

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

2015年12月4日

上午10時01分恢復聆訊

出席人士：許偉強大律師及鄭欣琪大律師，為外聘律師，代表食水含鉛超標調查委員會

黃佩琪大律師及李頌然大律師，由顧增海律師行延聘，代表有利建築有限公司、明合有限公司及伍克明

何沛謙資深大律師及殷志明大律師，由羅夏信律師事務所延聘，代表香港房屋委員會

王鳴峰資深大律師、陳樂信大律師及羅頌明大律師，由律政司延聘，代表水務署署長

林國輝大律師，由孖士打律師行延聘，代表瑞安承建有限公司

林定韻大律師，由孖士打律師行延聘，代表中國建築工程（香港）有限公司

譚俊傑大律師，由何謝韋、李偉業律師事務所延聘，代表啟晴邨及葵聯二邨公屋居民代表 Lee Pui Yi、Chong So Nga 及 Lui Hui Ping

許佐賓大律師，由的近律師行延聘，代表保華建築營造有限公司

許偉強先生：主席，我都係剛剛先收到蕭健煌先生就提交咗一張--應該係一張報價單。

主席：係。

許偉強先生：咁就畀咗我哋代表律師，即係 Lo & Lo 嗰邊，我都係啱啱先至收到，或者我呈交一份畀兩位睇下先。

主席：好。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

恆利工程公司（“恆利”）的證人：蕭健煌（（恆利擁有人）（彩福邨））
宣誓繼續作供

許偉強先生繼續盤問

問：蕭先生，我知道你就呈交咗一張有關彩霞邨三期地盤報價嘅一張文件？

答：係。

問：呢個彩霞邨三期同我哋尋日講嗰個彩福邨有冇關係？

答：就係彩福邨。

問：就係彩福邨嚟嘅？

答：係。

問：你呢一張咁嘅報價文件，我見到下面寫住「蕭健煌」，亦都有你公司嗰個「恆利工程公司」嗰個蓋章？

答：係。

問：係咪你簽名嚟嘍，嗰個？

答：係我簽名。

問：係。你呢一張報價表格係交咗畀邊位呀？

答：明合。誒...

問：明合？

答：係呀，交界明合。

問：明合邊位同事，記唔記得？

答：應該交咗畀伍克明。

問：伍克明？

答：係。

問：好。第1段嗰度，你就講話「大樓價：由地下至天面安裝一切來水喉、

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

去水喉及潔具以每伙計」咁樣。

答：係，冇錯。

問：你就計算出嚟，就大概係二千五百六十伙，咁每伙嘅價格就係 3,750 釐，係咪？

答：嘅。

問：我就想先停一停，喺呢度講一講先。呢個 3,750 釐，咁就係你...

答：係我報嘅價。

問：係你報嘅價？

答：係。

問：係。咁就...

答：實際上嗰個價就唔係呢個價。

問：唔，我等陣先再問你實際上嗰個價。你當時報呢一個價嘅時候，咁係考慮咗啲乜嘢嘍，呢度？即係包括咗啲咩嘢嘍度嘍？

答：包括咗就即係小五金嗰度，我寫咗喺度嘍。

問：吓？

答：包小五金係寫咗喺度囉，下面，最下面嗰度。

問：下面？

主席：包小五金？

答：嘅。

問：你下--你係講緊最後嗰段咩嘍？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：你係講「以上工程不包地渠、沙井...」嗰啲？

答：係。

問：跟住第二句係咩嘢？「包土...」

答：包土黏膠布。

問：包土黏膠布？

答：係，油灰。

問：油灰，係。

答：石油氣、膠水，同埋松香膏、錫條。

問：即係呢啲就係你講嘅小五金？

答：係，冇錯。

問：如果我哋以每伙計 3,750 釐，有幾多係你剛才講嘅小五金？有幾多係人工？

答：我初步嗰陣時，如果係報價嗰陣時估，我大概都係差唔多 200 釐嘅個小五金囉。

問：係。你剛才話呢個係你個報價喇當時，咁最後後畀大家商議咗之後，...

答：其實應該係三--我有記錯就應--因為個合約我搵唔到，就實際應該係三千六百幾。就呢個係大概--好似--即係唔係好記得嘞就。

問：係。

答：因為事隔咗咁多年。

問：唔。就住你最後講嗰啲包嘅小五金，入面嗰啲錫條我哋所講，即係我哋尋日一路講緊嗰個錫條。

答：係。

問：嗰度你有冇話參考過一個咩嘢價格嚟到定出嚟？

答：咪佢--嗰陣時咪話即係一磅幾多條，咁一磅幾多錢咁樣，自己略計一

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

計囉。

問：就住呢份文件，你仲有冇其他嘢補充？

答：冇，冇其他嘢補充。

問：唔該。

主席：李律師。

李先生盤問

問：蕭先生，呢份文件係昨晚你返番去，就搵到出嚟嘅，係咪？

答：係呀，係呀。

問：唔。喺自己公司搵？

答：屋企搵嘅。

問：屋企搵？

答：係。

問：事前你知道嚟呢個聆訊，有冇見過呢張嘢？

答：冇去喇呢樣嘢。

問：唔。突然間琴晚就醒起不如咁埋，咁就咁到嘞？

答：因為--係喇，琴晚去喇一啲，咁呀咁到囉。

問：唔。擺埋咗喺屋企...

答：因為啲報價我有 keep 嘅，係。

問：係。擺喺屋企㗎，定係...

答：擺喺屋企。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：咁即係你之前嚟呢個聆訊去準備，就有啲過屋企放咗呢一份文件嗰個地方？

答：有啲過，但係冇諗住呢個報價可能會有用。

問：唔，好，唔該。想問番你，琴日你講過嘅，明合就搵你去落標，係咪？

答：係。

問：落標嘅時候，畀圖你睇喇，係咪？

答：嘅。

問：睇圖嗰陣時，你會見到啲喉管嗰啲駁口位，係咪？即係有幾多個駁口？

答：咁呀見唔到。

問：轉彎位，一啲喉嘅轉彎位？

答：見唔到嘅。

問：都見唔到。即係啲喉直情——嗰幅圖連啲喉點樣走...

答：圖係有比例㗎嘛。

問：唔，聽我問埋先。

答：嘅。

問：嗰啲圖會唔會顯示啲喉點樣走位法？

答：當時報價係冇嘅。

問：唔。咁你點樣去...

答：係一條單線圖㗎嘅。

問：單線圖？

答：係呀。

問：一條條線？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：啲線代表咩嘢？

答：條線佢有寫呢條線係食水或者熱水或者係渠，咁樣有寫㗎嘛。

問：好喇，嗰啲線會轉彎㗎嘛，係咪呀？走嚟走去。

答：會轉彎。

問：好喇。

答：如果係轉彎咪轉彎。

問：每轉一個彎，你都知係咪一啲駁口位嘅位置？

答：冇錯。

問：好。睇完呢啲駁口位，上面冇寫㗎？嗰啲圖唔會寫話呢個用攞杙，呢個用燒焊，唔會寫低㗎嘛，係咪？

答：呢個冇，係。

問：唔。伍克明就有同你講「呢個地盤全部都係落燒焊嘅」？

答：走錫。

問：唔噃。走錫？

答：係。

問：所以你睇到呢啲圖嗰陣時就知道，啊，如果要包小五金的話，嗰啲錫就其中要--你要包嘅其中一種物料喇，啱唔啱？

答：啱。

問：所以你計數就計埋呢個錫料幾錢，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔。伍克明除咗話要走錫，係咪？你話嗰個字係咪叫「走錫」？你啱啱講嗰個話燒焊，伍克明同你講叫「走錫」？你啱啱用嗰兩個字，係咪「走錫」？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：呢個我又唔係好記得。

問：啱啱講嘍咋嘞，你？

答：即係話走錫囉，係喇。

問：走錫，唔該。

答：即係銅喉嘅走錫。

問：係。

黎先生：可唔可以解一解咩嘢叫做「走錫」呀？「走錫」係咩嘢意思？

答：走錫咪即係搽松香膏，跟住用火燒熱佢，咁加啲錫落去，...

黎先生：Okay。

答：...就為走錫。

黎先生：走錫，即係搽松香膏，然後燒焊，燒錫，錫燒焊，咁樣叫做「走錫」？

答：但係其實燒焊又另外一種解釋，即係燒焊就係我哋--即係行內燒焊，就係用風煤，就燒係另外一種焊嘍嘅，就燒啲銀焊，就唔係錫嘍嘅，就另外一種做法嘍嘅。

黎先生：走錫，即係走路個「走」？

答：走落去條喉--配件嗰度，即係嗰個駁口嗰度咋嘛。

問：即係話其實如果就住食水銅喉要燒焊，你哋嘅講法就叫「走錫」？即係你哋叫做...

答：唔係，唔係，唔係，兩種嘍嘅。

問：哦，嘎。

答：係嘞，走錫同埋燒焊係唔同。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：哦，我知。你要駁銅喉，你哋嘅術語就叫做「走錫」，啱唔啱？

答：唔係，駁銅喉係有幾種做法，有一種係攞杙，有一種係走錫，有一種係燒焊。

問：唔。燒焊就係你話要用啲風煤，有啲銀，有銀嘅？

答：係嘞，用風煤，就加熱佢，就用銀焊枝咁燒落去嘅。

問：唔。所以今次我哋講緊吓，你用嘅錫條又好，一綑綑嘅錫線都好，嗰種就叫「走錫」，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔，okay。伍克明先生都有同你講啲咁嘅錫料，走錫啲錫料係需要符合房屋署要求嘅，係咪？

答：有冇講過，我又唔記得。

問：唔記得？

答：係。

問：唔。好嘞，連工...

主席：咁你嘅理解呢？

答：我個理解係走錫就一--即係一路自己做開咁多年，做開嘅都係用啲錫條。

主席：一路用咗咁多年，...

答：係呀，我...

主席：...都係用啲隻錫料，咁即係用邊隻錫料呢？

答：就即係咪即係話用開，咁咪係呢隻，我諗住係呢隻囉。

主席：咁係綠色一卷卷嗰隻抑或邊隻呢？

答：因為當初我都唔知道係邊啲有鉛，邊啲冇鉛。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：唔係，你唔好理邊隻有鉛，邊隻冇鉛先喇，咁你係用開綠色一卷卷，抑或邊隻先？

答：我一路都係用開呢隻錫條嘅。

主席：一路都係用開呢隻錫條？

答：係。

主席：邊隻錫條？即係一條條啲嘢，...

答：一條條啲嘢，係。

主席：...抑或一紮紮啲嘢？

答：一條條啲嘢。

主席：用咗幾多年都係用呢啲錫條？

答：呢個地盤用喇，咁之前打工嗰陣時--出去打工都--幫啲判頭手都有用。

主席：個個都係用啲錫條？

答：嘎。

主席：冇人用過一卷卷綠色啲嘢？

答：我見到就--我知就有嘞。即係我做開啲嘢，就有嘞。

主席：係。好多年個囉嗰，你做咗？

答：吓？

主席：你做咗幾多年個囉嗰？

答：做咗好多年，唔係全部做水，有啲做渠嘍嘛。

主席：我知，咁你有做水嘅時候，就從來都冇見過綠色一卷卷啲隻？

答：係。

主席：係咪咁呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

主席：就次次都係一條條啲錫條啫？

答：嘅，或者燒銀焊，即係頭先講嗰隻燒焊。

主席：我哋唔好講燒銀焊，燒銀焊係用啲啲啲大啲嘅水渠--大啲啲啲渠嘅啫，啱唔啱？

答：唔係，唔係，唔係。

主席：吓？

答：好多私人啲啲都係--細喉都係燒銀焊嘅。

主席：不如你講下畀我哋聽，燒銀焊同埋走錫有啲咩分別，... (聽不清)

答：燒銀焊咪即係嗰個火力唔同咋嘛。即係...

主席：你話要用銀嘅焊條，銀...

答：用焊枝喇。

主席：焊枝。

答：銀嘅焊枝，係。

主席：係喇。

答：即係佢行銀幾多，咁樣啲焊枝。

主席：咁燒嘅時候，時間上點呀？有冇分別呀？

答：點樣有冇分別？

主席：燒嘅時間，即係用嘅時間去接一條，如果講緊同一個大細嘅銅喉，有冇分別？

答：差唔多嘅啫。

主席：時間差唔多？

答：係，時間差唔多。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：係呢一個火力就要猛啲，係咪呀？

答：係，係。

主席：咁要用風煤樽？

答：係，用風煤樽。

主席：就唔可以揸住...

答：可能個風煤嗰度--即係用嗰個石油氣同埋風煤嗰個可能有啲唔相同，有啲...

主席：我知。

答：有啲差別。

主席：咁銀焊係用石油氣打邊爐嗰啲，抑或係...

答：係嘞，嗰啲會平啲，風煤會貴啲。

主席：但係石油氣爐都得嘅？

答：燒唔到嘅，燒唔到銀焊。

主席：燒唔到銀㗎嘛？

答：係，燒唔到。

主席：即係要用風煤樽喇，銀焊就一定要？

答：係，冇錯。

主席：咁咪麻煩啲囉？

答：可以講係麻煩啲喇。

主席：係咪呀？

答：即係嗰個運送其他嘢都麻煩啲。

主席：好重㗎嘛，嗰啲？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係，冇錯。

主席：唔。咁如果高啲嘅時候，咁咪要--點樣樣？咁要好麻煩個囉嗰，又要條喉好長。因為你嗰兩個樽你揸唔到㗎嘛。

答：都唔會嘅，你...

主席：唔係呀...

答：...可以層層搵車仔推過去。

主席：車仔推過去，係囉，推過去嗰度，要放喺度囉？

答：係嘞，冇錯，放一樓。

主席：跟住如果嗰條水喉喺上高走，會唔會--啲水喉會唔會喺上高--喺天面走㗎？好少㗎喇，係咪呀？私人...

