問：唔。你又知唔知道佢有冇--即係响啟晴而家講緊，响啟晴度有冇做到佢應該做嘅嘢？

Q

R

R

S

主席：呢個太闊，呢個問題。

S

T

林先生：太闊？

T

U

主席：嘎。

U

V

V



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：即係佢响啟晴嗰度，係咪即係落手落腳做嘢，抑或係好似佢畀個委員會嘅口供，「我其實咩嘢都唔理嘅，除咗我要跟下有冇人投訴嗰啲進度。」即係佢基本上個意思係咁，「我咩嘢都唔--即係一至六棟，我都其實基本上唔係好理嘢嘅。」佢嘅响呢一個委員會度咁樣講。你同唔同意佢咁樣講法？佢係咪應該要做得更加--跟貼得好多㗎？

主席：呢個都係太過--呢啲咁 vague，咁模糊不清嘅問題呢，得出嚟嘅答案就係一個模糊不清嘅答案。

林先生：係。

問：或者咁樣，佢會唔會...

林先生：唔該，主席。

問：佢會唔會同黃貴雄講「其實你」...

主席：黃貴雄？

林先生：係，响啟晴一、二吖嘛。

問：會唔會同黃貴雄講「你--其實你要點樣做，用啲咩嘢嘅料...」

主席：不如你問下佢，就你所見，陳小華有冇去首先巡樓㗎？

答：因為兩樣嘢，我落地盤講緊多數我上嘅係上建築嘅寫字樓，或者會叫埋啲打理落嚟開會，一齊喺建築寫字樓嗰面開會。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：係。

答：因為我唔係成日喺地盤，甚至乎一日我可能落去半個鐘，甚至乎一個鐘，所以你問有關問題，我真係唔清楚。除非我成日喺地盤裏面望住個佢哋或者我行嚟行去嘅，全日嘅，咁我可能會知道啲。

問：即係換句話講，你嘅認知--至少你如果落去半個鐘頭，你嘅認知其實就好低？

答：半個鐘至一個鐘左右，因為多數落去，係呀，係...

問：而大部分時間...

答：...除咗有問題建築 call 我落去解決的話。

問：明白，好。而大部分時間你都係响嗰個寫字樓嘅，即係你會見--即係見瑞安或者其他嘅人士嘅？

主席：如果佢落去地盤，就會喺嗰個寫字樓，其餘時間佢就會巡其他嘅地盤。

林先生：係。

答：係，冇錯。

問：係。就會見中國建築或者其他嘅人，就唔係睇你自己嘅工人？

答：係。

林先生：主席，我有其他問題。

主席：唔該。仲有冇人有問題？冇問題。

梁先生就畀完證供，可以離開，唔該晒，嘍，走得嚟嘞。

答：好，唔該。

主席：下一位證人，唔該。

楊先生：主席，下一個證人係黃貴雄先生。

主席：好呀。

何標記建築工程有限公司（“何標記”）（中國建築（啟晴邨）及瑞安（葵聯邨第二期）的分判商）的第六證人：黃貴雄（何標記地盤主管／監工（葵聯邨第二期的地盤主管及啟晴邨第一座和第二座的監工））以本地話宣誓作供

楊先生主問

問：係。黃先生，我哋知道你响 2015 年嘅 12 月 3 號就做咗一份十三頁嘅證人口供。

答：係。

問：係。因為裏面係英文，但係雖然我知道內容已經係解釋過畀你聽，但係就要--我响現在嚟講係會讀出嚟嘅，係用英文讀出嚟，請麻煩你戴住個耳機。

**WITNESS STATEMENT OF WONG Kwai Hung (黃貴雄)**

I, WONG Kwai Hung (黃貴雄) ...works supervisor, of Unit 605, Tins Enterprises Centre, 777 Lai Chi Kok Road, Cheung Sha Wan, Kowloon, Hong Kong make this witness statement for the purpose of providing answers to those questions raised by Messrs. Lo & Lo (solicitors for the Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead in Drinking Water) in their letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> November 2015 to Messrs. Chiu, Szeto & Cheng (solicitors for Ho Biu Kee Construction Engineering Company Limited)

and will say as follows:

### 1. Question

Describe their background, qualifications and experience in the plumbing industry.

### Answer

I am one of the officers-in-charge/works supervisors employed by Ho Biu Kee Construction Engineering Company Limited ("**Ho Biu Kee**" or "**the Company**"). My duty is to look after the plumbing works installation of building projects undertaken by Ho Biu Kee. I am not a licenced plumber but I am very experienced in plumbing work with over 20 years experience. In addition, I am also a skilled worker holding a full trade test certificate in plumbing works issued by the Construction Industry Training Authority in 2000. I have worked for Ho Biu Kee since 2003.

### 2. Question

Confirm whether they were responsible for procuring soldering materials for the jointing the fresh water pipes in the 2 estates.

### Answer

(a) At the material times, I was not the person-in-charge of Kai Ching Estate. Mr. Chan Siu Wah ("**Mr. Chan**") was responsible for Kai Ching Estate and monitored the progress of works on site. I was just a block supervisor responsible for the plumbing and drainage works in Blocks 1 and 2. Mr. Chan

prepared and submitted materials request forms to the purchasing department of Ho Biu Kee.

(b) In respect of Kwai Luen Estate, I was the person-in-charge. One of my duties as person-in-charge was to monitor the progress of the plumbing works and to prepare and send material requests forms to the purchasing department of Ho Biu Kee so that materials could arrive at site in sufficient advance for the execution of the works. I would estimate what pipe materials (including pipes and their associated fittings) and the sundry materials (小五金) (soldering material is one of them) would be required according to the works requirements shown on drawings and the programme of work. I then prepared material request forms and submitted to the purchasing department of Ho Biu Kee for the procurement of materials. They would comply with my request.

(c) Thus, I was not responsible for procuring soldering materials for the jointing of the fresh water pipes in the Kwai Luen Estate although the request for these soldering materials was initiated by me.

### 3. Question

Confirm whether they were aware that soldering materials for the purpose of jointing fresh water pipes must be lead-free.

### Answer

At the material times, I was NOT aware that the solder strips which I requested might contain lead. Indeed, I was also NOT aware that soldering material for the purpose of jointing fresh water

pipes must be lead-free.

#### 4. Question

Explain and describe the means by which orders for soldering materials were placed with Prosperity and the steps and procedures by which the soldering materials were supplied by Prosperity and delivered after an order was placed. Please confirm whether they have informed Prosperity that the soldering materials ordered were to be used for the jointing ng of fresh water pipes.

#### Answer

(a) As said above, being the officer-in-charge/supervisor of the Kwai Luen site, I monitored the site progress and decided what and when materials (including sundry materials such as solders) would be required. I then prepared and sent material request forms to the purchasing department of Ho Biu Kee. The purchasing department staff of Ho Biu Kee would then place orders with suppliers who would arrange the goods to be delivered directly to the site. Upon delivery, I, as the officer-in-charge of the Kwai Luen site would check and return to the purchasing department of Ho Biu Kee confirming receipt of materials.

(b) I did not specify which firm/company should be the supplier. I only stated what materials would be required (the particulars of materials and their quantities) in the material request form. It is the purchasing department staff of Ho Biu Kee who decided which supplier(s) purchase order should be placed with. I understand that in respect of

pipes , valves and fittings, the requirements of them were provided in the contract specifications and/or drawings. Ho Biu Kee would propose brand and make of these materials to the main contractor who would in turn submit them to the Housing Department ("HD") for their approval. Thereafter, Ho Biu Kee would place supply contracts with these material suppliers who would deliver the goods to the site when they received the relevant orders from Ho Biu Kee. In respect of sundry materials, the purchasing department would leave them to our choice. In the case of Kwai Luen Estate, I considered that solder wires (錫線) and solder strips (錫條) should be required for the project. I then made request for those materials. The purchasing department of Ho Biu Kee then sourced those soldering materials and arranged for them to be delivered to the site for our use. Again I did not know which supplier the purchasing department would place order with. Hence I did not have conversation with Prosperity on soldering materials.

**5. Question**

Confirm and describe the procedures and steps taken by them to inform and report to Ho Biu Kee after orders were placed with Prosperity for soldering materials. Explain whether they have caused purchase orders, invoices and delivery notes to be passed to Ho Biu Kee for record.

**Answer**

Please see answer for Question 4. In essence, when

materials were delivered, I would sign and return the signed delivery note to Ho Biu Kee for record .

#### 6. Question

Confirm whether you were aware that the solder strips acquired from Prosperity and used in the 2 Estates contained lead.

#### Answer

I was NOT aware that the solder strips acquired from Prosperity and used in the Kai Ching Estate and Kwai Luen Estate might contain lead.

#### 7. Question

Explain why, notwithstanding that Ho Biu Kee has caused the two Main Contractors, China State and Shui On, to submit to the HA Form DCMPF716 (i.e. sample submission approval form) for "FRY" 99C lead-free solder wire together with supporting information to confirm the lead-free composition of such solder material , sub- standard solder strips which contained lead were actually acquired and used to joint the fresh water plumbing pipes in the 2 Estates.

#### Answer

(a) I was not involved in the materials submission and did not know whether Ho Biu Kee had submitted "FRY" 99C lead-free solder wires to the Housing Department for approval.

(b) As explained in later paragraphs, at the material times, I did not know that the solder



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

strips supplied by Prosperity might contain lead or that these solder strips were "sub-standard".

(c) It is fair to say that as far as I can remember in my previous work with Ho Biu Kee, they had never used solder strips (錫線) in the public housing projects. Kai Ching Estate and Kwai Luen Estate were the only two projects where solder strips had ever been used.

(d) I was not involved in the engagement of Prosperity for supply of soldering materials. I now find out from Mr. Ho Man Biu that Mr. Kevin Kwong noted from the tender document for Kwai Luen Estate plumbing works that solder materials specified should be lead-free. At that time, I knew nothing about this.

(e) Moreover, at that time, there had been a general lack of awareness within the plumbing industry of the risk of lead in Plumbing Material and in particular soldering materials and its implications on drinking water quality. Soldering materials for pipe connections had always been considered as only a minor and insignificant part of plumbing installations. Thus, it would not be surprising that the supervisor/office-in-charge including myself and workers did not pay particular attention in specifying that the solder should be lead free.

(f) At that time, there was no requirement or request by the HD and/or WSD to test the content of lead in the solder material.

(g) Mr. Chan Siu Wah was in charge of the Kai Ching Estate. He decided to use soft solder materials in the form of solder strips.

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

(h) My understanding at that time was that soldering material in the form of solder strip was used as a method for jointing small diameter pipes (i.e. those less than 50mm diameter). Nobody in Ho Biu Kee including myself held the view that using solder strips was a cheaper means or sub-standard method.

(i) Indeed, in terms of material wastage, I noted that the material wastage of solder in the form of strips was much higher than solder in form of wire. This is probably because of

(i) solder strip would melt at a much lower temperature and easily be liquidized, thereby flowing out from the joints; and

(ii) in the course of welding using solder strips, workers would hold the strip in one end whilst let solder in another end to melt and fill up the joint. In order to avoid the heat transmitted from the melting, workers would abandon the strip when the length was reduced to 75 -100mm to avoid injury by heating.

(j) Mr. Chan Siu Wah set out his requirement for the solder strips in Kai Ching Estate project to the purchasing officer of Ho Biu Kee who then placed orders with Prosperity for their supply of these solder strips. At that time, nobody of Ho Biu Kee knew that these solder strips might contain lead. Nobody knew that these materials might cause problem to the quality of potable water. Mr. Chan Siu Wah had since left the employment of Ho Biu Kee.

(k) As I was the person-in-charge and one of the supervisors of Kai Ching Estate, I adopted the same practice using solder strips for small

diameter copper pipes connection in Kwai Luen Estate. I therefore made similar request for these solder strips to the purchasing department of Ho Biu Kee.

(l) In the construction industry, there was a general perception that the certificate on water supply connection (Form WWO 1005) issued by the WSD should serve as an assurance of the quality of the plumbing system and the drinking water having regard to the water sample test results. I held this view at the material times.

(m) In Kwai Luen Estate project, Form WWO 1005 was issued by the WSD after satisfying with the water sample results.

(n) Prior to the issue of new Circular Letter WSD 1/2015 dated 13th July 2015, the 4 heavy metals - lead, cadmium, chromium and nickel were not required to be tested and included in Form WWO 1005.

(o) Hence it might be fairly said that the construction industry was in general not aware of the lead problem in the drinking water in the past.

## 8. Question

In paragraph (f) of the answer to Question 6 [K1/31], it was stated that the use of the solder strips was known to Shui On as well as the supervisory staff of the HD [HA]. Please confirm whether the use of these solder strips was approved and/or accepted by Shui On and the HA and identify the persons in Shui On and the relevant supervisory staff of HA who were aware that solder strips were used to joint

fresh water pipes.

**Answer**

(a) During the course of the plumbing works, Shui On gave continuous supervision by engaging a management team consisting of a competent and authorized agent who was stationed on site and managed the project work including the plumbing and drainage works undertaken by Ho Biu Kee. The Site Agent of Shui On was assisted by engineers, general foremen as well as supervisors to look after the execution of works by various sub-contractors including Ho Biu Kee.

(b) The AP / contract manager of the HD and his representatives (including Clerk of Works) also gave periodic supervision as necessary to ensure that the works met specified requirements.

(c) Solder strips were delivered in loose strips (each approximately 550mm) rather than on reels (solder wires). These solder strips were delivered as set out in material delivery notes in conjunction with solder wires. In the course of jointing pipes with solder wire, workers would take the whole reel with him and would not cut them into pieces. This would avoid the transmission of heat to workers' hands caused by the high temperature welding of solder wire. On the other hand, when solder strips were used, workers would just hold the strips in their hands in the course of welding as the melting temperature was relatively lower. Hence, it is our belief that the use of the solder strips, instead of solder wire on reels could easily be identified on site and distinguished by Shui

On as well as the supervisory staff of the HD [HA] during their routine inspection.

(d) Further, we had to inform the main contractors as well as the HD staff of all materials delivered to site for incorporation into works. If they requested copy of delivery orders of the soldering materials issued by Prosperity, I would give to them. In fact, for Kai Ching Estate, Ho Biu Kee did provide the delivery notes of Prosperity showing the delivery of “50 力扁錫條” to China State. However, to the best of my recollection, Shui On I HD staff did not request for such in Kwai Luen Estate. In any case, I verily believe that the foremen of Shui On should have been well aware of our use of solder strips in the Kwai Luen Estate. However, I could not remember the name of the Shui On foremen.

(e) Notwithstanding the matters aforesaid, to the best of my knowledge, there had been in general, a lack of awareness in the construction industry, as well as the HA, being the developer for public housing, of the risk of lead in solder and its implications for the drinking water quality and in tum, the associated health risks.

(f) For the HA, as far as drinking water in public rental housing estate, HA might not have focused on the presence of lead (or other heavy metals) in the fresh water supply system or in the water, and failed to target soldering materials as a high risk item. Hence in accepting newly completed fresh water installation, the HA required the 8 tests specified in Water Supplies Department Circular 2/2012 and these tests did not include heavy metals.

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

(g) By the same token, Shui On who was responsible for continuous supervision and accountable to the HA as the contractual party with the HA, might well be aware of HA's specification of using lead-free solder for copper pipe connection but might have also failed to pay due attention to the soldering material used.

(h) Moreover there had been no contractual requirement in the HA's building contracts in regard of the procurement procedure of soldering materials. Being one of the cost-insignificant sundry material items in building contracts, I understand that soldering materials were not included in the monthly interim payment applications submitted by Shui On to HD.

### 9. Question

Describe the differences (in components and functions) between solder wire (錫線) and solder strip (錫條). Explain the choice of using solder strips which contained lead instead of lead-free solder wire for the purpose of jointing fresh water pipes.

### Answer

I myself do not have knowledge on the difference in components between solder wire and solder strip. For use, please see Answers to Questions 7 and 8 above.

### 10. Question (a)

Explain the choice of using the soldering material

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

by the brand name of “50 力扁錫條” and confirm whether such solder strips were used as a result of recommendation by Prosperity.

**Answer**

Please see answer in Q4(b).

**Question (b)**

Describe the composition of such material and confirm whether it contains lead.

**Answer**

As I was just a site man responsible for the actual installation of plumbing works in building projects and did not have knowledge nor responsible for the material submission, I do not have knowledge of the composition of soldering material.

**Question (c)**

To the best of their knowledge and recollection, please confirm whether “50 力扁錫條” (as opposed to lead-free solder wires) have been used in the construction and installation of the fresh water plumbing system in other public housing developments in which they were involved and if so, please confirm when they first began using such soldering materials and identify the public housing developments concerned.

**Answer**

I do not know whether “50 力扁錫條” contains lead or not. Nevertheless, to the best of my knowledge and recollection, “50 力扁錫條” had only been used by Ho Biu Kee in the jointing of small sized pipes in the Kai Ching Estate and Kwai Luen Estate only.

B

B

C

To the best of my knowledge and recollection, "50  
力扁錫條" had not been used by Ho Biu Kee in other  
public housing developments.

C

D

D

E

Dated this 3<sup>rd</sup> day of December 2015.

E

F

Signed by Wong Kwai Hung (黃貴雄)

F

G

問：係，黃生。係，黃生。

G

H

答：係。

H

I

問：可以除咗個耳筒。好，我哋見到呢份證人口供就係你簽咗名嘅，係咪？

I

J

答：係。

J

K

問：你就睇過佢嘅內容，咁你正話都聽到，你確唔確認呢個證人供詞嘅內  
容係真實？

K

L

答：真實。

L

M

問：係。你打唔打算採納呢個證人供詞裏面嘅內容作為你嘅主證供嘅一部  
分呢？係，你要講出嚟。

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：願意，係。好，我只係有幾條問題想問一問你。

O

P

答：好。

P

Q

問：好。黃生，你幾時係參與過啟晴邨嘅項目？

Q

R

答：2012年4月。

R

S

問：我哋知道呢，你講過就話你响啟晴邨嘅項目，你係負責第一同第二座  
嘅管工，係咪？

S

T

答：係。

T

U

問：當第一同第二座係需要物料嗰陣嚟講，係邊個負責係要求買啲咩嘢物  
料㗎？

U

V

V



B

B

C

答：初期係陳小華即係幫一、二座落嘅。

C

D

問：係。

D

E

答：而家跟住到到中段之後，陳小華淨係顧住三、四座，所以何文標先生授權我同寫字樓採購物料。

E

F

問：係。即係變咗就係响後期嗰段時間，就係何文標先生授權你直接就向呢個寫字樓落個物料採購單，係咪？

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：唔。好嘞，咁想問一問，第一同第二座嘅話嚟講，我哋知道係用個銅喉嘅，係咪？

H

I

答：係。

I

J

問：呢啲銅喉嚟講，亦都要有啲焊料去接佢哋，係咪？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：你記唔記得嚟講，就係用乜嘢焊料呢？

L

M

答：用錫條、錫線，同埋銀焊枝。

M

N

問：唔。好，咁你記唔記得嚟講，就係响邊度地方係用呢個銀焊？邊度地方係用個錫線？邊度地方係用錫條？

N

O

答：15 至 42 就用錫條；50 同埋 67 嘅喉就用錫線；70 至 100 就用銀焊。

O

P

問：唔。

P

Q

Q

R

主席：再講多次，唔該。再講。

R

S

答：15 至 42 嘅銅喉就用錫條；50 同埋 67 就用錫線；70 同埋 100 就用銀焊枝。

S

T

T

U

問：我哋睇到唔同嘅直徑嗰度係用唔同嘅焊料，究竟嚟講係邊個決定係咁樣用？

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：而家我根據第三同第四座咁樣做法，啟晴邨。

問：即係你嘅意思响第一、二座咁樣做法，你係參照番第三同第四座嘅做法？

答：係。

主席：等一陣。係。

楊先生：係。

問：想問一問，就減壓掣呢，減壓掣係用乜嘢嚟將佢焊接--同啲喉管焊接㗎？

答：用錫線。

問：用錫線？

答：係。

問：照你响啟晴邨嘅經驗嚟講，有冇用過錫條嚟焊呢個減壓掣呢？

答：冇。

主席：減壓掣用錫線呀？錫條？

答：錫線，錫線。

楊先生：用錫線，用錫線。

主席：錫線？

答：嗰啲配件大，因為啲配件。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：唔。

問：好嘞，我而家要問你葵聯邨。

答：係。

問：葵聯邨嚟講，你係地盤打理，係咪？

答：係。

問：就地盤用嘅物料嚟講，係咪由你負責去做呢個採購？

答：係。

問：咁我哋知道嚟講--或者我畀你睇番一份文件就係 S1, 105 嘅。我知道呢張係一張發票，一般嚟講，就發票唔係黃生你去處理嘅。

答：係。

問：但係由於呢張發票我哋冇張送貨單喺度，我只係想問一問番你嘅情況。就呢張發票顯示到，就係响 2013 年嘅 6 月 4 號嘅時間嚟講，大概呢個時間，就雋景就係送咗畀何標記嘅葵盛圍地盤嘅一啲物料嘅，見唔見到？

答：見到。

問：係。咁响呢度嚟講，我哋睇番第二同第三個項目，嗰度就顯示到「英國 FRY 無鉛嘅錫線 (500G)」，見到嘛，有二十綑？

答：見到。

問：係。亦都有「英國嘅 50 力嘅扁錫條」，係 165 磅嘅，見到嘛？

答：見到。

問：首先，我想問一問你，就係要求呢兩種物料嘅嚟講，係邊個要求？

答：我。

問：係你要求嘅？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：嘅。

問：點解你會要求係兩種嘅物料呢？

答：因為我喺啟晴邨做過係咁樣，跟住照辦煮碗又帶埋嚟呢個葵聯邨用。

問：係。咁你嗰--你當時訂啲料就打算係嗰啲錫線响邊度用？

答：錫線燒減壓掣。

問：係。

答：錫條就燒嘅細配件。

問：係。正話你之前有提過，你响啟晴邨嗰陣嚟講，响大--54 同埋...

答：67，67。

問：...仲有六十--嗰啲嚟講呢，係要用錫線嚟燒嘅。咁葵聯呢，葵聯個情況又點樣？

答：葵聯都一樣。

問：都係一樣嘅？

答：係。

問：即係嗰啲錫線係愛嚟咁樣用，係咪？

答：係。

問：我哋知道就係除咗呢張發票之外，即係其實你睇番 102 頁，都係同一個 bundle S 嘅 102 頁。咁呢度係一個雋景做嘅一個總結單，呢個。黃生，睇唔睇到？

答：睇到。

問：係。就我哋見到除咗係呢--响第三行嗰度嚟講，你會見到有個「貨品名稱」，見唔見到？

答：見到。

問：好嘞，咁嗰度嚟講，我哋睇到就係除咗係--我哋唔好講最後嗰個 15

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

年 8 月 1 號嗰個。我哋講就係 13 年 4 月 24 號直至到 14 年嘅 3 月 20 號，就响個購物嗰度嘅貨物名稱，就除咗係 13 年嘅 6 月 4 號係訂過個「“FRY”無鉛錫線」之後，其他嗰啲都係訂過「英國 50 力扁錫條」，見唔見到？

答：係。

問：係。想問下，點解淨係第一次訂咗個無鉛錫線之後，跟住就有再訂呢個無鉛錫線呢？

答：因為我訂呢個無鉛錫線係整嚟燒減壓掣㗎嘛。

問：係。

答：足夠晒㗎嘞已經，錫條。

問：係。但係你正話提過嗰啲 54 同埋 67 嗰啲都要燒？

答：要，係呀，係呀。

問：係喇，係喇。

答：因為葵聯邨有 66 咁嘛。

問：有 66 嘅？

答：有。

問：係，明白。咁所以就你嘅意思，就係二十綑已經足夠燒呢啲...

主席：再講多次，葵聯邨有咩嘢話？

答：有 66.7 嘅嘍。

主席：冇大--冇六十...

答：有 66.7。

主席：因為錫線係 50 到 67，冇 50 至 67 呀？

答：有 54。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：你頭先話 50 至 67 要用錫線吖嘛。

答：因為啟晴邨先至有 66.7。

主席：50 至 67 要用錫線吖嘛，你頭先講話，15 到 42 用錫條吖嘛。

答：係，係。

主席：50 到 67 要用錫線㗎嘛。

答：係喇。

主席：呢個葵聯邨完全...

答：葵聯邨就係得 54...

主席：...唔使--吓？

答：...同埋 76。

主席：54 咪要用錫線囉？

答：係喇。

主席：咁用錫線咪要用多啲囉，除咗減壓掣之外？

答：我二十卷已經足夠㗎嘞，係呀。

主席：二十卷足夠呀？

答：係。

主席：得，繼續。

楊先生：好。

主席：真係夠？真係夠？

答：吓？

B

B

C

主席：二十卷真係夠？

C

D

答：夠，夠。

D

E

主席：你睇下啟晴邨，128頁，雖然佢六座，不過多好多個，二十、二十、四十、八十、一百一十、二百一十，三百一十個佢要。你葵聯邨二十個就夠嘞？

E

F

答：係呀，係呀。

F

G

G

H

主席：繼續。

H

I

楊先生：嘎。

I

J

J

K

問：黃生，我有啲--另外有啲問題想問你嘅，就係陳小華先生，你認識個呵，係咪呀？

K

L

答：咩嘢？

L

M

問：陳小華先生呢個人你認識嘅，係咪呀？

M

N

答：即係話喺啟晴邨認識。

N

O

問：係。好嘞，佢响--之前，响委員會嘅作供裏面，佢有咁講嘅，佢話鄺家富先生就曾經打過電話畀你，話畀你聽呢响個啟晴邨的焊料嚟講應該點樣使用嘅，有冇咁嘅事呀？

O

P

答：冇，冇，冇打過電話畀我。

P

Q

問：冇，係。咁就佢亦都有講過，就响--唔係，對唔住。好嘞，另外，就係响啟晴邨工程之前，即係你正話講過响2012年嘅6月，你就先去啟晴邨做？

Q

R

R

S

答：係。

S

T

問：咁你之前响邊個屋邨做開？

T

U

答：元州，元州邨。

U

V

V

B

B

C

問：元州，唔。元州邨係用乜嘢嘅焊料嚟去將焊接呢啲銅喉？

C

D

答：內含錫配件。

D

E

問：係，即係錫曲，係咪呀？

E

F

答：係。

F

G

問：係。好嘞，陳小華先生都提過，當然佢講緊另外一個項目...

G

H

主席：元州邨第幾期？

H

I

答：第五期，元州。

I

J

K

問：係。佢當然講緊油麗邨，佢就係話除咗呢啲錫曲裏面嘅焊料之外嚟講，仲要補錫嘅。响你自己做過元州邨嗰度嚟講，你處理過錫曲，你有冇需要補錫呢？

K

L

答：冇。

L

M

問：唔。點解唔需要？

M

N

答：因為佢個裏面已經足夠晒，有錫㗎嘞已經。

N

O

問：係。

O

P

答：一燒到出嚟，佢自動會流落地下，足夠晒。

P

Q

問：係，係。好嘞，但係有啲情況如果嗰個曲，即係嗰個焊--即係嗰個連接嗰度，譬如連接位漏水嘅，咁你哋會點樣做，會唔會係用呢個補錫嘅辦法，抑或有其他辦法？

Q

R

答：唔會，將個配件鋸咗佢，燂番出嚟，換過個新嘅。

R

S

問：係，你哋嘅做法咁樣？

S

T

答：係。

T

U

問：所以就你自己嘅個人經驗，就你冇用過個補錫嘅？

U

V

V



B

B

C

答：冇。

C

D

問：好，唔該。唔該，黃生，我有其他問題問你。麻煩你聽咗委員會嘅律師同埋其他嘅大律師，佢哋有嘢想問。

D

E

答：好呀。

E

F

F

G

石先生盤問

G

H

問：黃先生，早晨。就我有啲問題想問一問你。

H

I

答：好呀。

I

J

問：首先就係你 2003 年加入何標記？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：你講講你喺加入何標記之前嘅工作經驗。

L

M

答：係，係工人囉。

M

N

問：水喉工人？

N

O

答：係嘞。

O

P

問：係。教育程度係...

P

Q

答：中三。

Q

R

問：中三。

R

S

答：係。

S

T

問：所以如果有一啲即係文書嘅電郵啲啲，你會唔會處理，其實？

T

U

答：唔會。

U

V

問：唔會嘅。你就讀完中三就出嚟，一路都係從事水喉工人嘅行業？

V

答：唔係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：唔係，總之就係你到某個階段就入行。你幾時入行？

答：2000年嘅。

問：2000年嘅。2000年你考到個牌，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：係。2000至2003年就喺另外一啲水喉公司，或者另外一啲地方，即係唔係何標記嘅地方做工人？

答：係，係。

問：好，長話短說，你有冇做過打理，除咗葵聯之外？

答：有。

問：有。善明邨，將軍澳，記唔記得？

答：記得。

問：記得。你係咪做過打理，喺善明邨？

答：係，係。

問：我哋聽過有一個證人講過，就即係好簡短，你係咪做做下善明邨，應該係離開咗㗎？

答：善明...

問：將軍澳。

答：做完善明邨，跟住做元州。

問：得。總之你喺善明邨有過做打理嘅經驗，對嘛？

答：係。

問：元州第五期亦都係打理，對嘛？

答：係。

問：好。何文標同我哋講過喺啟晴邨嗰六座嗰啲分工嘅情況，咁我想同你

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

確實一下。

答：Okay。

問：打理人就係陳小華？

答：係。

問：係。一、二座叫做即係負責...

答：負責...

問：...即係打理就係成個項目就叫做陳小華，但係一、二、三、四、五、六，咁每兩座、兩座、兩座都會有人去負責，...

答：係，係。

問：...就一、二座負責人就應該係你閣下，係咪？

答：係。

問：係。三、四就係陳小華，對嘛？

答：係。

問：係。五、六就係范秀鵬，對嘛？

答：係，係。

問：好。你每日返工、放工，即係講得俗啲就叫做打躉嘅地方，就係嗰個地盤，你係唔會去寫字樓嘅？

答：唔會去。

問：唔會，好。你同梁偉健先生嘅關係，就係開頭梁偉健先生叫做係跟你學嘢咁嘅叫做係，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：對？

答：係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：跟住佢就即係晉升，佢就而家就叫做唔會話長駐一個地盤？

答：唔會。

問：佢就係管一炸嘅地盤，佢就周圍走，每日要？

答：係。

問：好。我想問一問你，就係你在啟晴邨呢個地盤負責一、二座之前，就我哋聽過你起碼有做過兩次打理經驗，善明同埋元州？

答：係。

問：有冇第二啲邨做過？不如講埋。

答：冇。

問：冇嘞？

答：冇。

問：得呢兩個邨？

答：係。

問：你嗰陣時喺呢兩邊邨做打理，咁其中一個--即係善明同元州都係何標記嘅項目？

答：係。

問：你嗰陣時做呢兩個項目嘅打理，其中一個職責係咪都係要負責向何標記嘅寫字樓填寫嗰啲叫做請購表去落單訂各種唔同嘅原料，包括小五金，對嘛？

答：係，係。

問：包括焊料，對嘛？

答：係。

問：我想問一問你，唔好講啟晴住，因為我知道啟晴你就話陳小華用咗某種嘅方法，咁你就跟佢可能，我哋唔好講嘞。

B

B

C

答：係，啱。

C

D

問：陳小華出現之前，咁善明同埋元州，你嗰陣時如果你係需要--講講先，  
嗰陣時呢兩條邨嘅水喉係咩嘢形式嘅水喉？銅喉？

D

E

答：銅喉。

E

F

問：點樣焊接㗎？

F

G

答：佢全部都係有錫配件㗎嘅。

G

H

問：錫配件，即係錫曲？

H

I

答：係，佢裏面有錫喺度。

I

J

問：Okay。咁即係就唔係話要零零舍舍買啲焊料嘅，...

J

K

答：唔使。

K

L

問：...佢嗰個錫曲裏面包含咗錫，你喺外面燒，佢就自然喺裏面會熔？

L

M

答：燒一燒，佢自然會滲晒出嚟。

M

N

問：係嘞，佢就喺裏面熔，就會滲咗入去，咁就自動駁咗？

N

O

答：係，係。

O

P

問：就唔係要零零舍舍買啲錫焊料？

P

Q

答：唔使。

Q

R

問：唔使嘅？

R

S

答：唔使。

S

T

問：好。但係我又想問一問你，就係所以喺呢兩個地盤元州同埋善明，你  
就填寫嘅請購表就有需要零零舍舍去訂一啲叫做焊料嘅嘢？

T

U

答：冇。

U

V

問：Okay。但係你學師嘅時候，你考牌嘅時候，你都會學--都要用--即  
係其中一個考驗嘅地方，就係要焊喉？

V

B

B

C

答：唔。

C

D

問：因為就唔係淨係攞枱，會考你唔同形式嘅駁喉嘅技術，對嘛？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：咁考過攞枱嘅，係咪呀？

F

G

答：咩嘢？

G

H

問：即係攞枱，即係擰--即係駁喉有唔同方式，有啲就咁擰㗎嘛？

H

I

答：唔係，而家我哋考牌都係有錫配件㗎嘅，都係。

I

J

問：好，都係用錫配件嘅？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：得。

L

M

答：我會--都係有錫嘅。

M

N

問：如果要你用焊嘅方法都係用錫配件嘅？

N

O

答：係。

O

P

問：所以其實你考牌嘅時候，你係冇受過一啲訓練係用一啲叫做焊料嘅嘢  
嚟到去焊接呢個喉管？

P

Q

答：冇，冇。

Q

R

問：冇？

R

S

答：冇。

S

T

問：即係如果而家叫你用焊料去焊喉管，你做唔到嘅？

T

U

答：做到。

U

V

問：你做到，咁你冇學過，即係手板眼見工夫嘅呢啲係？

V

答：唔係，而家呢啲係眼見工夫咋嘛。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：係囉，手板眼見工夫囉，...

答：係嘞。

問：...即係雖然你考牌唔係用焊料考，但係而家畀你叫你落手落腳去做，你都做到嘅？

答：做到。

問：做到。好嘞，咁講番就係到啟晴邨嘞。

答：係。

問：啟晴邨就你嘅證人供詞曾經講過，就係跟番一般嘅程序，就係陳小華作為成個邨嘅項目嘅打理，就由佢去負責填寫嗰啲請購表？

答：係。

問：但係剛才你都講過，後來就係咪由於即係即係一條邨裏面唔同座數嘅分工，所以某個階段開始，你就算唔係整個項目嘅打理，都開始有權就住第一、第二座所需要嘅一啲用料去填寫請購表，對嘛？

答：到到中段咪係囉。

問：中段開始就唔係事事都要陳小華填，就你都可以填，呢個就係啟晴嘅做法。咁同樣係咪都係適用於五、六座，即係范秀鵬都開始可以就係唔使下下請示陳小華，對嘛？對嘛？

答：咩嘢？

問：即係要填寫請購表，到到中後期，范秀鵬喺第五、六座都開始可以自己...

答：唔係，都要問--唔係，都要問過老細先嘅要。

問：唔係，老細即係就何生喇？

答：係，係。

問：即係何生到到中後期就開始授權你可以訂一、二期--一、二座--sorry，范秀鵬可以訂五、六座，...