答：天面走都有，水喉有。

主席：私人屋苑我講緊。

答：都有。

主席：都有？

答：係，冇錯。

主席：咁要擔梯爬上去，嗰條喉好長咁先至可以燒到個囉嗰？

答：哦，有竹棚，有棚架嘅。

主席：吓？室內呀，我講緊。

答：室內就唔使，室內就擔張工作台。

主席：室內擔張工作台？

答：嘎。

主席：咁出面就要--出面咪好危險？

答：出面有棚架，有竹棚啲啲。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：我知。

答：有橋板、有安全--着晒安全繩，啲啲救生繩啲啲都唔係話唔安全嘅。

主席：理論...

答：如果唔安全，都唔得喇。

主席：理論上有嘅啫，啲啲。

答：嘎。

主席：係咪呀？

答：咩嘢？

主席：理論上有呀？

答：唔係，都有用嘅，因為安全主任行得好密嘅。

主席：唔。

好，繼續吖。

問：剛才主席問你，走錫嗰陣時啲啲錫條，你就冇見過綠色一樽樽啲啲？

答：係，我有見過，係。

問：唔。做咗咁...

答：即係我有用過。

問：你冇用過？

答：係。

問：你見過嘅？

答：冇冇見過，我又--應該唔見，而家就見到喇，以前就好少見，應該...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：好少見，即係見過？

答：...冇印象。係呀。

問：好少見，但係冇印象？

答：係。

問：唔。做咗咁耐，你以前打工又好，開始自己做都好，你就用錫條嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：有冇試過用完錫條去訂貨，冇貨？

答：我做呢個地盤就有。

問：我問緊你咁耐以嚟。

答：之前打工我唔知道，唔係我訂。

問：咁你老闆訂完啲貨返嚟，放喺度，你都有見到啲貨嚟嘅，係咪？

答：呢個我都唔記得咗，因為咁多年啲啲嘢，邊度記得啲啲嘢。

問：你係咪迴避緊，根本你係知道有綠色罐嘅錫料呀？

答：冇迴避。

問：冇迴--從來冇見過？

答：係。

問：唔。啱啱你同我講話伍克明有冇同你講過要用一--符合房屋署要求嘅錫料，你就話唔記得，係咪？

答：嘎。

問：五分鐘前你咁答我嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：口供紙就唔係咁講嘅，你睇下第7段，第10頁，01。第7段，你睇

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

下下面三數上嚟，「就彩福邨項目而言，明合從來沒有告知或指定恆利購買任何一款『小五金』物料的品牌或規格，包括焊料，亦從未曾提議本人從哪裡購買焊料等小五金物料。」見唔見到？

答：見到

問：唔噃。點解嗰陣時你會咁樣講，但係今日--嗰陣時都話從來冇同你講，今日你就話唔記得嘞。點呀？蕭生。

答：唔明。聽唔明你問題。

問：哦，諗咗咁耐，就聽唔明我問題？

答：噏。

問：再問多你一次。幾分鐘前你同我哋講--我問你伍克明先生有冇問過--同你講過用啲走錫嘅錫料係需要符合房屋署要求，你話你唔記得，係咪？

答：係，係。

問：口供紙第7段呢一度你就咁講，明合從來冇同你講或指定恆利要買邊一啲小五金嘅物料牌子，包括焊料。呢度係講到你好似乜都唔知咁，總之小五金你自己買，伍克明一句都冇講過，明合一句都冇講過，好堅定嘅。

主席：明唔明呀，蕭先生？

答：係。

主席：你明個問題吓嘛？

答：應該係冇講過。

問：而家就係應該冇講過？

答：係呀。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：即係符合房屋署要求，呢個概念你係知㗎嘛，係咪，喺用料上？

答：呢個概念知嘅。

問：知嘅，好。睇睇 31 段，第 16 頁，最耐嗰句，「本人及恆利並無概念何謂『符合房屋署要求』的焊料。」咁我又想問問你，符合房屋署要求嘅概念你就知嘅，呢度就話焊料符合房屋署嘅要求你就有概念？

答：因為佢哋冇同我講話用邊隻焊料。

問：係。但係今朝最早你話你唔記得個番？

答：咩嘢唔記得？

問：唔記得伍克明先生有冇同你講過啲焊料要用符合房屋署要求。

主席：你要問簡單啲，我諗。

問：你明唔明我個問題？蕭先生。

答：唔明你個問題。

問：唔。

主席：或者咁講，啱啱你頭先至答完，就話你知道會有房屋署嘅要求㗎嘛。

答：嘅。

主席：房屋署有要求㗎嘛，就住焊料，啱啱即係兩題之前，你好似咁講，但係呢度又話完全冇概念咩嘢叫做房屋署嘅要求㗎？

答：我理解就係佢房屋署嘅要求係用啲銅喉啲啲啲。

主席：咩嘢銅喉啲啲？

答：即係啲喉料啲。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：哦。

答：嘎。

問：喉料唔係你買，係咪呀？

答：喉料唔係我買。

問：係囉。咁即係人哋啲啲明合要負責啲啲你就知，你自己要負責啲啲就有呢個概念？即係你顧人哋啲啲，都唔顧下自己啲啲？

答：因為佢哋冇同我講話用邊隻焊料。

問：唔。好，呢一個彩福邨呢個地盤，你就連工包料嘅，係咪？

答：包小五金。

問：包小五金，係嘞，包小五金。你係咪有要求過明合佢哋做呢個工程係要連工包料嘅形式？

主席：乜嘢話？

答：冇要求。

問：冇要求。以往呢，以往你打工嗰陣時呢？

答：打工更加冇要求，打工可以要求咩嘢啫。

問：唔。你個老細呢，有冇聽過你老細同明合佢哋合作嗰陣時？

答：冇聽過。

問：唔，好。好，問你第二樣嘢，木板房，木板房呢一樣嘢，就係用啲木板喺地盤度搭建出嚟嘅，係咪？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：起木板房嗰時就未起石屎樓嘅，未起個樓嘅，係咪？

答：做緊地腳。

問：唔。

答：做緊地下嗰層。

問：唔。木板房嘅用意，就係喺個木板房入面畫咗啲圖位，開一啲窿位去畀啲師傅去知道啲位置、長短係應該點樣分布，啱唔啱？

答：唔係，係留窿用嘅啫。

問：唔。

答：上大樓留窿用嘅啫。

問：係預定啲位愛嚟上大樓嗰陣時留窿，係咪？

答：係。

問：即係好似一個模型咁樣，大家睇完呢個木板房啲位置，起咗個大樓，一間間房間整好，就喺番同樣嘅位置度整呢個窿，整個個窿？

答：做埋喉嘅。

問：做埋喉嘅？

答：係。

問：木板房都有喉放喺度㗎嘛？

答：有，冇錯。

問：但係就冇用焊，就咁放喺度㗎咋嘛？

答：有，有焊。因為唔焊，就會跌落地下嘅。

問：嗰啲喉駁住，就咁拍住，一邊粗啲、一邊幼啲拍埋㗎咋嘛，擺喺木板房嗰度？

答：但係你嗰個木嗰度唔係好穩，係會跌落嚟㗎嘛。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：係。

答：彩福邨係有做--係有燒嘅，有燒死嘅，就...

問：即係你以往做過第二啲係冇燒死嘅，喺木板房入面？

答：未做過，冇我做過第二個。

問：唔。做木板房嗰陣時你使唔使喺度？

答：喺度。

問：唔。你啲員工都要喺度㗎喇？

答：冇，冇喺--未喺度嗰陣時，我喺度，我做嘅。

問：明白。咁即係係話你睇完木板房入面啲窿位，到時要開工嘞，你就教你啲工人，「噏，睇住呢度，呢個窿喺呢度，呢個窿喺嗰度」？

答：唔係教啲工人，係畀房署批，批完之後，房署會出圖，咁我哋跟張圖去留窿。

主席：即係落石屎嗰陣時要留窿㗎嘛？

答：係，落石屎之前，係嘞，冇錯。

主席：係喇。

問：唔，好。到睇樣辦房嘞，喺樣辦房嗰陣時你係都要在場，啱唔啱？

答：樣辦房在場。

問：唔。

答：你啲員工都要喺度，係咪？

問：冇，冇員工喺度。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：等陣。嘎。

問：亦都會有啲房屋署嘅人喺度？

答：房署不嬲都喺度㗎。

問：唔。

主席：等陣吓。房署嘅人會喺度。明合嘅人會唔會喺度？

答：明合嘅人都會喺度。

主席：得。唔。

問：有利嘅人都會喺度嘅，係咪？

答：有利更加有人喺度喇。

問：唔。喺嗰啲樣辦房，起個樣辦房，就要駁啲喉去示範一次咁樣嘅？

答：呢個我就唔知--唔清楚，因為我就叫我個伙記做嘅。

問：唔。

主席：等陣吓。

答：就問唔中我先落去參與下。

問：唔。

主席：樣辦房駁水喉...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：因為明合有人喺度話點樣做。

主席：唔係，我知。樣辦房駁--做水喉要做幾多日先至會做完？

答：呢個視乎嗰個工程個進度。

主席：樣辦房嗎？

答：係呀，佢嗰個--唔--樣辦房，係上咗大樓做嗰個樣辦房吖嘛？

主席：係呀，係呀。

答：咁佢會做咗籐咗瓦仔嗰啲先畀得我哋做㗎嘛？

主席：係呀，啱吖，我知。即係我個意思，即係人哋籐完晒瓦仔，跟住就到你，咁...

答：大概正式 okay 收貨嗰陣時，大概兩、三個月嘅。

主席：唔係，我唔係咁嘅意思，你聽清楚我問題先。

答：嘅。

主席：咁人哋整好個--倒完石屎，整好個瓢，跟住呢個樣辦房又籐好晒啲瓦仔諸如此類嗰啲嘢，跟住就交界你去做你水喉要做嗰啲樣辦房，樣辦房裏面嗰啲嘢，啱唔啱？

答：啱。

主席：係喇嘛？

答：嘅。

主席：咁你喺--首先我想問下你，好嘞，喺呢個樣辦房裏面，你要做啲乜嘢嘢先？

答：首先做水喉。

主席：做乜嘢水喉？

答：做銅喉，做來水喉，即係做食水喉。

主席：做來水喉，係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：跟住做去水喉。

主席：做去水喉，係。

答：跟住裝廚房、裝面盆。

主席：裝廁所，嗰啲洗面盆？

答：係，洗手盆、鋅盆嗰啲。

主席：裝鋅盆。咁花灑...

答：花灑掣嗰啲，係。

主席：花...

答：最後期先裝花灑掣，係。

主席：得，等陣。諗...

答：水龍頭。

主席：廁所？

答：係。

主席：坐廁？

答：坐廁。

主席：水龍頭？

答：嘎。

主席：差唔多喇，係咪廁所嚟講？

答：跟住廁所，係嘞。

主席：廁所。咁廚房呢？

答：廚房，咪裝鋅盆。

主席：鋅盆？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：裝鋅盆、龍頭，跟住又係試水囉。

主席：去水--咩嘢話？

答：試水，谷水。

主席：唔好試水住喇，你都未裝完，試咩嘢水啫，係咪？

答：嘎。

主席：你裝晒你先試㗎嘛，唔好試住。鋅盆，跟住仲有咩嘢？

答：洗衣機龍頭。

主席：洗衣機嘅頭，係咪呀？

答：係，係。

主席：唔。仲有冇嘢？

答：應該冇嘞。

主席：好嘞，廚房、廁所，係咪？廳嗰啲冇㗎喇？

答：嘎。

主席：冇水喉㗎嘛，廳？

答：廳冇水喉嘅，係。

主席：係囉。冇冇房㗎？抑或淨係得個空殼嘅啫？

答：空殼，冇房嘅。

主席：空殼嘅，都冇房，得。好嘞，即係你要裝來水喉、去水喉、坐廁、鋅盆、花灑、水龍頭，廚房有鋅盆，洗衣機嗰啲嚟水喉、去水喉咁樣樣，係咪？

答：冇錯。

主席：啱唔啱？

答：係，啱。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：好嘞，咁做廚房做--做廚房要做幾多日呀？或者廁所先，廁所好似複雜啲，廁所要做幾耐？

答：通常做喉就如果係唔--即係做，就應該一日嘍。

主席：一日？

答：連埋廚房、廁所做埋㗎。

主席：一日做完嘞，樣辦房？

答：做喉就係，淨係做來水喉。佢...

主席：我知。

答：嘍。

主席：即係頭先我哋所講啲啲嘢，包埋...

答：喺室內裏面吖嘛？

主席：吓？

答：淨係講裏面吖嘛？

主席：係，淨係講裏面咋嘛，而家。

答：嘍，嘍。

主席：係咪呀？

答：嘍。

主席：一日做完？

答：嘍。

黎先生：即係頭先所有啲啲都做晒，一日做晒？

答：一個單位。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

黎先生：一個單位，okay。

主席：係，樣辦房，係咪？

答：一個單位。

主席：係呀，係呀，係，樣辦房吖嘛？

答：係。

主席：樣辦房得一個嘍咋嘛，係咪呀？

答：唔係，樣辦唔係一個，成層都係。即係成十幾、廿個單位嘅，佢都做埋。

主席：成層樓做晒呀？

答：嘎。

主席：吓？

答：係呀。

主席：咁...

答：佢揀--係呀，揀一個月，即係成層--我哋成層都做晒嘅啲。

主席：唔係，佢揀一層已經做好晒嘢嘅，我明。但係係咪做--揀一個單位去鋪水喉？

答：唔係，因為嗰條邨有幾個唔同嘅單位，即係唔同款嘅單位，都要做嘍嘛。

主席：我知。唔係，唔係，唔係，咁你講嘞，你話你做咗幾多個樣辦房？

答：應該做咗六、七個。

主席：做咗六、七個樣辦房？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：咁係同一時間做，抑或喺唔同嘅階段做？

答：唔同嘅階段做。

主席：做咗六、七個樣辦房，唔同嘅階段做？

答：嘅。

主席：就係因為佢嗰啲屋邨嗰啲單位有唔同嘅大細、唔同嘅間隔？

答：係，冇錯。

主席：好嘞，咁一至兩日就可以做晒？

問：來水喉就係。食水喉，係。

主席：水喉咁嘛，我哋而家講來講去都係講水喉啫，係咪呀？

答：嘅。

主席：即係我哋頭先所講嗰啲，坐廁、花灑、水龍頭、鋅盆？

答：唔係，淨係做喉啫，淨係做喉，其他啲未裝得嘅。

主席：全部裝晒要幾耐呀？

答：全部裝晒要幾日。

主席：幾多日？

答：一個禮拜嘅。

主席：一個禮拜呀？

答：係呀，因為佢好多時辦房有啲嘢改嚟改去嗰啲嘢嘍嘛。即係實際都有統計過係...

主席：唔係，你做咗先嘍嘛。咁你梗係做完，佢話唔啱，你咪改囉，係咪？

答：嘅。

主席：我嘅意思，即係一次過做晒要幾耐呀--唔係，即係第一次做要幾耐？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：第一次做，呢個我又唔係好記得，因為佢不斷咁樣做，不斷咁樣改嘅啲嘢。即係話你今日喺度做做吓，咁可能佢睇到，又「哦，咁樣得呀，要點樣點樣。」咁又即刻改番佢。

主席：咁...

答：因為唔係等做好晒先去改。

主席：我知。咁咪即係換句話嚟講，每一次做辦房，差唔多你都要在場，係咪呀？

答：唔係，因為佢明合有人喺度，佢直接同工人講都得嘅。

主席：點解要同工人講都得呀，你係老闆吖嘛？

答：因為我已經--因為我要上樓面留窿啲啲。

主席：吓？

答：我要上樓面留窿。

主席：上樓面番窿，...

答：係呀。

主席：...重要過房署、明合啲啲嚟做樣辦房，睇下你啲啲嘢得唔得咩？

答：其實工人做都係一樣咋嘛，最緊要係交帶佢點樣做點樣做，都係跟佢啲個意思去做，邊個喺度都一樣。因為留窿啲度，如果我留錯窿，將來啲牆唔畀我鑿窿，唔畀開窿就好大劑。

主席：咁咪咁更加你要在場囉？

答：嘍。

主席：吓？你唔需要在場㗎？你...

答：我需要在場，我在場，咪响天面留緊窿。

主席：淨係天面--喂，唔係，呢--樣辦房呀，我個意思。你閣下第一次做呢啲房署工程，你要爭取經驗吖嘛，啱唔啱？你爭取經驗，你第一次做，房署有人嚟睇住你做，房署有人嚟 check，明合有人嚟 check，

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

咁你作為老闆，你係咪應該牛咁眼望住呢？

答：因為當時我都有--唔係成日喺度，即係問唔中會喺度。

主席：咁佢做樣辦房，唔會唔通知老闆。即係你負責人吖嘛，唔會唔通知個負責人到場啫，我諗。

答：所以我咪交帶咗一個信得過嘅伙記喺度搞。

主席：即係你自己就反而唔喺度？

答：少喺度。

主席：但是根據你嘅口供，有陣時駁水喉，你都要落手落腳做啲？

答：係呀。

主席：Okay。但係做樣辦房，你就交界你啲同事嘞？

答：多數交界同事，...

主席：多數交...

答：...我都有參與嘅。

主席：好，繼續。

問：房屋署啲人嚟到個場，都會問一問老闆喺邊，係咪呀？

答：呢個冇問過。

問：冇問。即係房屋署嚟到唔使見你，見你啲下面啲同事就得個囉啲？

答：房屋署點會見我啫。

問：咁要做樣辦吖嘛，係咪？

答：佢唔會話搵指定邊個做。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：你哋啲員工做嚟喇，明合唔會識做㗎？

答：咩嘢呀？

問：係咪？

答：咩嘢--咩嘢唔識做？

問：起樣辦房嗰陣時，都係你或者你啲員工做？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：係囉。咁房屋署啲人嚟到嘞，就梗係搵咗個老細先，啱唔啱？

答：房屋署唔會搵我哋嘅。

問：就唔搵--會唔會搵你吖？

答：唔會，唔會搵我，搵有利㗎咋嘛。

問：搵有利？

答：係。

問：就唔使搵你，唔使見下你？

答：點樣會見我？我唔咩嘢嘞。即係佢本身嚟到，咁有嘢，咁佢同--唔會直接同我講，佢係同有利講，有利同--或者有利同我講，或者同明合講，明合同我講咁咋嘛，即係要改動嗰啲嘢。

問：唔，好。你啱啱都講，起樣辦房都要幾日嘅時間，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：幾日入面，你點都會喺個地盤入面，係咪？

答：咩嘢呀？

問：嗰幾日入面，你都會喺個地盤嗰度㗎喇？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：喺，喺地盤度，係。

問：你就話你周圍行，係咪？

答：係。

問：但係你都會有去樣辦房睇下㗎？

答：有。

問：好。喺樣辦房，你有冇見到你啲工友喺度焊呢啲咁嘅走錫，做呢個工序嗰陣時，係將啲焊料一條條勾--屈一屈佢，嚟到去燒落去嘅，係咪？

答：呢個我就唔記得。

問：唔記得呀？

答：係。

問：你自己點做嘅，你以前唔係做老細嗰陣時？

答：因為屈呢，好多行家屈呢，係容易燒嗰個角度嘅問題嘅啫。即係你有啲曲尺，有啲你向埋牆裏面，如果你直筆甩咁樣，搵唔到過去，屈少少，咁樣屈落去係燒到裏面。嗰條錫條搵到裏面。

問：係囉，我咪就係咁問你。

答：但係嗰個辦房嗰度有冇咁樣做，我就唔係好記得。

問：即係你以前眼見啲人去焊條喉，有啲人就屈，有啲人就唔屈嘅？

答：呢個我有留意。

問：冇留意。你自己呢？

答：我自己就有時屈嘅。

問：唔。畀你睇睇啲相片，睇下嗰啲人施工嗰陣時嘅做法。P1 嘅 249 頁，睇下 (37) 號相。見唔見到呢幅相？就相信就有隻左手就揸住一條條狀嘅物體，見唔見到？

答：見到。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：右手就揸住嗰支噴火嗰啲火槍。

主席：我想問一問先，你就話你唔知道着住間條衫嗰個人係咪你，係咪咁嘅意思？

答：係呀。

主席：Okay。

答：唔見--唔，係。

主席：即係第(28)張相嗰個，你就話唔知係咪你？

答：係，唔認得。唔認得。

主席：唔認得--唔係，我想問一問先，你有冇一件咁嘅衫先？

答：冇。

主席：冇，okay，得，唔緊要。好，呢個--喺呢度有幾十張相。

答：嘎。

主席：呢幾十張相，譬如第(1)、第(2)，就要用嗰啲咁嘅水喉嗰啲配件，呢啲配件係咪你哋彩福邨用嘅水喉配件嚟嘅？

問：240頁，第(1)、第(2)。

主席：即係有好多唔同嘅配件，即係我而家睇緊(1)、(2)、(3)、(4)、(5)、(6)、(7)。

答：個樣就有啲似。

主席：個樣就有啲似？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：咁呢個跟住後面嗰啲第(9)、(10)、(11)、(12)、(13)、(14)、(15)、(16)嗰啲，呢啲地方係唔係又係你哋彩福邨嘅地盤嗰啲樣辦房嚟？

答：呢個就--即係唔記得呢個。

主席：唔記得？

答：記唔起，記唔起。

主席：好，呢個譬如第(49)去到第(55)嗰啲工序，唔好理嗰啲人係邊一個先，係咪你哋做彩福邨要做嘅工序嚟？唔好講個人係邊個先，係咪你哋要做嘅工序嚟？

答：彩福做個工序應該係咁樣做。

主席：係咁樣樣做嘅？

答：係。

主席：唔係，你睇完晒呢啲相，即係由第(1)去到第(55)，唔好理裏面嗰啲係咩嘢人先，okay？

答：嘅。

主席：你同唔同意第(1)去到第(55)所影嗰啲相係講緊彩福邨呢個地盤裏面所影嘅相嚟嘅先？

答：即係我印象中就好似有咁樣做過，就可能咩嘢--我就唔同意。

主席：即係你而家連話呢啲相係唔係彩福邨，你都唔同意，係唔係咁嘅意思？

答：嘅。

主席：即係你唔同意呢啲係彩福邨嘅相嚟嘅？

答：我唔知係唔係彩福邨。

主席：你唔知？喂，你承包過一千零一個屋邨咋嘛。

答：因為事隔咁多年，我都...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：吓？

答：...因為加加埋埋都成十年。

主席：有成...

許偉強先生：09年嘅啲相片。

主席：09年喎，邊有成十年？09年做到一幾年喎，幾年咋喎？即係你而家係個答案就係連呢啲相裏面所講嘅嘢，你都唔肯定係唔係彩福邨嘅，係咪咁？

答：係。

主席：得，好，繼續。

問：唔。去番啱啱第(37)號相，你唔認得唔緊要，有啲工序問下你。第249頁，呢度你見唔見到(37)號相，係咪喺呢一個--當佢係樣辦房先，你唔知佢係咩嘢都好，天花橫樑位嗰度係走緊錫，係咪呀？

答：冇印象。

問：睇完啲相...

答：好模糊，好模糊，睇唔清楚。

問：好，我有啲大相畀你睇，我都估到，畀你睇下啲大相。蕭生，見唔見？清楚啲嘞。係咪啲橫樑位，天花？

主席：呢個即係第幾張相？

許偉強先生：呢個第(37)。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：三十...

許偉強先生：七。

主席：唔該。

答：我唔敢肯定係唔係橫樑。

問：唔。點都好，喺嗰啲樣辦房又好，你哋正式施工都好，嗰喉上上下下都要做走錫嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔。再睇前少少嗰啲焊料嗰啲屈曲都畀你睇一睇，譬如話第(23)號相，245頁。睇得清唔清楚？

答：清楚。

問：清楚，好。見唔見到嗰啲--左手揸住嗰隻係咪嗰啲屈咗嗰啲焊料？

答：好似係。

問：唔。右手就揸住罐嗰啲打邊爐嗰啲火槍，係咪？

答：係。

問：嗰啲罐，唔。呢個就係你講，就係嗰人屈住愛嚟繞過嗰啲喉嘅後面嚟到走錫，係咪？

答：係。

主席：其實貼住墀牆嗰度好難燒個嗎？即係你後面嗰--貼住墀牆嗰度點--即係如果--即係純粹...

答：多數漏水都係入面。

主席：咁咪係囉。

答：係呀。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：因為你燒唔到㗎嘛，嗰度？

答：難燒㗎。

主席：係囉。

答：即係靠經驗喇，嗰㗎。

問：唔。所以如果喺嗰高位嗰度要燒，嗰㗎喉又貼埋牆，又要繞過後面，其實兩隻手舉起都好劫、好辛苦，係咪？

答：會有工作台㗎嘛。

問：唔。咁都要舉手，你工作台，個工作台唔會高過天花咁高，個人點企，係咪？你擔張凳、擔張檯、擔張梯都得喇，但係隻手都要舉高，係咪？

答：舉高、舉低就肯定㗎喇。

問：係喇。

主席：即係你第(30)號張相嗰㗎，嗰㗎係咪--我想問下你，嗰㗎係--譬如你呢個駁過--呢個叫做咩嘢，閘掣呀？

答：(30)號嗰張？

主席：(30)號張相。

答：嗰個係總水掣。

主席：即係成間屋嘅總水掣？

答：係，冇錯。

主席：即係入屋嗰陣時就咁樣樣？

答：即係因為佢水錶有個總水掣，跟住單位裏面有個水掣㗎嘛，...

主席：我知。好，咁樣...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：...如果有咩嘢事閃個總掣，就唔需要去搵到開門，閃水錶個個掣。

主席：我明。呢個總掣入嚟個--入嚟左邊就係白色嘅喉，係咪？有條白包住佢，包住條銅喉，係咪？

答：包膠銅喉嚟嘅。

主席：吓？

答：包膠銅喉。

主席：包膠銅喉嚟嘅？

答：係呀。

主席：有冇咩嘢特別嘅原因要包膠？

答：呢個係佢哋選嘅材料，我唔知道。即係多數係驚啲倒汗水啞，即係話回南天嗰陣時，條銅喉如果係冇包嘢，就可能會跌咗啲倒汗水落嚟，包咗會冇。

主席：因為佢裏面行啲係熱水，抑或凍？

答：熱漲冷縮。

主席：唔係。因為佢裏面行啲係熱水，抑或咩嘢？

答：唔係，唔係，唔係熱水，凍水。

主席：凍...

答：但係凍水都會有相差㗎嘛。

主席：有倒汗水？唔，所以...

答：係，倒汗水，即係喉面會有倒汗水。

主席：咁係咪即係入咗屋裏面，就全部行包膠嘅銅喉，喺屋裏面睇到啲啲？

答：係，係。

主席：唔。咁跟住呢個包膠銅喉接個總掣，嗰度係燒焊嘅？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係，冇錯。

主席：咁跟住我哋見到嗰度有啲白色...

答：白色嗰啲就士黏膠布嚟嘅。

主席：哦，哦，係，冇錯，我就係想問你呢啲。

答：係，士黏膠布。

主席：呢啲就其實...