B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

問：...開始就有呢個就唔使事事都要陳小華，對嘛？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：好嘞，咁講番用呢個乜嘢嘅嘢嚟到焊接，你嘅意思即係話其實以你做打埋嘅經驗，或者做負責落單嘅經驗--首先講番先，負責落單寫嘢，你就之前做打埋嘅時候，就已經有呢個經驗㗎喇？

F

G

答：有。

G

H

問：就負責訂焊料，負責要寫請購單訂焊料，其實係啟晴邨你係第一次先至開始原來要寫呢啲紙訂焊料個嘢，係第一次嘅啫？

H

I

答：第一次。

I

J

問：第一次。因為之前唔使你話，錫曲包埋？

J

K

答：唔使。

K

L

問：好嘞，咁而亦都係即係你負責經手過嘅地盤，打埋又好，或者係即係做一棟棟嘅負責人又好，需要用到焊料呢家嘢，其實都係啟晴先開始需要話訂焊料嘅，對嘛？

L

M

M

N

答：係，係。

N

O

問：你其他啲嘢項目可唔可以咁講，其他以前嘅經驗全部都係用錫曲嘅，對嘛？

O

P

答：係。

P

Q

問：你除咗做善明同埋元州之外，你就打埋喇，有冇啲其他另外嘅項目唔係做打埋，但係都有一啲負責一棟棟嘅經驗咁樣？

Q

R

答：唔係何標記地盤？

R

S

問：唔係何標記入面嘅？

S

T

答：唔係，我而家通常做啲嘢攞攞嘅。

T

U

問：Okay。

U

V

V



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：攞杭。

問：得。咁總之即係長話短說，就一係攞杭，一係錫曲嘅，總之啟晴就係第一次你接觸過嘅地盤需要用焊料？

答：係。

問：你係咪話畀我哋聽，就係話由於你啟晴呢個地盤第一次需要焊料，咁就係陳小華就話畀你聽用焊料...

答：佢冇話畀我聽。

問：吓？

答：我自己過去睇嘅啫，我去三、四座。

問：你去睇嘅，就係嘞，冇錯。我哋講一講，你由於啟晴係第一次接觸原來你要用一啲唔係錫曲嘅嘢嚟到去焊接？

答：係。

問：咁你當然就想知道冇--中後期先至係你填紙，但係一開始你都想去了解...

答：係，佢派畀我哋嘅。

問：...個工作個情況，咁你點樣去了解？你點樣去睇？你同我哋講，不如。

答：咪上去樓嗰度睇佢師傅點做。

問：上去邊個樓？

答：三、四座。

問：上三、四座？

答：唔。

問：即係陳小華負責嗰兩棟？

答：係。

B

B

C

問：就上去佢嗰度睇下陳小華嗰兩棟嗰啲師傅點做？

C

D

答：嘎，點做。

D

E

問：點解會睇佢負責嗰兩棟嗰啲師傅點做呢？係咪因為即係...

E

F

問：...佢係打理，佢有經驗啲，所以你跟佢話事咁呢，係咪呀？

F

G

答：係呀，佢落--唔係，佢落咗料返嚟，而家因為我未用過呢啲嘍嘛，...

G

H

問：係。

H

I

答：...我係用有錫嗰啲配件，我所以要上去三、四座望一望佢點樣做。

I

J

問：得，明白。咁即係其實就係因為一開始嘅時候，陳小華作為打理，佢已經就決定咗用錫條，就訂咗一拵錫條返嚟，所以你上去三、四座睇啲師傅點做嘢嘅時候，就自不然就係見到啲師傅用錫條去做嘢嘞，對嘛？

J

K

K

L

答：係，係。

L

M

問：陳小華一開始嘅時候，除咗你上去睇、學嘢嘅時候，除咗見到啲師傅用緊錫條，有冇見到啲師傅用緊錫線，一卷卷嘅？

M

N

答：冇。

N

O

問：冇。我哋分清楚我哋嗰啲語言先。

O

P

答：唔。

P

Q

問：一條條嗰啲錫條你所謂，...

Q

R

答：係。

R

S

問：...好易熔嗰隻，就係即係後來你喺啟晴--你喺葵聯開始都照訂嗰隻，就係呢啲一條條呢啲，對嘛？

S

T

答：係，啱。

T

U

問：而家攞咗，嚟嗰陣時一條條直㗎喇，對嘛？

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係，唔。

問：呢啲就係你口講叫錫條，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：好。你上啟晴二、三座--sorry，三、四座，即係陳小華負責嗰兩座睇佢啲師傅點做嘢嘅時候，有冇見到一卷卷呢啲嘢，圓形呢啲綠色嘅？

答：少吓。

問：少。但係有嘅？

答：有。

問：有。即係你上去睇陳小華負責嗰兩座叫做知道下點樣用焊料嘅時候，你見到好多一條條嘅？

答：係。

問：亦都見到少量綠色呢啲一卷卷嘅？

答：係。

問：有？

答：有。

問：咁你有冇問陳小華係咪佢訂嘅呢？

答：我有問佢。

問：冇問。咁其實即係你係盡在不言中，總之你上到去，就見到師傅有好多一條條長嘅錫條用緊？

答：係。

問：少量綠色嘅呢啲我哋叫錫線，係咪你叫做？

答：係。

問：邊個教你咁叫嘍？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：咩嘢？

問：邊個教你咁樣叫呢兩種焊料，一種叫條，一種線嘅，邊個教你咁樣叫？

答：我聽嗰啲師傅咁講㗎咋嘛。

問：啲師傅咁講嘅？

答：係。

問：即係其實唔係陳小華同你坐低，就係話「阿雄，我教你嘢。」唔係咁嘅？

答：冇，唔會嘅，唔係。

問：即係之上到去就望見一條條，啲師傅喺度講「錫條」，咁你就知，原來呢家嘢叫錫條？

答：係，係。

問：咁亦都啲師傅冇冇用到一卷卷綠色呢啲嘢嚟到焊接，你有冇見到？

答：我見到佢燒減壓掣係用呢隻。

問：你見到減壓掣就用呢隻，即係綠色一卷卷呢隻？

答：係。

問：咁呢隻嘢叫做錫線，係咪都係啲師傅咁講？

答：係。

問：即係錫條、錫線呢種叫法全部就係聽在場嗰啲師傅咁講嘅？

答：係。

問：就唔係叫做陳小華坐低話「教精你嘞」，唔係咁樣嘅？

答：冇，冇。

問：好嘞，咁至於頭先你所講，就係話過程唔同--咁銀焊枝你有冇見到呢，  
嗰次？

B

B

C

答：銀焊枝？

C

D

問：噶，有冇係睇啲師傅做嘢嘅時候見到呢？

D

E

答：銀焊枝冇見過。

E

F

問：冇見過。但係銀焊枝嘅功用，你係咪一路都知嘅，其實？

F

G

答：知嘅。

G

H

問：一路都知嘅？

H

I

答：知。

I

J

問：即係銀焊枝其實係要嚟做一啲即係好...

J

K

答：啲大喉。

K

L

問：...粗好粗啲嘅嘅？

L

M

答：係。

M

N

問：即係銀焊枝嘅功用其實你一路都知㗎嘞？

N

O

答：我知。

O

P

問：Okay，得。我哋針對條同埋線，我哋唔好講銀焊枝，...

P

Q

答：好呀，好。

Q

R

問：...銀焊枝個名都唔同尤其是。

R

S

答：Okay。

S

T

問：好嘞，頭先你所講，就係話唔知粗到--幼少少嘅就係用直身呢啲錫條，到到粗到某個直徑嘅，就用呢個錫線，或者啲啲減壓掣，因為好粗，咁就用錫線。

T

U

答：係。

U

V

問：呢一種嘅認知咁樣去分辨兩者嘅用途，斷粗幼嚟到去決定用途，呢個咁樣嘅知識係你靠眼睛，定係又係聽師傅講？

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：靠我自己經驗。

問：但係你之前冇用呢啲嘢經驗㗎嘛，...

答：咩嘢？

問：...之前用開錫曲㗎嘛，邊有經驗呢？

答：我諗--唔係，唔係，我諗住啲錫線即係嚟燒減壓掣。

問：我知。點解呀？冇人--聽清楚。

答：嘎。

問：你之前一向嘅認知同埋經驗就係用錫曲，錫曲就包埋喺裏面，就唔係要訂焊料。好嘞，咁你上到去啟晴第三、第四座，見到啲師傅就用緊一條條長呢啲錫條，就一卷卷呢啲你就話佢就要嚟做減壓掣。

答：唔。

問：好嘞，咁但係頭先你都講，水喉有粗有幼㗎？

答：唔。

問：頭先你又講，幼啲嘅--我哋唔好講實際嗰個粗幼度幾多厘米幾多盛，幼啲嘅就用條咁嘛，你話？

答：係。

問：粗啲嘅用線咁嘛？

答：係。

問：幼啲嘅用條，粗啲嘅就用線，呢一個咁樣嘅知識係你靠眼睇佢哋學番嚟，定係啲師傅同你傾偈聽番嚟？

答：靠眼睇番嚟。

問：靠眼睇？

答：係。

問：咁你就話去到見到啲人就係用一條條--我哋講番啟晴三、四座，即係

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

你上去學嘢啲次。

答：唔，唔。

問：你見到啲師傅用一條條長嘅就要嚟焊喉管？

答：係。

問：你就見到啲師傅用一卷綠色呢啲就要嚟焊呢個減壓掣吖？

答：同埋大喉，係。

問：同埋大喉，okay，得，因為你頭先冇。即係總之你親眼見到就係話佢  
啲就係用幼嘅錫線，一卷卷就係做大喉同埋減壓掣？

答：係。

問：一條條長嘅錫條就要嚟做...

答：細喉。

問：...細喉。咁你就唔係靠即係同佢哋傾交流經驗咁問番嚟嘅，總之你  
見到，...

答：係。

問：...靠眼見，你就自己推論，原來係咁樣用法嘅，你就有冇試過去問  
下，「係咪真嘍？嗰個分界點喺邊呀？」頭先你講過好多數目字，15  
至 42 就用條，50 至 67 就用線，呢啲咁樣嘅數目字嚟到分係你自己  
諗，係咪呀？

答：咩嘢？

問：即用呢啲--即係幾多直徑就係用條，幾多直徑就係用線，呢個係你自  
己內心嘅一個計算嚟嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：係。15 至 42 就係用條吖嘛，你話？

答：條。

問：15 至 42 係好--即係一個好標準嘅一種尺碼嚟嘅，15 至 42？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係，15。

問：跟住你就講到 50 至 64--50 至 67，對嘛？

答：係。

問：42 至 50 中間有冇嘢，冇嘢嘅？即係冇一啲喉係 42 至 50 咁樣嘅？

答：冇，冇，冇。

問：冇嘅。一係就 15 至 42，一係就 50 至 67，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：一係就 70 同埋 100 咁樣？

答：係。

問：70 同埋 100 就係銀焊枝咁嘛，你話，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：好嘞，咁你有冇去諗點解幼啲嘅喉就要用條，粗啲喉就用線呢？

答：細嘅喉咪容易燒啲喇，錫條。

問：細啲嘅喉--錫條，講番先。

答：唔。

問：呢啲全部--停一停先。你係冇同陳小華即係坐低走去討論過...

答：冇。

問：...線同埋條嘅特性、分別嘅？

答：冇，冇。

問：冇。所以其實你嘅證人供詞裏面講話，陳小華喺呢個邨裏面決定用錫條，跟住所以你後來去到葵聯都用錫條，你嘅意思唔係話真係陳小華同你真係坐低有傾談？

答：冇。



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：冇？

答：冇。

問：純粹係...

答：我睇番係。

問：...你覺得係陳小華決定咗咁樣用，然後你就從個人觀察就去揣摩出原來兩者之間嘅用途，就係用直徑粗幼條管嚟到去分開，係咪咁呀？

答：係。

問：咁跟住你頭先就有講，你就話條係易熔啲，係咪你話？

答：係。

問：條易熔啲呢樣嘢，你係點知道嘅呢？

答：即係燒落去快熔啲。

問：即係你係靠觀察嘅？

答：係。

問：即係你觀察啲師傅，你就見到佢哋擺住一條條長呢啲，你覺得佢燒比較快就熔嘞？

答：係呀。

問：即係個熔點比較低啲，對嘛？可能係。

答：係。

問：咁點解熔點低啲就比較適合係燒啲幼啲嘅喉管呢？

答：我見啟晴用過，咪就係照辦煮碗話照擺嚟，好用。

問：我明。但係點解易熔啲，就要嚟燒幼啲嘅喉管？

答：直覺囉。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：係。但係點解會方便咗呢，即係點解唔可以易熔啲要嚟燒埋粗啲喉管呢？如果咁易熔，佢走嚟--其實即係我係常人，我唔係專門做水喉，我嘅理解會唔會係話，係人都想快啲收工，你擺條錫條個熔點低啲，咁你燒咗佢好快熔，唔使坐喺度慢慢等，一燒熔咗佢，包咗條喉管咪得囉，...

答：係囉。

問：...粗幼都係咁做嘅啫。咁點解幼啲喉管就要用易熔啲錫條，但係到到粗啲嘅喉管就要用啲幼啲，但係難熔啲嘅錫線呢，點解呢？有冇諗過？

答：冇諗過。

問：冇諗嘅？

答：冇諗過。

問：總之你就見到啲工人...

答：我覺得好--唔係，我覺得好用，就整嚟燒細配件。

問：好用要嚟燒細配件？

答：係。

問：即係靈活啲，係咪你覺得佢轉彎轉得？

答：係，快熔，係。

問：因為你原本係直㗎嘛，咁容易熔，你覺得佢要嚟轉彎包啲細啲嘅喉就方便咁解，係咪咁呀？

答：係，係。

問：咁幼啲呢隻呢，幼啲呢隻你就見到一卷卷，就係啲師傅要嚟燒啲粗啲...

答：燒減壓掣。

問：...--減壓掣同埋粗啲嘅喉，係咪呀？

B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

D

黎先生：可唔可以講多一次，點解你減壓掣唔用條呢？

E

E

答：用咩嘢？

F

F

黎先生：減壓掣唔用錫條嚟燒呢？

G

G

答：減壓掣用...

H

H

黎先生：你粗啲啲啲喉管同埋減壓掣點解你唔用錫條，要用錫線，可唔可以講多一次點解？

I

I

答：而家因為佢錫線夠靱啲，我所以擺呢隻錫線整嚟燒減壓掣。

J

J

黎先生：靱啲，但係你耐啲個喎？

K

K

答：耐啲我擺高溫槍嚟燒咩嘛。

L

L

黎先生：你用高溫槍嚟燒？

M

M

答：係。

N

N

黎先生：即係你呢啲就係用高溫槍嚟燒嘅，...

答：係，擺高溫槍燒咪快啲。

O

O

黎先生：...用錫線嗰陣時，就唔係用啲啲...

P

P

答：唔係石油氣。

Q

Q

R

R

問：石油氣就係燒啲錫條嘅，呢啲叫做用風煤，係咪啲啲叫做？風煤，係咪呀？

S

S

T

T

主席：呢啲唔使，唔使應該。

U

U

石先生：唔使。

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：唔使，用高溫槍。

問：唔使風煤，高溫槍得㗎嘞？

黎先生：高溫槍。

石先生：Okay，高溫槍，得，okay。

黎先生：嗰個麻煩啲嘅照計？

答：吓？

黎先生：照計麻煩啲嘅，你用錫線？係咪麻煩㗎呀？

答：都係，係，係。

黎先生：我就奇怪點解你唔用埋錫條呢，係嗰啲嘅減壓掣都用埋錫條，即係我奇怪？

答：因為我而--因為個配件大，我驚佢漏水，所以用錫線嚟燒。

主席：漏水？

黎先生：驚漏水？

答：係呀。

主席：其實會唔會係因為個減壓掣--入去個減壓掣嗰條水喉個直徑係大啲呀？

答：係喇。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：你唔會擺條最細嘅銅管去裝呢個減壓掣嘅，係咪呀？

問：因為頭先你開始畀口供都好似講到關於減壓掣大細嘅問題，因為係大件嘅部件嚟㗎嘛，減壓掣係？

答：係。

問：但係我始終都唔係好明就係呢停一卷卷呢啲嘢有咩嘢特性，因為你話過你係有同人哋口中聽過錫條同錫線之間嘅特性，你都上去睇師傅做嘅啫？

答：係。

問：咁當然喇，你話「我唔諗嘢嘅，師傅見到佢用一卷卷呢啲做粗啲嘅喉，同埋做減壓掣，我照跟嘅啫，我唔諗嘅。」你咁講我明。

答：唔。

問：但係你頭先就係講啲嘢理由出嚟，就係話「我諗係因為咁嘅原因，所以我先至用圓形一卷卷呢啲嘢。」咁我所以先追問你。

答：係。

問：有啲乜嘢嘢係呢種圓形呢啲嘢係好啲，而係一條條嘅錫條有咁好嘅呢，你覺得？

答：佢因為個配件大，...

問：係，或者條喉大叫做。

答：...用錫線就可以夠韌--即係夠韌啲，係咪先？

問：點解佢會夠韌啲，你喺邊度聽番嚟嘅呢？

答：因為我要用高溫槍嚟燒㗎嘛，即係熔點就...

問：即係熔點高啲，你就覺得叫做韌啲？

答：係嘞。

問：即係難熔...

B

B

C

C

D

黎先生：即係太快呢，反為唔方便，係咪呀？

D

E

答：係，係。

E

F

黎先生：即係熔得太快反為唔方便燒？

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：點解太快唔方便？點解熔得太快唔好呢？

H

I

答：驚佢漏水。

I

J

主席：咁細喉都會漏水㗎？

J

K

答：吓？

K

L

主席：細喉都會漏水㗎？

L

M

答：唔係，你個細喉冇咁大壓力，細喉。

M

N

主席：即係講壓力？

N

O

答：嘎。

O

P

問：即係話大嘅喉或者減壓掣佢就要承受好大嘅壓力，咁所以你心諗就係不如搵啲難熔啲嘅嘢去，咁都叫做安心啲。呢啲係咪有教過，即係你學師嘅時候，定係唔係教...

P

Q

Q

R

答：自己...

R

S

問：吓？

S

T

答：自己靠感覺。

T

U

問：自己靠感覺嘅。硬啲嘅嘢就應該係好啲嘅，即係...

U

V

V

B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

問：...係抵償得到壓力嘅，得。咁所以就係其實你...

D

E

主席：對唔住。我想問下你，咁你之前嗰啲屋邨用錫曲嗰啲，減壓掣用咩嘢？

E

F

F

G

答：佢裏面都有錫㗎嘛。

G

H

主席：嗰啲又用錫呀又，得。嗰...

H

I

答：佢裏面有錫配件㗎㗎。

I

J

主席：即係咁大個減壓掣都係...

J

K

答：唔係，唔係，而家多數 80 嗰啲係走銀焊嘅。

K

L

主席：大...

L

M

答：80 同 100。

M

主席：大嗰啲我明，銀焊，我哋唔好理佢銀焊。咁你善明邨嗰啲減壓掣全部裏面都已經有晒嗰啲錫㗎裏面？

N

答：嗰啲而家好似 50 配件都係，全部有錫嘅。

N

O

主席：唔係，我問你減壓掣係唔係已經有埋錫㗎裏面？

O

P

答：減壓掣嘅配件係有錫，配件。

P

Q

主席：真係有埋呀？

Q

R

答：有。

R

S

主席：減壓掣好大個嗎？

S

T

答：50 嗰啲好細隻咋嘛。

T

U

主席：得，唔。繼續。

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：即係話其實就係靠觀察，然後就靠自己內心嘅一啲推論，你就覺得粗喉同埋減壓掣就需要用啲韌力好啲嘅嘢？

答：係。

問：難熔嘅嘢就應該韌力好啲，咁所以就推論，尤其是見到啲人咁做，所以就你推論咗就係減壓掣同埋粗喉就係用綠色呢種嘢嘞？

答：係。

問：幼啲嘅，你見到工人用一條條嘅錫條，又易熔，同埋壓力又唔係咁大，所以就用粗啲嘅--即係用一條條嘅錫條，咁你就有咗呢個咁樣嘅認知嘞，對嘛？

答：係。

問：就係憑觀察返嚟嘅，對嘛？

答：觀察。

問：咁至於兩種物料嘅叫法，就係聽啲工人咁講嘅，對嘛？

答：係。

問：但係你在上去睇呢個地盤第三、第四座，呢個工人做畀你睇之前，你知唔知道頭先你講啲嘅嘢，即係有錫條、錫線之分，原來大家嘅功用又唔同，你在嗰日上去之前，你自己知唔知呢啲嘢？

答：知。

問：知嘅？

答：知。

問：點知嘅？

答：我啲--唔係，我啲伙記會講番畀我聽，跟住叫我上去三、四座睇下佢點做。

問：即係其實都係圍繞因為啟晴，所以啲伙記話咗畀你聽，你就上去睇？

答：係。



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：咁所以其實都係你對錫條、錫線呢兩者嘅認知，即係個形狀係點嘅，或者原來係咁用嘅，都係因為做啟晴邨而知嘅啫？

答：係。

問：之前你未做啟晴邨，即係你伙記未話畀你聽原來有啲咁嘅嘢，之前，其實你係唔知道市面上係有啲咁樣嘅焊料一卷卷或者一條條，你唔知嘅？

答：唔知。

問：有冇聽過啲工人除咗用錫條、錫線嚟到區分呢啲焊料之外，有冇聽見有啲人用高溫或者低溫嚟形容呢一啲嘅焊料，有冇聽過？

答：有。

問：有。聽邊個講？

答：又係啲工人。

問：又係啲工人。佢哋點講？

答：咩嘢？

問：佢哋點講？

答：我淨係知--佢講畀我知高溫、低--同埋低溫錫㗎咋。

問：好嘞，高溫錫同低溫錫聽啲工人咁講，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：都係喺啟晴嗰度聽見呢樣嘢嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：佢哋用高溫錫嚟到代表邊種，圓形一卷卷呢隻，定係直一條條啲嘢？

答：圓形一卷卷。

問：圓形一卷卷嘅，你聽啲工人就叫佢哋做高溫錫，係咪呀？

答：係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：一條條啲錫條...

答：就低溫。

問：...就叫佢低溫錫，對嘛？

答：係。

問：即係呢個係工人嘅叫法。即係其實你喺啟晴呢個項目就學到有兩種唔同嘅區別嘅方法，一種就係用錫條、錫線嚟分？

答：唔。

問：一種就係叫高溫錫、低溫錫，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：得。咁到到你可以負責親手寫請購單，即係到到啟晴邨嘅中期，第一、第二座你寫請購單，咁當你發覺原來要訂焊料嘅時候，你就自己判斷需要用幾多邊一種嘅焊料，咁你就照寫「錫條」、「錫線」咁呀？

答：唔係，如果我落焊料，我都要去陳小華個架步，佢有啲請購單喺度，我咪過去望一望。

問：你會去陳小華嘅架步？

答：係。

問：但係架步係成個項目㗎嘛，係咪呀？

答：唔係，佢有本簿寫住要幾多盒、要幾多盒，我咪過去...

問：我知。但係我講架步，架步其實即係一個貨櫃箱？

答：個倉咁樣。

問：一個倉咁？

答：係嘞。

問：係成個項目一個架步嘅，係咪呀？定係原來...

答：唔係。

B

B

C

問：...一、二座會自己有自己嘅架步？

C

D

答：一、二--唔係--係吖。

D

E

問：一、二有自己，三、四有自己？

E

F

答：五、六都有自己，係。

F

G

問：好嘞，你就會去三、四個架步嗰度？

G

H

答：抄。

H

I

問：抄？

I

J

答：唔。

J

K

問：就睇下陳小華點寫？

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：Okay。咁...

M

N

主席：你嘅意思即係一個地盤有三個貨櫃，你哋公司？

N

O

答：三個架步。

O

P

主席：咁係咪即係三個貨櫃，唔係？

P

Q

答：冇貨櫃嘅我哋。

Q

R

問：你哋唔係用貨櫃做架步嘅，...

R

S

答：唔係。

S

T

問：...你哋自己搭個咁樣嘅屋仔？

T

U

答：唔係，佢上咗樓，嗰陣時喺樓。

U

V

問：上咗樓。

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：已經喺樓上面㗎嘞。

主席：即係求其搵一間...

答：房。

主席：...房做，唔。

問：咁你就去抄陳小華嘅寫法，對嘛？

答：唔。

問：以你嘅記憶吓，以你嘅記憶。

答：嘎。

問：你寫請購單訂焊料，你寫落去係寫乜嘢嘅？

答：錫條。

問：錫條？

答：唔。

問：就係因為你見到陳小華嗰度佢寫「錫條」？

答：係。

問：咁你知唔知道--咁但係工人都同你講過，工人都同你講過嗰啲叫錫條  
㗎喇，咁但係總之你就上去嗰個架步就睇下你要寫請購單用乜嘢嘅字  
嚟到形容？

答：係呀。

問：咁你見到佢哋用錫條咁樣？

答：係。

問：咁但係你有冇同嗰度任何人或者陳小華或者邊個去確認，「你呢度寫

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

住『錫條』，係咪即係我認知嗰種一條條嘅錫條？」定係你去到望見有「錫條」呢兩個字，就諗住係得嘞，應該都係？

答：係喇，應該係。

問：即係你有問人哋去確認嘅？

答：冇。

問：你望見寫「錫條」，咁寫「錫條」冇錯㗎嘞，就係咁做嘞？

答：係呀，係。

問：有冇見到陳小華佢哋嗰面嗰啲請購單有人寫過，請購錫線？

答：唔多覺我都。

問：唔多覺？

答：嘎。

問：即係其實你去到睇見陳小華嗰面...

答：佢有好多本簿嚟度，佢成個地盤咁大，...

問：係吖，係吖。

答：...佢一本嘢得嗰幾十張，係咪先？

問：係。咁所以係咪即係你嘅意思，你就唔係真係逐張睇，抽絲剝繭，你攞下攞下，求其見到就有一度寫住「錫條」嘅，你覺得㗎嘞，人哋都係咁寫，咁所以我都係咁寫，係咪咁嘅意思？

答：係，係。

問：你就冇真係抽絲剝繭逐版睇，睇下有冇訂錫線呢，冇？

答：冇。

問：你自己處理第一、第二座地盤，你自己嘅判斷有冇需要過訂錫線先？

答：冇。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：冇？

答：冇。

問：所以你亦都有留意有冇錫線，所以係咪呀？

答：冇，因為佢個--唔係，因為佢個架步已經訂咗成堆喺度喇嘛，已經。

問：即係總之你就覺得已有嘅錫線其實係夠嘅，所以你要請購新嘅焊料都係要錫條啫？

答：係喇。

問：所以你嘅注意力就係睇下陳小華佢第三、第四座嗰啲現有嘅舊請購單有冇訂錫條，對嘛？

答：唔係，而家你--而家因為一至六座全部錫條、錫線都係佢一早訂喇嘞已經，...

問：係，係。

答：...佢係派畀我哋喇嘛。

問：我明，我明。所以由於你嘅判斷就係話錫線一卷卷呢啲夠用，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：你自己有諗過要訂多啲嘅錫線，對嘛？

答：冇。

問：起碼經你手冇喇，第一、第二座？

答：冇，冇。

問：所以你去睇陳小華嗰啲舊嘅請購單要去抄嘢嘅時候，你嘅焦點就係要搵下佢咁點樣寫錫條，你就抄番佢咁嘅寫法？

答：係。

問：你就有特別留意錫線嘅寫法，冇？

答：冇。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：即係你喺啟晴邨就從來都有訂過錫線囉嗎？

答：我有訂過。

主席：唔。

答：全部都喺佢個倉擺㗎咋？

主席：得。或者我哋休息二十分鐘先，好唔好呀？好。

上午 11 時 28 分聆訊押後

上午 11 時 48 分恢復聆訊

出席人士如前。

何標記建築工程有限公司（“何標記”）（中國建築（啟晴邨）及瑞安（葵聯邨第二期）的分判商）的第六證人：黃貴雄（何標記地盤主管／監工（葵聯邨第二期的地盤主管及啟晴邨第一座和第二座的監工））宣誓繼續作供  
石先生繼續盤問

問：黃先生，以你喺即係地盤度打理嘅經驗，你都知道做房委會嘅項目，主承建商係需要向房委員呈交或者遞交或者遞上一啲喺水喉工程裏面將會使用嘅一啲部件或者材料係擺房委會嘅審批，呢個你知道有呢個步驟嘅，係咪？

答：唔知。

問：你唔知有呢個步驟嘅？

答：唔知。

問：好。從來冇人話過畀你聽？

答：冇。

問：咁你哋唔係應該喺地盤度有個房，有擺晒一啲已經批核咗嘅部件出

B

B

C

嚟，冇嘅？

C

D

答：我有睇過。

D

E

問：你有睇過？

E

F

答：冇睇過，因為我要用咩嘢料，就喺張請購表寫用乜嘢料，即係寫上總寫字樓，寫字樓就會畀我哋嘅啲料。

F

G

問：咁亦即係話你寫料就係用一啲形容詞去寫，你唔會用牌子去寫，係咪呀？

G

H

答：冇，冇嘅。

H

I

問：你就係用一啲好概括嘅形容詞，...

I

J

答：即係要個...

J

K

問：...譬如話呢隻係叫做錫條，咁你就寫「錫條」？

K

L

答：嘅，係。

L

M

問：咁你就倚賴寫字樓嘅同事就去決定搵邊個訂，同埋同佢哋訂咩嘢牌子啲咩嘢嘢，即係你覺得有啲咩嘢規格上嘅要求就寫字樓嘅事，或者公司任何其他嘅同事要同寫字樓搞掂去嘞？

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：就唔關你事，你哋嘅責任就係...

O

P

答：落料。

P

Q

問：...用最基本嘅字眼、啲啲形容詞就話畀佢聽你要乜嘢，就係咁嘅啫？

Q

R

答：係，係。

R

S

問：你就唔知道有審批呢個過程？

S

T

答：唔知。

T

U

問：就冇人話過畀你聽審批咗咩嘢料？

U

V

答：冇。

V



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：冇。我畀啲嘢你睇，transcript，呢個係聆訊口供嘅謄本，係 12 月 17 號，中文版嘅謄本，116 頁。116 頁，12 月 17 號。而家你面前應該就電腦個畫面就 show 咗出嚟。如果你想睇紙，如果你係想睇實際有張紙喺你面前，實在啲呢，就喺張紙上面。就 116 頁，你見到中間，呢一度話畀你聽，邊個證人喺度畀緊口供。呢個就係一個瑞安嘅證人，就係葵聯邨二期嘅地盤代表，一個叫溫偉豪先生，你知佢係邊個？

答：Site agent。

問：Site agent，係。

答：係。

問：你知佢係邊個喇？

答：知。

問：睇下佢講乜，睇下 119 頁，119。119，你睇到下面 P，英文字母“P”嗰度，就呢個溫先生就係睇緊你即係嗰份證人供詞嘅，okay？佢就係睇緊你份證人供詞講，就話「因為有啲錫條嚟到就唔係一卷卷嘅，係一條條嘅咁樣」，你係咁講㗎嘛，你證人供詞。呢個溫先生就喺度睇緊你嘅證人供詞裏面講一條條錫條送到場嘅時候嗰一段。

跟住就主席先生就問佢，你見唔見到？「我想問下你，...」你見唔見到嗰行？「...你識咗黃先生有幾耐？」

佢就話「以前一個地盤都係黃先生做打埋人，跟住就葵聯邨遇到佢。」

咁跟住你睇番 120 頁，120 頁中間講到善明邨，善明邨都係瑞安嘅，係咪呀？即係佢就話佢喺善明邨地盤識你嘅，有冇呢個印象？

答：冇。

問：冇。好嘞，呢個就係引子嚟嘅啫。

答：唔。

問：實際就佢就話--121 頁，你見唔見到中間 H、I 嗰度，主席就問佢，「喺善明邨嗰度，何標記用乜嘢焊料呀？」

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

「答：『都係用 Fry 99C。』」呢個係溫先生講嘅。

“FRY”99C 即係呢個立此存照，就係綠色一卷卷呢啲。呢位瑞安嘅 site agent 係咁講，就善明邨就一卷卷嘅呢啲，咁你有咩嘢回應呢？

答：根本我都有用過，我用--而家係善明邨係用有錫配件㗎嘛，嗰度。

問：即係用曲嘅，用錫嘅？

答：係，用有錫嘅曲。

問：Okay。咁善明邨你係 08、09、10 嘅嘢事情，我哋可能要考慮下，睇下 call 唔 call 得番善明邨嗰啲文件，可能需要房委幫一幫手，或者瑞安都可以提供下嘅如果係。

我哋繼續睇落去，就 123 頁。我哋睇嗰個謄本之前，問你一個好籠統嘅問題先，你嘅證據係咪話你係唔知道房委或者有關即係林林種種嘅規條係要求焊料唔含鉛嘅？

答：我唔知道。

問：你係唔知道嘅？

答：唔知道。

問：即係總之你做咁耐，其實係冇人教過你或者話過畀你聽，就係...

答：冇，因為啲辦唔係我上㗎嘛。

問：唔。咁...

答：我淨係顧住做，同埋請工人。

問：唔係，係咪你上唔係問題，有陣時唔係你上，你都會學到嘢㗎嘛，總之就係辦唔係你上--咪住，咩嘢叫做上辦呢，其實？

答：咩嘢？

問：咩嘢叫做上辦？你嘅--你頭先話辦唔係你上。

答：上辦係咪--佢係咪攞啲料去畀人批呢？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：咁你頭先你又話唔知道要攞料畀人批嘅，你又識講上辦嘅？

答：根本唔係我上㗎嘛，啲辦都。

問：係，但係我頭先問你知唔知有--要攞啲辦上去呈交審批呢個步驟㗎嘛，你又話唔知嘅？

答：咩嘢？

問：你知唔知道--係咪你做都好，有啲嘢唔係你做你都會知㗎嘛？

答：嘎。

問：你知唔知道有啲人係會將啲地盤嗰度用嘅建築物料或者水喉配件呈交上去房委會審批？

答：係。

問：你知唔知㗎？唔係你做都好，我知唔係你做，好多嘢都唔係你做，...