答：即係呢啲攪牙嘅，佢本身係牙嚟嘅。

主席：係，即係扭上去嘅？

答：係嘞，係嘞，扭落去，係嘞。

主席：唔。咁就你要黏啲膠布？

答：冇錯。

主席：即係換句話嚟講，大啲啲組件呢就全部都係上牙，就駁上去嘅？

答：唔係，大細都有嘅。因為呢啲掣佢係--佢呢隻--就佢揀到之後，就係牙掣嚟嘅，就一定要配個牙咀，所以要上落去嘅。

主席：哦，明白。譬如好似呢個總掣駁去嗰條包膠銅喉，後面就真係好高難度個囉嗰，如果要錫焊？

答：割咗啲膠，再包番入去囉，之後。

主席：唔係，唔係，我講駁水喉嗰陣時候，後面咪高難度個囉？

答：點樣高難度？

主席：即係你前面你見到就可以錫焊，後面呀黏住捧牆嗰度。

答：黏住捧牆，咪頭先講燒嗰陣時就屈一條錫條就喺後面，如果係溶咁就okay。

主席：吓？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：即係嗰條錫條，啲錫係會走出嚟咁就 okay。

主席：我知呀，咁咪又睇唔到？

答：睇唔到，我哋...

主席：經驗個咋喎？

答：...通常就係啲工人就擺塊鏡仔走去照，睇下燒唔燒到嘅。

主席：即係如果...

答：即係照番，係嘞，如果唔係到時漏水先搞就好大工程，每一單。

主席：即係呢啲如果漏水，就一定係後面漏，多數？

答：睇到有錫就--係嘞，唔漏。

主席：繼續。

問：好。問開啲相，我哋睇下啲啲工序，等我哋了解下相入面佢哋做緊乜嘢。你睇睇第 241 頁，(6)號相。(5)號相、(7)號相呢啲唔使，因為佢哋都係顯示啲啲料嘅啫，係咪？(5)號相、(7)號相咪顯示啲料，啱唔啱？

答：啱。

問：(6)號相呢？(6)號相見到個工友就揸住一支嘢，佢左手下面有個罐黃色嘅嘢，佢做緊咩嘢？

答：嗰個應該係松香膏。

問：唔。就搽喺個駁口位嗰度，係咪？

答：係，搽條喉，或者--同埋搽埋嗰個配件。

問：唔。(8)號相就呢個--就拎開咗，見到佢。(9)號相，後一頁。(9)號相就見到佢喺一支喉嗰度就好似搽緊啲嘢喺個駁口嗰度，見唔見？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：唔。佢做緊咩嘢？

答：邊個做緊咩嘢？

問：佢搽緊喺個駁口嗰度囉。

答：咪搽啲松香膏落個駁口嗰度。

問：明白。唔好意思，因為我哋行外人，所以要你幫一幫手，要解釋下啲相做緊乜嘢先得，我哋自己唔會意會到嘅。(10)號相，就係駁好咗兩條喉，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔。咁佢喺度做緊咩嘢，呢一個人？喺捧牆度整緊啲嘢。

答：佢咪榻埋後面嗰條喉入去嗰個 T 位嗰度。

問：唔，okay。

主席：你嗰啲相嗰啲冧巴唔係順序㗎嘛？即係啲工序唔係咁，你掉到亂晒籠嘅。

李先生：哦，係，好。

問：(11)號相又係嘞，搽番--搽緊嗰個 T 字位，係咪？搽緊啲松香膏？

答：係呀，冇錯。

問：唔。(12)號相又搽第二邊，松香膏。跟住先去到(10)號相，係咪？如果跟次序。

答：應該就係。

問：唔。好，後面嗰頁，(13)號相，就見到呢個工友喺一啲垂直--有一支垂直嘅就加落去啱啱嗰個 T 字位嗰度，你見唔見到？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：佢做緊咩嘢工作，喺度？

答：應該收緊嗰條喉碼。

問：個喉碼就綁住垂直嗰支短嘅喉？

答：係。

問：唔。(14)號相呢？

答：(14)號相佢咪揸住支肥燈，揸住支石油氣燈。

問：唔。(15)號相係咪又係搽緊松香膏？

答：係佢榻緊落嗰條喉嗰度，應該係。

問：唔。(16)號我哋知道就係揸--(16)號就係揸住支火鎗，係咪？冇乜特別嘢喇。

答：係，係。

問：(17)又係揸住支火鎗燒個 T 字位，係咪？係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔。(18)都係，見到有條錫線就屈住咗，咁就燒落個 T 字位嗰度？

答：係。

問：唔。其實慣常啲做法係咪都係咁樣㗎？問開就問，係咪即係嗰啲焊料會一段段、一段段咁樣，即係屈一屈，跟住就燒？

答：係，呢個純粹係講後面嗰度容易操作咁解。如果係直筆甩，咁裏面係搵唔到㗎嘛。

問：哦，係，係，係。即係屈曲嘅原因，因為後面，係咪？

答：係嘞，係嘞。

問：唔噃。但係我嘅意思係即係一條條、一條條，我望落去似大概呎零或者半呎嘅長嘅焊料，揸住一支支咁樣，左手揸住焊料，右手揸住火槍，呢啲係慣常嘅做法㗎？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：嗰個長短--錫條長短嘅你一條係差唔多兩呎長，佢用用到咪短囉。

問：唔，明白。

答：唔會話一用，剪到咁短嚟用㗎嘛。

問：Okay。呢啲你講就係嗰個咩嘢錫條，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：Okay。好，下面(19)就唔使。(20)都係燒個T字位啫，係咪？搵個火鎗。

答：係呀。

問：(21)號想清楚啲，後一頁，又係彎住咁燒個T字位個背脊嗰度。

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：唔。好，跳一少少，(25)，第246頁。(25)頁(號?)上喉碼。

答：係，上喉碼，因為有啲碼係螺絲，因為嗰啲係佛沙牆，佢入面係空心，又係籐啲膠枳，所以要用把電鑽嚟修落去。

問：咁嗰啲電鑽係咪要特別啲㗎，鑽呢啲磚嗰啲電鑽？

答：點樣為特別啲？

問：即係啲電鑽唔係用--應該話啲電鑽個鑽頭係要特別啲㗎嘛，如果要鑽啲磚面？

答：冇特別。

問：唔。平時如果你哋去地盤做呢，呢啲電鑽都係你哋自己帶落去？

答：係。

問：唔。所以就「包工具」，就係咁嘅意思？

答：工具包埋，係嘞，冇錯。

問：Okay，好。睇下先，後面(44)，第250頁--(43)先，睇睇(43)。(43)見到有支木棍，就好似掙緊啲嘢入捧牆嗰度，係咪？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：呢個我睇唔明係咩嘢意思，呢幅相。

主席：掙緊個膠枳入去，係咪呀？

李先生：一個膠枳，係。

答：哦，係呀，掙啲膠枳落去。

主席：係。

答：係。

問：係，掙啲膠枳落去？

答：係。

問：愛嚟做咩嘢，掙個膠枳入去？

主席：吓？

答：吓？

問：掙個膠枳入墜牆？

主席：唔係咁嘛？Mr Lee。

答：膠枳係明合提供嘅。

問：明白。好嘞，(44)，就...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：冇鑽過牆呀，你？

李先生：好坦白，睇過爸爸，幫過佢手。

主席：繼續，咁樣樣，繼續。

問：好。後面嗰啲都係開泥咁樣，就 okay。好，問一問你，陳偉峰呢個人，你識唔識呀？

答：邊個？

問：陳偉峰。

答：陳偉峰，應該都識。

問：係咪你嘅工友？

答：好似係。

問：唔。佢有喺彩福邨嗰度做嘢個呵？

答：應該有。

問：唔。請你睇睇 243 頁，(13)號相。呢個係咪陳偉峰嚟？

答：唔係。

問：唔係，好肯定，定係唔記得？

答：好模糊，我唔--唔...

問：我畀啲大相你睇。

答：嘎。

問：你望一望大相先，其實用嚟認一認人，呢個係咪陳偉峰？

答：唔係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：唔。我有陳偉峰工卡，有個樣喺度，畀你睇埋，認下呢個係咪陳偉峰？

李先生：主席，我遲啲再補番啲多啲特別啲嘅。

問：見到呢張工卡，係咪陳偉峰？

答：係。

問：呢個就係你個員工，係咪？

答：係。

問：(13)號相，呢個係咪佢？

答：唔似囉。

問：哦，你係咪講緊大話，其實？

答：我睇到就唔似。

問：唔，好，點都好。喺樣辦房嗰陣時，嗰啲焊料就你負責買，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔。所以如果呢啲相入面係講緊彩福邨，入面--喺彩福邨度起緊樣辦房，啲焊料都係你買嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔。所以我哋見到(28)號相，第246頁。

主席：陳偉峰就真係係喺你個地盤嗰度做嘢嘅，我睇緊 P1，第 159 頁。
P1，第 159 頁，喺上面數落嚟第二、四、六、七，第七個人名就係
叫陳偉峰，你就行頭，第一個蕭健煌。第 159 頁，P1。睇到呵？

答：睇到。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：唔。即係佢真係有喺你哋嗰度做嘢嘅？

答：係。

主席：就喺彩雲邨--彩雲道呢度，唔。

問：Okay。咁我哋返番 28 頁--唔係，(28)號相，第 246 頁。唔好意思。
望落去黃色個罐就係松香膏，係咪？

答：係。

問：個牌子就“FRY”嘅，係咪呀？

答：你講邊個牌子？

問：黃色個松香膏。

答：因為英文，我唔識。

問：唔。英文字母你都唔識，係咪？

答：一部分識。

問：唔。“FRY”，呢個扁啲，細罐啲，畀你睇睇。唔好意思。而家畀你睇
到黃色呢罐，係咪松香膏？

答：係。

問：細罐過而家相片見到個罐，係咪？

答：嘅。

問：你市面都見過大罐、細罐，啱唔啱？

答：啱。

問：係喇，不過買開都係大罐？

答：個罐係大罐嘅。

問：大罐平啲喇，係咪比起細罐？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：大罐平啲。

問：係咪呀？

答：呢個冇格...

問：即係比起上嚟？

答：冇格過價啲。

問：Okay，唔緊要。呢個牌子你見唔見到，你而家手上揸住嗰個，“FRY”，見唔見到？

答：見唔到。

問：哦，好，好。好嘞，(28)號相就見到個人揸住綠色嘅焊線，隔離係揸住黃色罐嘅松香膏，係咪？

答：嘅。

問：唔。所以如果呢個地盤係用焊線的話，以你估計，經驗吓，佢都會係用番呢隻綠色嘅焊線，搵出嚟剪開一段段，去整樣辦房，係咪？

答：唔係。辦房係用番我買番啲錫條用嘅。

問：一條條啲啲？

答：係，一條條啲啲。

問：房屋署喺度，啲人睇住你哋，你嘅講法都係用一條條啲啲？

答：我唔知佢哋有冇睇住我哋做，但係我做嗰陣時係全部都係用啲啲錫條。

問：你而家嘅講法係咪總之喺你處理過嘅工程，如果有房屋署嘅人喺度的話，你用嘅錫條都唔會係綠色呢隻？

答：係。

問：唔。冇人阻止過你，房屋署啲人？

答：冇。

問：大話嚟嘅，係咪呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇講。

問：唔。好嘞，今朝你睇完啲相，你就話呢個--你就話冇呢件衫，係咪？
間條衫。

答：嘅。

問：琴日你睇住呢幅相就話唔認得，確定唔到係咪你，係咪？

答：嘅。

問：琴日你答呢個問題嗰陣時冇諗過話「件衫我都有嘅，點會係我嘅啫？」
咁點解你唔乾乾脆脆咁答「呢個都唔係我」？要搞到今日，琴晚諗過、
度過返到嚟，就話呢個唔係你，點解咁樣有分別嘅？

答：因為我印象中係冇影過呢啲相。

問：呢件衫？

答：件衫冇--我冇着過呢啲衫，咪冇囉。

問：唔。咁點解琴日你唔直接咁答，「我都有呢件衫，我都有着過呢件衫，
嗰個一定唔係我喇。」點解你唔咁答？

答：因為佢冇問件衫，我咪冇答。

問：你有睇啲嘛，成幅相，你都睇咗好耐，好小心咁睇添。點呀？蕭生。

答：咩嘢點呀？

問：明唔明我個問題？

主席：即係佢嘅意思係話，尋日你做乜唔斬釘截鐵直接咁回答佢「呢個唔
係我嚟嘅，我冇呢啲衫」，即係佢嘅意思係咁。

答：因為冇問到--即係冇問到着咩嘢衫，咁我點知點答啫。

問：唔，好。你以往喺樣辦房嗰陣時都見到有人影相，係咪？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：吓？

問：你以往喺樣辦房嗰陣時，都會見到有人影相，啱唔啱？

主席：「以往」嘅意思係咩嘢？

李先生：哦，咁呀。

問：你喺彩雲（福？）邨見到人喺樣辦房嗰陣時會有人影相，係咪？

答：有冇人影相，我唔知，我有留意。

問：唔。冇留意有冇人影相，咁你見到定係見唔到？

答：即係我有留意有冇人影相，個地盤咁大，咁有冇人影相，咁戚出咁轉，我點知有冇人影相。

問：你有冇見過...