答：唔係我做嘅。

問：...生意合約都唔係你簽嘅，但係你知有㗎嘛，係咪你做同埋知唔知係兩回事㗎嘛，明唔明？

答：係。

問：你知唔知道又要上辦，呈交啲樣辦畀房委員審批呢樣嘢？

答：知。

問：知嘅其實係？

答：係。

問：得嘞。咁即係你知道有審批呢樣嘢，咁你知道其實焊料都要審批嘅，知唔知㗎？

答：唔知㗎。

問：你唔知焊料要審批嘅？

答：唔知。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：咁以你嘅理解乜嘢嘢先至要審批？

答：掣同埋銅喉嗰啲，同埋銅配件。

問：Okay。焊料你唔知道原來係要審批嘅？

答：唔知，我以為係小五金咋嘛。

問：Okay。但係實際上原來係審批咗嘅，呢樣嘢你係唔知嘅？

答：唔知。

問：你亦都唔知道原來有關嘅條例或者合約嘅條款要求唔含鉛嘅焊料，你係唔知嘅？

答：唔知。

問：好嘞，咁呢引子。我哋睇一睇，頭先我叫你睇呢個溫先生，122頁。睇122頁個底嗰度，個問題係主席先生問嘅，「佢就話喺嗰陣佢基本上--佢就話『我唔知道嗰啲焊料--即係食水喉嘅焊料一定要係無鉛。』」呢個係主席引你講嘅嘢，即係佢係套用番你證人供詞講嘅嘢，就叫溫先生去睇下佢有咩嘢回應。

跟住主席最尾嗰行就話「佢話佢唔知，你點答呢？」

跟住呢個溫先生就話「我覺得如果佢係有水喉--佢做咗咁多年水喉工牌嘅話...」而家係123頁個頂嗰度，你見唔見到？123頁最頂嗰度，左上角，「我覺得如果佢...」

你見唔見到？

答：見到。

問：「我覺得如果佢係有水喉工--即係做咗咁多年水喉工牌嘅話，因為以我而家知道，喺水喉工牌考牌嘅候會有講過呢句說話，我相信佢應該冇理由唔知。但係佢話--唔好意思，我可能理解錯，但係佢講水喉strip...」即係呢個係錫條吓，「...裏面含唔含鉛，我諗呢個我唔敢...」

「正如即係話佢呢句話，佢講嗰個solder strip，即係頭先講嗰啲含鉛佢唔知，我...」

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

「即係你唔同意佢第一句說話，抑或乜嘢呀？」

「我其實唔同意--我即係想講作為水喉工，佢應該知道燒嘅焊料係唔應該含鉛嘅，...」

停一停先。咁佢就話你作為水喉工係應該知道燒焊料係唔應該含鉛嘅，咁你有咩嘢回應呢？佢話你應該知，冇理由唔知嘅。

答：我咁係照計係唔知吖嘛，係咪先？

問：Okay，好。

答：如果我知，都唔會用呢隻，係咪呀？

問：好。跟住睇番落去，L 嗰度，「我想問一問，...」呢個係主席先生問佢，「...佢知唔知道，就你所知，交上去房署嗰啲係呢一隻 99C Fry 呀？」

99C“FRY”，就係你望一望我，就係呢一種，而家我哋大家都公認係唔含鉛嘅焊料，我亦都話畀你聽，我費事同你睇啲文件，因為費時失事，就係其實鄭先生佢遞辦上去畀主承建商，再交畀房委員審批嘅焊料係交咗呢隻嘅，綠色呢隻嘅，即係而家我哋知道係咁個隻嘅。

答：唔。

問：主席就問佢，「就你所知，交上去房署係呢隻 99C Fry，佢知唔知？」即係意思係你知唔知呀。

答：我唔知。

問：我知，但係--我知你話唔知，但係呢個溫先生佢就話「我敢肯定佢知道。」佢好肯定你知道。

主席就問佢「點解你咁肯定？」

咁佢答「因為點解呢？如果我睇番我以前嘅紀錄，我哋...」「我哋」即係瑞安，「...6月3號畀咗份嘢，e-mail 畀個阿健，而個阿健當其時佢其實係同黃貴雄係一齊做打埋人嘅，喺地盤，佢哋係坐埋同一個架步，冇理由阿健知，而佢係會唔知。」即係當時佢哋有兩個打埋人嘅。

「即係當時佢哋有兩個打埋人嘅？」

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

「當時佢哋有兩個打理人。」

「同一個架步，個架步即係同一個貨櫃箱？」

「係。」

「繼續。」

跟住睇番 124，咁有個問題，「頭先你講呢個阿健，全名係...」

跟住講「梁偉健。」

問題係「梁偉健。佢係咪整個葵聯二期工程都係做緊呢個打理人？」

跟住就答「梁偉健佢會比較--比黃貴雄高級啲，佢會寫字樓同地盤兩邊走，...」佢兩邊走呢個我哋知道。

但係呢度呢個溫先生佢嘅說法就係瑞安出過一個電郵去畀梁偉健，就係通知梁偉健審批咗嘅物料係乜嘢，咁而呢個溫先生佢推論就係話，因為你同梁偉健都叫做係呢個葵聯嘅打理人，就有理由一個知，一個唔知，我哋--呢個係佢嘅說法，你可能好多地方唔同意，但係我哋逐步逐步去講。

答：唔。

問：電郵就唔係由你處理嘅，對嘛？

答：係。

問：個電郵我可以畀你望一望，不過都係即係循例望一望。就係個電郵喺 H1 嘅 122 頁。H1，122，好快望一望，我知道你話唔係你處理嘅個電郵。不過--你見到呢一個電郵係列印咗出嚟嘅，你望面前電腦嗰個 mon 都應該有。

答：係。

問：122，英文--你話你讀到中三，咁英文--一般呢啲英文，你睇唔睇明？

答：睇唔明。

問：睇唔明嘅。咁呢個電郵就係 send 咗畀一個收件 hbkleung，咁你見

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

到喇，咁呢個我哋知道係梁偉健嘅電郵嘅地址嚟嘅。呢一個電郵係冇人畀過你睇嘅，對嘛？

答：係。

問：冇。但係我可以話畀你聽呢個電郵就係瑞安有位文先生就傳遞畀梁偉健，佢嘅意思就係將物料審批，即係房委會批核咗物料嘅一個文件 send 咗畀梁偉健，後面就係將房委會實際批核嗰份文件就 attach 咗，即係連埋嗰個電郵一齊傳送咗出嚟。咁你睇番 123、124，你都係應該話係冇見過呢兩張嘢，係咪呀？

答：冇，冇。

問：冇。咁見過你都未必會睇或者識睇，係咪？如果照你。睇番 128，128 就係嗰個物料呈交其中一啲嘅照片，左下角就見到一卷卷嗰啲嘢。我哋確認咗呢樣嘢先，電郵地址唔係你，你有見過呢個電郵？

答：冇見過。

問：但係梁偉健佢喺葵聯邨係唔係叫做都係一個同你共同係打理人呢，佢個角色？

答：唔係。

問：唔係？

答：唔係，佢升咗職㗎喇嘛，已經。

問：係。咁所以就呢個溫--呢個頭先我哋睇嗰個溫先生佢嘅認知就唔啱，你覺得佢唔係同你共同打理人？

答：係，唔啱。

問：打理人就係你一個？

答：係。

問：佢都會耐唔耐嚟到睇你嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：係。因為其實佢都叫做係跟你出身，即係我哋講得即係通俗少少，咁

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

都同你都傾得一兩句，都叫做即係唔係話唔相熟，即係會同你有兩句  
偈傾，都會有陣時搵你唔係淨係講下公事，咁都傾下偈咁嘅都會，係  
咪呀？

答：係。

問：所以佢喺葵聯邨嘅地盤出現，同你即係會有多兩句偈傾呢樣嘢，人哋  
見到都唔出奇嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：係。咁就佢嚟睇葵聯，就會喺嗰個架步嗰度就...

答：好少。

問：吓？

答：好少，都係上去 DS 房同我睇下啲圖啲啲咁樣咋嘛。

問：唔。但係你哋喺葵聯個架步係咪一個貨櫃，係咪？

答：唔係貨櫃，係樓嚟嘅。

問：吓？

答：喺個樓上面嘅。

問：喺樓上面嘅？

答：係。

問：咁即係呢個溫先生佢話葵聯喺同一個貨櫃其實都係講錯？

答：冇貨櫃。

問：唔係貨櫃嚟嘅？

答：冇貨櫃。

問：Okay。梁先生有冇同你傾談之中講過物料審批嘅事情？

答：冇。



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：冇？

答：冇。

問：因為溫先生嘅推論就係話梁先生收到，佢都知嘞，冇理由佢唔話畀你聽，總之你就係話，第一，你唔係--佢唔係打理，梁先生唔係打理，對嘛？

答：唔。

問：第二，就係梁先生亦都有同你講過...

答：冇講過。

問：...審批嘅事情？

答：冇。

問：係咪有間房將審批咗嘅物料擺出嚟㗎？

答：我就係冇--我就係唔知。

問：唔知？

答：唔知。

問：好。總之即係一言以蔽之，就係關於呢一個電郵裏面附有嘅文件同埋佢裏面所講審批咗嘅物料，你係唔知嘅？

答：我唔知。

問：梁偉健亦都有同你講過？

答：冇。

問：但係你睇番頭先個電郵，係6月3號。6月3號，頭先就我哋都睇過一啲嘅文件，攞番S1嘅102頁出嚟。S1，102。S1嘅102頁，你見到左手面，呢個係何標記自己即係寫字樓或者律師，幫佢打出嚟嘅一個列表，就係葵聯邨裏面訂焊料嘅一啲紀錄，即係佢能夠搵到嘅一啲紀錄。我哋就見到2013、2014期間，2015我哋唔好講住。呢個係--sorry，呢個係雋景擺出嚟，唔係何標記，我講錯，呢個係雋景整出嚟。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：得。

問：即係基於雋景嘅紀錄。你見到就係 6 月 4 號，你睇番第二行，你見到“4-Jun-13”，嗰個 invoice number 叫做“103609”，見唔見？最左面嗰棟“103609”，嗰張係張單嘅冧巴，個日期就係 4-Jun，即係 6 月，2013。咁嗰度嗰個 order 就有訂到「“FRY”無鉛錫線」，見到喇？

答：有。

問：跟住一迲直落，全部就係訂 50 力錫條，就訂咗二十網。頭先其實你律師問嘅時候，都問過呢一個現狀--呢個現象，訂咗二十網無鉛，咁啱係 6 月 4 號，就係頭先我哋見到 6 月 3 號批核咗。嗰個電郵你自己當時冇睇過，但係我話畀你聽就係 6 月 3 號傳出一個電郵，瑞安話畀梁生聽，就話而家批咗“FRY”，跟住 6 月 4 號就真係有張單就係訂“FRY”。

你睇番張發票，105 頁，就開咗張單，6 月 4 號嘅，就真係訂咗有“FRY”二十網，同埋亦都有訂錫條。當然我哋唔知道呢張 invoice，呢張發票出就 6 月 4，但係實際上個 order 幾時落，我哋就而家就見唔到。咁所以就即係--但係如果即係呢張發票，通常你訂貨，佢通常如果有貨，好快送到嘅，你嘅經驗？

答：係，係。

問：今日訂，可能今日到或者聽日到？

答：可能啱。

問：如果快嘅話？

答：得。

問：得嘅可以係。所以即係見佢 6 月 4 號咁啱又有張單嚟到，送“FRY”無鉛，即係啱嗰隻喎，咁有冇可能係有人真係收到審批通知，...

答：唔會。

問：...知道“FRY”係啱嘅，所以就訂“FRY”先，有“FRY”，咁啱就嗰日？

答：唔會。

B

B

C

問：唔會。點解呢？

C

D

答：唔會，因為佢成日唔係嚟我地盤，我哋亦都唔會傾過呢啲嘢，其實。

D

E

主席：因為咩嘢話？對唔住，因為咩嘢話？

E

F

答：咩嘢？

F

G

主席：因為咩嘢話？

G

H

答：唔係，因為梁偉健唔係成日嚟我呢度，佢一個月都嚟四、五次嘅都係，你有咁啱得咁蹺咋嘛，係咪先？

H

I

I

J

問：我明。即係你意思係話就算梁偉健真係收到 6 月 3 號個電郵，都未必真係有咁啱得咁蹺佢 6 月 3 號嗰日咁啱上嚟巡葵聯個地盤，又話到畀你聽，係咪咁意思？

J

K

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：你哋冇紀錄佢幾時嚟到巡，係咪？因為佢...

M

N

答：冇，冇，冇。

N

O

問：好，...

O

P

P

Q

主席：咁呢張發票裏面講啲無鉛錫條同埋 50 力扁--對唔住，無鉛錫線同埋 50 力扁錫條就係你訂？

Q

R

答：係。

R

S

主席：得。

S

T

問：頭先主席都曾經問過你，就係我哋如果淨係睇番雋景，喺 102 頁嗰版，我哋唔好跳咗去--等陣先吓。

T

U

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：葵聯有幾多棟樓，請問？一棟？

答：兩棟。

主席：兩棟？

答：係。

問：我哋講一講葵聯。咁葵聯你係做打理人，葵聯有幾多棟？提醒我。

答：咩嘢話？

問：葵聯有幾多座--幾多棟？

答：兩座。

問：兩座。咁所以訂貨就比較簡單啲，全部都經你手，對嘛？

答：係。

問：就唔係好似啟晴咁樣，又要即係後來到中後期分散咗咩嘢嘞，全部中央係你管理？

答：全部都係我。

問：所以如果係問你係咪全部都係你經手，你就比較有記憶？

答：係。

問：即係你唔使話「死嘞，未必係我經手個啲」咁，係咪呀？

答：唔。

問：所以頭先即係主席問你話「你呢度成炸雋景擺出嚟嘅葵聯單，淨係得見到一次訂過“FRY”。」雋景啲單未必齊，我話畀你聽，即係而家我哋啲單未必個個都 keep 得齊。但係以你記憶，其實葵聯你訂錫線“FRY”呢隻，係咪都淨係得開頭訂過嗰廿個？

答：唔係好記得。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：唔係好記得？

答：係。

問：最耐 2015 嗰下唔計，因為嗰下應該喺後面有啲事發生咗咁嘅。

主席：最耐嗰啲唔算，8 月。

問：但係你記得全個工程第一次就訂咗二十綑“FRY”，但係你係唔記得係咪淨係訂咗呢二十綑，係咪呀？

答：係，係，唔記得。

問：唔記得？

答：係。

問：點解第一次--因為啟晴就學你話齋，就係陳小華一早已經訂晒啲嘢，你去到睇三、四，佢哋其實已經用啲你覺得係訂咗嘅嘢喺度做緊？

答：係。

問：葵聯就你打晒骰？

答：係。

問：咁點解第一批你淨係訂 50 力，4 月，你到到 6 月先至訂“FRY”，先至訂錫線呢？

答：邊度？

問：呢張單，你 102 頁。2013 年 4 月 24 號你就先訂咗 110 磅嘅 50 力錫條，你到到 6 月先至訂“FRY”無鉛錫線，但係你打骰，你一開始--點解你唔係一開始就係所有你覺得要用，你可以訂晒先？

答：唔係，佢有大配件嚟，我先訂呢啲錫線嚟㗎嘛。

問：哦，okay，即係你覺得你開頭第一批訂，4 月嘅時候，你嗰陣時個判斷...

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係做走廊喉嗰啲咁樣，細喉仔。

問：即係你第一次訂貨，你個判斷就係淨係需要錫條，你訂錫條先？

答：係。

主席：咁你哋唔係裝咗大喉，先至會裝細喉？

答：唔係，我哋做咗走廊喉先。

問：走廊喉係幼啲嘅？

答：係，22 嘅。

問：你話唔記得有冇訂過第二次，或者另外一啲場合訂過“FRY”嘅無鉛錫線，係咪呀？喺葵聯。

答：唔，係。

問：因為點解呢？即係我哋就睇過嗰啲 bills of quantities，即係葵聯同埋啟晴嗰啲 bills of quantities，即係我--由於你話唔記得清楚，所以我唔同你即係逐條逐條數計。

答：係。

問：即係葵聯有六座，六座我哋將--你頭先所講，就係五十四--葵聯有兩座，啟晴有六座，okay？

答：係。

問：頭先你就話 50 至 67 就係用錫線，即係“FRY”呢隻？

答：係。

問：我哋計過啲數，我唔同你擺啲數出嚟，即係總之啟晴嗰六座，六座裏面 54 同埋 66.7，加埋就大約有 1,800 metre，1,800 米左右嘅長度。葵聯就有兩個 block，我哋睇番 BQ，佢就淨係用 54 嘅啫，你有冇印象淨係 54，就有 66.7 嘅？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：冇。

問：葵聯 54 毫米嗰啲管加埋，就 1,000 metre，1,000 公尺。所以就葵聯就個長度就少過啟晴。

答：係。

問：咁正常，啟晴咁多棟，但係啟晴就唔係多好多，啟晴就 1,800，葵聯就 1,000 咁。但係如果我哋相比番訂返嚟，即係雋景擺出嚟嗰啲單計出嚟嗰啲數，葵聯你就見到 102 頁，就淨係訂咗二十網嘅“FRY”。

但係如果你睇番啟晴，你睇睇 128 頁。128 頁，啟晴你會見到上面數落嚟第三行打橫，你見到已經有廿網“FRY”，見到嘛？上面數落嚟第三，有廿網嘅“FRY”，見到嘛？見到嘛呢度？呢個表亦都係雋景做出嚟嘅，係總結佢哋手頭上有關啟晴送貨嘅紀錄。

你見到二十網嘅“FRY”，你跟住望落去，你見到嗰張 invoice number，左手面“92042”嗰度，92042 嗰張單，你見到又有“FRY”無鉛錫線有四十網，見唔見到？四十網，“FRY”無鉛錫線，見到嘛？

答：見到。

問：跟住你再望落去 92271 嗰張 invoice，4 月 13 號有三十網；跟住 93422，invoice number，5 月 25 號“FRY”又一百網添；跟住 93976，12 號 6 月，“FRY”又一百網，嗰度段百網買嘅。即係所以呢個咁樣嘅即係唔同嘅數量，即係同兩座之間個喉管嗰個長短嗰個分別相隔太大，你明我意思嘛？

答：明白。

問：你淨係睇座數或者睇盛又好，你睇長短也好，啟晴係多過葵聯，但係都唔係多好多啫，但係呢度你睇訂嘅“FRY”，訂幼嘅係多好多啫。有好多個解釋，一係雋景啲單唔齊，但係我哋撇除呢個理由先，你諗唔諗到咩嘢理由係啟晴嗰啲喉駁埋嘅長度唔係真係多得葵聯咁多，但係紀錄上啟晴係用多咗好多呢一啲嘅幼嘅錫線，你諗唔諗到咩嘢理由？

答：唔係，可能我喺雋景嗰度單落咗，可能佢啲單唔齊可能。

問：即係你意思可能喺葵聯其實你唔係淨係訂廿網嘅，可能你中間有訂多咗，不過佢啲單唔齊？

答：係，係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：但係你就...

答：冇乜記憶。

問：...唔記得清楚，即係冇印象中曾經再加訂過幾多？

答：係。

問：但係總之你落單，你都係根據嗰個本子去辦事，就係你個判斷覺得有大嘢嘅嘢，配件，即係減壓掣或者粗嘅喉，...

答：係，用錫線。

問：...你就會話「我夠時候係要訂錫線」？

答：係。

主席：我哋知道其實啟晴邨有六座，咁唔係六座一齊起，五、六、三、四、一、二。五、六、三、四、一、二，你負責嗰兩座就係...

答：一、二。

主席：...最後嗰兩座，係咪？

答：最後嗰兩座，係。

主席：落成，咁最後先至裝水喉。

答：中段。

主席：即係我唔會話最後裝水喉，不過就係總之有先後次序，你就比較後啲？

答：係。

主席：咁我睇番 128，由 2012 年 6 月開始，其實一路都有 order 過呢個“FRY”個喎，...

答：嗯？

主席：...即係後半年，基本上你完全冇叫過無鉛錫線，咁當然你嘅解釋



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

就係話...

答：去陳小華嗰度擺。

主席：...之前去陳小華嗰度擺，係咪？

答：係。

主席：即係我嘅意思，我想話畀你聽，你由2012年6月26日開始，跟住一路去到睇埋第102，12年、13年、14年，其實你自己閣下負責呢四座樓宇，只係order過二十網嘅“FRY”無鉛錫線嘅啫。你同唔同意？

答：咩嘢？

主席：即係就咁睇單，即係由2012年6月開始，去到2014年嘅3月，喺你--即係單係睇呢啲單，你自己order嘅就只係得二十網嘅啫？

答：唔係，我喺啟晴邨去陳小華架步擺咁嘛。

主席：你order，你落單嘅，就係得二十網嘅啫。

答：而家--唔係，而家我睇單就係二十卷。

主席：係囉。

答：睇單。

主席：咁我哋梗係睇單，唔通睇咩嘢嘢啫。

答：係喇，我而家即係冇乜嘢記憶，係咪先？

主席：係呀，我明。即係你明我意思嘛？

答：明白。

主席：即係頭先石大狀都話畀你聽，你啟晴邨有三百幾磅嘅無鉛錫線，如果你將佢除六座，每座都起碼要用五十網，你呢度得二十網，仲係即係佢係咁講就話，點解6月3號批咗之後，6月4號就啱啱有二十網。即係呢個世界佢...

答：即係...

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：...我哋嘅意思就即係...

答：...就係咁躑。

主席：...冇咁躑，呢個世界就係。

答：就係咁躑，係咪先？

主席：得，好，就係咁躑。

問：但係亦都你嘅證據，即係總之我總結，就係咁躑 6 月 4 號佢送咗二十卷 FRY 嚟，但係就同審批冇關，因為你唔知，你係話？

答：唔知。

問：第二就係話，其實未必真係你淨係訂咗廿網咁少，因為其實可能有啲單唔齊，因為你忘記咗你跟住有冇再訂？

答：係，係。

問：咁其...

主席：同埋我哋見到--對唔住，sorry。同埋我哋即係見到，譬如--我即係純粹係咁講，譬如你睇番啟晴邨，2011 年 10 月 14 號就 order 二十網，係咪？

答：嘅。

主席：跟住下一個就係 12 月 17 號又 order 二十網，咁即係用晒先至 order，唔會一早 order 定㗎嘛，即係兩個月就已經用咗，你明我意思嘛？

答：唔會用晒先至 order。

主席：我知，即係你唔會用到最後一兵一卒，係咪？不過個問題即係都--即係你唔會一早 order 定一大--你係用幾多咪 order 幾多？

答：係呀。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：你哋個科文都係咁。即係呢度你睇到可能幾個月之間，就已經用咗 80 磅或者 100 磅，好短嘅時間裏面已經用好多。如果你係真係跟陳小華嘅做法去做嘅話，咁其實都係好快又已經用咗唔止二十網咁少，明唔明？

答：我明白，可能有啲啲單唔齊，啲單。

主席：Okay，好呀。

問：葵聯我哋頭先就講過，就係話你唔敢肯定你第一次訂咗二十--即係開頭訂咗二十網，用完之後有冇再訂過？

答：係，係。

問：但係我記得你講啟晴，你記得啟晴就係你落手訂嘅關於第一、二座嘅，就係冇經你手訂過錫線，對嘛？

答：冇，因為小華佢架步有咁嘛。

問：係嘞，呢度就係你講番，就係話你就依賴佢之前訂落啲啲，你就冇經你手訂？

答：冇。

主席：想問下你，雖然你打何標記工，去到啟晴邨嘅後期，即係你負責一、二座嗰陣時候，係咪都有係呢個多勞多得呢個制度畀你嘅呢？

答：冇，冇。

主席：吓？

答：返一日有一日。

主席：返一日工計一日錢？

答：係。

主席：唔。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：我哋就睇過啟晴邨嗰六座，有邊幾座係真係驗出有超咗標嘅即係食水咁，都唔係六座都有嘅，...

答：六座都有嘅，應該。

問：...一、二、四、五座都有，...

答：係。

問：...三同六就有。即係當然你可以話咁撞彩嘅啫，因為你就算用咗含鉛嘅物料，都唔係一定會滲咗入去嘅。咁但係一、二咁啱就係你負責嗰兩座，咁會唔會係因為你負責嗰兩座係因為即係用咗完全係偏多嘅錫條，所以先至統計上先至會即係有相對多我哋叫做中招嘅例子呢？

答：唔會，而家因為一、二座預製件多，喺大陸做落嚟啲啲。

問：預製件都係用中央採購返嚟啲啲件嘍咋嘛--啲啲焊料，...

答：即係喺大陸做...

問：...焊料都喺香港訂？

答：...佢連埋喉連埋盛，成個房吊--即係吊上樓嘅，即係多預製件，而家所以一驗出嚟咪多啲囉。

主席：係咪真係一、二多啲，預製組件？

答：佢係最--而家佢係最慢啲嘛，最慢佢咪啱啱成熟，係咪先？

主席：唔係，我知。但係我哋嗰陣時，譬如其實睇過嗰個...

石先生：我哋睇過個表係一、二、四、五都係驗出係有。

主席：唔係，預製組件，邊一個多啲？

石先生：預製組件呢個要睇睇。

B

B

C

主席：係呀。

C

D

D

問：但係我同你講，嗰個預製組件...

E

E

答：喺房口㗎嘛。

F

F

問：預製組件但係--預製組件需要焊料都係喺香港運上去嘅啫？

G

G

答：係。

H

H

問：都係關香港運上去嘅焊料，即是香港訂乜，上面就用乜，即係唔係話上面自己自把自為訂啲嘢㗎嘛？

I

I

答：係，係。

J

J

K

K

主席：你有冇份決定咩嘢焊料運上去？

L

L

答：冇，冇，冇，冇，冇。

M

M

主席：邊個話事？

N

N

答：後期嗰陣時，好後期嘅。

O

O

主席：我知，邊個話事？

P

P

答：邊個話事？

Q

Q

R

R

問：即係舉個例，你哋中央購咗一大炸嘅嘢返嚟，就去咗相對譬如話一、二座，三、四座，或者即係--你哋啲焊料全部去晒一個中央嘅地方擺嘅，係咪呀？訂番嚟，係咪呀？

S

S

T

T

答：係，係。

U

U

問：唔係話一、二嗰啲就送貨嚟，就擺一、二，唔係嘅？

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：唔會。

問：啲人送焊料嚟，就擺晒喺一個中央嘅地方嘅？

答：係。

問：咁邊個決定喺呢個中央嘅地方有一大堆焊料，又直又彎，邊個決定 send 啲乜嘢上大陸？

答：唔知。

問：唔知？

答：唔知。

問：咁但係食水含鉛...

主席：陳小華好似都話唔知個呵？

石先生：係冇乜嘢人知。

主席：係呀，唔。何標記有一個人知？

石先生：梁偉健都唔知，咁先要問過...

主席：係囉，個個都唔知嘅。

石先生：我今朝特登問一問梁生先嘅。咁但係...

主席：何生都唔知？何生。

問：但係你唔好理啲嘢喺邊度做，但係我哋講緊焊料，焊料都喺嗰度嚟嘅啫，係咪？

答：係。

問：同埋食水含鉛，你唔係淨係因為喺預製組件裏面啲焊料有鉛，因為你走廊啲係唔係預製，對嘛？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係。

問：你個層嗰啲走廊唔係預製，對嘛？

答：唔。

問：對。咁所以即係我問多你一次，即係當然我哋而家就即係都係摸索緊，就係一、二、三、四同埋五、六，就分三個人去即係主理，三、四裏面係有一座中咗招，有含鉛，五、六都有，但係一、二就係兩座都有，都即係相對唔少嘅。

答：唔。

問：咁即係我就想問下你，有冇可能即係睇番，就係即係三、四係--唔係，一、二係由於係你負責，咁你有冇可能係你主理之下，主要或者大部分都係用咗錫條，所以先至多咗，即係統計上好似多咗，一、二座有超標嘅情況出現呢？定係你一、二座，你都係冇呀，都係照做㗎咋，即係？

答：都係--唔係，都係照咁樣做，都係照--都係...

問：即係都係照粗嘅就係用...

答：係嘞，都係照咁樣做。

問：粗嘅就用錫線，幼嘅就用錫條，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：好嘞，你等一等先。我就想畀一畀陳小華先生佢所講過嘅一啲嘢，就畀你睇睇，睇下你有啲乜嘢嘅回應。你睇睇 K3 呢個 file。K3，陳小華先生嘅證人供詞，佢係用中文寫，咁所以就唔使帶耳筒翻譯。

答：唔。

問：47 段。47 段佢就回應你嘅證人供詞 7(k) 段，「黃貴雄喺佢證人供詞 7(k) 段就話佢喺葵聯邨二期嘅項目使用錫條係跟隨我的做法」，即係佢，即係陳小華，即係你話你係跟佢嘅做法，佢話佢唔同意。

睇下你嘅 7(k) 講咩嘢，2242，不過我譯番畀你聽，因為係英文嚟嘅。2242 你喺 7(k) 裏面，你就話你係葵聯--你係啟晴其中一個即係主理，有個兩座嘅主理人，你就喺葵聯嘅時候，你就用番喺啟晴邨

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

同樣嘅一個做法，就係用錫條。

咁即係話你係跟隨啟晴嘅做法，咁佢就唔同意，佢話佢同你一路都係將呢啲焊料叫做錫條，佢亦都有同你討論過用焊料，亦都有討論過錫條同錫線。

睇下最冠嗰度先，最冠嗰兩句，陳小華話冇同你討論過用咩嘢焊料或者焊料之間嘅分別，呢度你同意嘅，係咪？

答：吓？

問：你睇下最冠嗰兩句，陳小華佢話冇同你討論過用咩嘢焊料，...

答：冇。

問：...呢個你同意嘅，佢係冇同你講過，你同意？

答：係。

問：亦都有討論過錫條同錫線嘅分別？

答：冇。

問：冇討論過。但係佢話佢唔同意你喺葵聯二期用錫條係跟佢嘅，咁呢個你同唔同意？

答：咩嘢？再講多次。

問：你睇下第 47 段，佢頭嗰兩行，「黃貴雄」--即係總之陳小華佢話你話你喺葵聯邨二期用錫條呢個做法係跟佢，即係陳小華嘅啫...

答：跟啟晴。

問：跟啟晴，係咪呀？

答：係，啟晴。

問：咁但係就--okay，跟啟晴，得，我明，得。跟啟晴，而你覺得啟晴呢個做法係陳小華決定嘅，對嘛？

答：係。

問：唔會有第二個？



B

B

C

答：唔會。

C

D

問：跟住你睇睇--你等一等。有冇聽過龍逸邨？

D

E

答：有。

E

F

問：龍逸邨有聽過？

F

G

答：有。

G

H

問：龍逸邨係陳小華做打理嘅？

H

I

答：好似係啫。

I

J

問：係。你有冇喺呢個龍逸邨裏面扮演任何角色，幫手做或者盛？

J

K

答：冇。

K

L

問：冇，得個聽字嘅啫？

L

M

答：聽嘅。

M

N

問：咁你知唔知龍逸邨用咩嘢料，焊料？

N

O

答：唔知。

O

P

問：唔知。

P

Q

主席：葵聯邨之後，你下一個打理嘅地盤係乜嘢地盤？

Q

R

答：葵聯？

R

S

主席：邨之後。

S

T

答：我做完葵聯之後，跟住就有喺呢間公司做。

T

U

主席：走咗嘞？

U

V

答：走咗。

V

B

B

C

答：8月份嘅，一三--唔知14年定13年，走咗差唔多半--差唔多走咗半年嘅都。

C

D

主席：係囉，跟住又再返番去何標記，係咪呀？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

主席：係囉。你再返番去何標記，下一個打理嘅地盤係邊一個地盤？

F

G

答：我四圍走嚟走去個啲都係，而家有去水泉。

G

H

主席：水泉澳？

H

I

問：水泉澳？

I

J

J

K

答：係。

K

L

主席：第幾期，全部都係？

L

M

答：水泉一、二都有。

M

N

主席：一、二都...

N

O

答：同埋三、四都有。

O

P

主席：做打理？

P

Q

答：唔係。

Q

R

主席：做咩嘢？

R

答：做睇下--同佢跟下啲料嗰啲咁樣。

S

主席：跟下啲料。即係跟下啲咩嘢料--唔係，你實際上你個職位係咩嘢先？

S

T

答：都係打理。

T

U

主席：都係打理。

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：即係--唔係，唔係...

問：打理嘅意思就唔係成條邨一個做阿頂嗰個打理？

答：唔係，即係好似我老細鍾意叫我去邊，我咪去邊，係咪先？

主席：我知，我哋個個都係咁，我都係，咁但係你去做乜嘢先得㗎？

問：即係你個參與度，你係得個「睇」字，定係你有冇份去決定用咩嘢料，定係唔係嘅，我淨係走嚟望下，返去報告嘅啫？

答：望下，咪帶住啲工人點樣做嘢咁樣。

問：落手落腳做嗰個就唔係你？

答：唔係。

問：因為你知道好多種，落手落腳做肯定唔係你？

答：唔係。

問：最頂話事嗰個，每個 project 得一個嗰個，真嗰個打理又唔係你？

答：唔係。

問：你就係寫字樓會派你走去望一望有冇嘢需要跟進，有冇嘢唔掂咁樣，即係關注下咁樣？

答：係，係。

問：咁咪同梁偉健做啲嘢差唔多，係咪呀？

答：低佢一級咁樣。

問：低佢一級？

答：係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：類似咁嘅嘢，都係去了解一下個進程，唔識做又教下你咁？

答：係。

問：即係工人唔識焊料會問你嘅，使唔使--會唔會？

答：咩嘢？

問：工人唔識燒焊都會問你嘅，會唔會？

答：唔會。

問：唔會？

答：你請嚟返嚟啲師傅多數識燒。

問：Okay。即係問下佢哋料夠唔夠咁樣？

答：嘎。

問：料夠唔夠唔係應該打理決定嘅咩，佢知嚟喇？

答：咩嘢？

問：打理就係負責睇下啲料夠唔夠，咁你去睇咩嘢？

答：打理負責開會啲啲咁樣樣，負責開會。

問：你負責開會？

答：唔係我負責開會。

問：真個打理負責去開會，你落去巡下嘅？

答：即係落去幫頭幫尾咁樣。

問：Okay，得。即係冇一啲既定話你要做嘅嘢，但係總之就落去望下有冇嘢要幫手咁樣？

答：係。

問：有啲乜嘢，真個打理或者唔得閒，咁就可能要問你，因為你係公司派落嚟嘅？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：嘅。

問：你又係咁樣逐個地盤走㗎會，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：即係唔係淨係會長駐㗎譬如話水泉澳，唔會嘅？

答：唔會。

主席：我又想問下你，即係葵聯邨就係你最後一個地盤，就係 order--  
落單係 order 錫條又好，錫線又好，係咪咁呀？

答：係。

主席：跟住之後又有再 order 過？

答：係。

主席：亦都唔知道何標記以後做嗰啲公共屋邨係用乜嘢嘅焊料？

答：係。

主席：乜嘢都唔知？

答：係。

主席：即係係呢兩條屋邨你就知嘅啫，其他所有都唔知？

答：係。

主席：跟住何標記之後用嗰啲屋邨有問題、冇問題，你都唔知？

答：唔知。

主席：唔。

問：但係話時話，而家出咗事，即係報紙又賣晒，電視又影晒，咁你而家  
就知道原來點解食水驗出嚟即係含過量嘅鉛呢樣嘢，就因為原來啲焊

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

料就係訂咗一啲原來係唔合用嘅焊料，裏面原來係即係超咗標，啲鉛嘅含量。咁何標記其實內部有冇同番你哋講，「第時你哋有咩嘢去做打理，寫焊料，記住要寫乜」，有冇講番，而家事後？

答：有，而家有。

問：而家叫你寫咩嘢？

答：咩嘢呀？

問：而家事後同你講番咁以後會點寫？

答：以後寫番錫線。

問：寫番錫線？

答：唔。

問：使唔使寫無鉛？

答：咩嘢？

問：使唔使寫埋無鉛？

答：唔使。

問：唔使，係咪呀？寫咗錫線，明㗎嘞，係咪呀？

答：錫線應該明。

問：明㗎嘞？

答：嘎。

問：Okay。你同你哋寫字樓個女士，趙小姐或者黃慧萍佢哋，或者有個叫Caitlyn（譯音）嘅女士，你哋之間有冇交往，定係你，「我唔理㗎嘞，我填完張請購單，fax 番去就算㗎嘞」？

答：冇。

問：冇嘅？

答：冇。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：唔會打電話跟進嘅，你 fax 番去，啲人收到，自己識跑，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：亦都冇人走嚟問你，「你要呢件係乜東東嚟㗎？」冇嘅，全部你寫咗，佢明，咁你就算，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：請等一等吓。有幾張單想畀你睇睇，S1，86 頁-107。107，呢個係葵聯嘅，呢個「雄」係你嚟嘅，...