答：我唔會跟住每一個人吖嘛。

問：你有冇見過人影相？

答：我有見過。

問：唔。其實(28)號相，呢個係你嚟嘅，係咪呀？

答：唔係，唔係我嚟。

問：唔。(50)號相、(52)號相，同樣 252 頁。嗰個都係你嚟，係咪？

答：唔係，唔係我嚟。

問：好，再睇睇，241 頁，(8)號相，放大少少畀你睇。

李先生：畀住一張你先，主席，真係唔好意思，我哋...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：見唔見到佢左上角有個筲咁樣？幅相左下角，有個打邊爐嗰啲石油氣樽？

答：見到。

問：個樽尾嗰度，見唔見到有綠色圓圓咁嘅嘢？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：所以如果當日喺度整緊樣辦房，用嘅錫料就係呢一樽綠色嘅錫料，啱唔啱？

答：但係呢啲相都唔知係咪彩雲影嘅。

問：答我問題喇，不如。

主席：呢啲相唔知係咪彩雲（福？）邨。

問：Okay，好，唔緊要，你仍然堅持咁樣。好，綠色呢一罐嘢喺 2015 年 7 月，即係鉛水事件發生之前，你係咪見過已經？

答：係，我未用過，未見過，係。

問：未用過？

答：未見過。

問：未見過？

答：係。

問：去買料，或者去五金舖，你有冇試過見到有呢一個綠色嘅焊料？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇為意。

問：唔。以往你去訂料，去雋景又好，和興都好，呢兩間你都識，聽過喇，係咪？

答：和興我有聽過。

問：雋景有喇？

答：係全部同雋景訂。

問：同雋景訂料有冇試過用用吓，再訂錫條，錫條話唔夠，雋景叫你用呢隻綠色嘅焊料？

答：未試過斷貨。

問：唔。完全未試過斷貨，所以...

答：係。

問：...從來冇綠色呢個送到去你地盤嗰度？

答：冇。

問：唔。喺彩福邨呢個地盤工作期間，有利嗰啲人係唔係會稱呼你做「阿蕭」㗎？

答：係。

問：唔。有利當中有一個人叫 Charles (譯音)，Charles Yee，你係咪咁稱呼一個人叫 Charles 㗎？

答：唔記得。

問：唔記得，好。

答：因為同有利啲人唔係好熟，寫字樓。

問：係，同有利啲人唔係好熟，但係 Charles 比較熟，同唔同意？

答：唔記得，唔記得有咁嘅人。

問：就住彩福邨呢個地盤，你係有交過綠色嘅焊料同埋黃色嘅松香膏畀

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Charles 呢個人？

答：冇。

問：冇？

答：係。

問：唔噃。你有交過料畀冇利？

答：冇。

問：唔。好，問你第二啲嘢。當啲焊料訂貨送到去地盤之後，好多時啲工友係咪好快會擺起，跟住就去施工？

擺喺上面，答：因為佢唔想再落嚟，因為一日落嚟係食飯時間先落嚟咋嘛。

問：唔。第一，唔想落嚟再擺，係咪？

答：係，因為樓層高。

問：擺到自己足夠用嘅份量，就去施工地方，係咪？

答：佢應該會預多少少。

問：預多少少？

答：係呀。

問：預到啲工程嘅急趕啲嘅時候，啲工友就搶咁樣囉嗱，係咪？

答：咁又唔會嘅。

問：好快散晒喇，啲貨？

答：你講點樣會好快散晒？

問：一送到嚟，啲工友就擺，啲判頭會同啲工友講「欸，嚟貨嘞，各自落嚟擺，上去各自嘅地方施工。」

答：佢要幾多咪擺幾多。

問：係。通常都擺晒，係咪？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：唔會攞晒。

問：唔，okay。工人你要出糧畀佢哋，就要畀個工人名單明合，係咪？

答：係。

問：上面都講咗呢一啲人，工人就係你嘅僱員，啱唔啱？

答：係。

問：唔。亦都有啲係會有強積金啲資料喺啲表嗰度，係咪？

答：係。

問：唔。咁就呢啲人先可以出糧，啱唔啱？喺個表上面出現嘅人名，呢啲人先可以出糧？

答：係。

問：唔。好，最後問你，以往你打工嗰陣時，嗰個工程個模式，即係關於連工包料，以前你打工嗰時有冇試過唔係連工包料，即係小五金？

答：呢個我唔清楚。

問：有冇試過？即係你老闆有冇試過？

答：呢個我有去問，冇問過。

問：你有冇遇到開工嗰陣時啲料唔夠，同老闆講，老闆話「唔得呀，上面個大判都未訂貨，等下喇你哋」？

答：未試過。

問：未試過？

答：係。

問：次次都好夠貨？

答：係。

問：好，好。覺唔覺得連工包料呢一個做法，對於你嚟講，係會方便過唔連工包料，喺小五金嗰個層面上？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：呢個冇統計過。

問：自己訂料係咪都好快，你覺得？

答：因為佢哋報價嗰陣時要求係我包，咁我咪包囉，但係我又冇試過話唔包，...

問：唔，好。

答：...所以唔知道嗰個分別。

問：唔。其實喺彩霞--彩福邨，對唔住。彩福邨呢個工程入面，起緊嗰時候，你已經知道係唔可以用一啲含鉛嘅物料，啱唔啱？

答：唔知道。

問：你已經知道係需要用符合房屋署要求嘅物料，啱唔啱？

答：呢個知道。

問：唔。伍克明同你講嘅，啱唔啱？

答：冇同我講過。

問：你點知呀咁？

答：佢話咩嘢--佢哋咩嘢--佢啲科文話畀我聽。

問：即係明合嘅科文話畀你聽？

答：係呀。

問：唔。當中包括焊料都係用...

答：冇講過焊料。

問：雖然你知道要符合房屋署要求，我向你指出，其實你知道要符合房屋署要求...

主席：唔係，咁有啲咩嘢要符合房屋署嘅要求？因為水喉嗰啲大件嗰啲嘢全部唔關你事。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：因為房屋署要求就係即係譬如麻根嗰啲係唔畀用嘅，淨係用士黏膠布嘅。

主席：係。點解麻根唔畀用？

答：我唔知，因為佢唔畀用麻根嘅。即係我哋通常之前，即係之前嗰啲做法，即係好早期嘅做法就打咗啲麻根再加啲士黏膠布，最早期我學師嗰陣時就係士黏膠布都有，係用麻根加油灰，加銅油灰，即係裝嗰啲鉛水喉嗰陣時。

主席：裝咩嘢？

答：鉛水喉。

主席：鉛嘅水喉？

答：係呀，嗰啲鐵喉。

主席：哦，鐵喉。

答：係。

問：唔。你話嗰啲鉛水喉嘅通俗嘅叫法即係鉛--嗰啲「鐵喉」，係咪呀？

答：我哋行內叫係「鉛水喉」。

問：鍍鋅嘅，鍍嗰啲，係咪？

答：鍍--冇--唔係，講「鉛水喉」嘅啫，寫都係寫「鉛水喉」嘅，即係我哋寫。

問：但係指就指係鍍鋅嘅喉，係咪？

主席：唔係，你唔好理佢，總之「鉛水喉」佢哋即係。

李先生：好，唔緊要，好，唔緊要。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：好，向你指出其實喺彩福邨呢個地盤，你其實知道係要用綠色個罐嘅焊料，啱唔啱？

答：唔知道。

問：而你為咗一啲原因，就唔用嗰隻，用一條條嘅焊料，係咪？

答：唔係。

問：唔。用焊條就唔話畀明合聽，係咪？

答：冇人話畀我聽呢隻唔用得。

問：你有話過畀明合聽你用乜嘢？

答：呢個我買咗返嚟都擺喺嗰度，我亦都唔會收埋，又唔係偷偷咁擺喺度做。

問：係，你仲要話房屋署啲人喺度，都係用一條條添，我聽到。

答：係。

問：唔噃。你買完貨啲單都有畀明合啲喇，係咪？

答：佢冇要求，冇畀佢。

問：唔，好。最後問你一個好簡單嘅議題，今次嚟呢個聆訊，你就做咗呢份書面供詞，係咪？

答：噯。

問：做供詞嗰陣時，成個過程吓，有冇一段時候莫海光同你一齊？

答：冇。

問：唔。做之前有冇同莫海光傾過？

答：冇。

主席：呢啲係--呢度係我哋嘅 Commission 嘅 lawyer 擺㗎嘛。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

李先生：知道，唔該晒，冇問題。

主席：咪係囉。

李先生：唔該晒。

主席：你唔係有啲咩嘢 allegation，係咪呀？

李先生：冇問題。

主席：係。

林先生：我有兩條問題。

林先生盤問

問：蕭生，如果我哋去番個--啲啲相，如果你可唔去睇一睇第(21)、(23)號相？我知道你嘅口供關於係唔係個條邨，即係個個--我知道個一 part 嘅口供。但係我想睇睇(21)同埋(23)，我見到呢位工人，就算唔係你哋嘅工人或者你唔認識嘅工人，呢一位嘅工人係擺咗個錫條--我唔知係錫條定係咩嘢，咁呢就錫線定係錫條，當佢--唔好理係咩嘢先，都係剪咗出嚟係去用嘅，係咪呀？剪咗出嚟，手揸住。

答：呢張相我就即係唔敢肯定佢有冇--即係話係咪剪出嚟，但係即係如果係佢用個陣時，即係佢大概兩呎長嘅，咁用下咁會短㗎嘛。

問：明。但係問題係就算用嘅時候係兩呎，當係你用開啲啲，咁都係手揸住...

答：係，手揸住嘅。

問：你亦都有冇見過人擺住成卷--揸住成卷去做呢一個同樣嘅動作？

答：我有見過。

問：因為其實係--因為如果你就算係揸住個個“FRY”個個成卷，係完全唔方便你哋啲工人嘅操作，你同唔同意呢個講法？同埋好重㗎嘛，係咪呀？

過，我唔知道。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

林先生：Okay。咁我有其他問題。

主席：唔該。有冇人有問題？

譚先生：好快，兩條。

主席：好呀。

譚先生盤問

問：想講番你嗰個--蕭先生，想講番你第5段嘅證人供詞。即係我有兩條問題嘅啫，就係你做呢個彩福邨呢個項目嘅時候，其實你有冇搵四判㗎？

答：冇。

問：你有搵四判嘅，嗰次？

答：係。

問：哦，okay。另外你都提過你自己做過四判，咁嗰啲有冇搵五判咁樣？有㗎嘞，係咪？

答：冇。

問：冇嘅，okay。第5段，佢嗰度...

主席：我睇緊。

譚先生：係，係。

主席：得。

譚先生：係，我有其他問題。

主席：唔該。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

冇搵四判，喺你名下嗰啲工人，一百一十幾個嗎？

答：因為呢個樓室係好多嘅，佢有啲可能做咗...

主席：一日？

答：...幾個月，或者做咗個零月，做咗十零日又走嘅。

主席：其實即係全部都係散工嚟嘅，一百一十四個？

答：呢行個流動性好大，佢今日嚟，聽日走都得。

主席：係囉。即係全部斷日計？

答：係嘞，冇錯，返一日有一日。

主席：唔。返一日走一日。咁我想問，我記得你好似講過，就話知道房署又有規例，又要 85 個 per cent，15 個 per cent 嗰啲咁樣樣嘢嘅呢，咁點樣樣可以--點可以即係--點可以確保係啱比例？

答：咪盡量搵番有大工牌嗰啲。

主席：盡量個咋嘞，即係你唔夠人，其實咩嘢人嚟你都要請㗎喇其實？

答：唔係，如果佢唔識做，咁你請嚟做咩嘢？即係如果...

主席：即係如果有個中工牌，係咪呀？

答：其實中工牌就好少嘅。

主席：係咩？

答：嘍。

主席：全部都大工，得，唔緊要。

我想問下你哋係咪會搵呢個 Charles 出嚟？

黃小姐：係呀，係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：咁你--如果你搵 Charles 出嚟，不如唔該 confrontation，唔係一陣間走咗之後，我--又話「我唔知個啲，我唔識個啲，我唔知你邊個啲。」

黃小姐：係，主席，因為呢位 Charles Yee，我哋琴晚聽完佢證供之後，就搵咗佢，但係佢就唔啱有利工作嘅。

主席：聽唔到。

黃小姐：Charles Yee 我哋就琴晚搵佢，咁但係佢就唔係啱有利工作，而家就啱另外一間公司工作。

主席：係。

黃小姐：佢最早嚟到係十二點九，咁我今朝都同佢傾過，佢都要 12 點 45 分先至到到呢一度，因為佢今朝有另外一個會，咁希望主席如果可以嘅話，容許我哋...

主席：佢嘅證供有幾耐？

黃小姐：唔長。

主席：「唔長」，即係幾耐？

黃小姐：大概我諗十五分鐘嘅。

主席：十五分鐘嘅？

黃小姐：嘍。

主席：咁我哋休息先。

黃小姐：唔該。

主席：係，請講。

許偉強先生：就我有一個補充。

主席：係，好呀。

許偉強先生進一步盤問

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：蕭生，啱啱剛才主席同埋有利律師都問過你有關個樣辦房你需唔需要即係親身喺嗰度嘅。咁你都有答到嗰個問題，就話即係有時你啲伙記都搞掂嘅。咁你呢...

答：伙記參與多。

問：我唔知有冇聽錯，你就提到一度就話，你就需要去個天簾嗰度留窿，跟住主席又問過你，「喂，咁冇理由緊要得過睇住個樣辦房㗎？」我想問下你，你話嗰個咩嘢「天簾嗰度留窿」個意思係點解？

答：因為佢呢個樓面落石屎之前，我哋要留咗啲窿，如果嗰個窿留得唔啱，咁落咗石屎就好大劑。如果係辦房佢做得唔啱，佢要求點改都可以改到，即係我個--當時嗰個...

問：你講嗰個「天簾」喺邊度？

主席：天面呀。

許偉強先生：天簾呀？

主席：天面定天...

問：面--天面？

答：天面，天面，即係--唔係，即係樓面囉，樓面。即係---一層，即係譬如好似如果落石屎落到5樓，咪5樓樓面囉。

問：係。

答：即係我哋跟住個樓層，跟住嗰個樓一路上㗎嘛。

問：係，得，唔該。另外你講個樣辦房呢，就因為...

主席：唔係，我唔係好明個天面、樓層，咁你已經起到譬如三...

答：樓面，樓面，樓面。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：我知。你起到--你如果你起咗兩層，都已經差唔多啲嘢都定晒，仲使乜--就又要走上去個天面度睇住呀？

答：有啲嘢要咩嘢嘅，又要去跟番，因為有啲樓層--即係有啲樓層唔同，即係佢特別層又係有啲--啲啲減壓掣啲樓層，啲啲留窿圖係唔同嘅。

主席：吓？

答：係唔係層層有嘅。

主席：天面，唔緊要，繼續。

許偉強先生：唔。冇，我有其他問題。

主席：即係我嘅意思即係倒石屎你又要特登--咁呢啲...

答：即係我留咗窿之前先--之後先落得石屎。

主席：我明，我梗係明喇，係咪？如果唔係封死咗個窿，咪你大...

答：係嘞，係嘞。

主席：好難搞，係咪？不過你唔係次次樣辦房都啱啱倒石屎，係咪？

答：咁如果係上面唔需要我，咁我咪落嚟參與辦房個度。

主席：係囉，係囉。

答：所以就唔係話站場喺度囉。

主席：係囉，係囉，係囉。

答：嘎。

主席：好呀，咁我哋休息先。我哋十--休息，暫--暫--十二點幾話？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

黃小姐：十二點九。

主席：你叫佢早啲喇。

黃小姐：好，我繼續追緊。

主席：如果早啲嘅話，就話畀我哋聽，咁跟住...

黃小姐：係，如果早到，我哋通知。

主席：係呀，嘎。

蕭生，你唔好走住，你留番喺度先。

咁我哋休息。

上午 11 時 30 分聆訊押後

下午 12 時 44 分恢復聆訊

出席人士如前。

黃小姐：多謝主席、黎委員。我下一個證人係余逸銘先生，Charles, Yee Yat Ming。

主席：可唔可以畀個身份證我望一望？

黃小姐：好。

主席：唔該。

有關有利建築有限公司（總承建商）的第六證人：余逸銘（有利建築有限公司的前 Architectural Quality Control Coordinator（彩福邨））以本地話宣誓作供

主席：請坐。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

黃小姐主問

問：余生，你而家個職業係乜嘢？

答：Planning Engineer，策劃工程師。

問：係。咁你而家喺邊度任職？

答：南豐集團。

問：係。咁你係咪曾經喺有利任職？

答：係。

問：幾時？

答：07年12月至到03年5月。

主席：幾多？13年？

答：13年，係，係，唔好意思。

問：好嘞，你喺有利做嗰陣時嘅職位係咪 AQCC，Architectural Quality Control Coordinator？

答：係，冇錯。

黃小姐：主席同議員，有關佢嗰個文件上，亦都可以喺 I1,255 頁，Mr Wong 嗰份 statement，即係黃天祥嗰份 statement 睇到，I1,255 頁。

主席：係。

黃小姐：第4項。

主席：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

黃小姐：Yee Yat Ming, AQCC。

主席：得，睇到。

黃小姐：唔該。

問：你喺加入有利後，係咪唯一做過嘅地盤工程就係彩雲道嘅彩福邨？

答：係，冇錯。

問：咁你所知，有利嘅承判係承判咗水喉工程呢個合約，係咪畀咗明合有限公司？

答：係，畀咗明合。

問：然後，明合亦都係同呢個恆利工程，咁我哋所知，個東主就係蕭健煌先生，咁就承判咗畀蕭健煌先生做，咁你知唔知？

答：知道。

問：你喺法庭認唔認到佢，而家？

答：認到，佢而家喺度。

問：喺邊度？

答：呢位先生。

主席：唔該。

問：好嘞，咁我想畀你睇睇啲相片，就係 P1, 240 開始。睇唔睇到啲相片？

答：睇到。

問：咁我就想你由 240 開始，一路慢慢睇到去 252 頁。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：你睇完話畀我哋聽。

答：睇到--睇緊而家。

問：嘎。

答：睇完。

問：睇晒，係咪？

答：睇晒。

問：咁我哋睇到個日子，就睇到係呢啲相片就喺 2009 年 3 月 27 號拍攝。
你認唔認得呢啲相片係咪彩福邨呢個地盤？

主席：你應該咁問，不過唔緊要。你唯一係做過彩福邨，係咪？

答：係呀，係呀，做過彩福邨啫。

主席：呢啲相係咪...

答：係彩福邨嘅相嚟嘅。

主席：係彩福邨嘅相嚟？

答：係嘞，做 demonstration 嘅相嚟嘅。

問：好，你頭先就話啱啱講話做 demonstration，“demonstration”
嘅意思係點解？

答：我哋咁樣，因為每做一個工程嘅 works，開始之前都會做一個
demonstration，連同房屋署，咁就做畀佢睇，我哋係跟番上咗嘅
辦，上咗嘅 method statement，同埋個 specification 去嚟施
工嘅。咁喺呢個 demonstration approve 咗之後，我哋先可以再
大手開工。咁所以...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：得，得，等陣，慢慢講。你所講個 demonstration 係講緊木板房抑或係樣辦房？

答：樣辦房。

主席：樣辦房。得，繼續。

問：你記唔記得當時做呢個示範或者 demonstration，裏面啲人包唔包括蕭健煌先生？

答：包括。

問：好嘞，我哋睇呢輯相片，你睇唔睇到相片中邊一位係蕭生？

答：有嘍，第 246 頁，(28) 嗰張相。

問：係，即係揸住綠色...

答：係。

問：...錫線卷同埋黃色“FRY”嗰個“POWER FLUX”嗰個人？

答：係，係，冇錯。

問：點解你會認得係佢？

答：因為嗰陣時都常見到蕭生嘅，咁同埋我認得佢件衫，咁同埋呢個身形，咁同埋我一睇到呢張相，我就知道係佢。

問：係。佢點樣稱呼你嘍？

答：Charles。

問：蕭生又點樣稱--你又點樣稱呼蕭生呢？

答：阿蕭。

問：唔。咁佢話唔識你嗎，咁你其實係識佢嘅，係咪呀？

答：識。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：好嘞，我哋睇到呢個物料，係(28)嗰度，左--右邊揸住就係黃色一卷嘢，左邊就揸住“POWER FLUX”，如果我哋再睇(29)、(31)，嗰度好清楚係寫住「無鉛」，係咪？

答：係，冇錯。

問：咁其實做呢個 demonstration 嗰陣時，我哋有啲相放大咗，想畀你睇一睇，都係呢輯相嚟嘅，不過放大咗少少。咁我哋有啲相放大咗，想畀你睇番。

答：唔該。

問：係第八幅圖、第九幅，第十五幅先。咁第八、第九、第十五幅，其實你見唔見到個工具箱，係有啲黃--綠色嘅一卷卷嗰啲嘢，係咪？

答：工具箱裏面有綠色一卷，係，見到。

問：咁嗰啲焊料，其實做呢個 demonstration 都係用緊呢隻焊料，係咪？

答：用緊呢隻焊料，冇錯。

問：好嘞，咁當然我哋睇咗個 demonstration，其實你有冇幫明合擺過辦上去畀屋宇署做 submission, material submission?

答：有，因為呢個必須嘅，所以呢個當時入嗰個辦都 exactly 係呢一隻嚟嘅。

問：當陣時做呢個 material submission，係邊個畀辦你？

答：我記得係蕭生畀辦我嘅。

問：蕭生畀你？

答：係。

問：你有冇同佢傾過話要邊隻辦，或者邊隻...

答：佢畀咗我之後，我就會做一個 submission 嘅，我記得嗰陣時係批咗返嚟嘅。

問：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：批咗返嚟之後，你有冇話番畀蕭生聽？

答：一般我哋程序就文件上會 cover 番畀我哋二判 (subcontractor)，即係明合。

主席：我知。

答：係，咁但係有冇同蕭生講話批咗，我就唔記得。

黎先生：我想知呢個辦係蕭生交界你，定係你要求佢交呢一隻辦畀你㗎？

答：哦，都係咁樣喇，我哋會聯絡二判，叫佢上辦嘅，咁當時我就唔係叫蕭生去上嘅，我係聯絡明合嘅打理人，叫佢「喂，要上辦嘞，咁要上畀房署去批嘅。」咁當時之後，就係蕭生擺個辦過嚟畀我。

黎先生：即係佢交界你就係呢一隻？

答：係。

黎先生：你見到頭先呢一隻，綠色嗰隻？

答：係。

問：好嘞，點解你咁記得呢隻綠色呢隻辦上 submission 畀你，點解你記得咁清楚係綠色呢個辦？

答：哦，因為呢個印象比較深刻，因為我嗰陣時啱啱做 Housing project，咁喺我接觸焊料之前，我嘅認知，就焊枝應該係一條條嘅，咁當時佢擺嚟就係一卷卷，咁我就印象就深刻啲，咁我見到係一卷，同埋佢綠色囉，因為當時收到嘅辦冇乜辦係咁嘅綠色嘅，即係咁 sharp 嘅綠色，所以個印象就深刻啲。

黃小姐：主席、委員，完成主問。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：唔該。

許偉強先生盤問

問：余生，我想問一問你，就係剛才你講，就話喺有利，你就淨係負責過呢個彩福邨嗰個工程嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：我想問下你，你當時負責呢個工程嗰陣時，知唔知道房屋署就住呢個焊料需要咩嘢規格係應該點樣，你知唔知㗎？

答：因為佢有 specification 嘅，所以都知。

問：係。邊個話畀你知？

主席：自己睇，抑或咩嘢？

答：自己睇同理上辦嗰陣時，個 clerk of works 都有問，咁佢都有提我「喂，係咪無鉛㗎，即係 lead-free 㗎？」咁所以係會清楚知道。

問：唔好意思，我想搞清楚，係話 clerk of works 會同你講無鉛？

答：唔係，佢係 check 一次話「你係咪 confirm 㗎嘞？」因為我哋上辦，我哋唔會話上到去阿 Sir 就會睇嘅，即係佢都會問下我哋，「你了唔了解呢個辦係啲咩嘢㗎？」咁當時我都睇咗個 spec 係知道要跟啲乜嘢。

問：係。即係咁講，嗰個程序就係因為你要負責即係編排好上辦嗰陣時嗰個物料、嗰個樣辦，同理啲文件都係你負責嘅，係唔係？係咪呀？

答：係呀，係呀，冇錯。

問：你負責去即係編制呢個文件嘅時候，準備呢啲文件嘅時候，你話就係你有冇睇過房署嘅 spec？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：有。

問：有嘅，唔。咁然後就你去到遞交呢一個樣辦嘅時候，亦都有同房署職員傾過，係咪？

答：傾過，每一份都傾嘅，係。

問：係。我想問一問你，就係如果我哋睇番嗰個呈交嗰個樣辦，如果我哋睇番 B15.3, 38910。呢個我從文件度就睇到，就係關呢個彩福嘅，有關嗰個樣本嗰個呈交嘅。如果你睇下第 38911 嗰頁，中間嗰度，見唔見到“For and on behalf of the Contractor”嗰度有個簽名嘅，係咪？

答：係呀。

問：嗰個就係一位應該係姓朱嘅先生，係咪？

答：係呀，冇錯。

問：佢係咪你同事嚟㗎？

答：係同事嚟嘅。

問：我想知道係遞交呢個文件上去嘅時候，實情係你遞交定係呢位朱先生遞交㗎？

答：我遞交，佢 endorse。

問：佢 endorse 嘅，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：你哋兩個都有睇過嗰個物料嘅樣辦嘅？

答：冇錯。

問：係。你剛才講，就係話如果你係即係需要呢個水喉分判商交呢一個焊料嘅樣辦上嚟嗰陣時，你哋會先係聯絡明合嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：明合啲職員嘅？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係，冇錯。

問：你當時本人自己有冇聯絡明合邊位職員，就住遞交呢一個焊料嘅樣辦同佢傾過？

答：嗰陣時明合打嚟，好似叫阿和（譯音）。

問：阿和，係。我想問下你，就係你就同咗明合講，叫話「喂，你要安排呢啲樣辦，即係交上嚟嘞」咁？

答：係，係，呢個係其中一樣。

問：係嘞。咁就當時你就冇直接去搵過蕭健煌先生嘅？

答：冇。

問：然後，你知唔知道點解係蕭健煌先生佢自己遞畀你哋有利，點解唔係佢擺去明合嗰度嘅？

答：唔知。

問：唔。講番呢個樣辦房，即係彩福邨嗰個樣辦房，剛才我哋都提及過，如果係我哋講緊以每一層嚟到計，大概每一層有幾多個樣辦房左右，你記唔記得？

主席：咩嘢每一層有幾多？我想問下彩福邨做咗幾多個樣辦房？

答：我唔記得咗，但係應該會揀番幾個有代表性嘅單位嚟做嘅。

主席：即係多過一個嘅？

答：多過一個。

主席：唔該。

問：多過一個，係咪每一個即係唔同嘅...

答：個 layout 唔同。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：個 layout 唔同嘅？

答：或者裏面嘅--應該係個 layout 唔同，主要係個 layout 唔同。

問：係。啱啱你睇過嗰啲相，就係喺個樣辦房嗰度影嗰啲相，你記唔記得係邊一個影呢啲相㗎？

主席：呢啲唔--問咗都答--冇意思㗎嘛。

答：唔記得。

許偉強先生：好，得，我有其他嘢。

主席：唔該。

黎先生：我想問一問，你頭先提過話係有個 clerk of works 同你係聯絡，一齊喺嗰度嘅，係咪？係咪同一時間喺嗰度出現㗎，呢咩相影嗰陣時？

答：喺嗰相入面定係...