答：係。

問：...下面簽名呢個？

答：係。

問：跟住 108 嗰個「雄」都係你嚟嘅？

答：係。

問：得。跟住一連串都係你嚟嘅。咁就跟住睇番啟晴嗰啲送貨單，你睇睇跟住到到 186 頁。186，你確認呢個「雄」就係你嚟嘅，係咪呀？黃貴雄。

答：係。

問：186，總之簽嘅「雄」就係你，okay？

答：係。

問：我想同你最後問一問一個問題，就係即係你頭先我問到，就係話點解一、二座啟晴好似多咗啲，即係有啲即係...

答：預製件多。

問：係嘞，有啲含鉛會喺一、二座搵到，三、四或者五、六就唔係話真係座座都有，咁你就提到預製組件，但係我想知道即係點解你覺得關預製組件事，因為我頭先都同你講過，預製組件嗰啲焊料都係香港訂，然後之後中央訂上去嘅啫？

B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

問：咁所以如果係焊料嘅事，都係香港訂焊料嘅事，點解你覺得係關預製組件事？

D

E

答：而家你因為攞個水辦，就喺個房口個水龍頭攞，如果預製件嗰啲喉全部都喺房裏面做晒㗎嘛。

E

F

問：咁點呢？

F

G

答：所以咪多，都係一樣都係咁樣做，我哋都係。

G

H

問：即係你覺得啲焊料都係嗰啲焊料？

H

I

答：係。

I

J

問：咁但係你話一、二座...

J

K

答：個預製件多。

K

L

問：一、二座嘅預製件多？

L

M

答：係。

M

N

問：咁所以點呢，啲手工唔好，唔係？

N

O

答：唔係手工唔好，都係用嗰隻錫條可能。

O

P

問：係嘞，咁點解呢？就係你覺得嗰個問題。

P

Q

答：我都唔知點解。

Q

R

問：哦，okay，得，好。

R

S

石先生：我有其他嘅問題，主席先生。

S

T

主席：唔該。

T

U

林先生：主席。

U

V

V



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

林先生盤問

問：黃生，我想有啲問題問你嘅。

答：唔。

問：如果你去番 S1 嘅 102 先，或者因為呢個比較容易一啲處理。係，呢個主席就已經同你講咗，除咗 6 月 4 號嗰個巧合嗰樣嘢已經問咗，我唔再問。除咗 6 月 4 號之後，就係全部都係去到 3 月，14 年，全部都係用 50 力，係咪你見到？

答：係。

問：你就話可能有啲--雋景有可能有啲單，但係基本上你自己又唔記得有冇自己 order 過嘅？

答：係，唔記得。

問：錫線我講緊，係咪？

答：唔。

問：如果我哋睇番嗰個進度嚟講，我哋 6 月 4 號，我哋見到有 165 磅嘅 50 力，係咪？

答：係。

問：即係換句話講，你自己亦都知道有錫條同埋錫線嘅分別，係咪？

答：嘅。

問：因為你一定要咁樣講上去嗰個採購部，佢哋先至可以咁樣同你 order 到，啱唔啱？

答：係。

問：跟住落嚟，你 6 月，我相信係初期嘅階段，係咪？

答：係。

問：因為我哋有啲資料就話嗰個樣辦房就係 5 月 13 號，2013 年就做起，係咪？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係。

問：即係你個印象都係差唔多，即係 6 月 4 號你就即係只不過啱啱初期開始嘅時候？

答：唔。

問：咁你响 6 月就入咗 165 磅 50 力，就二十綑就係錫線，係咪？

答：係。

問：咁你用到 8 月，咁都要用 275 磅，係咪？

答：唔。

問：咁用咗又係用兩個月，就去到 10 月，咁又係二百零磅，又兩個月，啱唔啱？

答：唔。

問：咁去到 11 月，我相信比較--11 月就只不過 55 磅。唔係，11 月--sorry，55 同埋 110。即係換句話講，你嘅採購，即係每個月大概如果籠統啲計，百零或者 220 咁樣，係咪？

答：唔。

問：去到 12 月，即係個高峰期就過咗，係咪？

答：唔。

問：即係做完晒基本嘅需要，啱唔啱？係咪？

答：係。

問：咁基本上嘅需要，咁我相信去到 3 月嘅時候，就會係啲啲執漏，可能補啲啲咁嘅做法，啱唔啱？因為我見到中間都好似冇--唔需要再 order 其他，係咪？

答：唔。

問：啱唔啱？你又會同意我嘅講法，啲啲咁嘅減壓掣，其實會係最後期先至會用，係咪？

B

B

C

答：唔係...

C

D

問：即係意思整晒所有嘅工序之後，到到減壓掣就係你要之後先至裝上去，係咪？

D

E

答：唔係，因為佢有...

E

F

問：咁係幾時？

F

G

答：...配件嚟咗地盤，即係我啲伙計喺下面燒到一套套，放喺個架步，等佢差唔多批咗盪之後，我跟住就做，唔會...

G

H

問：但係你啲喉都未駁，因為如果你全盛期都係响--我哋睇到啲日子係8月、10月、11月嘅時候，全盛期你要駁晒啲喉先至要搞啲減壓掣？

H

I

答：唔係，你啲減壓掣係一套套燒咗放喺度先。

I

J

問：即係你嘅講法就係好早？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：有幾早？

L

M

答：佢有配件嚟咪可以燒得。

M

N

問：有配件嚟就燒得？

N

O

答：係。

O

P

問：唔係最後先至做？

P

Q

問：我想問你關於呢一度啲送貨單，係你去睇過送個咩嘢貨嚟，然後去簽，係咪？

Q

R

答：係。

R

S

問：即係換句話講，當時你無論係8月、11月，我見到係全部係有你嘅簽名，除咗有一張係一個阿富嘅，阿富係會係你嘅副手，會唔會係咁？

S

T

答：係。

T

U

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：咁佢係你副手嘅時候，咁你或者係阿富，都會點過晒當時嚟到嘅物料啱唔啱嘅，係咪？

答：係，係。

問：你嘅講法就係話--等我睇睇，你嘅講法就係話無論係瑞安，都會係有人响工地度係會知道有物料嚟，係咪？

答：係。

問：你知唔知瑞安 check 嘅係物料，會唔會包括小五金，你自己知唔知？

答：唔知。

問：你唔知？

答：係。

問：你亦都唔--响一個葵聯邨裏面，你自己亦都有畀過任何，或者瑞安亦都有畀過--要你攞任何關於小五金嘅 delivery note，係咪？

答：係。

問：即係換句話講，你响你口供度，就話佢哋應該知，咁呢個係其實你係估嚟咋嘛，係咪？

答：係。

問：冇實質嘅證據，或者冇實質嘅個人資料話瑞安一定知或者應該知，係咪？

答：係。

問：你估嘅啫。而二來，我就想問你關於嗰個--你嘅口供裏面，又話有要响工人攞住一卷卷咁樣去燒焊，係咪？

答：邊度？

問：你口供，你記唔記得你口供有講過話响工人就要--响燒焊工人攞住成卷去燒嘅？

答：佢做減壓掣咪用。

B

B

C

問：淨係做減壓掣嘅時候？

C

D

答：係。

D

E

問：咁做減壓掣，你話你响下面做嘅，係咪？

E

F

答：係。

F

G

問：即係响你自己嘅工地嗰度，...

G

H

答：係。

H

I

問：...工地自己做？

I

J

答：工場。

J

K

問：自己嘅工場？

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：你自己--你哋何標記裏面嗰間房裏面自己做？

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：有幾多個減壓掣？

O

P

主席：一棟樓。

P

Q

答：一棟樓而家好似 100 個啲同埋 80 個啲，...

Q

R

問：幾多個？

R

S

答：...都有成八套，而家好似 80 個啲有兩套。

S

T

問：100 就有八套，80 就有兩套，係咪？

T

U

答：係。

U

V

問：即係十套。咁要整幾耐？

V

B

B

C

答：咩嘢？

C

D

問：要整幾耐？

D

E

答：睇下嗰個工人嘅手工，快同埋慢。

E

F

問：大概呢，一個？

F

G

答：如果喺嗰個架步嗰度嵌一個差唔多成日，要...

G

H

問：要嵌一日？

H

I

答：...開埋料燒。

I

J

問：唔，唔。咁嗰個就係响減壓掣度就見到啲工人用呢啲咁嘅--我哋見到嗰個一卷卷嘅做，係咪咁呀？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：當時有幾多工人...

L

M

答：咩嘢？

M

N

問：...做呢一樣咁嘅減壓器？

N

O

答：一個。

O

P

問：一個工人做晒？

P

Q

答：係，係。

Q

R

問：唔。一個工人可以做得晒咁多個，即係做十日？

R

S

答：佢喺下面--唔係，佢喺下面嵌咗先，等佢如果喺大樓做得嗰陣時，先至搬上去，嵌上去。

S

T

問：唔。咁嗰個做焊嗰樣嘢係幾時做，係响下面做抑或大樓上面做？

T

U

答：焊係燒銀焊定走錫先？

U

V

問：我哋講緊錫線呢樣嘢。

V

答：錫線？

B

B

C

問：我哋而家講緊呢個減壓掣係用錫線，係咪你講緊？

C

D

答：係。

D

E

主席：唔係，咪住先。減壓掣上到去大樓上高用銀焊定係同錫焊？

E

F

答：大嘅配件用銀焊，細嘅配件就用錫線。

F

G

主席：咁有幾多個減壓掣係要大，有幾多個係要細？

G

H

答：如果好似 100 嘅有八個。

H

I

主席：100 嘅係大㗎喇？

I

J

答：係。

J

K

主席：100 mm，你係咪講緊？

K

L

答：係。

L

M

主席：直徑 100 mm？

M

N

答：係，係。

N

O

主席：咁嗰啲就用銀焊？

O

P

答：用銀焊，同埋 80 都係。

P

Q

主席：80 就得兩個咋嘢？

Q

R

答：唔係，80 都係有八個。

R

S

主席：80，八...

S

T

答：八個。

T

U

主席：咁大嘅幾多個？兩個呀？

U

V

答：大嘅都係有八個。

V

主席：大嘅又有八個。

B

B

C

C

D

問：咁頭先你又話一個八個，一個兩個嘅？

D

E

答：唔係，50 個啲就有兩個，50，50。

E

F

主席：又...

F

G

G

H

問：再重新嚟多次。100 嘅有幾多個？

H

I

I

J

主席：咪住先，一躉樓要裝幾多個減壓掣先？

J

K

答：四個 100。

K

L

主席：要四個 100？

L

M

答：唔。

M

N

問：四個 100。係，跟住呢？

N

O

O

P

主席：仲有呢？

P

Q

答：四個 80。

Q

R

主席：四個 80，仲有呢？

R

S

答：一個 50。

S

T

主席：一個 50？

T

U

答：係。

U

V

主席：咁九個？

V



B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

主席：係九個喇嘛？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

主席：前面嗰八個銀焊？

F

G

答：係。

G

H

主席：後面嗰個用錫焊？

H

I

答：用錫線。

I

J

主席：用錫線。咁用好少錫線個咋喎？

J

K

問：係喇，咁唔使擺二十網？

K

L

主席：係囉，咁好少個咋喎？

L

M

答：係呀。

M

N

N

O

問：係囉，咁你...

O

P

答：我--唔係，我有剩啲錫線擺嚟燒喉。

P

Q

問：即係有...

Q

R

主席：有剩你就要嚟燒喉。

R

S

S

T

問：係，燒咩嘢喉呢又？

T

U

答：50 喉。

U

V

V

B

B

C

問：燒 50 喉。咁又夠唔夠用？又要燒幾多 50 喉？

C

D

D

主席：燒 50 喉？

E

E

答：都話雋景啲單都話我唔知佢齊唔齊全，係咪先？

F

F

主席：你當佢齊全先，係咪？你當佢齊。我哋又諗唔到有啲咩嘢理由雋景要哋我哋。

G

G

答：唔。

H

H

主席：唔。

I

I

J

J

問：同埋你自己都唔記得你自己有冇 order 過，係咪？

K

K

答：係呀，係呀。

L

L

問：其實事實上你自己除咗 6 月 4 號知道收咗嗰個 sample 之外，你從來都有 order 過，係咪呀？

M

M

答：係。

N

N

問：係咩嘛？

O

O

答：唔記得。

P

P

問：唔記得定係呀？

Q

Q

答：唔記得。

R

R

主席：不如我哋食完飯先至再繼續，你諗清諗楚究竟有幾個減壓掣，仲有啲乜嘢掣係要用--唔係，我嘅理解應該都有個囉喎，係得減壓掣，冇乜嘢掣個囉喎。晏晝兩點半返嚟再繼續。

S

S

T

T

U

U

下午 12 時 52 分聆訊押後

V

V

B

B

C

下午 2 時 31 分恢復聆訊

C

D

出席人士如前。

D

E

主席：繼續，係。

E

F

林先生：係，主席。

F

G

G

H

何標記建築工程有限公司（“何標記”）（中國建築（啟晴邨）及瑞安（葵聯邨第二期）的分判商）的第六證人：黃貴雄（何標記地盤主管／監工（葵聯邨第二期的地盤主管及啟晴邨第一座和第二座的監工））宣誓繼續作供  
林先生繼續盤問

H

I

I

J

問：黃生，食晏之前，就主席就問你去諗清楚究竟係有幾多個呢啲咁嘅壓力掣係需要裝嘅時候係需要用呢個焊料同埋用邊一隻焊料嘅，你而家可唔可以講得到出嚟？

J

K

K

L

答：係咪焊線呀？

L

M

問：焊線，冇錯。

M

N

答：係。

N

問：唔好講錫紙啲啲，淨係錫線。

O

O

答：八套。

P

P

問：八套係...

Q

Q

答：八套，兩吋，八套嘅五十盒。

R

R

問：八套嘅五十？

S

答：係。

S

T

問：另外呢，另外仲有冇其他？

T

U

答：冇。

U

V

V

B

B

C

問：即係淨係八套啫？

C

D

答：係，八套，五十。

D

E

問：五十--我想請問你，如果你要焊，焊邊一個位？

E

F

答：焊啲配--响啲曲同埋叉。

F

G

問：同埋叉個位？

G

H

答：唔，同埋外瓦嘴。

H

I

問：需要用幾多網，一個？

I

J

答：如果好似一套咁樣，都係用一網嘅嘅咋。

J

K

問：一網？

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：即係用八網，換句話講，係咪呀？

M

N

答：係。

N

O

主席：一套用一網呀？

O

P

答：係。

P

Q

主席：好多嘍，一網好長嘍。

Q

R

答：係呀，佢有埋啲外瓦嘴啲嘅嘅。

R

S

主席：吓？

S

T

答：外瓦嘴，上...

T

U

主席：咩嘢...

U

V

答：外瓦嘴，上掣個隻。

V

B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

主席：得，唔緊要，因為我哋遲啲有呢一個建造業訓練局同埋呢一個職訓局嗰啲人嚟話畀我哋聽究竟你啱定唔啱。

D

E

E

F

問：但係至少你自己係冇落手落腳做過嘅？

F

G

答：冇。

G

H

問：你就係會你係根據啲工人話畀你聽--唔係，sorry，你點知道用一網呀？

H

I

答：咩嘢話？

I

J

問：你點知用一網？

J

K

答：我...

K

L

問：你自己冇落手落腳做過，你點知你工人用幾多？

L

M

答：唔係，我預計佢用一網。

M

N

問：你預計佢用一網？

N

O

答：預計，係。

O

P

問：用多用少你知唔知？

P

Q

答：咩嘢話？唔知，唔知。

Q

R

問：用多咗或者用少咗，你自己知唔知？

R

S

答：唔知。

S

T

問：咁你點預計？

T

U

答：咩嘢話？佢用--唔係，佢用剩咪放番嚟度，又用下一套。

U

V

問：至少你話就有八個，咁就用八網，其他呢，而家你有二十網？

V

答：唔。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：6月4號，其他點用呀？

答：咩嘢話？

問：其他嘅錫線用咗去邊，點用呀？

答：用剩咪放喺度。

問：就咁放喺度？

答：係。

問：當時2013年有冇用剩，你知唔知？

答：唔係好記得。

問：用剩嘅物料之後會點樣樣，係咪攤番去何標記？

答：唔係，喺地盤。

問：响地盤？

答：係。

問：咁點呀？就咁擺喺度？

答：係。

問：冇人用？

答：咩嘢話？

問：冇人用？

答：我唔係成日看住啲物料㗎嘛我，我要四圍...

問：你一定係看住物料嗰個嘅，因為你要--當你冇物料嘅時候，你要去order㗎嘛，你唔係看住物料嗰個，邊個看住？

答：我唔係成日睇住啲物料放喺度，邊個用、邊個用，我係見到佢冇，先至落order㗎嘛。

問：你就曾經响口供度講過，就話啲工人要成卷咁樣揸住嚟燒嘅，你有講

B

B

C

咗個原因，係咪？

C

D

答：唔。

D

E

問：你會同意有其他嘅工人就話係從來都係剪咗出嚟燒嘅，從來都唔會揸住成卷燒嘅，有啲工人，我問咗兩、三個都係咁講嘅，你同唔同意佢哋嘅講法，抑或你唔知？

E

F

答：我唔知。

F

G

問：你唔知？

G

H

答：唔。

H

I

問：即係你自己嘅講法又係亂講嘅？

I

J

答：咩嘢話？

J

K

問：你自己話啲工人揸住嚟燒嘅講法係唔啱嘅？

K

L

答：我話佢揸住一網嘅嚟燒就唔會整親隻手，即係一卷啲錫線。

L

M

問：你又點知？

M

N

答：吓？

N

O

問：你又點知佢會整親隻手，你都自己冇燒過？

O

P

答：我望到㗎嘛。

P

Q

問：你望到佢直情突然間整親手跌落地下咁樣？

Q

R

答：唔係。

R

S

主席：我想問下你，即係你哋成日都話要捫咁一大概，因為驚燒親隻手呢一個問題，你將啲個石油氣爐個火噴，你唔係燒啲條錫條，你燒啲個喉管嘅之嘛，啱唔啱呀？

S

T

答：係。

T

U

主席：你跟住就燒完--個喉管燒到熱，跟住你先至將條焊條炳上去之嘛，

U

V

V

B

B

C

等佢嗰啲焊條熔咗喺個管嘅上面之嘛，咁點會燒到隻手嘅呢？我成日都唔係好明。

C

D

答：唔係，佢一路燒個配件，你一路整個錫條落個配件，一路咁索入去。

D

E

主席：係，啱，我明，即係我嘅意思你揸住條錫條，條錫條就唔會熱嘅，嗰個喉管就會熱啫？

E

F

答：唔係，佢驚支槍射--即係噴傷嗰隻手。

F

G

主席：吓？

G

H

答：所以燒到一半，佢就攞㗎喇。

H

I

主席：咁你燒到--你燒燒燒到條喉管熱，你就炳上去喇嘛？

I

J

答：係。

J

K

主席：你驚你咪擺開囉。

K

L

答：等佢--唔係，驚佢熔唔晒嘛。

L

M

主席：吓？

M

N

答：佢要一路係咁燒...

N

O

石先生：佢意思係熔緊嘅時候都要燒住嘅，即係我諗佢意思係。

O

P

Q

主席：唔使喇，你可以燒熱啲㗎嘛？

Q

R

答：燒熱啲，你燒到太老，佢唔食㗎嘛。

R

S

主席：熱得滯又...

S

T

答：唔相食。

T

U

主席：呢樣嘢係第一次聽咋喎。

U

V

答：係呀。

V



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：熱得滯又唔熔㗎？

答：咩嘢話？熱得滯，燒得太過過老得滯，佢唔相食入去嘅。

主席：點樣唔相食入去？

答：即係燒得嗰個火太犀利得滯，嗰個錫條放落去...

主席：咁咪唔好理佢住，唔好理佢熱唔熱得滯先，咁都照計，你哋成日都話要怕熱，其實你呢隻手--如果呢隻右手用火嘅，呢隻揸住個錫嘅，你燒燒燒燒燒到咁上下，你咪擺開，跟住熔囉，凍咗之後咪再燒下佢囉。

答：唔係，佢通常燒到咁短都係攞㗎喇。

主席：我知燒到短會攞，我個問題就係你揸住嗰條錫條唔熱㗎嘛，啱唔啱呀？

答：係。

主席：你去到最後，你炳唔到落去，咁梗係要攞，係咪先？

答：唔。

主席：不過個問題就係你哋話燒到 10 m...

答：燒到十三、四...

主席：...-- 10 cm，4 吋就攞囉喎。

答：係呀。

主席：吓？

答：係呀。

主席：因為你哋永遠都係話「所以我慳唔到嘅，因為我要攞 4 吋嘅起碼都」。

答：唔。

主席：其實我個問題就話使唔使呀？你又唔係--如果你話我好似揸住支火柴咁樣樣，支火柴就快燒到尾，我就攞咗佢啫，你燒條喉吖嘛，你燒條喉，跟住炳落去之嘛，點解要...

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：通常啲伙記都係咁樣做法嘅真係，燒到差唔多...

主席：點解要好似揸住支火柴咁樣樣扒咗佢呢，剩番4吋都？

答：佢驚焗到隻手。

問：而家主席就話焗唔到。

主席：焗唔到咩嘛。

問：你明唔明呀？

答：我聽到。

問：你聽到。

主席：再焗啲咪戴住對勞工手套囉。

問：同埋個個都戴勞工手套㗎嘛其實，㗎唔㗎呀？

答：唔。

問：係囉，根本上係焗唔到，你嘅講法其實係唔正確嘅，你同唔同意？

答：唔同意。

主席：即係呢個咁話浪費好多其實冇咩錢，就係...

答：嗰啲伙記唔會同你慳嘅。

主席：我知伙記唔會同佢慳，不過個問題都唔係咁多啫，我想話就係，

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

因為啲水喉公司上嚟就話畀我聽「其實我哋冇心嘅，因為慳唔到幾多。」即係我就喺度諗諗下，點解要攞佢啫？點解咁長就要攞啫？

問：你諗唔諗到點解？

答：咩嘢話？

問：你諗唔諗到頭先主席話嗰個點解？

答：唔係，而家好似通常啲伙記都係咁樣做嘅真係，我諗唔到。

問：或者咁樣講，黃生，你同唔同意？其實就冇人就會成嚟、成卷咁樣擺住去燒嘅，因為咁樣做法係唔方便嘅，即係開工唔方便嘅，你同唔同意？

答：唔同意。

問：你今日响呢個食晏之前就係講關於善明邨，我有啲問題想問你嘅，你哋公司鄭生就話所有其他嘅屋苑，佢哋何標記做嘅全部都係用 FRY 嘅，你知唔知？

答：唔知。

問：你又知唔知善明邨其實响 5 月 18 號，我文件就一時攞唔到，但係我知道個資料就係 5 月 18 號 09 年就同房署入咗個 submission 嘅，你自己又知唔知？

答：唔知。

問：就係用 FRY 嘅。

答：唔知。

主席：邊個「你自己」？佢入呀？

問：唔係，你哋何標記？

B

B

C

答：唔知。

C

D

D

林先生：唔係，係何--sorry，瑞安入咗。

E

E

主席：瑞安入善明邨係入“FRY”嘅。

F

F

G

G

問：係要用“FRY”嘅，你知唔知？

H

H

答：唔知。

I

I

J

J

石先生：我想請問林大律師係咪即係瑞安搵到啲文件，而家嚟緊會...

K

K

林先生：未搵到文件，但係有人話畀我聽。

L

L

石先生：你知道？

M

M

林先生：知道個日子啫。

石先生：因為我都想知道頭先嗰個就係話如果有文件 submit 過係...

N

N

主席：善明邨係咪用錫曲？

O

O

石先生：係。

P

P

Q

Q

答：係。

主席：係咪呀？

R

R

答：係用錫曲。

S

S

T

T

林先生：佢哋用--好似--係，係用錫曲嘅。

U

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：但係响 5 月 27 號 09 年，就房署就係 approve 咗要用“FRY”嘅，你又知唔知？

答：唔知。

主席：即係你嘅意思，如果我有理解錯誤嘅，就係就用錫曲就係完全唔使事後做補救嘅，完全唔需要用嗰啲 FRY 99C，跟住有啲咩嘢問題嘅時候去補嘅？

答：係。

林先生：主席，我有其他問題。

MR PENNICOTT 盤問

問：Mr Wong, good afternoon. I represent China State and I want to ask you a few questions, not many, because Mr Shieh and Mr Lam have already covered quite a few areas already. First of all, can I ask you this: over what period of time precisely were you block supervisor for blocks 1 and 2 at Kai Ching?

答：2012 年 4 月。

問：Until when?

答：直至年尾。

主席：直至乜嘢話？

答：12 月，年尾。

主席：2012 年嘅 12 月？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：2012年年尾。

問：For a period of eight months; is that right?

答：係。

問：When you arrived at Kai Ching in April 2012, what plumbing works had been carried out already on blocks 1 and 2?

答：排喉、房喉、外牆膠喉、天面同埋啲渠。

問：Was it Mr Chan Siu Wah who was, as it were, in overall charge of that work before you arrived?

答：係。

問：Prior to April 2012, I think you told us that you were working on the Un Chau Estate Phase 5. Is that right?

答：係。

問：That comprised three blocks?

答：係。

問：Is it your evidence that solder, of any type, was not used on that project?

答：冇，冇。

問：It's not your evidence it was used? Was silver brazing used?

答：銀焊有。

問：All right. Now, prior to Un Chau, as we have heard, you were working on a Shui On estate called Shin Ming; is that right?

B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

問：We know that Shin Ming was completed in 2011. Do you recall that?

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：Mr Shieh earlier suggested that it might have started in about 2009. Let's assume that's right. You started with HBK in 2003. What other projects were you involved in between 2003 and 2008?

F

G

G

H

答：裝潔具同埋做膠喉，同埋裝水錶，仲有四圍去個個地盤，人哋起咗貨嗰度執水。

H

I

I

J

主席：係邊幾條邨，佢想知道。

J

K

答：唔係好記得。

K

L

主席：2003至2009喺邊幾條邨度做嘢？

L

M

答：唔係好記得。

M

N

主席：唔記得？

N

O

答：唔。

O

P

主席：畀啲例子我哋。

P

Q

答：海麗邨。

Q

R

主席：海嘢嘢？

R

S

主席：海麗邨，仲有呢？

S

T

答：都唔係好記得。

T

U

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：Let's see if we can jog your memory. Would you look at or be shown H1/121. Mr Wong, just to explain very briefly, this is a list of contracts carried out by Shui On, and you will see in the middle column a heading "Subcontractors"; do you see that? Do you follow?

答：睇到。

問：Just by way of example, let's look at item 3, Ching Ho Estate. HBK was the subcontractor. It was 2006. Were you involved in that estate?

答：冇。

問：What about the next one, Choi Ying?

答：冇。

問：The next one, Lam Tin?

答：藍田，淨係裝潔具。

問：Okay. What about Yau Lai, the next one?

答：油麗邨，未做過。

問：Okay. Then could you be shown, please, F2/1340. You can put that file away, Mr Wong. Mr Wong, this is a similar list but in relation to China State. Again, if you just cast your eye down the names of the estates, the first nine items, do you recognise any of those, to save me going through them one by one? Forget number 5, I'm sorry.

答：喺海麗邨做過。

問：Doing the sort of work that you describe, it that right?

答：係，係執水。



B

B

C

主席：咩嘢叫執水？

C

D

答：即係好似個--如果好似個潔具爛，咪換潔具囉，同埋個龍頭爛，咪換龍頭。

D

E

主席：漏水呢？

E

F

答：吓？

F

G

主席：漏水？

G

H

答：嗰啲係攞枱配件嚟嗰啲。

H

I

主席：都會漏水㗎。

I

J

答：吓？

J

K

主席：都會...

K

L

答：少。

L

M

問：So is this right then, Mr Wong, that the first time that you personally had ever encountered soldering of copper pipes was on the Kai Ching project?

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：Was the Kai Ching project the first and only time you had worked with Mr Chan Siu Wah?

O

P

答：係。

P

Q

問：One of the common denominators of Kai Ching, Kwai Luen, Un Chau and Shin Ming was the licensed plumber, Mr Lam Tak Sum. Is he a gentleman that you know?

Q

R

答：唔識。

R

S

問：When you were supervising the plumbing construction in blocks 1 and 2 at Kai Ching, were you never

S

T

U

T

U

V

V

B

B

C

introduced to him?

C

D

答：冇。

D

E

問：So, similarly, you were never introduced to him on the other three projects either; is that your evidence?

E

F

答：冇。

F

G

G

H

主席：即係冇同佢傾過偈？

H

I

答：淨係佢嚟地盤，淨係帶我哋去擺錶同埋去擺水辦，跟住驗水，淨係呢三次，其時...

I

J

主席：擺水錶？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

主席：去邊度擺水錶？

L

M

答：去水務局，要佢簽名去擺水錶㗎嘛。

M

N

主席：擺水錶，驗水。

N

O

主席：最遲入--擺水辦，最遲即係出水紙之前擺水辦？

O

P

答：係。

P

Q

Q

R

問：Do you ever recall Mr Lam inspecting any of the plumbing works at blocks 1 and 2?

R

S

答：冇。

S

T

問：Mr Wong, do you agree with this general proposition, that the sequence of construction of the plumbing works was, firstly, the common areas, including the corridors; do you agree with that? That was the first

T

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

stage of works?

答：係。

問：Then with some overlap, then next the individual units?

答：我唔明，再問多一次，我唔明。

問：Yes. Broadly, I am putting to you, Mr Wong, is it goes common areas, individual units, external areas. Do you agree with that sequence, as a general point, in terms of...

答：我第一時間係做走廊先，係做走廊先嘅，跟住先做房口。

主席：最耐外牆？

答：係。

問：Mr Wong, to the best of your recollection, in about June-July of 2012, was the plumbing works proceeding in all six blocks in tandem -- to the best of your recollection?

答：唔記得。

問：A different topic. Can I ask you please to be shown again S1/186. Mr Wong, this is a delivery note that Mr Shieh showed you earlier, and it's signed by you?

答：係。

問：As I understand it, it is for materials exclusively for blocks 1 and 2; is that right?

答：係。

問：You refer in your witness statement to you having the

B

B

C

C

authority to order materials from head office in the latter stages of the project. How do you define "latter stages"? Obviously we've got October 2012 here. How do you define "latter stages"?

D

D

E

E

答：即係差唔多趕貨嗰陣時，趕貨嗰陣時。

F

F

問：When these materials arrived on site, you obviously took delivery of them, you checked them and you signed the delivery note; is that right?

G

G

H

H

答：係。

I

I

問：Then you personally would, or perhaps with others, take the materials to blocks 1 and 2; is that right?

J

J

答：係。

K

K

問：Could I then ask you to be shown S1/160 -- the same file, page 160. This is a delivery note dated 25 May 2012, and you will see the third item on there, Mr Wong, is 100 reels of FRY 99C lead-free solder. Do you see that?

L

L

M

M

答：睇到。

N

N

問：Can you help us with this: when 100 reels of FRY lead-free solder turned up at the site and delivery was taken, how would it be distributed amongst the six blocks?

O

O

P

P

答：佢放喺 3、4 座個架步嗰度，你要問佢擺囉。

Q

Q

R

R

問：My understanding, from other evidence, Mr Wong, is that certainly by about June-July 2012, there was in fact a workshop for HBK in each of the six blocks. Do you agree with that?

S

S

T

T

答：係。

U

U

問：Are you saying that the storage of materials was only in blocks 3 and 4?

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係呀，佢分派畀我哋㗎嘛。

問：Right, but you had to go and fetch the material from the blocks 3 and 4 workshops if you wanted that material; is that right?

答：係。

問：Was there a process by which you had to, as it were, sign out for any of the materials that you took from the workshop, or could you just go and help yourself?

答：唔使簽嘅。

問：Okay.

主席：既然中央統籌，點解要畀你哋去 order 啲嘢呢？即係如果啲嘢都去晒陳小華第 3、第 4 座嗰度擺㗎喇？

答：係。

主席：咁點解又要你又可以 order、范秀鵬又可以 order、嗰個又可以 order 呢？陳小華一個都知道究竟有貨定冇貨，剩番幾多焊料。

答：唔係，你因為去到中期，佢淨係僱住第 3、第 4 座起貨，就唔理我 1、2、5、6，所以啲料一到咗地盤，就佢 3、4 座要晒先㗎喇，所以我哋先同我哋老細講話授權我哋真係而家自己可以請購表擺物料。

主席：但係就依然都係送去第 3、第 4 座？

答：唔係，到中段嗰陣時，我哋落單就去番我哋 1、2 座或者五--而家或者 5、6 座。

主席：咁嗰度就你哋自己收貨？

答：係。

主席：譚國豪係邊一個嘅伙記㗎喇？

答：唔係，佢又係公司工㗎嘅又係。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：我知，佢係通常係...

答：管工嚟，又係。

主席：佢係邊座嘅管工？

答：最褻扈陳小華一走，咪輪到譚國豪。

主席：係囉，因為我睇番實際上你收貨嘅送貨單唔係咁多嘅咋喎。

答：係。

主席：你收貨嘅送貨--即係就住啟晴邨嚟講，都係得嗰兩、三單係你收貨嘅咋喎，2012年11月15號，第190頁，就寫住你收貨，不過呢個係收銀焊支嘅。

答：係。

主席：錢德成係你嘅伙...

答：唔係，又係陳小華伙記。

主席：又係陳小華，係囉。

答：係。

主席：2012年10月20號，呢個第186頁就係你簽，得110磅，再之前，184，譚國豪，呢個唔係你嘅人嚟㗎嘛？

答：唔係。

主席：係囉。再之前就係180頁，就係梁偉健收，寫住聯絡人黃貴雄，呢個係咪都係代--同你收㗎？第180頁係咪同你收㗎，第1、2座？

答：而家因為張張請購表都差唔多有佢名，梁偉健。

主席：係，我知，即係你喇，係咪？

答：係。

主席：咁冇㗎囉喎，之前嗰啲陳小華㗎喎，係咪呀？即係實際上你order嘅貨係真係好少、好少嘅咋喎，如果你話你--即係如果你所講嘅正確嘅話。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係。

主席：吓？

答：係。

問：Just on the further question of delivery notes, could I ask you please to go to your witness statement, at K3, page 2244. At subparagraph (d), at the bottom of the page, Mr Wong, you say: "Further, we had to inform the main contractors as well as the HD staff of all materials delivered to site for incorporation into works. If they requested copy of delivery orders of the soldering materials issued by Prosperity, I would give to them."

Mr Wong, so far as Kai Ching is concerned, were you ever requested by anybody at China State to give them a copy of a delivery note or an order?

答：冇。

問：To the best of your understanding, was there any instruction from HBK's head office that the main contractor, China State, should be given copies of the delivery notes, as far as you are aware?