黎先生：影嗰陣時喺唔喺嗰度㗎，佢？

答：啲相嗰陣時？

黎先生：嗰啲相影嗰陣時，個 clerk of works 喺唔喺嗰度？

答：如果簽呢個文件嗰個--唔係，我唔記得咗嗰陣時有邊個 clerk of works，因為佢仲有啲 ACW 嘅，即係唔一定係 COW 去睇。

黎先生：係個 clerk of works 要求你係交嗰啲物料返去畀佢睇嘅，係咪個 clerk of works 要求你交呢一啲物料㗎？

主席：唔係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：唔係。

黎先生：唔係？

答：唔係。

黎先生：就幫你有傾過，知道話叫你哋係用一啲係無鉛嘅焊料？

答：如果淨係講呢個 demonstration，我哋要約 clerk of works 嚟睇，即係我哋唔係就咁自己做，跟住再影相嘅。

黎先生：嗰個 clerk of works 有冇同你直接傾過嘞？

主席：唔係，你講上辦嗰陣時候，抑或係影相嗰個時候？

黎先生：上辦嗰陣時。

主席：上辦嗰陣時，係，講上辦。

答：哦，上辦嗰陣時。上辦嗰陣時有傾過。

黎先生：有傾過，佢話畀你知...

答：即係我哋會坐低，擺晒啲文件出嚟，擺埋個 sample，...

黎先生：佢有提過你係...

答：...跟住就喺度 review 晒所有文件，係咪跟到個 spec，因為我哋會擺份 spec 喺度，擺我上嘅文件，再有一份 sample 喺度，咁然後 cross check 番，係咪跟到房署個 spec 囉。

黎先生：佢有提醒你話要用無鉛嘅焊料嘅？

答：有呀。

黎先生：佢有提醒你嘅，就係嗰個房屋署嘅職員嚟嘅？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係，房屋署嘅職員。

黎先生：唔，唔，okay。

主席：蕭生，你有冇嘢想問呢位余先生？

蕭健煌先生盤問

問：我想問你，啲相...

主席：你企起身問佢。

問：即係唔係你自己--即係你有睇住佢影相，咁你又點知道嗰個相肯定係我呢？

主席：你點知啲相裏面係佢？

答：首先我一睇張相，我就好肯定嗰個係佢，咁即係除咗件衫同埋個身形，因為佢嗰陣時成日着呢件衫。

黃小姐：主席，唔好意思，我哋啱啱搵到幅圖係關於個邨嘅安全啲會議，係睇到呢件衫，係蕭生嗰陣時着住呢件衫。

主席：你不如擺埋--繼續問埋先，蕭先生。

問：你話我擺啲啲--即係話畀批辦嗰個，即係你話嗰個一卷卷啲錫條畀你，交界你嗰陣時有冇文件簽番畀我嘅呢？

答：冇喎。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：你又肯定係我交界你？

答：因為當時我記得我同你傾過偈嘅，我就話你--因為你成卷畀我嘅，咁當時我就未上過呢隻辦嘅，我就話「欸，你剪一啲畀我上咪得囉。」我記得嗰陣時你就同我講話「欸，唔得㗎，要成卷擺上去上㗎。」

問：因為我知道呢個地盤，我接觸你係好少嘅。

答：但係你都--因為你都好多時候擺啲明合啲 sample 畀我，咁所以我...

問：我從來冇擺過明合啲 sample 畀你。

答：哦。

主席：佢哋--佢咁講嘢，你同唔同意佢咁講法？

答：唔同意。

主席：唔，得。

黃小姐：主席，因為我哋都係啱啱先搵到，我可唔可以喺其後補番嘅呢？

主席：其後先至補。

黃小姐：唔該晒。

主席：係想--不如等我睇咗先，或者畀黎生睇埋。呢度有一張相，或者請你睇一睇，余先生，上面就似乎就好似有蕭生個樣同埋着住嘅衫。

答：係嘞，呢個咪佢囉。

主席：畀蕭生睇一睇，蕭生。好嘞，首先，就住呢幅相裏面嗰個，蕭生，你同唔同意係你嚟㗎，呢個--幅相裏面嗰個人？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

蕭健煌先生：好矇，我唔敢肯定。

主席：吓？你唔同意嗰個係你嚟？你同唔同意相裏面影到嗰個人係你？

蕭健煌先生：應該係，應該係。

主席：應該係，咁上面嗰件衫就好似似乎同而家嗰幅呈上嚟嗰啲相嘅衫就差唔多樣個囉喎，咁你同唔同意？

蕭健煌先生：（沒有可聽到的回答）

主席：就住呢方面，仲有冇嘢想問？蕭先生，有冇嘢想問？

蕭健煌先生：（沒有可聽到的回答）

主席：冇，冇嘢問，好，唔該晒。冇嘢問呢位先生喇嘛？

黃小姐：冇嘞，冇。

主席：呢張相遲啲就補番畀我哋。

黃小姐：好。

主席：余先生，好，唔該晒你。

答：哦，唔使客氣。

主席：多謝你今次嚟畀證供，好，可以離開㗎嘞。

答：好。

主席：咁就仲有冇證人㗎，你哋？仲有冇證人，冇喇嘛，係咪呀？冇證人。

黃小姐：冇證人嘞，主席。

主席：係咁多？

黃小姐：主席，唔該晒。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：係。

許偉強先生：主席，我哋就咁提議嘅，如果係咁，我哋下個禮拜一開始，就會處理有關中國建築嗰方面嘅證供，咁就其實我都有同另外啲 involve party 嘅律師團隊都有傾過呢啲安排，咁不如我就既然今日有呢個時間，我就即係公告下天下，睇下呢個可唔可以作為一個理想嘅安排。首先，我哋就下個禮拜就想處理咗有關中國建築嘅證人，然後，因為我哋知道嗰啲外判同埋啲水喉匠，就唔係淨係做中國建築有關嗰啲咁嘅項目嘅，有好多都係橫跨咗其他嗰啲總承建商。所以我哋個建議嘅做法，就係就住跟住嗰三個總承建商嘅證人，就一併過處理咗先。

主席：係。

許偉強先生：然後就處理外判嘅證人，...

主席：明白。

許偉強先生：...然後就處理嗰個水喉匠，就諗住係咁樣做嘅。

主席：係。

許偉強先生：而次序方面，我哋就係會處理咗呢個中國建築先，然後就係瑞安，最後就係有利--最後就係保華嘅，係嘞，係嘞，係嘞。

主席：唔。

許偉強先生：咁就呢個就係我哋而家嘅建議。

主席：係。

許偉強先生：咁另外就係我哋十--知道 14 號，就原先我哋安排咗呢個 Professor Bellinger 嚟畀口供嘅，因為 Professor Bellinger 就會 13 號夜晚先至嚟香港，咁我哋有機會喺 14 號之前即係可以見到佢，所以我哋都想話喺 14 號攞啲時間，我哋律師團隊同 Professor Bellinger 見一見面嘅。所以如果係咁，就住 Professor Bellinger 嗰個口供，我哋就想 15 號開始。

主席：星期二？

許偉強先生：星期二嚟嘅，係嘞。咁就呢個就係我暫時即係提出嘅安排。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：好呀。

許偉強先生：唔該。

主席：我哋今日就呢個研訊就到此為止，咁樣我哋星期一朝頭早 10 點鐘就再繼續。咁到時各位如果對呢個時間表有咩嘢唔同嘅睇法，就到時向我再陳述，好唔好？唔該晒。

蕭先生，基本上你嘅——同你有關嘅證供、證據就應該完晒㗎嘞，所以星期一就隨便你，如果你話有興趣嘅話，就可以繼續嚟；如果你話「我唔想出席嘞」，都可以唔出席，明白咁嘛？

蕭健煌先生：明白。

主席：唔該晒。

2015年12月04日

下午1時08分聆訊押後

Friday, 4 December 2015

(10.02 am)

(Transcript of simultaneous interpretation

except where otherwise specified)

MR KHAW: Chairman, I just received from Mr Siu Kin Wong an invoice which has been sent to our instructing solicitor, Lo & Lo. I just received it. Perhaps I will circulate it. I submit it to the chairman. (Handed).

MR SIU KIN WONG (on former affirmation)

Further cross-examination by MR KHAW

MR KHAW: Mr Siu, I know you have submitted the quotation regarding Choi Ha Estate Phase 3?

A. Yes.

Q. This Choi Ha Estate Phase 3 -- we were talking about Choi Fook Estate -- are they related?

A. This is indeed Choi Fook Estate.

Q. This quotation that you submitted, I can see that you have put your name, Siu Kin Wong, there, and your company stamp and your signature?

A. Yes.

Q. This quotation, who did you submit it to? Ming Hop?

A. Yes, Ming Hop.

Q. Which staff?

A. Ng Hak Ming.

Q. In the first paragraph, you mentioned that the price

would cover from the ground floor to the rooftop, but installation of the plumbing and the drainage, it would be charged per unit. There are 2,560 units, each costing \$3,700. Let's pause here for a bit. This \$3,700 --

A. That's my quotation.

Q. -- that's your quotation, isn't it?

A. This is not an actual cost.

Q. I will ask you the actual cost in just a moment. When you quoted this price, what consideration did you have in mind? What would be included?

A. It would include the metal filler.

Q. Say again.

A. It includes the metal filler at the bottom, the metal fillers.

Q. You are talking about the last paragraph? The project doesn't include the manholes, the sewage, and then it includes the steam tape, the plastering, LPG, glue, solder paste, solder wire and tools, and these are the metal components that you talk about?

A. Yes.

Q. Let's take \$3,700. How much would be attributed to the components and how much to the labour?

A. 200 for the components -- for the materials, I mean.

Q. This is your quotation, as you said, after discussion,

C after negotiation? C

D A. It should come to \$3,600 or something, roughly. I don't
remember exactly after so many years. D

E Q. For the materials that are included, the tin solder
wire, did you make reference to any pricing standard? E

F A. We get charged per pound and then I work out the sum
myself. F

G Q. Is there anything else you would like to add to this
H paper? H

I A. No. I

J CHAIRMAN: Mr Li. J

K Cross-examination by MR LI (continued) K

L MR LI: Mr Siu, this document was something you found
yesterday, from your company? L

M A. From home. M

N Q. Did you see this document before you came to this
hearing? N

O A. I didn't dig it up myself. O

P Q. All of a sudden, you thought of this document? P

Q A. Yes, I dug up the document; I found it. I've got the
quotation. Q

R Q. You put at home? R

S A. Yes. S

T Q. Before you came to this hearing, when you made the
preparation, you didn't dig up the documents, or you T

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C didn't dig up this particular document? C

D A. I did try to find the documents, but I didn't think that D
this quotation would be of any use.

E Q. Let me put it to you -- yesterday, you said that E
Ming Hop commissioned you to put in the tender. When
F you read the drawings, you saw the drawings of the F
G piping, how many joints there would be, and so on? G

H A. I couldn't see it. H

I Q. What about the elbows? Did you see the elbows? I

J A. No, I didn't see them. J

K Q. In the drawing, the drawing has a scale. Would the K
drawings be showing the alignment of the pipes?
L A. Not during the quotation stage. It was a simple line L
drawing.

M Q. All the lines, what are the lines representing? M

N A. The lines, I would say, it is for hot water, for cold N
water, for drainage.

O Q. The lines would turn a corner, wouldn't they? O

P A. Yes, they would turn. P

Q Q. The turning point would be the joints, wouldn't they? Q

R A. Yes. R

S Q. Having seen these drawings, the drawings wouldn't say S
you should use compression or you should use soldering
T for certain joints? T

U A. No, it doesn't say. U

V

Q. But Ng Hak Ming would say to you that this you have to solder?

A. Yes, with tin wire.

Q. So you saw the drawings and you would realise that if the materials have to be included, you would have to include the solder wires, so when you work out the sum, you would include the solder wire as well?

A. Yes.

Q. Ng Hak Ming said that tin solder had to be used. That's soldering joints. Did he use these words? What did he say?

A. He said tin wire, tin wiring for the copper pipes.

COMMISSIONER LAI: What exactly do you mean? In Chinese, "char see", what does it mean?

A. It means we will use the solder paste and then we heat it up and put the solder wire there.

COMMISSIONER LAI: Right, using the solder paste, and then you solder the joints; that's called "char see" in Cantonese?

A. Well, it has another meaning. Soldering, we use -- it also means the brazed soldering, the silver brazing.

COMMISSIONER LAI: "Char see", the two characters, "char" is the character for "walking", isn't it?

A. Right.

MR LI: For soldering joints for the water pipes, you use

C the soldering? When you join up the pipes, you call it
"char see"?

C

D A. There are a number of ways to join the copper pipes.

D

E One is compression. One is soldering. One is welding.

E

F The welding is to use acetylene cylinder, we use the
silver brazing.

F

G Q. Here, we are talking about the solder wire this is what
you called the "char see"?

G

H A. Right.

H

I Q. Mr Ng Hak Ming told you that these tin solder materials
will have to measure up to the HD requirements?

I

J A. I don't remember whether he said it.

J

K CHAIRMAN: In your understanding, what is your
understanding?

K

L A. My understanding is that for solder joints, we have been
M doing this for so many years, we have been using this
N kind of solder wire.

L

M

N

O CHAIRMAN: What solder wire do you use all these years?

O

A. We have been using this kind of solder stick.

P CHAIRMAN: Is it a green one in rolls, or which one are you
using?

P

Q A. I don't know which one contains lead and which doesn't.

Q

R CHAIRMAN: Don't care which one contains lead or not. Have
S you been using the green ones which are in rolls?

R

S

T A. Yes, this is the one. This is the tin solder stick that

T

U

U

V

V

C I've been using.

C

CHAIRMAN: Which type? Which brand?

D A. In bundles, in sticks.

D

E CHAIRMAN: How many years have you been using these tin
solder sticks?

E

F A. On this site, and also previously, when I help the
G contractors, I always use the same.

F

G

H CHAIRMAN: Everyone using the tin solder stick; nobody used
the green one, in rolls?

H

I A. Not that I am aware of.

I

J CHAIRMAN: You have been there for so many years?

J

A. Sorry?

K CHAIRMAN: You have been there so many years?

K

L A. Yes, I have been there for so many years. I don't just
do fresh water plumbing. I also do drainage.

L

M CHAIRMAN: But you have never seen the green ones in rolls?

M

N A. Correct.

N

O CHAIRMAN: Every time you use, you use the tin solder
strips.