答：冇。

問：Could I ask you please to be shown a photograph at bundle A1, page 714. Look at the photograph, the second one from the bottom. You should see there a photograph of a 100 millimetre diameter pressure-reducing valve, copper alloy. Do you see that?

答：見到。

問：I know others have touched on this before, but I just want to try to get it clearer. What is your

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

understanding of how solder would be used in relation to this pressure-reducing valve, if any?

答：佢有個--而家佢有一個法蘭，就有個杯，咁條喉插落去，咁就燒完，跟住燒個瓦嘴，跟住上掣。

主席：好難譯㗎喎，呢個真係。咪住先，唔好咁複雜，呢個係咪 reducing valve 嚟嘅先，係喇，係咪？呢個係 reducing valve。

答：係。

主席：因為我淨係睇到--如果你要駁呢啲，就應該係咪用個啲啲叫做 flange 呀？側邊啲 flange，就咁樣樣上螺絲嘅之嘛，唔使用燒焊㗎嘛，啱唔啱呀？我嘅理解。

MR PENNICOTT: That's my understanding, Mr Chairman and Mr Wong.

問：So explain the relationship between pressure-reducing valves and the use of solder, please, Mr Wong.

答：係有個法蘭，如果駁銅喉，就插條銅喉落去燒，跟住燒番個瓦嘴，上掣，就係咁樣之嘛。

主席：有個法蘭，...

答：就有收到個...

主席：即係 flange 喇？

答：係。有個法蘭餅同埋有個玉，就插條喉落去，就走番銀焊。

主席：走番銀焊？



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係。

主席：你頭先唔係話要走錫焊嘅咩？

答：而家呢個 100 嚟㗎嘛，呢個。

主席：哦，100 就走銀焊？

答：係。

主席：咪住先，呢個啲唔係兩條水喉由一邊去到另外一邊，中間經過呢個咁樣嘅裝置嘅咩？

答：係。

主席：咁點樣又要插乜嘢嘢落去邊一度呢？

答：你駁番銅喉嘛。

主席：係，我知道要駁銅喉，你條銅喉就梗係駁一邊㗎喇，係咪？

答：兩邊都要駁。

主席：我知兩邊，我哋而家用一邊做例子先，咁啲條銅喉插入去呢個個...

答：個法蘭。

主席：法...

答：加個法蘭先。

主席：係，加個...

答：鐵嘅法蘭。

主席：喺出面？

答：係。

主席：喺條喉嘅上...

答：係，跟住有啲個肉，啲個銅肉。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：呢啲唔係上螺絲嘅咩？

答：上螺絲，佢咪配法蘭，但要配啲鐵法蘭，駁銅嘅鐵法蘭。

主席：係吖，咁跟住點樣樣仲要用 solder 呢？

答：唔係，佢個配件係咁樣吖嘛。

主席：我知。

黎先生：啲啲焊料喺邊度加落去？

主席：都唔使用焊料。

黎先生：佢話要用焊料吖嘛，你？

主席：你話要用焊料吖嘛？

答：而家係--唔係，如果係 50 嘅減壓掣，就用焊料燒啲配件。

主席：而家你--如果呢個係 100，呢個而家我哋睇到嘅係 100，佢嘅意思  
-- Mr Pennicott 嘅意思，你根本唔需要用銀焊，銀焊都唔使用，  
上螺絲。

MR PENNICOTT: Either。

主席：Either, either。

MR PENNICOTT: No solder, no silver brazing.

主席：係囉，唔需要，上螺絲嘅之嘛，將兩條喉駁埋，喺啲度上螺絲，喺  
啲啲 flange 啲度上螺絲，包住佢，咁咪竊埋囉。

MR PENNICOTT: I'm just trying to establish the witness's  
understanding of the connection between soldering or  
silver brazing on the one hand and this...

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：即係根據你所講，係完全唔需要㗎嘛，呢個唔需要㗎。

答：係呀。

主席：呢個係五...

答：唔係，係要駁喉先至需要之嘛。

主席：我知梗係要駁喉喇，如果唔係，點樣樣 reduce 呢個 pressure 啫，啱唔啱呀？你啲喉係咪喺呢度咁樣樣穿過去？

答：唔係。

主席：唔係，咁喺邊度穿過去？

答：咪加個法蘭。

主席：你畫出嚟，擺張紙畫，你做咗二十幾、三十年水喉，識畫喇，係咪？畀張白紙佢，畀張 A4 白紙佢喇不如，畀支筆佢。而家有個咁上下嘅樣畀你可以抄，你話--我哋下低見到啲 gate valve 都係用 flange，一頭一尾，一頭一尾啲水管駁埋去，跟住就上螺絲㗎喇嘛。

答：唔。

主席：擺上嚟畀我。唔明啫，對唔住，我諗冇乜人明啫，畀佢哋睇下先。可能 Mr Yeung 會明，佢讀工程啲啲，我唔知。

楊先生：我真係唔知。

主席：如果有人明嘅，解釋畀我聽。等一陣先，keep 住先，畀番佢先。我就畫得唔係幾好，如果呢個係呢個 reducing valve，係咪啲水喉應該咁樣駁呢？畀啲工程專家望一望。上螺絲，啲圈嗰度應該有啲 nuts and bolts 喺度上咗上去，畀後面啲睇下，唔該。

係喇，係咪應該咁樣駁？係咪咁樣上呀？係咪咁樣駁呀？

B

B

C

答：係。

C

D

主席：係囉，咁咪喺兩個 flange，法蘭呀你叫做，上個螺絲穿過去，跟住兩頭，一頭一尾上實佢，點樣樣用焊料呀？

D

E

E

F

楊先生：法官閣下，就因為呢個法蘭就係個位置同埋厚度，呢度會有--即係你正話主席畫個位置，呢度嚟講，要焊咗佢。

F

G

石先生：最簡單嘅方法就係叫個證人搵支紅筆畫咗邊度佢會落焊，話畀佢聽，最好就係。

G

H

H

主席：邊度要落焊料，你寫喇，係喇。

I

I

石先生：有冇紅筆？畀支紅筆個證人，你叫佢喺嗰度用紅筆畫啲焊料喺邊度。

J

J

主席：即係喺個法蘭嗰度，個邊嗰度同個喉管嘅外圍？

K

K

楊先生：係。

L

L

主席：得，明白。唔好喇，不如擺埋嚟，等我畫埋，問下佢係唔係喇。

M

M

石先生：Okay。

N

N

主席：擺支紅筆嚟。係咪咁嘅意思呀？Mr Yeung。

O

O

楊先生：係，咁樣上，就...

P

P

主席：即係當然我哋睇到一邊，係咪？

Q

Q

楊先生：係，冇錯。

R

R

畀埋佢哋睇，問下佢係咪咁先。

S

S

答：係。

T

T

主席：係，得，畀啲律師望。啱唔啱呀？黃生，啱咩嘛？

U

U

答：啱，啱。

V

V

B

B

C

主席：啱。如果係咁，做八個都用唔到一卷喎。

C

D

答：咩嘢話？

D

E

主席：我當你幾多話？70呀？50呀？嗰個喉嘅...

E

F

楊先生：50。

F

G

主席：嗰個直徑50，我當你個--嗰個叫做乜嘢呀？

G

H

楊先生：圓周。

H

I

石先生：Circumference, pi。

I

J

主席：吓？

J

K

楊先生：圓周。

K

L

主席：圓周？

L

M

石先生：圓周，圓周。

M

主席：係，有數計吓，我唔記得咗。

N

楊先生： $\pi^2 r$ 。

N

O

O

P

主席：都係好少嘅咋喎，點用到成卷咁嘅焊料呀？

P

Q

答：唔係，佢有剩嗰啲攞嚟燒喉。

Q

R

主席：又有剩攞嚟燒喉而家？

R

S

答：唔。

S

主席：一卷都可以燒晒八個喇，有多添呀可能，點答呀？

T

答：有剩攞嚟燒喉囉。

T

U

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：好，繼續，唔該，yes。

問：I am going to move on, Mr Wong.

主席：呢個 keep 番實佢，呢個我哋做 exhibit，畀個編號佢。

問：I'm going to move on. Can I just ask you this question, Mr Wong: do you agree that gate valves don't require any soldering?

主席：下面呢一隻。

答：係咪即係減壓掣呀？

主席：呢隻，gate valve。

答：呢一隻就唔使。

問：What about stopcocks; do they need soldering?

主席：呢啲我哋上面未曾即刻識譯到，stopcock，楊律師，stopcock。

MR PENNICOTT: It's the photograph at 717, if it helps.

主席：我哋去 717 睇下。

楊先生：停水掣，法官閣下。

主席：係，呢隻。

答：活塞即係咩嘢，活塞？

主席：吓？

答：活塞係咩嘢？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

主席：Stopcock。呢隻唔使，係咪呀？係咪呀？係咪唔使用 solder？

答：（沒有可聽到的回答）

MR PENNICOTT：The question is does he agree this doesn't need soldering?

答：係唔需要。

問：Okay. Just one last topic, Mr Wong. In your answers to Mr Shieh earlier, you made mention of the prefabricated units in Kai Ching; do you remember that?

答：係。

問：What was the purpose of making reference to the prefabricated units? Why did you refer to them? What were you trying to convey to the Commission?

答：先頭石律師講話點解我 1、2 座點解會有啲啲鉛水，驗出嚟啲啲水特別多啲，而家係 1、2 座係最遲嘅，佢所以係而家預製件係多啲嘅。

問：That's simply not right, is it, Mr Wong? Because the position is this: block 2 are most prefabricated units. Block 1 had the least prefabricated units. Yet the answer in terms of alleged excessive lead in the water was the same. So what's the connection that you are trying to make, Mr Wong?

答：表達都有乜意思。

MR PENNICOTT：Thank you very much.

主席：有人問喇嘛？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

殷先生盤問

問：黃生，我代表房委會嘅，我想同你跟進你嘅書面證人口供，係回答第8條問題嘅，如果英文嘅版本係2244，第(c)段嗰度，英文字母(c)嗰度，我想同你澄清啫，你嗰度似乎就話房署嘅人員就應該知道係用一啲含鉛嘅焊料嘅，因為--首先我想同你講一講，你嘅意思唔係話有個別嘅房署嘅人員同你講過話佢知，或者你同佢講話畀佢聽你用緊嗰啲焊料係含鉛嘅，唔係咁樣吖嘛？

答：係。

問：你嘅意思，即係你有同佢咁溝通過吖嘛？

答：冇。

問：你呢度只不過係話你自己估，你相信啲房署嘅人員係應該知道你用緊啲含鉛嘅焊料，你係咪咁講？

答：冇。

問：因為似乎你就話因為有鉛嗰啲焊料就一支支嘅，燒嘅時候都係揸住一支支嘅，無鉛嗰啲焊料就成卷咁揸住嚟燒嘅，似乎你嗰度作出個推論，就係話如果見到啲工人係揸住一支支咁嘅，嗰啲都應該知道係有鉛㗎喇，你係咪咁嘅意思？

答：唔係。

問：咁你係咩嘢意思，你可唔可以解畀我聽？

答：都係錫囉，嗰啲係。

問：而家我哋講緊兩種錫料吖嘛？

答：係。

問：我哋知道有一啲錫料係含鉛㗎嘛？

答：我唔知。

問：而家我哋呢度知道吖嘛。

答：而家就知。



B

B

C

問：你嗰個證人口供嗰度就話房署啲人員如果見到唔係揸住成卷嗰啲嚟燒，都應該知你係用緊一支支嗰啲散裝嗰啲，係咪咁解？

C

D

答：我唔知佢知唔知喎。

D

E

問：你唔知佢知唔知，咁得喇。

E

F

F

G

主席：仲有冇人有問題？冇。

G

H

好，唔該晒黃生，畀完證供，可以走得。

H

I

答：好，唔該。

I

J

J

K

主席：我哋或許 take 一個十分鐘嘅 break。

K

L

L

M

下午 3 時 26 分聆訊押後

M

N

下午 3 時 40 分恢復聆訊

N

O

出席人士如前。

O

P

P

Q

楊先生：主席，下一位證人係趙惠娟女士。

Q

R

主席：好呀。

R

S

何標記建築工程有限公司（“何標記”）（中國建築（啟晴邨）及瑞安（葵聯邨第二期）的分判商）的第七證人：趙惠娟（何標記採購部主任）以本地話宣誓作供  
楊先生主問

S

T

T

U

問：趙女士，就我哋知道嚟講，就係响上年嘅 12 月嘅時候，就 12 月 23

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

號嗰陣時你做咗一份證人口供嘅。

答：係。

問：但係最近嚟講，就前一、兩日，你就係睇完之後，你有啲嘢修改，你而家人咗一份修改嘅證人口供，就係由 1 至到 21 頁嘅？

答：係。

問：好喇，就請你戴起個耳筒，我就用英--因為你份口供係英文嘅，我打算用英文讀出嚟。

答：唔該。

THE GOVERNMENT OF  
HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION

Commission of Inquiry into  
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water

Re: Ho Biu Kee Construction Engineering Company Limited

**REVISED WITNESS STATEMENT OF CHIU Wai Kuen Jess (趙惠娟)**

I, CHIU Wai Kuen Jess (趙惠娟) (also known as Jess CHIU) Purchasing Officer of Unit 605, Tins Enterprises Centre, 777 Lai Chi Kok Road, Cheung Sha Wan, Kowloon, Hong Kong make this witness statement for the purpose of providing answers to those questions raised by Messrs. Lo & Lo (solicitors for the Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead in Drinking Water) in their letter dated 10th December 2015 to Messrs. Chiu, Szeto & Cheng (solicitors for Ho Biu Kee Construction Engineering Company Limited) and will say as follows:

**1. Question**

Describe the positions held by them in Ho Biu Kee and their scope of duties and responsibilities.

**Answer**

(a) I am the Head of the Purchasing Department of Ho Biu Kee Construction Engineering Company Limited ("Ho Biu Kee" or "the Company"). I report to **Ms WONG Wai Ping 黃慧萍** ("Ms. Wong"), who was at the material times and still is the Personal Assistant to Mr. HO Man Piu, the Managing Director of Ho Biu Kee. There are two other staff in the Purchasing Department namely, **Ms CHAN Wai Ling, Catlin (陳惠玲)** ("Catlin") who joined Ho Biu Kee in March 2012 and Ms. **TSANG Tsz Him, Purple (曾紫謙)** ("Purple") who only joined Ho Biu Kee in April 2015. Both Catlin and Purple worked under me. From time to time, I would assign work to these two ladies and they would report important matters to me.

(b) Within Ho Biu Kee, Mr. Kevin KWONG ("**Mr. Kwong**") was responsible for tendering and planning for the plumbing and drainage works in all building projects which included the 2 Estates (i.e. Kai Ching Estate and Kwai Luen Estate). Fresh water plumbing system was one of the items of works to be undertaken by Ho Biu Kee. It has been our general practice that after the tender was successful and sub-contracts were awarded to Ho Biu Kee by the main contractors, Mr. Kwong would provide the quantity of the materials anticipated in the plumbing sub-contracts to me (usually the billed quantity under measurable items) and I would seek quotes from suppliers. I would then prepare price comparison for consideration of Mr.

Ho Man Piu so that he could decide which materials suppliers Ho Biu Kee should place order with for their Supply and delivery of these materials. After Mr. Ho decided, I would secure supply contracts with the chosen suppliers with a remark there that the validity is subject to final approval by the Architect. I would also inform Mr. Kwong of the chosen materials. Mr. Kwong was then responsible for the submission of plumbing materials (covering copper pipe & fittings valves and solder material etc.). In respect of the 2 Estates, I understand that following the usual practice, Mr. Kwong also arranged samples of materials such as pipes, valves, fittings etc. to the main contractor of these 2 Estates (i.e. China State for Kai Ching Estate and Shui On for Kwai Luen Estate).

(c) However, as soldering materials were sundry items and not measureable items and the quantities of them would vary depending on the workmanship of workers there was no supply contract for them with material suppliers.

(d) When purchase orders would be issued depends on the works progress on site and when the materials were approved. From time to time, the supervisor/officer-in-charge would notify the Purchasing Department through written purchase requests how much materials would be ordered and when they should be delivered to site. Before I placed first purchase orders under each of the supply contracts, I would usually ask Mr. Kwong whether the materials had been approved or not. If the answer was affirmative, I would have no hesitation to cause the purchase orders be issued. However, if approval was not forthcoming, I would discuss with Mr. Ho and seek his agreement on whether to purchase or not. I wish to add that at the material times I was not aware that solder

materials required the approval of the Architect.  
Thus, I had never asked Mr. Kwong whether solder  
materials had been approved.

(e) Regarding the sundry materials for the fresh water plumbing system, the requirement (including what materials, quantity and when required) was stated by the supervisor/officer-in-charge of the site. These sundry materials included soldering material. They usually sent purchase requests to the Purchasing Department of Ho Biu Kee for placing orders with suppliers.

(f) When requests for purchase of sundry materials were received by the Purchase Department purchase orders would be prepared and issued to material suppliers for delivery to site of the materials so requested. For welding/soldering materials which were considered as sundry items, they would be supplied by Prosperity and purchase orders would be placed by us with them.

(g) Since I joined Ho Biu Kee in February 2009, Prosperity has been supplying the welding/soldering components and materials to Ho Biu Kee. From time to time, Prosperity provided to Ho Biu Kee price list of common sundry materials (typical one as **Annex A** dated April 2012). Prosperity updated and revised their price list at regular intervals. When we received updated price list from Prosperity, we would usually check and compare with the old ones to see what revision had been made and by how much. We would then talk to Prosperity (usually Mr. CHOW Ka Ping regarding pricing) and ascertain the reasons for increase. For those items which had substantial increase in unit rate, we might check the market prices from other suppliers to see if the rates offered by Prosperity would still be

competitive. If we found that Prosperity rates were significantly higher than the market, we would negotiate lower rates with Prosperity. This would usually end up with discount (say 5% to 10%) offered by Prosperity to its published rate.

(h) In any event, when we received request for supply of materials from Ho Biu Kee's site personnel in-charge, we would usually telephone the staff of Prosperity informing them of the particulars of materials which we would like to purchase and ask them to quote for them. As Prosperity had a standard price list for sundry items (such as the consumables for welding including soldering materials) they would usually revert and tell us that we could follow the standard price. Sometimes we might negotiate with them for a better discount; sometimes we might not. All depends on how urgent Ho Biu Kee wished to have the materials and what quantities.

(i) In the case of Kai Ching Estate, since Mr. Chan Siu Wah ("**Mr. Chan**") required solder strips in addition to solder wire, we therefore asked Prosperity whether they had these materials and the price. Mr. Chow Ka Ping of Prosperity told us that they had "英國 50 力扁錫條" available and the rates for supply of this could be found at the price list of Prosperity previously sent to Ho Biu Kee. We then prepared purchase orders setting out the quality of "錫線" and "錫條" requested by our site people and asked Prosperity to send them to the Kai Ching Estate site. In our purchase orders, we also set out the unit prices which were based on the Prosperity's price list.

j) For the sake of completeness and upon perusal of records kept by Ho Biu Kee in respect of Shui Chuen O Project (which is still ongoing), I wish to

point out that we had obtained quotation from Tung Wah Metal & Machinery Limited (東華五金機械有限公司) (“**Tung Wah**”), who is also one of our suppliers on their supply of 錫線”. The unit rate of “錫線” from Tung Wah was only HK\$67 per pound, which was significantly lower than that supplied by Prosperity (which was of about HK\$145 per pound (being of net price of HK\$160 per 500 gram and with 500 gram equal to 1.1 lb)). However since Ho Biu Kee had in business with Prosperity for many years and we had confidence in the quality of product supplied by Prosperity and further the sundry items did not take up much of costs, we therefore decided to purchase from Prosperity “錫線” for use in Shui Chuen O Project and other plumbing projects. There is now produced and shown to me marked **Annex B** the relevant documents evidencing the above.

(k) Within Ho Biu Kee, purchase orders with value below \$100,000 would be signed by Ms. Wong. For those above \$100,000, Ms. Wong would first check the purchase orders and Mr. Ho Man Piu would thereafter sign on behalf of Ho Biu Kee.

(l) Upon receipt of the purchase orders (which were usually sent by fax) Prosperity would arrange for delivery of materials to site. Upon receipt of materials, the officer-in-charge (and sometimes supervisors in charge of blocks) of each site would check that the materials conformed to the delivery note. If yes, they would sign on the delivery notes with quantity marked and return copies of them to the head office of Ho Biu Kee. Prosperity would later send the original delivery notes (signed for acceptance by Ho Biu Kee’s site personnel) to the accounts office of Ho Biu Kee for payment application.

(m) If partial delivery was made by Prosperity and

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

the total quantities did not match with the quantity we ordered in the purchase orders, the purchase orders issued before would be revised and resent to Prosperity. When delivery was made, Prosperity would submit invoice for the quantity actually delivered. Thus there could be several invoices for the same component but for different quantities delivered at different times.

## 2. Question

Describe their background, qualifications and experience in the plumbing industry and in the procurement of plumbing materials, in particular, soldering materials for the jointing of fresh water pipes

### Answer

I was a secondary school Form 5 graduate. I had also studied elementary accounting. I have worked with Ho Biu Kee since around February 2009. Prior to that, I worked for more than 20 years in the purchasing and procurement department of World Houseware Group (including its subsidiary, Southern Plastic Materials Plastic Products Co. Ltd. (南塑建材塑膠制品)) which manufactured and supplied PVC pipes for plumbing and drainage. Prior to joining Ho Biu Kee, I did not have previous experience in metal pipes (including copper pipes) and soldering materials for jointing of fresh water pipes.

## 3. Question

Confirm whether they were responsible for procuring soldering materials for jointing the fresh water pipes in the 2 Affected Estates and for placing the related orders for soldering materials with Prosperity.

### Answer



I was responsible for the procurement of soldering materials for jointing the fresh water pipes in the 2 Affected Estates and for placing the related orders for soldering materials with Prosperity. In carrying out the aforesaid work, I was assisted from time to time by Catlin. Ms. Wong was also involved and supervised my work

#### 4. Question

Confirm whether they were aware that soldering materials for the purpose of jointing fresh water pipes must be lead-free.

#### Answer

At that time, I was NOT aware that soldering materials for the purpose of jointing fresh water pipes must be lead-free.

#### 5. Question

Explain and describe the instructions given by Mr Chan and/or Mr Wong and/or Mr Kwong and/or any other person(s) from Ho Bui Kee to each of the Procurement Staff in relation to the procurement of soldering materials for each of the 2 Affected Estates.

#### Answer

(a) Mr. Kwong is not and was not at all material times attached to the Purchasing Department of Ho Bui Kee and I do not work under Mr. Kwong. Hence Mr. Kwong did not give me any specific instructions on or was ever involved in procurement of soldering materials for any estates including the 2 Affected Estates. Soldering materials were sundry items and Mr. Kwong was never involved in procurement of them.

(b) After site works commenced at Kai Ching Estate,

Mr. Chan (the person-in-charge of site work for Kai Ching Estate plumbing and drainage sub-contract) requested that soldering material in the form of solder strips and solder wire be supplied for the plumbing works in Kai Ching Estate project.

(c) At the material times, we (i.e. all staff of the Purchasing Department of Ho Biu Kee) did not know that solder strips might contain lead; nor did we pay attention to whether solder strips contained lead or not as we were not aware of the requirements that solder strips should be "lead-free". In following up Mr. Chan's request we simply asked for the supply of "solder strips" (錫條) from Prosperity. We did not request for particulars brands of "solder strips" or specify what metal content the "solder strips" should contain or should not contain.

(d) As the costs of soldering materials were not expensive and we had long history of working in collaboration with Prosperity, we then placed orders with Prosperity for their supply of "solder strips" to comply with Mr. Chan's request. In response to our request for "solder strips" Ho Biu Kee was then supplied with "英國 50 力扁錫條" by Prosperity.

(e) A similar request for solder strips was made by Mr. Wong Kwai Hung ("**Mr. Wong**") in respect of Kwai Luen Estate project. We also complied with his request and placed order with Prosperity for their supply of "solder strips" (錫條). Again "英國 50 力扁錫條" was delivered to site by Prosperity.

(f) Moreover I myself did NOT check or verify whether the request for soldering materials were those specified in the submissions of materials to the HA.

**6. Question**

Explain and describe how they placed orders for soldering materials with Prosperity. Confirm whether they have informed Prosperity that the soldering materials ordered were to be used for the jointing of fresh water pipes. If they have not informed Prosperity that the soldering materials to be supplied were to be used for jointing fresh water pipes, explain the steps they took to ensure that Prosperity would deliver soldering materials suitable for jointing fresh water pipes.

**Answer**

- (a) For placing orders for soldering materials with Prosperity, please see my Answer to Question 1 above.
- (b) As explained in my Answer to Question 1, Prosperity has been supplying the welding/soldering components and materials to Ho Biu Kee for many years. Prosperity was at the material times widely known in the plumbing trade as a reliable supplier for pipes and consumables for plumbing work.
- (c) As far as I am aware, in the course of dealing with Prosperity for preparing soldering material samples and details for approval Mr Kwong told them that the solder materials would be required for jointing water pipes in public housing estates. Prosperity then proposed that Ho Biu Kee should use "FRY" lead-free solder wire and Powerflow Flux and gave the corresponding samples and details to Mr. Kwong. On the basis of these information and sample materials, Mr. Kwong then prepared submission on behalf of Ho Biu Kee to the main contractors/HD. Therefore I believe that Prosperity, in fulfilling Ho Biu Kee's

orders for soldering materials (solder wire and solder strips), was aware or made aware that the soldering materials were to be used for the purpose of jointing fresh water pipes in public housing estates.

(d) It is against the aforesaid background that I came to belief that Prosperity would supply Ho Bui Kee with material complying with the requirements required by the Water Supplies Department ("WSD").

(e) Since the soldering material was sundry in nature and inexpensive, I did not seek advice from Mr. Kwong on the suitability of solder strips.

(f) Apart from informing Prosperity the name and particulars of the site (i.e. Kai Ching Estate and Kwai Luen Estate), I did not personally inform anybody of Prosperity that the soldering materials ordered were to be used for the jointing of fresh water pipes.

## 7. Question

On the basis of the Purchase Records, a Summary is enclosed and a total of 43 transactions for the procurement of soldering materials have been identified in respect of the 2 Affected Estates (Enclosure 1).

(a) In relation to Kwai Luen Estate, 12 transactions were made by the purchasing department between April 2013 and August 2015:

### Question 7(a)(i)

(i) Identity the person(s) among the Procurement Staff who placed the purchase orders for soldering materials in respect of Kwai Luen Estate and those who determined

which type or brand of soldering materials should be ordered and acquired from Prosperity and explain the reasons and bases of his/their decision.

**Answer 7(a)(i)**

- (a) As the purchase orders for Kwai Luen Estate could not be located, I could not tell precisely whether it is me, Catlin or Ms. Wong who actually placed the orders for the first 11 transactions. For transaction 12, the request from site was dated 28 July 2015 and the corresponding order was issued on 13 August 2015. This order was prepared by Catlin and signed by Ms Wong. In any event and as explained in my Answer to Question 1 above, we only followed the request of site personnel-in-charge of Kwai Luen Estate (i.e. Mr. Wong) on the soldering materials and placed orders with Prosperity for "solder strips" (錫條) and/or "solder wire" (錫線) without specifying what type or brand from Prosperity.
- (b) Based on the materials request form sent by Mr. Wong, Ho Biu Kee asked for the supply of "solder strips" (錫條) from Prosperity and Ho Biu Kee was then supplied with "英國 50 力扁錫條"
- (c) In respect of Mr. Wong's request for the use of "solder wire" (錫線), purchase orders were issued to Prosperity for supply of solder wire. Prosperity then supplied "FRY" lead-free solder wire.
- (d) In respect of transaction 12, we placed order for high temperature solder wire (non leaded) (高溫錫線(無鉛)) as by then, we knew

that solder strip was suspected to be a source for excess lead in water. In order to avoid any problem, I was specifically requested by Mr. Ho Man Piu NOT to make any order for solder strip and to specify that soldering materials used should contain "no lead".

**Question 7(a)(ii)**

(ii) Explain why sometimes Fry lead-free solder wire (transactions 2 and 12) and at other times (transactions 1, 3-11) "英國 50 力扁錫條" were purchased. Explain in particular why both types of soldering materials were acquired in transaction 2.

**Answer 7(a)(ii)**

(a) Soldering materials were requested by Mr. Wong in the materials request forms sent from time to time to suit site work progress. Mr. Wong set out his requirement in terms of quantity for the solder strips as well as solder wire to the Purchasing Department and orders were placed by us with Prosperity for their supply of these solder strips/solder wire per the material request form to suit the site work progress.

(b) I did not know why sometimes Fry lead-free solder wire (transactions 2 and 12) and at other times (transactions 1, 3-11) "英國 50 力扁錫條" were used. For transaction 2, both "solder strips" (錫條) and "solder wire" (錫線) were required by Mr. Wong. For transaction 1, 3 to 11, "solder strips" (錫條) was required by Mr. Wong. We simply did according to his requirement and asked

Prosperity to supply those materials. Nobody in Ho Biu Kee (including myself) knew that these "solder strip" materials might cause problem to the quality of potable water.

(c) For transaction 12, the request from site was dated 28<sup>th</sup> July 2015, which was after the media reported there was excess lead in drinking waters in public housing estates. Hence only lead-free solder wire was requested per the instructions of Mr. Ho Man Piu.

(b) As regards Kai Ching Estate, the purchase records of 31 transactions may be found (between November 2010 and January 2013). Most of the relevant purchase orders were missing:

**Question 7(b)(i)**

(i) Identify the person(s) among the Procurement Staff who placed the purchase orders for soldering materials in respect of Kai Ching Estate and those who determined which type or brand of soldering materials should be ordered and acquired from Prosperity and explain the reasons and bases of his/their decision.

**Answer 7(b)(i)**

(a) As the purchase orders for Kai Ching Estate could not be located (except for transactions 27, 29, 30 and 31 as they are now discovered by Prosperity), I could not tell precisely whether it is me, Catlin or Ms. Wong who actually placed the orders for these 27 transactions (i.e. those other than transactions 27, 29, 30 and 31). In any event and as explained in my Answer to

Question 1 above, we only followed the request of Mr. Chan who was then the site personnel-in-charge of Kai Ching Estate on the soldering materials and placed orders with Prosperity for "solder strips" (錫條) and/or "solder wire" (錫線) without specifying what type or brand from Prosperity.

(b) For transaction 27, it was prepared by Ms Wong and Catlin, and signed by Mr. Ho Man Piu.

(c) For transaction 29, it was an urgent request. Ms Wong prepared the purchase order and she signed the order.

(d) For transaction 30, it was prepared by Catlin and Ms Wong signed the order.

(e) For transaction 31, it was prepared by Ms Wong and Catlin, and signed by Mr. Ho Man Piu.

(f) Based on the materials request forms sent by Mr. Chan, Ho Biu Kee asked for the supply of "solder strips" (錫條) from Prosperity and Ho Biu Kee was then supplied with "英國 50 力扁錫條"

(g) In respect of Mr. Chan's request for the use of "solder wire" (錫線), purchase orders were issued to Prosperity for supply of solder wire. Prosperity then supplied "FRY" lead-free solder wire.

**Question 7(b)(ii)**

(ii) Explain why sometimes Fry lead-free solder wire (transactions 3, 5, 10, 11, 15 and 18) and at other times "英國 50 力扁錫條" were



purchased. Explain in particular why both types of soldering materials were acquired in transactions 3, 5, 10, 11 and 18

**Answer 7(b)(ii)**

(a) Soldering materials were requested by Mr. Chan in the materials request forms sent from time to time to suit site work progress. Mr. Chan set out his requirement in terms of quantity for the solder strips as well as solder wire to the Purchasing Department and orders were placed by us with Prosperity for their supply of these solder strips/solder wire per the material request form to suit the site work progress.

(b) I did not know why sometimes Fry lead-free solder wire (transactions 3, 5, 10, 11 and 18) and at other times“英國 50 力扁錫條” were used. For transactions 3, 5, 10, 11 and 18, both “solder strips” (錫條) and/or “solder wire” (錫線) were required by Mr. Chan. For other transactions, Mr. Chan requested “solder strips” (錫條) only. We simply did according to his requirement and asked Prosperity to supply those materials. Nobody in Ho Biu Kee (including myself) knew that these “solder strip” materials might cause problem to the quality of potable water

**8. Question**

Explain the choice of Prosperity as the supplier for soldering materials and confirm the length of Ho Biu Kee’s business relationship with Prosperity as far as the procurement of soldering materials is concerned.

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V**Answer**

Prosperity has been dealing with Ho Biu Kee for a long time supplying welding/soldering materials as well as comprehensive range of metal works (brackets, thread rods, galvanized bolts/nuts/washers) for use in construction projects. Due to the long working relationship, Ho Biu Kee reposed trust and confidence on Prosperity for the products they supplied.

**9. Question**

After an order for soldering materials has been placed with Prosperity, explain how the Procurement Staff would inform Mr Chan, Mr Wong, Mr Kwong or other staff of Ho Biu Kee at the building site of the 2 Affected Estates about the purchase order and the expected delivery.

**Answer**

(a) In general, we would state on each purchase order the name of the site person (consignee) of Ho Biu Kee for contact by Prosperity (with telephone number provided). Prosperity would then contact the relevant Ho Biu Kee site staff (usually 2 days in advance but if the requirement of material was urgent then it might be shortly after they received the purchase order) to confirm the time for delivery of materials to match site operation.

(b) For Kai Ching Estate, we usually stated Mr. Chan as the contact person in our purchase orders. However, for those materials needed urgently (for example by block foremen), we wrote down the name of those block foremen (such as Mr. Wong) as contact person.

(c) For Kwai Luen Estate, we usually stated Mr. Wong and / or Mr. Leung Wai Kin (梁偉健) as the contact

person(s) in our purchase orders.

(d) We would not send copies of purchase orders placed with Prosperity or other suppliers to Ho Bui Kee site people. It has been our policy that site staff was not required to know the cost of the items of materials in the purchase order. If materials were urgently required, site staff would call us (with material request form to be provided later) or would on few occasions approach Prosperity directly for their supply of materials and the timing.

(e) As Mr. Kwong was not involved with material delivery, he would not be notified of delivery of material to site.

#### 10. Question

Explain the choice of using the soldering material by the brand name of "50 力扁錫條" and confirm whether such solder strips were used as a result of recommendation by Prosperity.

#### Answer

(a) As the purchasing staff (including myself) were not responsible for site works and did not know how works were being carried out, I could not tell why the soldering material by the brand name of "50 力扁錫條" was chosen and used.

(b) To the best of my knowledge, such "英國 50 力扁錫條" was used as a result of recommendation by Prosperity. Ho Bui Kee only requested "錫條" in its purchase orders and Prosperity delivered "英國 50 力扁錫條" to Ho Bui Kee.

#### 11. Question

Describe the steps, if any, taken by the Procurement

Staff upon delivery of the soldering materials on the construction site of each of the 2 Affected Estates.

**Answer**

(a) After delivery of the soldering materials to the construction site of the 2 Affected Estates, Prosperity would submit its invoices together with the signed original of the Delivery Notes (signed by the officer-in-charge of the site acknowledging delivery) to Ho Biu Kee Accounts Office for payment processing.

(b) There were no specific steps by Procurement staff upon delivery of soldering materials (and other items in the Purchase Order) unless the quantities delivered did not match with those requested on the purchase order. By way of example, the quantity ordered might be delivered in tranches to site on various occasions. Sometimes the total quantity delivered might be less than that ordered. On such occasion, we would then update the purchase order and issue a revised one to Prosperity.

(c) For transactions 27 and 31 mentioned in Question 7(b)(ii) the quantity of solder material (and other sundry materials) ordered was delivered to site in tranches on more than one occasion. We therefore marked on the Purchase Orders the quantity delivered on each occasion and the Purchase order (issued on 2<sup>nd</sup> November 2012) was later revised (on 13<sup>th</sup> May 2013) to reflect the actually delivered quantity. For partial delivery, Prosperity would issue separate invoices for the quantities delivered. (Invoice dated 23<sup>rd</sup> November 2012 for Transaction 27 for 100 lb of solder strip. invoice dated 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2013 for Transaction 31 for 165 lb solder strip.) These invoices were in purported

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
VA  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

compliance of the same Purchase Order KT1AP-30208-PB. Indeed a total of 550 lb solder strip under this order was delivered to site on 3 occasions.

**12. Question**

Confirm whether they were aware that the solder strips “50 力扁錫條” acquired from Prosperity and used in the 2 Affected Estates contained lead.

**Answer**

I myself and other procurement staff of Ho Biu Kee (including Catlin and Ms Wong) was not aware that the solder strips “50 力扁錫條” acquired from Prosperity and used in the 2 Affected Estates contained lead.

**13. Question**

Explain why, notwithstanding that Ho Biu Kee has caused the two Main Contractors, China State and Shui On, to submit to the HA Form DCMPF716 (i.e. sample submission approval form) for “FRY” 99C lead free solder wire together with supporting information to confirm the lead free composition of such solder material, non-compliant solder strips which contained lead were actually acquired and used to joint the fresh water plumbing pipes in the 2 Estates

**Answer**

I was not involved in the material submission or site operation. I am therefore unable to provide meaningful answer save as to those matters which I have already deposed before.

Dated this 19<sup>th</sup> day of January 2016

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

問：趙小姐，趙小姐，趙小姐。

答：同意。

問：我哋見到就有個簽名嘅，呢度，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：你就睇過呢份修改咗嘅證人口供，你係咪確認個內容係真實嘅？

答：係。

問：你願唔願意採納證供嘅內容嚟講，作為你主證供嘅一部分？

答：願意。

問：好，我有幾條問題想問一問你嘅，首先你講咗，你話你响 2009 年嘅 2 月就加入咗何標記？

答：唔。

問：你就而家嚟講，就係採購部嘅主管？

答：唔。

問：你係咪加入嗰時已經係主管？

答：唔係。

問：你幾時成為主管？

答：大約 10 年左右。

問：10 年左右？

答：唔。

問：我哋見到你响個證人口供嗰度你講咗就話 Catlin 同 Purple 嚟講，都幫緊你手嘅？

答：係。

問：你會時不時就委派啲工作畀佢嘅，係咪？

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：係。

問：我想問你，你同佢哋嘅分工大概係點樣樣？

答：一般當收到地盤嗰啲請購表，譬如有啲小五金類或者其他叫做濕碎少少，我就會分配畀佢哋，各人負責一啲，就譬如叫佢哋 fax 畀啲供應商，叫佢哋報價返嚟，叫佢哋跟住嚟就打單，譬如邊個平，咁咪打單，如果或者重要少少嗰啲即係主材料就多數我自己去做。

問：好，Catlin 同 Purple 佢哋買咗啲嘢之後嚟講，佢哋有冇匯報畀你聽？

答：基本上因為佢哋做頭嗰兩次都有--即係有少少舊嘅地盤嘅資料參考，如果睇佢一、兩次 okay 呢，我就唔會點再跟進，但係都知佢哋訂啲乜嘅，大致上。

問：你知道佢哋訂咗啲咩嘢料嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：Okay，唔該。好，我想問一問你，就係關於龍逸邨嘅，你有冇印象？龍逸邨呢條邨。

答：係咪即係屯門十八？

問：屯門，係，屯門龍逸邨。

答：係，係，係。

問：陳小華先生曾經提及過嘅，佢話就係有採購部有同事就打電話畀佢聽，就話响個物料請購單嗰度，即係由陳小華先生填寫嗰度嚟講，佢原本就填寫咗呢個錫條嘅，就要求佢改為錫線，我想請問你，你有冇打過電話畀陳小華先生？

答：我本人就有。

問：你知唔知其他採購部同事有冇打過？

答：我唔清楚。

問：你有冇叫過其他採購部同事打呢啲電話？

B

B

C

答：其他，我唔...

C

D

問：有其他採購部同事幫你手㗎嘛？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：你有冇要求其他嘅採購部同事打電話畀陳小華先生，請佢就响個採購單嗰度由錫條改為錫線呢？

F

G

答：我就冇叫過其他同事做。

G

H

問：好喇，有一樣嘢就係想請你睇一睇一份文件，就係都响你證人口供嘅最盡乸嗰一頁，即是就係响 2378.24，K3 嘅 2378.24。

H

I

答：即係邊份？

I

J

問：我哋見到呢份就係你擺出嚟嘅，就係一張物料請購表，就係關於水泉澳邨嘅，有冇印象？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：呢度嚟講，我哋睇到就係有一拵嘅物料，你就要求就係東華去報嘅，我哋睇番第 3 項至到第 8 項就係你哋有啲字寫住，叫「東華」，「attn: 蔡生」，就請報價，係咪？

L

M

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：好喇，你有印象呢個物料請購表，係咪？有冇？

O

P

答：有。

P

Q

問：你睇一睇就係我哋會見到就係响第 6 項就係關於個錫線嘅，100 卷，見唔見到呀？

Q

R

答：見到。

R

S

問：報番嚟個價錢就係 67 釐 1 磅，係咪呀？

S

T

答：係。

T

U

問：你响你證人口供嗰個第 1 段嘅 (j) 嗰度都有提及過呢樣嘢？

U

V

答：係。

V



B

B

C

問：我就想問一問你，首先呢度嘅錫線，你叫東華報番嚟嘅錫線同埋你响呢個雋景買番嚟嘅錫線嚟講，係咪同埋一樣嚟㗎？

C

D

答：喺字面上應該同一樣。

D

E

問：同一樣嚟嘅？

E

F

答：係。

F

G

問：你個目的叫東華報價係有啲咩嘢目的？

G

H

答：起碼大約知道市場價。

H

I

問：想知道市場價？

I

J

答：係。

J

K

問：知道市場價有咩嘢作用？

K

L

答：如果譬如佢真係平好多或者真係大家真係即係 apple to apple 嘅話，我哋就會同雋景即係話「喂，點解你咁貴呀？」咁樣，即係會同雋景講價。

L

M

問：咁雋...

M

N

答：但係以我--唔好意思，以我所知，譬如呢一張單嚟講，喺我哋公司一向做開，就基本上見到「錫線」、「錫條」，已經第一時間會訂雋景，根本都--基本上都唔會考慮第二個供應商，純粹係愛嚟參考市場價。

N

O

問：明白。水泉澳結果就係邊間供應商供應啲錫線？

O

P

答：雋景。

P

Q

問：雋景。好，最後一樣都係關於呢個錫線、錫條個比較價錢嘅，我哋睇番你個證人口供嘅第1段(j)，即是簡單嚟講，就係响係2378.5嘅，2378.5頁嘅。

Q

S

答：係。

S

T

問：我哋見到你就做咗一個比較，其實就黃慧萍女士都提過呢樣嘢，但係佢話佢唔清楚個內容，就叫問你嘅。好喇，我哋睇一睇就係(j)嗰段，你就係將正話東華五金畀你個價錢去做一個簡單嘅比較，就同埋雋景

T

U

U

V

V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

嘅價錢，係咪？

答：係。

問：好喇，我想問一問你，你就話雋景提供畀你就係 160 釐嘅，我哋知道 160 釐係一網嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：同埋嚟講，就係似乎雋景嘅單嘅度就有提過 160 嘅，咁 160 釐一網嘅你點樣嚟先，首先問你？

答：首先如果你話雋景嗰個 general quotation 係 190 釐，因為嗰個佢係畀佢自己所有嘅客睇嘅，...

問：我停一停先，你...

答：...跟住呢個 160 釐...

問：對唔住，趙小姐，停一停。你講緊嗰個 general quotation 係咪我哋响 2378.23 頁？

答：係，雋景嗰個參-- 2378.23 嗰個。

問：我哋見到有第 2 個項目，就係個“FRY”無鉛錫線嘅，190 釐，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：就係同呢個 160 釐就有個相差嘅，見到，係咪？

答：係。

問：咁呢 160 釐點嚟？請你繼續講。

答：190 釐，因為佢係即係叫做所有公--即係佢嘅所有客都係畀呢個餐牌嘅，因為佢話畀我哋，我哋成日話佢貴，咁佢話「Okay，因為我哋合作咗咁耐，你搵到個市場價咁平。」咁話，咁惟有畀我哋一個特價 160 釐，但係佢就即係淨係 for 我哋何標記嘅啫，佢就話即係唔會再同出面講到咁囉，即係已經好優惠價畀我哋。

問：明白。

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

答：所以最新個價應該係 160 釐。

問：我哋見到嚟講，你就將呢 160 釐，將佢化為就 145 釐 1 磅？

答：係。

問：呢個係點解--即係點樣化出嚟？

答：因為雋景嗰個...

主席：呢個我哋明嚟喇，唔使問呢啲。

楊先生：Okay，明白，咁得。

問：咁唔需要喇。

答：哦，okay。

問：Okay，好。

楊先生：主席，我有其他問題問趙小姐。

主席：唔該。

我諗啲律師都會有啲問題問你嘅，而家四點半喇，我哋休息喇，麻煩你聽朝 10 點鐘再嚟。

答：好呀。

主席：唔該，我哋休息喇。

2016年1月20日

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

下午 4 時 29 分聆訊押後

C Wednesday, 20 January 2016 C

(10.02 am)

D (Transcript of simultaneous interpretation D

E except where otherwise specified) E

MR LEUNG WAI KIN (on former affirmation)

F CHAIRMAN: Mr Leung, when you were here last week, you gave F

G an oath; do you remember that? The oath is still G

H effective, so you won't have to do it again. H

Cross-examination by MR SHIEH (continued)

I MR SHIEH: Mr Leung, I have one or two follow-up questions I

J for you. Last week we talked about some prefab units in J

K the mainland, some of them were manufactured in the K

L mainland. For Kai Ching Estate, it was the only estate L

in which the relevant pipes were manufactured in the

mainland. Do you know that?

M A. Yes. M

N Q. For solder, as far as I know, they would be centralised N

received at the Kai Ching Estate site?

O A. I'm not aware of that. O

P Q. So on how the solder is delivered from the site to the P

mainland, you are not aware; right? And you don't know

Q who was responsible in the co-ordination? Q

R A. Yes, I don't know. R

S MR SHIEH: In that case, I might not have further questions S

for you. T

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C Thank you. I have no further questions. Maybe C  
other counsel might have questions.

D Cross-examination by MR LAM D

E MR LAM: Mr Leung, I have some follow-up questions for you. E  
I represent Shui On. Are you the project manager of  
F Kwai Luen Estate? F

G A. Yes. G

H Q. And Wong Kwai Hung would be the site supervisor; right? H  
A. Yes.

I Q. So you are the project manager of Kwai Luen Estate, and I  
J if there are any issues from Shui On, they would contact J  
you directly; right?

K A. Partly. K

L Q. Let me put it this way. At the site, if there's L  
M anything Wong Kwai Hung needs to know, you would tell M  
him; right?

N A. Yes. N

O Q. But you represent Ho Biu Kee, so for any issues, you O  
would be notified; right?

P A. Yes. P

Q Q. Now you are the main contact person for Shui On; right? Q  
A. Yes, if they need to contact me, yes.

R Q. You told us about the email in H/122. Let's look at R  
S that. S

T In the evidence you gave, you did not follow up on T  
U U  
V V

**A** *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* **A**

**B** Commission of Inquiry into Day 42  
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water **B**

**C** this. So can I put it to you that you did not tell Wong **C**  
Kwai Hung this information?

**D** A. Correct. **D**

**E** Q. You did not share this information with Ms Wong or **E**  
Ms Chiu from the procurement department; right?

**F** A. Correct, I did not tell them. **F**

**G** Q. Did you circulate this information to the Kwai Luen **G**  
Estate site office?

**H** A. No. **H**

**I** Q. So, in other words, after receiving this information, **I**  
you did not do anything to follow up?

**J** A. Right. **J**

**K** Q. Do you agree that Mr Man from Shui On passed you this **K**  
information because he expected follow-up work from

**L** Ho Biu Kee? **L**

**M** A. Correct. **M**

**N** Q. Now I have another question for you. In the email, it **N**  
says hbkleung@yahoo.com.hk?

**O** A. Correct. **O**

**P** Q. There's another email, hbconstruct or something of that **P**  
sort. That's your personal email; right?

**Q** A. Yes. **Q**

**R** Q. In other words, you told Mr Man to contact you at this **R**  
email address. This is not a generic Ho Biu Kee email

**S** address; right? **S**

**T**

**U**

**V**

A. Yes.

Q. If you never followed up on this -- and no one else at  
Ho Biu Kee knew about the sample submission; right?

CHAIRMAN: Kevin Kwong would know as well.

MR LAM: For your subordinates, for example, Wong Kwai Hung,  
the procurement department staff, no one knew, apart  
from Kevin Kwong?

A. Yes.

Q. After you knew about the sample approval on 3 June, why  
did your staff order 20 reels of lead-free solder on  
4 June?

You can look at S1/102. Was it merely  
a coincidence? We know that either you or Wong  
Kwai Hung could order the material, so either you did it  
or Wong Kwai Hung did it; right?

A. Yes.

Q. Now, can you explain this coincidence: after receiving  
this document on 4 June, someone at your company ordered  
20 reels of FRY lead-free soldering wire?

A. I don't know why.

Q. Was it a coincidence?

A. I'm not sure if it was a coincidence.

Q. It's simple. Either you -- only you or Wong Kwai Hung  
could place an order, and Mr Chow from Prosperity said  
that if you don't specify -- if you want lead solder



wire, he will just follow your request. So someone must have told Prosperity that 20 reels or rolls of solder wire and 150 pounds of solder strips were needed, and that's why someone made an order.

First of all, did you do that on 4 June, after receiving that email?

A. I can't remember. In my recollection, I didn't place that order.

Q. And Mr Wong Kwai Hung must be told by your staff before he knew how to place an order, if Mr Chow was correct and solder wire must be specified, or else they won't deliver solder wires.

A. You can put it this way.

Q. So, in other words, somehow Wong Kwai Hung knew that the FRY lead-free soldering wire were approved and as such he placed that order, can I put it this way?

A. I'm not sure, because I didn't place the order.

Q. I will ask him later. So are you saying that you don't know what happened and that he did it?

A. Yes.

Q. Well, this is strange. Let's refer to the submission.

As Mr Shieh mentioned before, now, you worked under Wong Kwai Hung in the past; right?

A. Yes.

Q. And subsequently you rose to a higher rank than him;

right?

A. Yes.

Q. When you worked under Wong Kwai Hung, at which site did you work together? Did you know Mr Chan Siu Wah at that time?

A. No.

Q. When you worked under Wong Kwai Hung, do you know if he knew Chan Siu Wah?

A. I'm not sure.

Q. You told us that at Kai Ching Estate, when Chan Siu Wah was in charge, you were already more senior than Wong Kwai Hung and you were in charge of other sites; right?

A. Yes.

Q. So, in other words, you also saw how Chan Siu Wah worked at Kai Ching Estate; right?

A. Yes, I would visit the site.

Q. So you would try to understand the work progress. Would you discuss issues like whether materials were adequate, or similar conversations?

A. I might have asked him to follow up on the materials and update us on the site progress.

Q. Now, at Kai Ching Estate, did he perform the work he should have done?

CHAIRMAN: This question is probably too wide.

MR LAM: What I meant is was he personally carrying out the

work or was he following up on complaints? Would it be that basically he wasn't personally involved in blocks 1 to 6, and you should have followed up more closely?

CHAIRMAN: This kind of question is way too vague and you would only get very vague answers.

MR LAM: Would he tell Wong Kwai Hung how he should work and the materials he should use?

CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you can try to find out if Chan Siu Wah made site inspections.

A. At the site, I usually visit the site office and ask the persons in charge to convene for a meeting. I would spend half an hour or an hour at the site, so I'm not sure -- I really don't know how to answer the questions you have asked.

MR LAM: So, in your half an hour or so at the site, you had very little understanding of the situation?

A. I would spend half an hour or one hour.

Q. And most of the time you stayed at the office, right, the site office, to meet Shui On or other parties?

CHAIRMAN: If he visited the site, he would stay in the office, and the other times he would inspect the sites.

MR LAM: To meet China State or other people, right, instead of your own staff?

A. Correct.

MR LAM: I have no further questions.

CHAIRMAN: Anybody else with questions? If not, Mr Leung,  
you have concluded your evidence. You can leave.

(The witness withdrew)

CHAIRMAN: Next witness?

MR YEUNG: The next witness is Mr Wong Kwai Hung.

MR WONG KWAI HUNG (affirmed)

CHAIRMAN: Please take a seat.

Examination-in-chief by MR YEUNG

MR YEUNG: Mr Wong, we know that on 3 December 2015 you  
produced a 13-page witness statement. It's in english.  
The contents have been explained to you. I will read  
out the statement in English for you, so please turn to  
your headset for translation.

(Statement read in English)

(In English) That statement was made on 3 December  
2015 and signed by Wong Kwai Hung.

(Via interpreter) Mr Wong, please take off the  
headset. Now, you signed on this witness statement;  
right? You read and you heard the contents. Can you  
confirm the contents of this witness statement?

A. Yes.

Q. Would you accept the content of this witness statement  
as part of your evidence?

A. Yes.

Q. I only have a few questions for you. Mr Wong, when did

you take part in the Kai Ching Estate project?

A. April 2012.

Q. You told us that for Kai Ching Estate, you were responsible for -- you supervised blocks 1 and 2?

A. Correct.

Q. When materials were required at blocks 1 and 2, who were responsible for deciding which materials to acquire?

A. At first, it was Chan Siu Wah, and later Chan Siu Wah was only responsible for blocks 3 and 4, and so Ho Man Piu authorised myself to procure materials from the office.

Q. So, in the later stages, you were directly authorised by Mr Ho Man Piu to make purchase orders to the procurement department?

A. Yes.

Q. So we know blocks 1 and 2 used copper pipes.

A. Yes.

Q. These copper pipes, it requires soldering to connect them?

A. Yes.

Q. Do you recall what materials were used?

A. Solder strip, solder wire, and also silver brazing.

Q. Do you recall when or where silver brazing was used and where solder strip, solder wire was used?

A. 15 and 42, we used solder strip. 50 and 67, we used

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 42	
C	solder wire. 70 to 100, we used silver brazing.	C
D	Q. Could you repeat?	D
E	A. Between 15 and 42, we used solder strip; 50 and 67, we used solder wire; 70 and 100, we used silver brazing.	E
F	Q. We see that with different diameters, different soldering material was used, so who would decide what	F
G	material would be used?	G
H	A. For example, in blocks 3 and 4, I complied with that knowledge in Kai Ching Estate.	H
I	Q. You mean you just copied what format was used in blocks	I
J	1 and 2 and you applied it to blocks 3 and 4?	J
K	A. Yes.	K
L	Q. I would like to ask, the pressure-reducing valve, how was that connected to the pipes?	L
M	A. Solder wire.	M
N	Q. So in your experience in Kai Ching Estate, did you use a solder strip to connect the pressure-reducing valves?	N
O	A. No.	O
P	CHAIRMAN: Pressure-reducing valves uses solder wire? Solder strip?	P
Q	A. Solder wire. Those were large components.	Q
R	MR YEUNG: Okay. Now I would like to ask you about Kwai Luen Estate. You were the site supervisor there.	R
S	So the material, were you responsible for procurement?	S
T	A. Yes.	T
U		U
V		V

Q. I can show you a document. S/105. I know this is an invoice, and Mr Wong, you don't deal with these, usually, but since we don't have a delivery note.

I just want to ask you -- this invoice indicates that on 4 June 2013, Prosperity had delivered to the Kwai Shing Circuit construction site some material; do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. Here, looking at items 2 and 3, it indicates that UK FRY lead-free wire, 500 grams, 20 rolls. Do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. And we also have WL50 solder strip, 165 pounds. Do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. I would like to ask you, the request for these two types of material, who made that request?

A. I did.

Q. So why did you ask for two types of material?

A. Because in Kai Ching, I did that, I applied this method, and I just applied the same methodology here, in Kwai Luen.

Q. So your intention was to use --

A. I would use the solder wire first and the pressure-reducing valve.

Q. Just now, you mentioned, in Kai Ching Estate, between

50 and 67, you need to use solder wire. What about in Kwai Luen?

A. The same in Kwai Luen.

Q. So that's how the solder wire was used?

A. Yes.

Q. So we know that aside from this invoice, referring to bundle S, page 102 -- so this is a summary table prepared by Prosperity; do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. We see in the third column, you see the goods' name. So aside from the last item, 1 August 2015, look at 24 April to 20 March 2014. We have the goods' names. So aside from 4 June 2013, when you ordered FRY, the rest of the orders were WL50 solder strips.

So why were all subsequent orders solder strips, aside from the first order of solder wire?

A. The solder wire was the pressure-reducing valve. It was sufficient, 20 rolls.

Q. But you said you required the solder wire for 50 to 67 mm diameter tube, but there weren't any 50 to 67 mm diameter tubes. So you are saying the 20 rolls --

CHAIRMAN: Can you repeat? What did you not have in Kwai Luen?

A. We didn't have 66.7 diameter tubes. We didn't have 66.7.



A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C CHAIRMAN: Because solder wire is used for 50 to 67. C

D A. We have 54. D

E MR YEUNG: Just now you said you had to use solder wire for E

F 50 to 67 mm diameter. F

G A. In Kai Ching, we only had 66.7. G

H CHAIRMAN: You said 50 to 67 you had to use solder wire, and H

I 15 to 42 you had to use solder strip. I

J A. Yes. J

K CHAIRMAN: So in Kwai Luen -- K

L A. In Kwai Luen, there was only 54 and 76. L

M CHAIRMAN: So you have to use solder wire for 54 diameter M

N tubes. N

O A. Yes. O

P CHAIRMAN: So you had to use more solder wire, aside from P

Q the pressure-reducing valve? Q

R A. 20 rolls was sufficient. R

S CHAIRMAN: Okay. Please continue. S

T Really? Was it really sufficient? 20 rolls was T

U enough? U

V A. Yes. V

CHAIRMAN: Take a look at Kai Ching Estate, on page 128. V

Even though they had six blocks, but they ordered a lot

more. We see 20, 20, 40, 300 -- they needed 310 rolls.

And only 20 rolls was sufficient for Kwai Luen Estate?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Please continue.

MR YEUNG: Mr Wong, I have some other questions for you.

Mr Chan Siu Wah -- do you know him?

A. I knew him in Kai Ching Estate.

Q. Previously, in his evidence, he said Mr Kwong Ka Fu had phoned you, telling you that in Kai Ching Estate the solder material, how to use that material. Did that happen?

A. No, I did not receive a call.

Q. He also said that he -- prior to the work in Kai Ching Estate, you said you had only joined in June 2012, and prior to that, where had you worked?

A. In Un Chau Estate.

Q. In Un Chau Estate, what soldering material was used?

A. Components that contained solder.

Q. Mr Chan Siu Wah --

CHAIRMAN: Which phase in Un Chau Estate?

A. Phase 5 of Un Chau Estate.

MR YEUNG: Chan Siu Wah had worked in Yau Lai Estate, so aside from yourself, aside from components that contained solder, you also had to reapply solder. You had dealt with self-contained solder. Did you have to reapply solder?

A. No, because there was sufficient solder in the component. Once you soldered, it would flow, and it was

sufficient.

Q. But in some cases, the joint, if it leaks, what would you do? Would you have to reapply solder?

A. No. We would uninstall and re-install a new component.

Q. So, in your experience, you have not had to reapply solder?

A. (Shook head).

MR YEUNG: Okay. Thank you, Mr Wong. I have no further questions for you. Please respond to other counsel's questions.

Cross-examination by MR SHIEH

MR SHIEH: Good morning, Mr Wong. I have some questions for you. You had joined Ho Biu Kee in 2003, so before joining HBK, can you tell us your work experience?

A. I was a worker.

Q. A plumbing worker?

A. Yes.

Q. And your education level?

A. Form 3.

Q. So do you have to deal with documents or emails?

A. No.

Q. After form 3, you had joined the workforce and you were in plumbing all the time?

A. No.

Q. So at a certain stage you joined the industry. When did

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

you join the industry?

A. In around 2000.

Q. You got your licence?

A. Yes.

Q. So between 2000 and 2003, you were in other plumbing companies other than Ho Biu Kee?

A. Correct.

Q. So, to cut a long story short, aside from Kwai Luen, were you a site supervisor in Shin Ming Estate, Tseung Kwan O; do you remember?

A. Yes.

Q. Were you a site supervisor there?

A. Yes.

Q. We heard a witness saying -- did you leave Shin Ming Estate halfway, in Tseung Kwan O?

A. After Shin Ming Estate, I worked in Un Chau Estate.

Q. So you had supervisor experience in Shin Ming Estate, and Phase 5 of Un Chau Estate you were a site supervisor as well?

A. Yes.

Q. Mr Ho Man Piu told us the six blocks in Kai Ching Estate and the division of labour. I just want to confirm with you, the site supervisor was Chan Siu Wah. Blocks 1 and 2 -- the site supervisor was responsible for the whole project, Mr Chan Siu Wah, but every two blocks

C there was someone responsible. Blocks 1 and 2, the  
responsible officer there was you, yourself?

C

D A. Yes.

D

E Q. In blocks 3 and 4 was Chan Siu Wah; 5 and 6 was Fan  
Peng?

E

F A. Yes.

F

G Q. So every day you spent your time on the site? You  
weren't in the office?

G

H A. Correct.

H

I Q. Your relationship with Mr Leung Wai Kin -- he  
apprenticed with you?

I

J A. Yes.

J

K Q. And he was promoted and now he's not permanently  
situated in the site; he manages different sites? He  
has to run around?

K

L A. Correct.

L

M Q. I would like to ask you, in the Kai Ching Estate site,  
before being responsible for blocks 1 and 2, we heard  
that you were site supervisor in two other estates: in  
Un Chau and Shin Ming. So, in those two estates, you  
were site supervisor, Shin Ming and Un Chau -- they were  
also Ho Biu Kee sites?

M

N

O A. Yes.

O

P Q. So, when you were site supervisor, were you responsible  
for filling out material request forms to procure

P

Q

R

S

T

U

C different materials, including sundry and minor metal  
hardware, including soldering material?

C

D A. Yes.

D

E Q. So set aside Kai Ching. We know that Chan Siu Wah used  
F a certain method and you just followed. So set that  
F aside. Before Chan Siu Wah appeared in Shin Ming and  
G Un Chau, at that time, if you -- at that time, what kind  
G of tubes and pipes were used? How were they connected?

H A. They were all leaded parts, so they contained lead.

H

I Q. Are you referring to tin elbows? In other words, no  
J solder had to be procured? The tin elbow already  
J contains tin or solder, and the solder would be  
K embedded; you don't need to purchase solder separately?

I

L A. Correct.

L

M Q. Now I have another question for you. At these two  
M sites, Shin Ming Estate and Un Chau Estate, in the  
N requisition form you filled, you did not ask for solder?

N

O A. Right.

O

P Q. But when you obtained your certificate, one of the parts  
P of the test is solder, or you needed to know different  
Q types of pipe connections? There are different types of  
Q pipe connections; some are mechanical, some are not?

Q

R A. When I took the test, we used leaded solder.

R

S Q. So, when you took the test, you were not trained on the  
T type of solder used to joint pipes. Now, if you were

S

T

T

U

U

V

V

asked to solder pipes, you wouldn't know how to do it?

Well, it's an easy job for you; right? Even though you weren't tested on that, if you are asked to do it now, you can do it; right?

A. Yes.

Q. Now let's come back to Kai Ching Estate. You said in your witness statement that as per normal procedures, Chan Siu Wah, as the person in charge of the project, would fill out those requisition forms. Subsequently, since there is a division of work within the same estate, even though you were not the overall person in charge of the project, you started filling out requisition forms for blocks 1 and 2?

A. Yes. That happened in the latter stages but not from the start.

Q. So that's what you did for Kai Ching Estate.

Does it also apply to blocks 5 and 6? In other words, Fan Sau Peng does not have to ask Chan Siu Wah for approval every time? So in terms of filling out these requisition forms, in the latter stages, Fan Sau Peng for blocks 5 and 6?

A. He still had to ask the boss, Mr Ho.

Q. But in the latter stages, Mr Ho started authorising you to take care of blocks 1 and 2.

A. Ye.

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 42 B
C	Q. And blocks 5 and 6 for Fan Sau Peng?	C
	A. Yes.	
D	Q. And Chan Siu Wah did not have to be sought out every	D
E	time?	E
	A. Yes.	
F	Q. On the materials used to solder the pipes, from your	F
G	experience as the person in charge or the person	G
H	responsible for making orders, when you were the person	H
I	in charge you already had experience, right, to make	I
	orders?	
	A. Yes.	
J	Q. At Kai Ching Estate, it was the first time you ordered	J
K	solder and filled out requisition forms; right? You	K
L	didn't have to do it before?	L
	A. Correct.	
M	Q. For sites you were responsible for, if solder had to be	M
N	used -- now, you only started ordering solder for	N
O	Kai Ching Estate; right? For prior projects, you used	O
	tin elbows?	
	A. Correct.	
Q	Q. Apart from Shin Ming Estate and Un Chau Estate, were you	Q
R	involved in other projects, in a position outside of the	R
	site supervisor?	
S	A. Well, it was not -- those works were not with	S
	Ho Biu Kee.	
T		T
U		U
V		V



Q. So it was either compression joints or tin elbows, so Kai Ching Estate was the first time you used solder.

A. Yes.

Q. Kai Ching Estate was the first time you had to use solder.

A. Yes.

Q. And Mr Chan Siu Wah told you --

A. Well, that's just -- I made visits myself.

Q. Kai Ching Estate was the first occasion when you started to use something rather than a tin elbow for jointing.

A. Yes.

Q. You only started filling out the forms in the latter stages, but right from the start you wanted to understand the work progress; right? Can you tell me a little bit more?

A. I would visit the buildings and see how the masters worked. I visited blocks 3 and 4.

Q. In other words the two blocks in charge by Chan Siu Wah.

A. Yes.

Q. You would look at the masters at those two blocks. Why did you decide to look at those two specific blocks and how the masters work? Is it because he was more experienced?

A. I had not used these parts before. I used leaded components. So I had to see how they do it at blocks 3

and 4.

Q. So right from the start, as the person in charge, Chan Siu Wah decided to use solder strips and he ordered a bunch of solder strips, so when you visited blocks 3 and 4 to see how the masters worked, you saw them using solder strips?

A. Correct.

Q. Apart from trying to learn something, apart from the fact that the masters or workers are using solder strips, did you see anyone using solder wires? Let's get this clear. For pieces of solder strips, which are low melting, and starting from Kwai Luen Estate, you ordered the same materials, these solder strips; right? (Indicating).

These are the solder strips you are referring to; right?

A. Yes.

Q. When you visited blocks 3 and 4 of Kai Ching Estate, in other words the two blocks responsible by Chan Siu Wah, when you saw the workers work, did you see these green reels of material? (Indicating). When you visited those two blocks to see how solder was used, you saw solder strips as well as small quantities of green reels. Did you ask Chan Siu Wah if he ordered those items?

C So, in other words, you arrived and you saw a lot of  
D long solder strips and a small number of green reels of  
E solder wire. Who taught you how you can describe these  
two types of materials?

C

D

E

A. I heard them from the workers.

F Q. In other words, Chan Siu Wah did not sit down and tell  
G you anything? So you arrived and you saw solder strips?

F

G

A. Yes.

H Q. And did they use these materials for solder?

H

I A. I saw the workers using the green reels of solder.

I

J Q. Do the workers call them solder wires as well?

J

A. Yes.

K Q. So that's what you said. So it's not what Chan Siu Wah  
L said; right?

K

L

A. Yes.

M Q. Have you seen any silver brazing sticks? Have you seen  
N any silver brazing sticks from other workers?

M

N

A. No.

O Q. Are you aware of the function of having these brazing  
P sticks?

O

P

A. Yes, I know. They are for very big projects.

Q Q. Now let's focus on solder strips and wires. You said  
R for thinner pipes, straight solder strips would be used;  
S for thicker pipes, then solder wires would be used,  
T because pressure-reducing valves are needed.

Q

R

S

T

U

U

V

V

Who told you how you can decide which type of solder to use for pipes of different diameters?

A. That's from my own experience.

Q. But how would you have the experience? You used tin elbows before.

A. I knew that tin wires were to be used if pressure-reducing valves were present.

Q. So according to your experience, you have always used tin elbow with embedded solder; you don't have to order solder separately. So at blocks 3 and 4 of Kai Ching Estate, you saw the workers using strips of solder. The strips of wire are for the pressure-reducing valves. But as you said, there are thick pipes and there are thin pipes.

Let's not talk about the exact diameter, but for thinner pipes you would use solder wires -- solder strips, and for thicker pipes you would use wires. So how did you come to know about that? Did you hear it from other workers or was it from your own observation?

A. It was my own observation.

Q. You said you arrived. Let's look at blocks 3 and 4 of Kai Ching Estate. You saw workers using solder strips, and you saw workers using green reels of solder for pressure-reducing valves.

A. Yes.

Q. So, in other words, you saw them using solder wires for bigger pipes and pressure-reducing valves, and solder wires were used for thinner pipes.

A. Yes.

Q. So that's your own deduction?

Did you ever ask anyone whether this is true, for 15 to 42, you would use strips; for bigger diameters, you would use wires? So on when you would use solder strips or wires, depending on the diameter of the pipe, that's just your own impression; right?

A. Right.

Q. For 15 to 42, you would use strips. So 15 to 42 millimetres are rather standard diameters, and then you talked about 50 to 67 millimetres.

A. Yes.

Q. What about between 15 to 42 millimetres? Are there no pipes of the diameter of 42 to 50 millimetres?

A. No.

Q. So there are only three categories: 15 to 42, 50 to 67, and 70 to 100 millimetres.

A. Yes.

Q. So did you ever consider why thinner pipes require strips and thicker ones require wires?

A. For thinner pipes, they are easier to solder.

Q. Let's pause here. Did you sit down with Chan Siu Wah to

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

discuss the differences between solder strips and wires?

In your witness statement, you said Chan Siu Wah decided to use solder strips in this estate. So at Kwai Luen Estate, you decided to use solder strips. So what you meant was that Chan Siu Wah did not sit down and discuss that with you; that's just your feeling of what Chan Siu Wah wanted, and you figured out the differences by yourself, in terms of the difference in diameter, strips and wires, and so on?

A. Yes.

Q. You said strips melt more easily.

A. Yes.

Q. How do you know the fact that it melts more easily?

A. When it's solder, it melts more quickly.

Q. So it's from observation; right?

A. Yes.

Q. When you see workers holding solder strips, you feel that they melt more easily? In other words, the melting point is lower. So why would a lower melting point be appropriate for thinner pipes?

A. I saw that happen in Kai Ching Estate.

Q. So why would low-melting solder be more appropriate for thinner pipes?

A. That's just intuition.

Q. Why can't you use low-melting solder for thicker pipes

C as well? I'm not a plumbing expert, but from my  
D understanding, everyone wants to get the work done  
E sooner rather than later, so with a lower melting point,  
F it melts quicker, then you don't have to wait; it just  
G melts and you solder the joint.

F A. Yes.

G Q. It's the same for large or small diameter. So why do  
H you use a low-melting solder for small diameter tubes  
I and a high-temperature solder for larger diameters?

I Have you thought about that?

J A. No. No. It just felt easy to use. It felt convenient  
K to use for small components.

K Q. It was more flexible?

L A. Yes.

M Q. It was a straight strip and you felt that it could  
N navigate around small components easier?

N A. Yes.

O Q. What about the wire, solder wire? It was used for large  
P diameter pipes and pressure-reducing valve?

P A. Yes.

Q COMMISSIONER LAI: Could you explain why you don't use  
R strips for the pressure-reducing valve, why you don't  
S use strips for soldering the pressure-reducing valve?  
T For the large diameter pipes and pressure-reducing  
U valve, why you didn't use the strip?

T

U

V

A. Because the solder wire is rigid, and we use that -- but it takes longer to melt, so I use a higher-temperature torch.

COMMISSIONER LAI: So you use a high-temperature torch to solder the solder wire?

A. Yes.

COMMISSIONER LAI: You don't use --

A. Not LPG torch.

MR SHIEH: So for these, you use the oxyacetylene torch?

A. We just use a high-temperature torch.

COMMISSIONER LAI: So isn't it inconvenient when you use solder wire? Is it more inconvenient?

A. Yes.

COMMISSIONER LAI: So I'm surprised why you don't use solder strip on the pressure-reducing valve.

A. Because the component is large, we are worried that it might leak, so we have to use solder wire.

CHAIRMAN: Would it be because the pressure-reducing valve, it has a larger diameter inlet?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: You wouldn't use the smallest tube to install the pressure-reducing valve.

MR SHIEH: You had talked about the size of the pressure-reducing valve. I still don't understand. These rolls, what's the characteristic of these? You



said you never heard from people what the difference is between strips and wire; you just went to observe people at work. So when you see the master using the wire on large diameter pipes and pressure-reducing valves, you didn't question them; you just followed their example?

But after thinking about it, I think there must be some characteristic, there must be some advantage of using the roll, and there must be some disadvantage to using the strip.

A. Because when the component is large or the tube is large, the solder wire is a bit more rigid -- because I used a high-temperature torch.

Q. So the melting point is higher and you think that makes it rigid?

COMMISSIONER LAI: So when it melts too quick, it's not convenient?

A. Right.

MR SHIEH: Why would it not be convenient.

A. Because I'm afraid it would leak.

CHAIRMAN: It would leak for the small diameter tubes as well.

A. Because small tubes don't carry high pressure.

MR SHIEH: So large tubes or pressure-reducing valves, they have to withstand larger pressure. Have you been taught that in your training?

A. I understood, so I learnt this through intuition.

CHAIRMAN: Hang on. I would like to ask you -- your

previous estates, where you used --

A. The material containing solder, self-contained solder,  
the elbow --

CHAIRMAN: So a large pressure-reducing valve?

A. So the 80 mm diameter used silver brazing.

CHAIRMAN: The large -- setting aside the silver brazing.

Shin Ming, they had contained solder in the joints?

A. It's the same for 50 mm. They contain solder.

CHAIRMAN: I am asking you, pressure-reducing valves, do  
they contain solder?

A. The components contain solder. The pressure-reducing  
valve is very large. The 50 mm are pretty small.

CHAIRMAN: Please continue.

MR SHIEH: So, in other words, you relied on observation and  
you relied on deduction, and you felt that you needed  
something more ductile for pressure-reducing valves and  
large diameter pipes, and you also saw people at work  
using these methods, so for the pressure-reducing valves  
you used the green roll, and you also saw workers using  
the solder strips, it melted easily and the diameters  
weren't that large, so you would use solder strips.

So you formed that idea through observation. So the  
terminology, you also picked it up from workers?

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C A. Correct. C

D Q. But in blocks 3 and 4, before you saw these workers, D

E were you aware of this knowledge, that there was E

F a difference in the solder strip and solder wire, their F

G melting points were different -- so before making that G

H observation, you were aware? H

I A. Yes. I

J Q. How did you know? J

K A. My staff would tell me, and they told me to go visit K

L blocks 3 and 4 to take a look. L

M Q. So it's because of Kai Ching, your workers told you and M

N you had to make a visit -- so your knowledge of solder N

O strip and wire shape and their application was because O

P of Kai Ching Estate? P

Q A. Yes. Q

R Q. So, prior to that, before your staff told you that there R

S were these materials, so you weren't aware that there S

T was this type of solder material in the market? T

U A. No. U

V Q. Have you heard workers, aside from calling them by strip V

or wire, have you heard of

high-temperature/low-temperature as a classification?

A. Yes.

Q. Where did you hear that from?

A. From workers.

**A** *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* **A**

**B** Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 **B**

**C** Q. What would they say? How would they describe it? **C**

**D** A. I only know that they talked about high-temperature and low-temperature solder. **D**

**E** Q. You heard that from workers? **E**

**F** A. Yes. **F**

**G** Q. It was also from Kai Ching Estate? **G**

**H** A. Yes. **H**

**I** Q. So, when they referred to high-temperature solder, was it the green roll or the straight strip? **I**

**J** A. The round roll. **J**

**K** Q. You heard the workers call the roll high-temperature solder. **K**

**L** A. Yes. **L**

**M** Q. And the solder strip was low-temperature solder? **M**

**N** A. Yes. **N**

**O** Q. So that was the workers' terminology. So in Kai Ching Estate you learned that there were two different types of classification, you can call it solder strip, solder wire, and you could also call it high-temperature or low-temperature solder? **O**

**P** A. Right. **P**

**Q** Q. So by the time you could fill out material request forms halfway through the works of Kai Ching, you realised that you needed material, so you would assess what type of solder and how much was required? **Q**

**R**

**S**

**T**

**U**

**V**

A. If I require the solder material, I would go to Chan Siu Wah's workshop.

Q. You would go to Chan Siu Wah's workshop. So for the whole site? So the workshop you are referring to, it's like a warehouse? There is only one warehouse --

A. Blocks 1 and 2, 3 and 4, 5 and 6 would have their own warehouses.

Q. You would go to the warehouse for blocks 3 and 4 and you would copy his information; you would see what he had --

CHAIRMAN: So you are saying there are three warehouses in the site for your company?

A. There are three warehouses.

CHAIRMAN: So three containers?

A. It's not a container. It's already within the units on one storey, on one particular storey, on one unit.

MR SHIEH: So you would copy his orders. So, as far as you can recall, when you filled out the material request form for solder material, what did you write?

A. "Solder strip".

Q. Because you saw in Chan Siu Wah's request form, he wrote "solder strip".

A. Yes.

Q. But your workers told you these are called solder strips, so when you go to the workshop, you have to fill out a request form, you have to use some terminology and

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

you saw "solder strip".

A. Yes.

Q. But did you confirm with anybody such as Chan Siu Wah that solder strip is the thing that you are looking for, or did you just see the characters "solder strip", so you just copied that?

A. Yes.

Q. Have you seen in Chan Siu Wah's material request form that they asked for solder wire?

A. I didn't quite notice that. There are a lot of books there. There's only a few dozen sheets in a book.

Q. So you wouldn't go through them one by one; you just flip through them, and you saw somewhere it said "solder strip" and that's it?

A. Yes.

Q. I'll use that terminology, since they did so.

A. Yes.

Q. So you did not go through them one by one to see if they ordered solder wire?

A. No.

Q. So when you handled blocks 1 and 2 sites, were you aware that you should procure solder wire?

A. No.

Q. So you didn't look for solder wire?

A. Because in the workshop they would have ordered a lot of

material.

Q. So there was sufficient solder wire, and you only needed to order solder strips, so you would take a look at Chan Siu Wah's old material request form and see if they ordered solder strip?

A. Well, because blocks 1 to 6, he had already ordered all the solder strips and solder wire. He just assigned me some to use.

Q. So, in your judgment, the rolls of solder wire were sufficient? You had not thought about ordering more solder wire, at least not through your own hands?

A. That's correct.

Q. So, when you looked at Chan Siu Wah's old material request form, your focus was to find how they described solder strip, and you copied their terminology?

A. Yes.

Q. You did not notice their terminology for solder wire?

A. No.

CHAIRMAN: So in Kai Ching you never ordered solder wire?

A. I had not ordered solder wire. I just retrieved it from his workshop.

CHAIRMAN: Let's take a 20-minute break.

(11.29 pm)

(A short adjournment)

(11.48 am)

MR SHIEH: Mr Wong, in your experience with construction sites, you are aware that Housing Authority projects, the main contractor is required to submit some component or material samples that would be used in plumbing works for their approval? You are aware of this step; right? You are not?

A. I am not aware.

Q. So nobody ever told you?

A. No.

Q. In this site, don't you have a room where you have approved components?

A. I have never seen those, I have never seen that, because whatever material I require, I would have to fill out on a material request form, and I would send it to the office and the office would deliver the material.

Q. So, in other words, you have to use some terminology, you don't use brand names.

A. Right.

Q. So you give a general description, this is solder strip, and you have to rely on the office staff to decide where to procure, what to procure, and what brand name? So any specifications, that is the responsibility of an officer?

A. Yes.

Q. It's not your responsibility. Your responsibility is to



A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C use the basic terminology, descriptions, to tell them C

D what you want? D

E A. That's it. E

F Q. And you are not aware of an approval process? F

G A. No. G

H Q. Nobody told you what was approved? H

I A. No. I

J Q. Let me show you some material, a transcript. This is J

K a transcript of witness evidence, 17 December. It's K

L a Chinese transcript. Page 116, 17 December. You can L

M read that off the screen, or you can refer to the hard M

N copy. N

O At page 116, you see which witness is giving O

P evidence here. This is a Shui On witness. Phase 2 P

Q Kwai Luen Estate, Mr Wan Wai Ho, site representative. Q

R You know who they are? R

S A. Yes. S

T Q. Let's see what they say. Let's look at page 119. T

U Page 119, in paragraph P, this Mr Wan, he was reading U

V your witness statement. He read your witness statement V

and said, when the solder material arrived, it wasn't

strips, it was rolls. So Mr Wan was reading your

statement, saying what solder material arrived.

The chairman asked:

"I want to ask you, how long have you known Mr Wong

Kwai Hung?"

He says:

"In a previous site, where Mr Wong was a site supervisor, I also met him in Kwai Luen Estate."

In the middle of page 120, it talks about Shin Ming Estate, which is also a Shui On project. He said he knew you from Shin Ming Estate. Do you recall that?

A. Yes.

Q. So that is just an introduction. He says, page 121, in the middle, H to I, the chairman asked:

"In Shin Ming Estate, what solder material was Ho Biu Kee use?"

The answer was FRY 99C. That's what Mr Wan said. FRY 99C, the green roll here (indicating).

So this site agent from Shui On says Shin Ming used these rolls. What is your response then?

A. I never used that. In Shin Ming we used the tin elbow.

Q. Shin Ming Estate was 2008, 2009, 2010. We might need the Housing Authority to assist us or Shui On to provide material, some information regarding this.

Let's continue. Page 123. Before we read the transcript, I will ask you a general question. Your evidence, you said you don't know Housing Authority, other than miscellaneous requirements, that they require solder material?

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A. I didn't know that.

Q. So, in your work, nobody told you or instructed you?

A. No. Because I did not submit the samples. I just do the actual work.

Q. So you didn't submit samples. What do you mean by submit samples? What do you mean when you said --

A. Submit material for approval.

Q. Just now you said you weren't aware of that approval process.

A. Because I'm not responsible.

Q. When I asked you did you know that you had to submit -- that material needed to be submitted for approval, you said you didn't know. So would you know work that you are not involved with? Do you know that some people would take the construction material or plumbing components, they would submit it to the Housing Authority for approval?

A. Yes.

Q. Did you know that? I know you are not responsible, you didn't sign the business contract, but you know that there are contracts? These are two separate issues. But do you know there is a process for HA approval?

A. Yes.

Q. You know that? So you know there is an approval process. Do you know that solder material also needs to

be approved? You didn't know that?

A. No.

Q. So, in your understanding, what needs to be approved?

A. The tubes, the components and the fittings, and minor hardware.

Q. You didn't know that, and you also weren't aware that the contract or regulations required lead-free components?

A. I didn't know that.

Q. So that's the background.

I referred you to Mr Wan's -- page 122. The question was raised by the chairman:

"He [Mr Wong Kwai Hung] said:

'I don't know that the tubes, that is the fresh water tubes, solder material had to be lead-free'."

The chairman posed the question to elicit Mr Wan's response, and he said he doesn't know. "How do you answer?" Mr Wan said, at the top of page 123, top-left:

"I feel that if he has a plumber's licence for so many years -- because I know now that when they took the licence, it had been mentioned, and I believe he has to know that ...

Chairman: So you do not agree with his first sentence or what do you mean?

Answer: As a plumber, he should know that solder

material should not contain lead."

Pause there. He says that as a plumber, you should know that solder material should not contain lead. What is your response? He says you should know.

A. Well, I don't know that as a fact. If I knew, I wouldn't use the material.

Q. In paragraph L, the chairman says:

"I would like to ask, as far as you know, the 99C FRY was submitted to the Housing Authority?"

99C FRY is this material (indicating). It is agreed that it's lead-free. And I tell you, Mr Kwong, when he submitted to the main contractor for HA approval, he submitted this material, the green. We know this as the correct material.

The chairman asked him:

"So you submitted FRY 99C. Do you know that that was submitted?"

Answer: I don't."

I know you said you don't know. Mr Wan said:

"I know definitely he is aware.

Chairman: Why are you so sure?

Answer: Because, if I refer to my old records at Shui On, on 3 June, we emailed Ah Kin something, and at that time Ah Kin and Wong Kwai Hung were working together as site supervisors, and they were working in

the same workshop; they worked in the same location."

A. Right.

Q. Let's go on. Let's look at page 124. The full name of  
Ah Kin is Leung Wai Kin. Question:

"Was Leung Wai Kin the person in charge throughout  
the entire Kwai Luen Estate Phase 2 project?

Answer: Leung Wai Kin, as I understand, was more  
senior than Wong Kwai Hung, and he would spend part of  
the time in the office and part at the site."

And he would inform Mr Leung Wai Kin of the approved  
materials. Mr Wan deducted that since you and Leung  
Wai Kin are both in charge of Kwai Luen Estate, so both  
of you should know.

So that's his version. You might not agree, but we  
can tackle them one by one. You were not responsible  
for the email?

Now, I can show you that email. The email is at H1,  
page 122. Let's look at this email. I know you didn't  
process this email.

Now, this is a printed copy of the email. It's  
displayed on the monitor.

You have secondary 3 level. Do you understand basic  
English?

A. No.

Q. The receiving party was "hbkleung", so we understand

that this is the email address of Leung Wai Kin. No one showed you this email; right?

A. Right.

Q. This email was sent by Mr Man of Shui On to Leung Wai Kin. The HA's material approval letter was sent to Leung Wai Kin, and the actual approved document by the HA is attached to this message.

On pages 123 and 124, you have not seen these two documents; right?

A. Correct.

Q. Even if you have seen them, you might not understand.

Let's look at page 128. This is a photo record for sample submission. On the bottom left, you can see reels of materials.

Now, let's confirm this first. The email address doesn't belong to you and you have not seen this email address. This email -- at Kwai Luen Estate, were Leung Wai Kin and yourself both persons in charge?

A. No. He was promoted.

Q. So that's why Mr Wan's understanding was wrong?

A. Yes, wrong.

Q. You and Mr Leung were not both persons in charge; you were the only person in charge. Would he visit you from time to time? He worked under you in the past.

A. Yes.

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C Q. You are still close with each other; right? You still C  
talk with each other; right?

D A. Yes. D

E Q. Would you chat with each other outside work? E

F A. Yes. F

G Q. At the Kwai Luen Estate site, he might have a chat with G  
you and that's quite normal; right?

H A. Yes. H

I Q. And whenever he visited Kwai Luen Estate, he would visit I  
the workshop; right?

J A. Very seldom. He would usually visit the DS room and J  
talk to me.

K Q. (Chinese spoken). K

L A. It's not a container, it's a building or office. L

M Q. (Chinese spoken). M

N A. There's no container at all. N

O Q. In your conversation with Mr Leung, did he tell you O  
anything about sample submission?

P A. No. P

Q Q. Mr Wan deduced that he knew and so there's no way you Q  
wouldn't be informed, so Mr Leung didn't call you;  
R right? And Mr Leung didn't tell you anything about the R  
sample submission or approval?

S A. No. S

T Q. Is there room for approved materials? T

U

V



A. I don't know.

Q. So in short, you are not aware of the email attachments and the approved materials, and you weren't told by Mr Leung Wai Kin?

A. Correct.

Q. Now let's go back to the email on 3 June. Let's look at S1/102. On this page, on the left, this was the list compiled by Ho Biu Kee's office staff or counsel, and it lists out the material records for Kwai Luen Estate between 2013 and 2014. Let's not talk about 2015 first. This is provided by Prosperity, not Ho Biu Kee. Apologies.

On the second item, you see a date, 4 June 2013.

The invoice number is 103609, in the left column.

That's the invoice number. The date was 4 June 2013.

FRY lead-free solder wire was ordered, and thereafter, they were all UK WL50D solder strips, and Mr Yeung asked about this. 20 reels of lead-free solder wire were ordered.

Now, you didn't read that email at that time, and I now tell you that the email was sent on 3 June from Shui On, and they told Mr Leung that the FRY solder was approved. On 4 June, there was an order on FRY solder.

You can look at the invoice on page 105. There was an invoice on 4 June. You ordered 20 reels of FRY, and

you also ordered solder strips. Now, the invoice was dated 4 June, but we don't know when the order was actually placed.

When you make an order, the deliveries usually arrive very soon; right?

A. Perhaps if I order today, it will arrive tomorrow at the earliest, if the circumstances allow.

Q. And there was an invoice on 4 June. The correct material -- in other words, FRY lead-free solder wire -- was ordered. So would it be possible that someone received the approval and subsequently made an order?

A. No. (Chinese spoken).

CHAIRMAN: Can you repeat that, please? What did you say?

A. Leung Wai Kin did not visit me very often. He only visited me four to five times a month.

MR SHIEH: So if Leung Wai Kin received an email on 3 June, so he might not happen to be at the site on 3 June.

A. Yes.

Q. Do you have any records of when he visited the site?

A. No.

CHAIRMAN: So, the lead-free solder wire and WL50D solder strips were ordered by you; right?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Okay.

MR SHIEH: As the chairman mentioned, if we just look at

page 102 --

CHAIRMAN: How many blocks are there in Kwai Luen Estate?

A. Two.

MR SHIEH: Let's look at Kwai Luen Estate. You were the person in charge; right?

A. Yes.

Q. How many blocks were there?

A. Two.

Q. So the ordering was straightforward. It all went through you?

A. Yes.

Q. It's not like the situation at Kai Ching Estate?

A. Yes.

Q. So, if you handled or processed all these orders, then you might better remember what happened.

A. Yes.

Q. Just now, here is a bunch of orders submitted by Prosperity. Their order records might not be complete. But as far as you remember, for Kwai Luen Estate, for the FRY lead-free solder you ordered, can you confirm that only 20 reels were indeed ordered?

A. I cannot remember.

Q. Now let's ignore 2015. For the entire project, first you ordered 20 reels of FRY, but you cannot remember if you only ordered these 20 reels?

A. Correct, I cannot recall.

Q. For Kai Ching Estate, Chan Siu Wah made an order well in advance, and you were responsible for Kwai Luen Estate.

For the first batch, why did you only order WL50D and you only ordered FRY in June? According to this record on page 105, on 24 April 2013, you ordered 110 pounds of WL50D solder strips and on 4 June you ordered 20 reels of FRY lead-free solder wire. Why was that?

A. Whenever the components arrived, I would order solder wires.

Q. So in April --

A. Those are for small or thinner pipes along the corridor.

Q. So that was your judgment.

CHAIRMAN: Don't you install big pipes before installing smaller pipes?

A. We would small thinner pipes along the corridor first. They were 22 millimetres in diameter.

MR SHIEH: You said you can't remember whether a second order of FRY lead-free solder was made; right?

A. Yes.

Q. We looked at the bills of quantities for Kwai Luen Estate and Kai Ching Estate. You said you can't remember that, so I won't go through these one by one. There are six blocks in Kwai Luen Estate. You said there are two blocks in Kwai Luen and six blocks in

Kai Ching.

A. Yes.

Q. For 50 to 67 millimetres in diameter, solder wires would be used?

A. We did some maths.

Q. So for the six blocks at Kai Ching Estate, within those six blocks, 54 plus 66.7 -- together the total length is about 1,800 metres, and there are two blocks in Kwai Luen Estate. When we look at the BQs, they only use 54 millimetre pipes. Do you remember that?

A. Yes.

Q. They didn't use 67 millimetre pipes for Kwai Luen Estate. The total length of 54 millimetre pipes comes to around 1,000 feet. So, for Kwai Luen Estate, the total length is shorter. For Kai Ching Estate, it's 1,800 metres and for Kwai Luen it's 1,000 metres.

When we look at the records supplied by Prosperity for Kwai Luen Estate, only 20 reels of FRY was ordered. When you look at Kai Ching Estate, let's look at page 128. For Kai Ching Estate, for the third item to the end -- for the third item, you can see 20 reels of FRY solder; do you see that? This was prepared by Prosperity, a summary of their delivery records to Kai Ching. So you see 20 rolls of FRY.

Moving down, if you look at invoice number 92042,

you see there 40 rolls of FRY; you see 40 rolls of FRY.

Then, moving down, 92271, on 13 April, 30 rolls of  
FRY. 93422, 25 May, there were 100 rolls of FRY.

93976, on 12 June, there were 100 rolls. So different  
quantities.

So the correlation or the difference -- the  
discrepancy is too large between the blocks, whether you  
look at Kai Ching -- Kai Ching is more but not by a lot.  
But here, if you look at the orders for FRY, there's  
much more, but there could be many reasons for that.  
Maybe the invoices are incomplete.

But if you look at the pipes, the length of pipes,  
it's not much more. But Kai Ching has used much more  
solder wire. Can you think of a reason why?

A. Perhaps the orders with Prosperity are not complete.

Q. So maybe you ordered more material -- well, you can't  
recall -- you don't recall making extra orders -- but  
you are saying you are just following instructions, so  
"when there are large components, pressure-reducing  
valves, or large pipes, then I will need to order solder  
wire"?

CHAIRMAN: We are aware that in Kai Ching Estate there are  
six blocks. They weren't built at the same time. 5, 6,  
4, 3, 1, 2, in that order. The two that you were  
responsible for were the last two, and you had to

install -- you had to do the plumbing installation at the end. But there is a sequential order and you were at the end of the sequence.

So, looking at page 128, from June 2012, there was no order for FRY material. In the latter half of the year, you had not ordered lead-free solder wire. Your explanation was that you got the material from Chan Siu Wah. But I am telling you, from 26 June 2012, all the way to page 102, to 2012, 2013, 2014, you were responsible for these four blocks, and you had only ordered 20 rolls of FRY lead-free solder. Do you agree?

A. What was that?

CHAIRMAN: Just looking at the invoices, from June 2012 all the way to March 2014, just looking at the invoices, your orders for FRY amounted to 20 rolls.

A. In Kai Ching --

CHAIRMAN: I'm talking about your orders. There were only 20 rolls.

A. There are only 20 rolls, according to the invoices.

CHAIRMAN: Of course we have to refer to invoices.

A. I can't recall everything.

CHAIRMAN: I understand. Do you understand what I am saying?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Just now, counsel Mr Shieh mentioned that in

Kai Ching there were orders for 300-plus pounds of solder wire. If you divide that, each block would have to use 50 rolls. Here you only have an order for 20 rolls. He says that it was approved on 3 June and there was an order on 4 June for 20 rolls.

We are saying there cannot be such a coincidence, and you are saying it is a coincidence?

A. It is a coincidence.

MR SHIEH: So I will summarise. It just so happened that 20 rolls of FRY were delivered on 4 June, but it is not related to the approval process. You weren't aware.

So you might have ordered more than 20 rolls, because the invoices are incomplete --

CHAIRMAN: Sorry. Just giving an example, in 2011, there was an order for 20 rolls, and then on 17 December there was another order, so that means you used up your first order on 14 October; you used up the material in two months. Do you understand what I am saying?

A. Well, we won't consume all the material before we place an order.

CHAIRMAN: Yes. You won't use up to the last inch of wire. You will continue to order as it's consumed. It's the same with your foremen.

So here you see that between a few months, some 80 or 100 pounds are already consumed. Within a short



period of time, a lot of material is consumed.

So, if you were to follow Chan Siu Wah's methodology, then you would use more than 20 rolls within a very short space. Do you understand?

A. I understand. But some of the invoices are incomplete.

MR SHIEH: In Kwai Luen, we mentioned that you are not sure whether your initial order was 20 rolls, whether there were further orders. But I recall you said in Kai Ching, when you ordered, you did not order solder wire?

A. Because Chan Siu Wah's workshop had the material.

Q. And you said you relied on his previous orders and you did not make orders yourself.

A. That's right.

CHAIRMAN: I would like to ask you, even though you worked for Ho Biu Kee, but towards the end of Kai Ching Estate, you were responsible for blocks 1 and 2. Was there a piece-rate arrangement?

A. We were given a daily salary.

MR SHIEH: We have looked at the six blocks of Kai Ching Estate. So which blocks have been identified as having excessive lead?

A. I think all six blocks.

Q. 1, 2, 4, 5, but not 3 and 6. So you can say that's chance. So even material with lead had been used, it

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C might not leach. But you are responsible for blocks 1 C

D and 2. There was excessive solder strip. That's why D

E statistically we have more cases. E

F A. But there were more prefabricated units in blocks 1 F

G and 2. G

H Q. But there was a central procurement of solder material. H

I A. So tubes, pipes and material was prefabricated, so I

J that's why they have more cases of excessive lead. J

K CHAIRMAN: Do we have more prefab units in blocks 1 and 2? K

L A. It was the slowest. L

M CHAIRMAN: I know. M

N MR SHIEH: We had looked at the table. Blocks 1, 2, 4, 5 -- N

O I am referring to -- O

P CHAIRMAN: Prefab units, which blocks had more prefab units? P

Q MR SHIEH: I can tell you that the prefab units require Q

R soldering, and that material was delivered from Hong R

S Kong. S

T A. Yes. T

U Q. So it's solder material ordered from Hong Kong, and they U

V didn't order their own material in the mainland. V

A. Yes. Q

CHAIRMAN: Did you decide what material would be delivered

to China? R

A. No. (Chinese spoken). S

CHAIRMAN: Who was in charge of that? T

U

V

MR SHIEH: Let's say you procured some material centrally for blocks 1, 2 or 3, 4, so your material was stored centrally.

A. Yes.

Q. So it wasn't delivered to the individual blocks, let's say 1 and 2; it was stored centrally?

A. Yes.

Q. So in this central location we have a whole bunch of solder material. Who decided what would be sent to China?

A. I don't know.

CHAIRMAN: Chan Siu Wah also said he didn't know. Nobody knows. Nobody in Ho Biu Kee knows.

MR SHIEH: Leung Wai King doesn't know.

CHAIRMAN: Nobody knows.

MR SHIEH: I need to ask Mr Leung.

CHAIRMAN: Even Mr Ho doesn't know.

MR SHIEH: So it's not just because of leaching in a prefab unit. The corridor units were not prefabricated.

A. Correct, yes.

Q. Let me ask you again -- 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, they were divided into three batches. Blocks 1 and 2, both blocks have quite a bit of excess of lead. So 1 and 2, you were responsible for those. So would it be possible that under your management, a lot of solder strip was

used, so statistically we have a higher proportion of excessive lead there? Or are you saying you just followed instructions? You followed instructions?

A. I followed the instructions.

Q. So for large pipes you used solder wire and for smaller pipes you used solder strips?

A. Yes.

Q. I want to show you Mr Chan Siu Wah's statement and see what reaction you have. Let's take a look at K3, Chan Siu Wah's witness statement. It's in Chinese, so you don't need the interpretation service.

Paragraph 47, these are responding to your paragraph 7(k). That says that Kwai Luen Estate Phase 2 was just following my example, Chan Siu Wah's example. He disagrees.

Let's see what your paragraph 7(k) says. It's in English. Page 2242, in 7(k), you say that you were the person in charge and one of the supervisors of Kai Ching Estate, and you had adopted the same practice of using solder strips for small diameter copper pipes connection in Kwai Luen Estate.

Chan Siu Wah disagrees. He had not discussed with you the use of solder material, he had not talked about solder strip and solder wire. In the last two lines, Chan Siu Wah said he did not discuss anything with you.

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 42	
C	Let's look at the two final lines. Chan Siu Wah	C
D	said he did not discuss with you which type of solder to	D
E	be used, and he did not discuss the differences between	E
F	solder strips and wires. He said he doesn't agree with	F
G	your view that you followed his practice for Kwai Luen	G
H	Estate in the use of solder.	H
I	Let's look at the first two lines in paragraph 47.	I
J	Chan Siu Wah said you said the practice of using solder	J
K	strips in Kwai Luen Estate took reference from the	K
L	example of Kai Ching Estate.	L
M	A. Yes.	M
N	Q. And you feel that the decision was made by Chan	N
O	Siu Wah --	O
P	A. Right.	P
Q	Q. -- and there cannot be another possibility; right?	Q
R	A. Right.	R
S	Q. Have you heard of Lung Yat Estate?	S
T	A. Yes.	T
U	Q. Chan Siu Wah was responsible for Lung Yat Estate; right?	U
V	A. Yes.	V
V	Q. Did you have any role to play at Lung Yat Estate? Did	V
	you help out?	
V	A. No.	V
	Q. So you only heard about it?	
	A. Yes.	

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C Q. Do you know what soldering materials were used for Lung Yat Estate? C

D CHAIRMAN: After Kwai Luen Estate, what was the next estate D  
E you were responsible for? E

F A. After Kwai Luen Estate, I no longer worked for this F  
G company. I left. G

H CHAIRMAN: When was that? H

I A. Around August 2013. Probably 2013 or 2014, I had left I  
J for half a year. J

K CHAIRMAN: Then you returned to Ho Biu Kee; right? K

L A. Yes. L

M CHAIRMAN: After you returned to Ho Biu Kee, what was the M  
N project you were next in charge of? N

O A. I went everywhere, Shui Chuen O Estate. O

P CHAIRMAN: Which phase was it? P

Q A. Phases 1 to 4. Q

R CHAIRMAN: What were you responsible for? R

S A. I followed up on the materials with them. S

T CHAIRMAN: So actually what was your position? T

U A. I was taking care of issues. U

V MR SHIEH: Are you referring to the person in charge? V

A. Well, I will go where my boss tells me too.

CHAIRMAN: I know. It's the same for all of us, including myself!

So what did you actually do?

- 58 -

MR SHIEH: What was your level of involvement? Were you only observing or did you decide which materials to be used?

A. No. I would teach the workers how to carry out different tasks.

Q. So you wouldn't do the nitty-gritty and you weren't the actual person in charge. So you were someone sent from the office to the site to see if there's anything wrong or if any help was required. So your job was very similar to Leung Wai Kin?

A. Well, he was more senior than me.

Q. So, if the workers don't know how to solder, they would ask you; right?

A. No. The workers we hired all know how to solder.

Q. So what were you responsible for?

A. I was responsible for meetings. I did not convene the meeting, but I would help out at the site.

Q. So you did not have any specific responsibilities, but whenever help is needed, people might ask you, because you were sent by the company? So you would visit several sites; right? You would not just stay in Shui Chuen O Estate; right?

A. Right.

CHAIRMAN: Kwai Luen Estate was the last time you ordered solder strips or wires, and thereafter you did not make

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 42	
C	any more orders, and you wouldn't know the type of solder used in future public rental housing projects?	C
D	A. Yes.	D
E	CHAIRMAN: So you only know about these two estates and nothing else?	E
F	A. Right.	F
G	CHAIRMAN: So you wouldn't know whether the relevant estates had problems?	G
H	A. Right.	H
I	MR SHIEH: Right now, we have had an incident which is widely reported in the media. The excessive lead was due to non-compliant solder, and the lead content was high.	I
J		J
K		K
L	So, internally, what can you do to clarify the solder use? Retrospectively, how are they going to put it?	L
M		M
N	A. I would just write "solder wire".	N
O	Q. Do you need the words "lead-free"?	O
P	A. No.	P
Q	Q. So, if you write "solder wire", it's well understood?	Q
R	A. Yes.	R
S	Q. For Ms Chiu, Madam Wong Wai Ping and Catlin, do you maintain communications or follow-up?	S
T	A. No.	T
U	Q. Or you would send them a fax and people would know what	U
V		V



A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 42	
C	to do?	C
	A. Yes.	
D	Q. Did nobody come and ask you what it is?	D
E	A. You know, you wrote something, and if they understand it, that's the end of the story.	E
F	Q. I would like you to look at some records. S1, page 86.	F
G	Page 107. This is for Kwai Luen Estate. You signed on this form; right?	G
H	A. Yes.	H
I	Q. And again you signed on page 108; right?	I
J	A. Yes.	J
K	Q. Now let's look at the delivery notes for Kai Ching Estate. Let's look at page 186. Can you confirm that this was your signature?	K
L	A. Yes.	L
M	Q. So whenever there's this Chinese character "Hung", it represents you?	M
N	A. Yes.	N
O	Q. I have one more question for you. I told you that for blocks 1 and 2 of Kai Ching Estate, there are more prefab units, and for blocks 3 to 6, they might not have prefab parts. So I would like to know why you feel this is relevant to the prefab parts. Solder is centrally organised in Hong Kong, and do you know why prefab units are relevant?	O
P		P
Q		Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V	- 61 -	V

A. The pipes were all pre-fitted in the room.

Q. So what?

A. So there would be a lot -- you know, the procedures are the same.

Q. So do you feel that the solder materials are the same?

A. Yes.

Q. But for blocks 1 and 2 --

A. There are a lot of prefab parts.

Q. So what? Does it affect the workmanship?

A. No. Solder strips would be used.

Q. Why?

A. I don't know why.

MR SHIEH: I have no further questions, Chairman.

Cross-examination by MR LAM

MR LAM: Mr Wong, I have some questions for you. I would like you to look at page 102 of S1.

Apart from the order on 4 June, thereafter, right until March 2014, WL50D was always used. You might say that -- well, there might be records from Prosperity, but basically you cannot recall when you ordered the lead-free solder wire.

In terms of the progress, on 4 June 2013, we see 165 pounds of WL50D tin strips. So, in other words, you know the difference between solder wires and strips. That's what you have to say to the procurement

department, before they can place an order.

In early June, some information shows that the sample flat was completed on 13 May 2014. So on 4 June you only started the work, and in June you bought 165 pounds of WL50D and 50 reels of solder wires, and by August you had to use 275 pounds and they can be used in the next two months, and in October again, around 200 pounds of solder strips, and in November only 55 or 110 pounds.

So, in other words, every month you would balance 100 to 220 pounds, and by Christmas, the peak period has already passed and a lot of works have been completed. So, by March, it would be the time to remedy the problems. So I don't think further orders are required.

Do you agree that the pressure-reducing valves would be installed later, after all the remaining works have been completed?

A. No. Some parts have arrived, and I asked my staff to solder them, as I said, and place them at the workshop, and when it's approved we can immediately begin work.

Q. We can see from the table that the peak periods were in August, November and December. Did the pressure-reducing valves come in batches --

A. They are set aside?

Q. How early do they arrive?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 42	
C	A. As soon as the components arrive, we can solder them.	C
	Q. They are not soldered at the last minute?	
D	A. No.	D
E	Q. Then I would like to ask, the delivery notes, did you inspect what was delivered and signed?	E
F	A. Yes.	F
G	Q. So, in other words, whether it was August or November, we see all of the signatures were yours, except one	G
H	signed by Ah Fu. Ah Fu is your deputy. So you or Ah Fu	H
I	would inspect the material delivered?	I
J	A. Yes.	J
K	Q. And you say, whether it was Shui On, there would be someone on the site, and they would know whether the	K
L	material had been delivered.	L
M	Do you know whether Shui On would check minor metal hardware?	M
N	A. No, I don't know.	N
O	Q. In Kwai Luen Estate, you had also, and Shui On had not asked for records regarding minor metal hardware?	O
P	A. Correct.	P
Q	Q. So, in your evidence, you say they should know -- you are just conjecturing?	Q
R	A. Yes.	R
S	Q. There's no actual proof or actual information indicating Shui On would know?	S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A. That's correct.

Q. I would like to ask, in your statement, you also say you saw workers holding rolls of solder?

A. Yes, I have seen that.

Q. The solder workers would use a whole roll to solder?

A. For soldering of the pressure-reducing valves.

Q. And the pressure-reducing valves were done downstairs?

A. In the workshop.

Q. In the room, in Ho Biu Kee's room, how many pressure-reducing valves were there in one block?

A. For the 100 mm, there were eight sets, and for the 80 mm, there were two sets.

Q. Eight sets for 100 mm and two sets for 80 mm. So for ten sets, how long would that take?

A. It depends on the workers' workmanship.

Q. How long does it take, on average?

A. It takes a whole day in the workshop. We need to prepare the material, we need to solder.

Q. So you've seen workers using the solder rolls?

A. Yes.

Q. How many workers were there? How many workers were working on the pressure-reducing valve?

A. One worker.

Q. So one worker can do all the work?

A. Well, they have to assemble it first and then install

C the pressure-reducing valve.

C

D Q. So the soldering, when is it done downstairs? Is it  
done downstairs or upstairs?

D

E A. Are you referring to silver brazing or solder wire?

E

F Q. We are dealing with solder wire; you used the solder,  
pressure-reducing valve.

F

G CHAIRMAN: Well, pressure-reducing valves, when they are  
delivered upstairs, do you use silver brazing or solder  
H wire?

H

I A. For large components, we use silver brazing. For small  
J components, we use solder wire.

I

K CHAIRMAN: So how many pressure-reducing valves are large  
and how many are small?

J

K

L A. There were eight 100 millimetres.

L

M CHAIRMAN: Those are large. Are you referring to 100 mm  
diameter?

M

N A. Yes.

N

O CHAIRMAN: 100 mm.

O

A. Yes.

P CHAIRMAN: Those use silver brazing.

P

Q A. Yes, 80 also.

Q

R CHAIRMAN: 80, there were only two.

R

A. There were also eight 80 mm.

S CHAIRMAN: How many large? Two?

S

T A. There were also eight large.

T

U

U

V

V

**A** *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* **A**

**B** Commission of Inquiry into Day 42 **B**  
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water

**C** MR LAM: Just now you said two and eight sets. **C**

A. There were two 50 mm.

**D** MR LAM: Let's do it again. Let's start again. **D**

**E** CHAIRMAN: Now, how many pressure-reducing valves are there **E**  
in one block?

**F** A. Four 100 mm. **F**

**G** CHAIRMAN: And then? **G**

A. Four 80 mm.

**H** CHAIRMAN: And then? **H**

**I** A. One 50 mm. **I**

**J** CHAIRMAN: So a total of nine. **J**

A. Yes.

**K** CHAIRMAN: Are you sure? **K**

A. Yes.

**L** CHAIRMAN: So silver brazing for the first two. **L**

**M** A. Yes. **M**

**N** CHAIRMAN: And the last one using solder wire. So you **N**  
wouldn't use a lot of solder wire?

**O** MR LAM: You don't need 20 rolls. **O**

**P** CHAIRMAN: That's a small sum. **P**

**Q** A. So the remaining solder wire would be used on tubes and **Q**  
pipes. 50 mm pipes.

**R** MR LAM: Used on what size? **R**

**S** A. 50 mm. **S**

**T** Q. (Chinese spoken). **T**

**U**

**V**

A. I told you, I don't know whether the Prosperity invoices are complete.

CHAIRMAN: Let's assume they are complete. We don't see any reason for Prosperity to deceive us.

MR LAM: In fact, aside from 4 June, when you received that sample, you had never made any orders?

A. I can't remember.

CHAIRMAN: Let's come back after lunch. You can think thoroughly how many pressure-reducing valves, and what other -- to my understanding, there shouldn't be any other components needed. There is only pressure-reducing valves, there's nothing else.

Okay, let's resume at 2.30 then.

(12.53 pm)

(The luncheon adjournment)

(2.31 pm)

CHAIRMAN: Let's continue.

MR LAM: Mr Wong, before the lunch break, the chairman asked you to consider how many pressure-reducing valves required solder during the installation. Are you referring to solder wires?

A. Yes.

Q. Let's not talk about silver brazing. Let's focus on solder wires.

A. Eight sets, 2 inches. Eight sets times 50.



A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

A  
B  
C  
D  
E  
F  
G  
H  
I  
J  
K  
L  
M  
N  
O  
P  
Q  
R  
S  
T  
U  
V

Q. Anything else?

A. No.

Q. So eight sets. Which part would you apply the solder?

A. The back and the intersection.

Q. So how many reels are required for each set?

A. For each set, around one reel is required.

Q. So in other words eight reels would be required?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: You need one reel for one set?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: That's a lot of solder.

A. That includes the tip.

CHAIRMAN: So you need one reel per set? All right. Later

on, we will have witnesses from the Construction

Industry Council and Vocational Training Council to show

us whether what you said is accurate.

MR LAM: You weren't personally involved in the

installation, so how do you know that one reel is

required per set, since you didn't personally do the

hands-on work?

A. I expect to use one reel per set.

Q. So if more or less solder is actually used, would you

know that? So how did you come up with that estimation?

A. If there's any left over, it can be used for the next set.

Q. You said there are eight sets and eight reels of solder were required, and for others, 20 reels were ordered on 4 June. So what about the other solder wire, where were they used?

A. If they couldn't be finished, then they would be stored.

Q. In 2013, was there any solder wire left over?

A. No -- well, I cannot recall.

Q. If there are any leftovers, would they be transported back to Ho Biu Kee?

A. No, they would be left on site.

Q. So you would simply leave them at the site? So no one would use them?

A. I didn't monitor the materials all the time.

Q. You were the one -- you had to be the one monitoring the materials, because when you ran out of materials you had to make orders?

A. I wasn't present all the time, and I would only place orders if we ran out of materials.

Q. In your evidence, you said workers had to hold the whole reel of solder as they conducted soldering. According to the workers, they would cut the wires up in pieces. I have asked two or three workers. Do you agree with what they said?

A. I don't know.

Q. So, according to you, you describe what the workers were

doing, so apparently that's wrong?

A. I said if the workers held the wires in their hands,  
they might be burnt.

Q. So how do you know?

A. I saw them.

MR LAM: Have you seen any workers getting hurt?

CHAIRMAN: I have a question. You said a big chunk of the  
solder had to be discarded to avoid any burns. When you  
use the LPG torch, you don't apply the torch on the  
solder; you just apply it on the pipes. So, as the pipe  
heats up, you would apply the solder, or the solder  
sticks, so that the sticks would stick on the pipes. So  
how could the workers burn their hands?

A. As they solder the parts.

CHAIRMAN: I understand when you hold the solder strip --  
well, the solder itself wouldn't get hot, but only that  
the pipe would get hot.

A. The workers worry that the solder torch might burn their  
hands.

CHAIRMAN: So, if they are afraid of getting hurt, then they  
can just take it away.

A. (Chinese spoken).

MR SHIEH: The torch must be constantly applied.

CHAIRMAN: You can apply it for a longer time period.

A. If it gets too hot, then the solder might not stick

properly.

CHAIRMAN: So if the temperature is too high --

A. The solder might not stick properly.

CHAIRMAN: (Chinese spoken)?

A. If the fire is too strong, the solder might not apply properly.

CHAIRMAN: Let's not think about the temperature. You said you are afraid of the heat. Let's take this right hand here, as an example -- let's say if they hold the torch with their right hand, they can simply apply the torch and take it away when it gets too hot? (Demonstrating).

A. Usually, they would discard the remaining when the solder shrinks.

CHAIRMAN: My point is that the solder strip itself is not hot, so of course, at the end, if you cannot apply the solder, you have to discard it. So right now you said you would only apply 10 centimetres or 4 inches then you would discard the solder. That's what you said. Then you said you cannot save the solder because you would discard the remaining part every time.

So my feeling is, is that really necessary? If you are holding a matchstick, then you are going to discard it when the matchstick gets too short.

A. That's the normal practice of the workers.

CHAIRMAN: So you don't have to discard 4 inches of solder?

A. They are afraid that their hands would be burnt.

MR LAM: That's what the chairman thinks. The chairman thinks it would not happen. Even if they are worried, they can wear gloves. So this is a wrong description if you say the hand might be burnt.

CHAIRMAN: So there's a lot of wastage.

A. Well, the workers won't try to save money for you.

CHAIRMAN: But still, they don't have to waste such a big chunk of solder.

The plumbing contractors told us that they did not do it on purpose and they did not manage to save a lot of materials or solder. So my question is why do you have to throw away such big chunks of solder?

MR LAM: Do you know the reason?

A. That's the normal practice of the workers. I have nothing to add.

Q. Mr Wong, do you agree that no one would hold the whole reel of solder as they applied soldering, because it's inconvenient; do you agree?

A. No, I do not agree.

Q. Before the lunch break, you talked about Shin Ming Estate and I have some questions for you. Mr Kwong, your colleague, said that other estates Ho Bui Kee was responsible for all used FRY. Do you know that on 18 May 2009, a submission was made to the Housing

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C Department? C

D A. No. D

E Q. Ho Biu Kee made the submission. E

F A. I didn't know. F

G Q. Excuse me, it was submitted by Shui On. FRY was G submitted for Shin Ming Estate; do you know?

H A. No. H

I MR SHIEH: (Chinese spoken). I

J MR LAM: I haven't managed to locate that document. J

K (Chinese spoken). K

L MR SHIEH: (Chinese spoken). L

M CHAIRMAN: For Shin Ming Estate, were tin elbows used? M

N A. Yes. N

O MR LAM: On 27 May 2009, the Housing Department approved the O use of FRY; are you aware of that?

P A. No. P

Q CHAIRMAN: Now, if I understand correctly, the use of tin Q elbows would not require the use of FRY.

R A. Yes. R

S MR LAM: I have no further questions. S

T Cross-examination by MR PENNICOTT T

U (All questions from Mr Pennicott were in English) U

V MR PENNICOTT: Mr Wong, good afternoon. I represent V China State and I want to ask you a few questions, not many, because Mr Shieh and Mr Lam have already covered

quite a few areas already.

First of all, can I ask you this: over what period of time precisely were you block supervisor for blocks 1 and 2 at Kai Ching?

A. April 2012.

Q. Until when?

A. Until the end of the year. Until December.

CHAIRMAN: Do you mean December 2012?

A. The end of 2012.

MR PENNICOTT: For a period of eight months; is that right?

A. Yes.

Q. When you arrived at Kai Ching in April 2012, what plumbing works had been carried out already on blocks 1 and 2?

A. The laying of pipes, the pipes outside, those at the roof and pipes or drainage pipes.

Q. Was it Mr Chan Siu Wah who was, as it were, in overall charge of that work before you arrived?

A. Yes.

Q. Prior to April 2012, I think you told us that you were working on the Un Chau Estate Phase 5. Is that right?

A. Yes.

Q. That comprised three blocks?

A. Yes.

Q. Is it your evidence that solder, of any type, was not

used on that project?

A. No, it wasn't used.

Q. It's not your evidence it was used?

Was silver brazing used?

A. Yes, silver brazing was used.

Q. All right. Now, prior to Un Chau, as we have heard, you were working on a Shui On estate called Shin Ming; is that right?

A. Yes, that's correct.

Q. We know that Shin Ming was completed in 2011. Do you recall that?

A. Yes. Yes.

Q. Mr Shieh earlier suggested that it might have started in about 2009. Let's assume that's right. You started with HBK in 2003. What other projects were you involved in between 2003 and 2008?

A. I installed sanitation. I worked with plastic tubes. I also installed water meters, and I also had to follow up with other workers' residual work.

CHAIRMAN: The question was in which estate.

A. I don't really remember.

CHAIRMAN: So between 2003 and 2009, which estates did you work in?

A. I can't recall.

CHAIRMAN: Could you give some examples?



A. Hoi Lai Estate.

CHAIRMAN: Anything else?

A. I can't recall.

MR PENNICOTT: Let's see if we can jog your memory. Would you look at or be shown H1/121.

Mr Wong, just to explain very briefly, this is a list of contracts carried out by Shui On, and you will see in the middle column a heading "Subcontractors"; do you see that?

Do you follow?

A. I can see it.

Q. Just by way of example, let's look at item 3, Ching Ho Estate. HBK was the subcontractor. It was 2006. Were you involved in that estate?

A. No.

Q. What about the next one, Choi Ying?

A. No.

Q. The next one, Lam Tin?

A. I only installed sanitaryware in Lam Tin.

Q. Okay. What about Yau Lai, the next one?

A. I did not work there.

Q. Okay. Then could you be shown, please, F2/1340. You can put that file away, Mr Wong. Mr Wong, this is a similar list but in relation to China State. Again, if you just cast your eye down the names of the estates,

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C the first nine items, do you recognise any of those, to C  
save me going through them one by one?

D Forget number 5, I'm sorry. D

E A. I have worked in Hoi Lai Estate. E

F Q. Doing the sort of work that you describe -- F

F A. Correct. I was following up. F

G CHAIRMAN: What is "following up"? G

H A. If the sanitaryware was broken, if the faucet was H  
broken, I would have to fix all the errors.

I CHAIRMAN: What about leaks? I

J A. Those were compression joint components. J

K CHAIRMAN: It might leak? K

K A. Not so often. K

L MR PENNICOTT: So is this right then, Mr Wong, that the L  
first time that you personally had ever encountered

M soldering of copper pipes was on the Kai Ching project? M

N A. Correct. N

O Q. Was the Kai Ching project the first and only time you O  
had worked with Mr Chan Siu Wah?

P A. Correct. P

Q Q. One of the common denominators of Kai Ching, Kwai Luen, Q  
Un Chau and Shin Ming was the licensed plumber, Mr Lam

R Tak Sum. Is he a gentleman that you know? R

S A. I don't know him. S

T Q. When you were supervising the plumbing construction in T

U

V

blocks 1 and 2 at Kai Ching, were you never introduced to him?

A. No.

Q. So, similarly, you were never introduced to him on the other three projects either; is that your evidence?

A. No.

CHAIRMAN: You mean you never had a conversation with him?

A. He would take us to collect the meters, samples. We would inspect. Those are the only three occasions.

CHAIRMAN: Collecting water meters, where did you collect the water meters?

A. At the Water Supplies Department, we had to sign.

CHAIRMAN: Then you would inspect and also collect water samples. So before the permit was issued, you would have to collect samples.

A. Yes.

MR PENNICOTT: Do you ever recall Mr Lam inspecting any of the plumbing works at blocks 1 and 2?

A. No.

Q. Mr Wong, do you agree with this general proposition, that the sequence of construction of the plumbing works was, firstly, the common areas, including the corridors; do you agree with that? That was the first stage of works?

A. Correct.

Q. Then with some overlap, then next the individual units?

A. I don't understand your question. Could you rephrase your question?

Q. Yes. Broadly, I am putting to you, Mr Wong, is it goes common areas, individual units, external areas. Do you agree with that sequence, as a general point, in terms of --

A. Well, I would work in the corridors first. I installed corridors first. Then I do the entrance.

CHAIRMAN: And exterior walls are the last?

A. Right.

MR PENNICOTT: Mr Wong, to the best of your recollection, in about June-July of 2012, was the plumbing works proceeding in all six blocks in tandem -- to the best of your recollection?

A. I cannot recall.

Q. A different topic. Can I ask you please to be shown again S1/186. Mr Wong, this is a delivery note that Mr Shieh showed you earlier, and it's signed by you?

A. Yes.

Q. As I understand it, it is for materials exclusively for blocks 1 and 2; is that right?

A. Correct.

Q. You refer in your witness statement to you having the authority to order materials from head office in the

latter stages of the project. How do you define "latter stages"? Obviously we've got October 2012 here. How do you define "latter stages"?

A. So when it was in a rush, we had to meet the deadline.

Q. When these materials arrived on site, you obviously took delivery of them, you checked them and you signed the delivery note; is that right?

A. Correct.

Q. Then you personally would, or perhaps with others, take the materials to blocks 1 and 2; is that right?

A. Correct.

Q. Could I then ask you to be shown S1/160 -- the same file, page 160. This is a delivery note dated 25 May 2012, and you will see the third item on there, Mr Wong, is 100 reels of FRY 99C lead-free solder. Do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. Can you help us with this: when 100 reels of FRY lead-free solder turned up at the site and delivery was taken, how would it be distributed amongst the six blocks?

A. We would store it in the workshop of blocks 3 and 4 and you would have to collect as much material as you needed.

Q. My understanding, from other evidence, Mr Wong, is that

certainly by about June-July 2012, there was in fact a workshop for HBK in each of the six blocks. Do you agree with that?

A. Yes.

Q. Are you saying that the storage of materials was only in blocks 3 and 4?

A. That's correct. They would deliver the material to us.

Q. Right, but you had to go and fetch the material from the blocks 3 and 4 workshops if you wanted that material; is that right?

A. Correct.

Q. Was there a process by which you had to, as it were, sign out for any of the materials that you took from the workshop, or could you just go and help yourself?

A. There was no signing off.

Q. Okay.

CHAIRMAN: Well, if it's centrally allocated, why did you need to order material then? If all the material went to Chan Siu Wah in blocks 3 and 4 and it was stored there --

A. Correct.

CHAIRMAN: -- then why -- Fan Sau Peng could place orders, because Chan Siu Wah, he would be aware of what was out of stock and how much residual material there was?

A. Because in the interim period, blocks 3 and 4 were his

top priority and he couldn't care about blocks 1, 2, 5  
and 6, so all the material went to blocks 3 and 4 first.  
We told our boss, we were authorised and we could fill  
out our own material request forms.

CHAIRMAN: But then they would still deliver to blocks 3  
and 4?

A. No. At the latter stages, once we made the orders, they  
would arrive at blocks 1 and 2 and 5 and 6.

CHAIRMAN: So you received the goods yourselves; right?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: To which company did Tam Kwok Ho belong?

A. He was a supervisor.

CHAIRMAN: Which block was he responsible in?

A. When Chan Siu Wah left, it's Tam Kwok Ho's turn.

CHAIRMAN: There weren't a lot of delivery notes in which  
you were the receiving party with regards to Kai Ching  
Estate. You were the receiving party, only two or three  
delivery notes.

15 November 2012, page 190. It says you were the  
receiving party, but silver brazing sticks were  
delivered. Who was Ching Tak Shing?

A. He was a staff of Chan Siu Wah.

CHAIRMAN: And on 20 October 2012, on page 186, you signed  
on it. There were only 110 pounds of solder strip, and  
Tam Kwok Ho was not your staff; right?

On page 180, Leung Wai Kin was the receiving party.

The co-ordinator was Wong Kwai Hung. So does it mean you received those batch of goods, on page 180? So did the two of you receive the goods?

A. His name is on almost every delivery order.

CHAIRMAN: So yourself or him received the goods. What about the others -- in the other delivery notes, Chan Siu Wah was the receiving party. So you only ordered very few materials, if what you said was indeed correct?

A. Yes.

MR PENNICOTT: Just on the further question of delivery notes, could I ask you please to go to your witness statement, at K3, page 2244.

At subparagraph (d), at the bottom of the page, Mr Wong, you say:

"Further, we had to inform the main contractors as well as the HD staff of all materials delivered to site for incorporation into works. If they requested copy of delivery orders of the soldering materials issued by Prosperity, I would give to them."

Mr Wong, so far as Kai Ching is concerned, were you ever requested by anybody at China State to give them a copy of a delivery note or an order?

A. No.

Q. To the best of your understanding, was there any



instruction from HBK's head office that the main contractor, China State, should be given copies of the delivery notes, as far as you are aware?

A. No.

Q. Could I ask you please to be shown a photograph at bundle A1, page 714. Look at the photograph, the second one from the bottom. You should see there a photograph of a 100 millimetre diameter pressure-reducing valve, copper alloy. Do you see that?

A. I see that.

Q. I know others have touched on this before, but I just want to try to get it clearer. What is your understanding of how solder would be used in relation to this pressure-reducing valve, if any?

A. There's a structure where you insert the pipe and there's a tip where you apply this switch.

CHAIRMAN: This is rather hard to translate. Can you make it less complicated? This is a pressure-reducing valve; right? This is a pressure-reducing valve. If you are to make connections, you have to use a so-called flange, and you would use screws; you won't have to apply solder. Is that the correct understanding?

MR PENNICOTT: That's my understanding, Mr Chairman and Mr Wong.

So explain the relationship between

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into  
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C pressure-reducing valves and the use of solder, please,  
Mr Wong. C

D A. There's a valve. If it's used to connect copper pipes, D  
E then it would be connected to a copper pipe before heat E  
F is applied to the tip. F

F CHAIRMAN: There's a flange; right? F

G A. There's a flange where you can insert the pipe and G  
H silver brazing would be used. H

H CHAIRMAN: But you said soldering would be used. H

I A. This is a 100 millimetre diameter part, so that's why I  
J silver brazing is used. J

J CHAIRMAN: All right. Wait a second. J

K So from one end of the pipe to the other, it would K  
L pass by this device. So what do you have to connect to L  
M this part? M

M A. It has to be connected to the copper pipe. M

N CHAIRMAN: Yes, I know that. N

O A. Copper pipes would be connected to both sides of the O  
P valve. P

P CHAIRMAN: If a copper pipe is inserted into the flange, P  
Q then you have to connect a metallic flange first? Q

Q A. You have to connect it to the pipe, and it would be the Q  
R copper core itself. R

R CHAIRMAN: Don't you use screws? S

S A. Yes, a metallic flange must be connected to the copper T  
T  
U  
U  
V

end.

CHAIRMAN: So why do you still need to apply solder?

A. That's how the component or the device works.

COMMISSIONER LAI: Where do you apply the solder?

CHAIRMAN: Well, you don't need to use solder at all, but according to him, solder is required.

A. For 50 millimetre pressure-reducing valves, then solder would be applied.

CHAIRMAN: We are looking at 100 millimetre

pressure-reducing valve. What Mr Pennicott meant was that no silver brazing is required. You just have to use screws.

MR PENNICOTT: No solder, no silver brazing.

CHAIRMAN: Right. You just have to apply screws on the flange to connect the pipes.

MR PENNICOTT: I'm just trying to establish the witness's understanding of the connection between soldering or silver brazing on the one hand and this --

CHAIRMAN: According to your version, this is completely unnecessary.

A. Yes. It's required only if pipe connections have to be made.

CHAIRMAN: Of course, I understand, or else how can you reduce the pressure? So do the pipes pass through this device?

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 42 B

C A. No. C

D CHAIRMAN: So where does it pass through? D

E A. You have to add a flange. E

F CHAIRMAN: Can you draw it, please? F

G Please pass him a sheet of paper. G

H You have been in plumbing for almost 30 years, I'm H

I sure you know how to -- you can draw it up. Please pass I

J him an A4 sheet and a pen. J

K Now we will show you something similar which you can K

L copy. For gate valves, they also have flanges on both L

M ends, where the pipes connect, and then screws would be M

N applied. N

O (The witness complied) O

P Please pass it to me. (Handed). P

Q I don't understand, sorry. I think no one would Q

R understand what that means. Let's show them what it R

S looks like. (Handed). S

T Perhaps Mr Yeung, who is an engineering expert, T

U might understand it. U

V MR YEUNG: I don't know. V

CHAIRMAN: If anyone understands what it means, please

explain it to me.

Hold on a second. Please pass the drawing back to

him. (Handed).

(Drawing). I might not have done a very good job.

If this is pressure-reducing valve, is this the way the pipe connections should be made? Please show it to the engineering experts. You can just screw it on.

So there should be some nuts and bolts before you can tighten it.

Is this the case? Is that the way it's connected?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Exactly. So you call it a flange joint, and you don't need soldering, you just use a screw to tighten it.

MR YEUNG: This flange, the location (indicating his own sketch) --

MR SHIEH: So the witness, could you mark a location with a red pen, to indicate.

CHAIRMAN: At the edge of the flange and external area of the pipe. Let me draw on the diagram and ask him. Give me a red pen as well. (Drawing).

Mr Yeung, is this what you mean?

MR YEUNG: Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Of course we are only look at it from the edge, sideways.

A. Yes, that's it.

CHAIRMAN: So let's circulate it amongst counsel.

Mr Wong, is that correct? If it's the case, you wouldn't need one reel for eight sets of these valves.

You said it's a 70 millimetre or 50 millimetre. The diameter is 50 millimetres -- the circumference?

MR YEUNG: The circumference.

CHAIRMAN: You can calculate that. I forget the formula.

MR SHIEH: It's another one, it's pi r.

CHAIRMAN: So why would you use the whole reel of solder wire?

A. They would use the remaining material.

CHAIRMAN: Use the remaining?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: So you can solder either of them with one reel, and there's still surplus. How do you respond?

A. So we use the remaining material for soldering.

CHAIRMAN: Okay. Please continue.

MR PENNICOTT: I am going to move on, Mr Wong.

CHAIRMAN: Please retain this diagram as an exhibit. Give it a number.

MR PENNICOTT: I'm going to move on.

Can I just ask you this question, Mr Wong: do you agree that gate valves don't require any soldering?

CHAIRMAN: The one below, in the picture below.

A. This one doesn't need soldering.

MR PENNICOTT: What about stopcocks; do they need soldering?

CHAIRMAN: (Chinese spoken).

MR PENNICOTT: It's the photograph at 717, if it helps.

CHAIRMAN: (Chinese spoken).

A. What is a stopcock?

CHAIRMAN: This one does not need solder?

MR PENNICOTT: The question is does he agree this doesn't  
need soldering?

A. That does not require soldering material.

MR PENNICOTT: Okay. Just one last topic, Mr Wong. In your  
answers to Mr Shieh earlier, you made mention of the  
prefabricated units in Kai Ching; do you remember that?

A. Yes.

Q. What was the purpose of making reference to the  
prefabricated units? Why did you refer to them? What  
were you trying to convey to the Commission?

A. Just now, Mr Shieh asked, in blocks 1 and 2, why would  
there be excessive lead in the water sample, and  
blocks 1 and 2 were the latest and they had more  
prefabricated units.

Q. That's simply not right, is it, Mr Wong? Because the  
position is this: block 2 are most prefabricated units.  
Block 1 had the least prefabricated units. Yet the  
answer in terms of alleged excessive lead in the water  
was the same. So what's the connection that you are  
trying to make, Mr Wong?

A. There's no specific meaning attached to that.

MR PENNICOTT: Thank you very much.

CHAIRMAN: Any other questions?

Cross-examination by MR YIN

MR YIN: Mr Wong, I represent the Housing Authority, and I would like to follow up with your written statement. In your response to question 8 -- in the English version, it's page 2244, paragraph (c) -- I just want to clarify with you.

It seems that you are saying the Housing Department's staff, they should be aware that solder material contained lead. So, first of all, you are not saying that individual Housing Department staff told you that they knew, or you had told them that the solder material you were using contained lead. That's not what you said; right?

A. Correct.

Q. So you had never communicated with them?

A. No.

Q. You are just saying that you are guessing, you conjecture, you think that Housing Department staff knew you were using solder material containing lead?

A. No.

Q. Because it seems that soldering material with lead were in strips and lead-free soldering material were in rolls and you had to hold the whole thing in your hand. It seems that your deduction is that if you see workers



working with strips, they should know they contain lead;  
is that what you mean?

A. No.

Q. What do you mean, then? Could you explain?

A. It's solder. It's tin, tin solder.

Q. We're talking about two types of soldering material. We  
know some contain lead.

A. I don't know.

Q. But we know now.

A. Yes.

Q. In your witness statement, you say the Housing  
Department's staff, if they see -- if it wasn't a roll,  
then they should have known you were using the strips.

A. I don't know whether they knew.

CHAIRMAN: Anybody else with questions?

Okay. Thank you, Mr Wong. You have given evidence.

You are free to leave.

Let's take a ten-minute break.

(The witness withdrew)

(3.26 pm)

(A short adjournment)

(3.41 pm)

MR YEUNG: Chairman, the next witness would be Madam Chiu  
Wai Kuen, Jess.

MS JESS CHIU WAI KUEN (affirmed)

CHAIRMAN: Please take a seat.

Examination-in-chief by MR YEUNG

MR YEUNG: Ms Chiu, we know that on 23 December last year, you prepared a witness statement. One or two days ago, you wanted to make some amendments, and you submitted a revised witness statement. It contains 21 pages.

Please put on your headset. Since your witness statement is in English, I will read it out in English.

(Statement read in English)

(In English) That is now dated the 19th day of January 2006.

A. I agree.

Q. You see your signature there. You have read this revised witness statement. Do you confirm the contents are accurate? Are you willing to accept this as part of your evidence?

A. Yes.

Q. I have a few questions for you. First of all, you said that in February 2009 you joined HBK, and you are now manager of the procurement department. Were you manager then?

A. No.

Q. So when did you become manager?

A. Around 2010.

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Day 42 B  
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water

C Q. We see in your witness statement Catlin and Ms Wong were C  
assisting you.

D A. Yes. D

E Q. So from time to time you would delegate some work to E  
them?

F A. Yes. F

G Q. What was the division of labour between you and the G  
other staff?

H A. When we received a material request form from the site, H  
I say for sundry items, I would delegate that to them, and I  
J I would tell them to get a quote from the suppliers, J  
then they would type out the orders.

K If it was for important, main material, I would K  
L handle that. L

M Q. So Catlin and Purple, after they purchased the material, M  
did they report back to you?

N A. Basically, the first couple of times there were some N  
O examples that they could make a reference to, so I would O  
P take a look and see if there were any errors. I was P  
aware of what they ordered, yes.

Q Q. I would like to ask you, regarding Lung Yat Estate, do Q  
you have any recollection of that estate?

R A. Is it Tuen Mun Area 18? R

S Q. Yes. Mr Chan Siu Wah mentioned the procurement S  
T department staff had phoned him and told him that in a T  
U U  
V V

material request form, that is the form filled out by Chan Siu Wah, he had asked for short solder strips and he was instructed to revise that to solder wire. Did you make that call?

A. No, I did not.

Q. Did other procurement staff?

A. I don't know.

Q. Did you ask other procurement staff to make that phone call?

A. Other staff?

Q. There were other procurement staff assisting you. Did you request other procurement staff to phone Mr Chan Siu Wah to amend the order from solder strip to solder wire?

A. I did not instruct other staff.

Q. I would also like to direct you to the last page of your witness statement, K3/2378.24.

We see this is a material request form for Shui Chuen O Estate.

A. Yes.

Q. We see there is a list of material, and you asked Tung Wah to give you a quotation.

So, for items 3 to 8, you have written "Tung Wah, attention Mr Choi, please provide quotation". You have some recollection of this material request form ^ (ask)?

A. Yes.

Q. Please take a look, in item 6, that is solder wire, 100 rolls?

A. Yes.

Q. The quotation returned was \$67 per pound. In your witness statement, paragraph (j), you mention this issue. I would like to ask you, the solder wire you asked Tung Wah to provide a quotation for and the solder wire you purchased from Prosperity, was it the same?

A. Well, if you look at the wording, it seems like the same thing.

Q. So the purpose for having Tung Wah provide a quotation?

A. It was to gauge market price.

Q. What's the purpose of that?

A. If they are a lot cheaper or if you compare apples to apples, then I would ask Prosperity, "Why are you so expensive?" But excuse me, for this example, in our company, we would order from Prosperity first regarding the solder strip or solder wire. We wouldn't consider other suppliers.

Q. So for Shui Chuen O project, who provided the material?

A. Prosperity.

Q. The last item, a price comparison between solder strip and solder wire. If we look at paragraph (j), page 2378.5, we see you have done a comparison. Ms Wong

Wai Ping had mentioned that but she says she is not very clear and told us to ask you.

In paragraph (j) you said Tung Wah's price, you compared that to Prosperity's price. So I would like to ask you, you are saying the net price was \$160 per roll, and it seems that in Prosperity's -- they don't mention \$160, so how did you get the \$160 price?

A. First of all, the general quotation from Prosperity was 190. They gave that price to all their customers.

Q. Please stop. The general quotation, is that on page 2378.23?

A. Yes, 2378.23.

Q. Item 2, we have FRY 99C, \$190, so there is a \$30 difference. How do you get to 160?

A. That's a reference price for all their customers, so we tell them they are expensive because we found a market price that was cheaper, so they gave us a special price of 160, just for us. So it was supposed to be a preferential price.

Q. We see this \$160, you converted to \$145 per pound.

A. Yes.

Q. How did you convert that?

CHAIRMAN: We know that. There's no need to ask that.

MR YEUNG: Okay.

Chairman, I do not have any other questions for

C Ms Chiu.

C

D CHAIRMAN: Other counsel will have questions. It's 4.30,  
let's adjourn. You can return tomorrow at 10 o'clock.

D

E Thank you.

E

F (4.29 pm)

F

G (The hearing adjourned until 10.00 am the following day)

G

H

H

I

I

J

J

K

K

L

L

M

M

N

N

O

O

P

P

Q

Q

R

R

S

S

T

T

U

U

V

V

C INDEX C

PAGE

D MR LEUNG WAI KIN (on former affirmation) .....1 D

E Cross-examination by MR SHIEH (continued) .....1 E

F Cross-examination by MR LAM .....2 F

(The witness withdrew) .....8

G MR WONG KWAI HUNG (affirmed) .....8 G

H Examination-in-chief by MR YEUNG .....8 H

Cross-examination by MR SHIEH .....15

I Cross-examination by MR LAM .....62 I

J Cross-examination by MR PENNICOTT .....74 J

Cross-examination by MR YIN .....92

K (The witness withdrew) .....93 K

L MS JESS CHIU WAI KUEN (affirmed) .....94 L

Examination-in-chief by MR YEUNG .....94

M M

N N

O O

P P

Q Q

R R

S S

T T

U U

V V