O

P A. Or sometimes silver brazing.

P

Q CHAIRMAN: Let's not talk about silver brazing. Silver is
for the larger diameter pipes; is that right?

Q

R A. No, no, no. Some private buildings, small pipes, they
S also use silver brazing as well.

R

S

T CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you can enlighten us on these. Solder

T

T

U

U

V

V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C jointing and silver brazing, what is the difference? C

D A. Silver brazing, the intensity of the fire would be D
different.

E CHAIRMAN: You need to use silver strips. E

F A. Yes. They use silver strips. F

G CHAIRMAN: Is there any difference in terms of welding, the G
time for welding, the time used to make a joint? Say
H for the same diameter of copper pipes, is there any H
difference in time?

I A. Similar. I

J CHAIRMAN: In terms of time. J

K A. In terms of time, similar. K

L CHAIRMAN: What about temperature? Temperature has to be L
higher.

M A. Right? M

N CHAIRMAN: And you use oxyacetylene cylinders? N

O A. Yes. There may be a difference between LPG and O
oxyacetylene.

P CHAIRMAN: I know. Silver brazing, do they use LPG? P

Q A. That is cheaper, but oxyacetylene is more expensive. Q

R CHAIRMAN: You can use LPG? R

S A. You can't use LPG for brazing, silver brazing. S

T CHAIRMAN: You need to use oxyacetylene. T

U A. Right. U

V CHAIRMAN: That is more complicated; right? V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	A. You may say that it is more troublesome, more complicated. Say transportation, more troublesome.	C
D	CHAIRMAN: It is heavier.	D
E	A. Correct.	E
F	CHAIRMAN: If it is higher, then it will be very troublesome? You cannot hold up the cylinders; right?	F
G	A. We can wheel it by cart.	G
H	CHAIRMAN: Yes, you can use a cart and then put it in the building, but if the pipe is on the ceiling, is it seldom?	H
I	A. Yes, sometimes.	I
J	CHAIRMAN: In private housing estates?	J
K	A. Yes, yes, there may be.	K
L	CHAIRMAN: So you need a ladder?	L
M	A. Yes. We have scaffoldings.	M
N	CHAIRMAN: I mean indoor.	N
O	A. Indoor, you don't need that. You just get a working platform.	O
P	CHAIRMAN: Yes, a working table, a platform. Then if it is outside, it would be dangerous; is that right?	P
Q	A. Yes. There are scaffolding, bamboo scaffolds, and there are also boards and also safety belts. It's safe.	Q
R	CHAIRMAN: Well, theoretically, right? Is it just theoretical?	R
S	A. What? Pardon?	S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	CHAIRMAN: Was it just theoretical?	C
	A. It's safe.	
D	CHAIRMAN: Please go on.	D
E	MR LI: Just now, the chairman asked you, in doing the tin	E
	soldering, you didn't see the green cans?	
F	A. I have not seen that before.	F
G	Q. Have you seen that before?	G
	A. I have seen it now. I didn't have any impression	
H	about it.	H
I	Q. You seldom saw it? You have been in the business for so	I
	long. Whether you are an employee or whether you have	
J	your business, do you use the solder wires, solder	J
	strip? Is there any shortage of supply?	
K	A. Well, in the past, when I was a worker, my boss order	K
	that.	
L	Q. When there is delivery of goods, can you recall that?	L
	A. I cannot recall that.	
M	Q. Are you just dodging the question whether there's the	M
	green cans of solder wire?	
N	A. No, I have never seen that before.	N
	Q. Now, you said, talking about Ng Hak Ming, did he ask you	
O	to use solder strip that is according to the requirement	O
	of the Housing Authority?	
P	A. No.	P
Q	Q. On paragraph 7:	Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

"With regard to Choi Fook Estate, Ming Hop has never told or required Hang Lee to buy metal sundry of certain brand or designated requirement."

Did you see that? Do you see that? Why you said so, but today you said that Ming Hop has never told you this, and then today you also say that you didn't recall; why is it so? (A one-minute pause).

Mr Siu?

A. I don't understand your question.

Q. You have been thinking for so long and now you say you don't understand my question. I ask you again. A few moments ago you told us -- I asked whether Ng Hak Ming told you the soldering materials would have to comply with the Housing Authority's requirements. You said you could not recall. But in paragraph 7, you said Ming Hop never told you or required you to buy what type of metal components. "They didn't ask us to buy any brand." It seems that Ng Hak Ming has never said a word on this. You are very firm. He didn't tell you to buy what brand or what specification? (A 30-second pause).

CHAIRMAN: Do you understand the question? Mr Siu, do you understand the question?

A. Well, I should not have said that.

MR LI: You shouldn't have said that? The concept of complying with the Housing Authority's requirement, you

should know that?

A. Yes, I know that.

Q. Now look at paragraph 31. The last sentence:

"I and Hang Lee has no idea or no concept about whether the soldering material comply with the requirement of the Housing Authority."

But you say you know the requirement of the Housing Department, but you say you have no concept or idea about the soldering material that fits the requirement of the Housing Department.

A. They didn't specify what type of soldering material.

Q. But this morning, you said that you cannot recall whether Mr Ng Hak Ming had told you that the solder material had to meet the requirement of the Housing Department.

CHAIRMAN: I think you have to ask your question in simple forms.

MR LI: Do you understand my question, Mr Siu?

A. I don't understand your question.

CHAIRMAN: You have just answered that you knew there was a requirement by the Housing Department, or there were requirements by the Housing Department, as far as solder material was concerned. But, here, you said that you had no idea of what was the requirement of the Housing Department.

A. My understanding was that the Housing Department required copper pipes.

MR LI: But you didn't buy the copper pipes?

A. No, I didn't.

Q. As for those, Ming Hop had to be responsible, you knew it, but for what you should be responsible, you have no idea about it?

A. Well, they didn't tell me what type of solder material I should use.

Q. Okay. Now, concerning the Choi Fook Estate site, this is material plus labour?

A. Just metal components.

Q. Did you ask Ming Hop for this, that is, labour plus material? Did you ask for that?

A. No, I didn't.

Q. When you were employed, did you ask for that?

A. Well, what can I ask for, since I am an employee?

Q. Did you hear about what your boss said when they worked with Ming Hop?

A. I have never heard about it.

Q. Concerning the mock-up flat, timber mock-up flat, it was put up with timber on site. When the timber mock-up flat was built, there was no concrete superstructure?

A. They were doing the groundworks.

Q. The purpose of the timber mock-up flat is to draw up

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	some plans and then there were some holes so that the	C
D	workers knew where should the location of the various	D
E	facilities be. And the holes, it was just like a model.	E
F	A. If you look at the timber mock-up flat, you saw the	F
G	location, and after the big building was put up, then	G
H	you knew where the holes would be and then where the	H
I	pipes would go.	I
J	Q. Was there any soldering?	J
K	A. Yes, there must be soldering, otherwise things will	K
L	drop.	L
M	Q. Concerning the joints of the pipes, they just put	M
N	together; right?	N
O	A. But the wood cannot hold the pipes. They will fall. In	O
P	Choi Fook Estate, there is soldering.	P
Q	Q. You did on other sites, there was no soldering?	Q
R	A. I have never done that on other sites.	R
S	Q. When they put up the timber mock-up flat, were you	S
T	present?	T
U	A. I was.	U
V	Q. Your employees would be present?	V
	A. No. I did it. I was present.	
	Q. If you look at the holes in the timber mock-up flat,	
	when the actual work starts, then you teach your	
	workers, "The hole is here, this hole is over here and	
	the other hole is over there"?	

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C A. No, it's for approval by the Housing Department. We C
follow the drawing to keep the hole.

D CHAIRMAN: When they do the concreting, they have to leave D
holes.

E A. Yes. E

F MR LI: When it comes to the sample flat, you also have to F
be present?

G A. Yes, I was present. G

H Q. And your employees would have to be present? H

I A. Yes, some employees are present. I

J Q. And some Housing Department staff were present? J

K A. Always. K

L CHAIRMAN: Housing Department staff were present. Ming Hop, L
how about the staff from Ming Hop?

M A. Yes, they were present. M

N MR LI: Yau Lee staff were present? N

O A. Yes, of course. O

P Q. Now, concerning the sample flats, you had to join the P
pipes as demonstration; right?

Q A. I am not sure. I asked my employees to do that. Q
Sometimes, I went down and get involved.

R CHAIRMAN: Concerning the connection of pipes in sample R
flats, Ming Hop had staff present?

S A. Yes. S

T CHAIRMAN: Concerning the connection of pipes, how many days T
U
U
V

C were needed?

C

A. It depends on the progress.

D CHAIRMAN: I refer to the sample flats, please.

D

E A. Sample flat, that was in the big building. Now, they
put up the tiles and then they let us in.

E

F CHAIRMAN: Yes, I know. After they have put up the tiles,
G then it's your turn; right?

F

G

H A. When it's okay, when there's the reception, about two to
three months.

H

I CHAIRMAN: Now, listen to me. Now, they pour concrete, they
J get the frame ready, then they put up the tiles and then
K they handed that to you, so that you did the pipes in
the sample flat; correct?

I

J

K

L A. Correct.

L

M CHAIRMAN: My question for you is this. Now, in this sample
flat, what did you have to do? First, the pipes, what
N type of pipes?

M

N

O A. Copper pipes, that is, fresh water pipes, and also the
drains. And also put up the basin and toilet. The
P sink.

O

P

Q CHAIRMAN: And also the shower?

Q

A. Yes, the shower. Later, in a later stage.

R CHAIRMAN: Just a moment.

R

S A. Also the taps.

S

T CHAIRMAN: And also the toilet seats?

T

U

U

V

V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C A. Toilet seats. C

CHAIRMAN: The tap, that's about all.

D A. Then the toilet. D

CHAIRMAN: And then the kitchen. E

E A. The sink, and then the tap, and then test the water. E

F Test the water. F

CHAIRMAN: Now, before testing the water, you have not G

H finished the fitting? After you have fitted everything, H

I then you do the testing. Sink, what else? I

A. The washing machine mixer, the tap. I

CHAIRMAN: Anything else? J

J A. That's pretty much all of it. J

K CHAIRMAN: So that's for the kitchen and the toilet, not so K

L much in the dining room. L

A. No pipes in the living room. L

M CHAIRMAN: Any bedroom or just an empty shell? M

N A. Yes, just an empty shell flat. N

CHAIRMAN: So you have to fit on the pipes, the sink, the O

O shower, the mixer, the washing basin -- there is the O

P sink, the washing machine, drainage pipes for the P

Q kitchen -- so, for the kitchen, how many days do you Q

think it would need? Let's take the toilet first, which Q

R is more complicated. How long does it take you? R

S A. For the piping, one day, together with the kitchen and S

T the toilet. T

U

V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C CHAIRMAN: For the sample flats? C

D A. Yes, for the fresh water plumbing. D

E CHAIRMAN: Yes, I know. For all the stuff we have E

F mentioned. F

G A. You are talking about inside? G

H CHAIRMAN: Yes, talking about inside. H

I A. One day, a single day, would do. I

J COMMISSIONER LAI: For everything that we mentioned, one J

K single day, you get this completed? K

L A. One flat, yes, for the sample flat. Yes. L

M CHAIRMAN: The sample flat, only one, isn't it? M

N A. No, the whole floor. There are a few dozen sample flats N

O for the floor. O

P CHAIRMAN: All of them? P

Q A. Yes. We do the entire floor. Q

R CHAIRMAN: Yes, I know they hand over a floor to you, but do R

S you pick one flat for the pipes to be installed? S

T A. Yes, they had different units in the same housing T

U estate. U

V CHAIRMAN: So how many sample flats have you done? V

A. I think I have done half a dozen.

CHAIRMAN: Half a dozen sample flats you have done. Did you

do them all at the same time or different stages?

A. Different stages.

CHAIRMAN: Half a dozen sample flats, done at different

stages. That's because, in the housing estates, there are units of different sizes and different dimensions?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: All right, then. One to two days, you get them over and done with?

A. Yes, for the fresh water pipes.

CHAIRMAN: Yes, we are talking about the fresh water pipes. The washing basin, the water closet, the sink.

A. It's just the pipes, not the fitments.

CHAIRMAN: So for all of them to be fitted, how long does it take you?

A. It would take a couple of days.

CHAIRMAN: How many days?

A. A week.

CHAIRMAN: One week?

A. Because in these sample flats, they keep changing things around.

CHAIRMAN: You would do it first, and if there are changes to be made, then you change it? So I am talking about the time it takes you to complete the whole thing; how long does it take you, for the first time?

A. I don't quite remember, because as we go along, they keep changing. As you are working on it, they would change things. They would change as you go along.

CHAIRMAN: So every time, you have to be there when you are

C fitting the sample flats?

C

A. Well, they can talk to the workers themselves.

D CHAIRMAN: Why did they have to talk to the workers? You

D

E are the proprietor.

E

A. Well, I have to go up to the flats, to make the holes.

F CHAIRMAN: Is it more important than building the sample

F

G flats? This is Ming Hop verifying your workmanship?

G

H A. Well, the workers can do it, I can instruct them and
they can work according to instruction. If I get the

H

I holes wrong in the units, then I can't really core the
holes; there would be big trouble.

I

J CHAIRMAN: So that's all the more reason why you have to be
K there. You didn't have to be there?

J

K

L A. I didn't have to be there. I was up there making the
holes.

L

M CHAIRMAN: I am talking about the sample flats. Now, you
N took up the HD project for the first time. You had to
build up your experience, didn't you; is that right?

M

N

O You had to build up your own wealth of experience. The
P HD came along and conducted the checking, Ming Hop came
along and conducted the checking. As the boss,
Q presumably you should be looking and watching the
R workers like hawks?

O

P

Q

R

S A. I wasn't there all the time. Sometimes, I would be
T there.

S

T

T

U

U

V - 20 -

V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C CHAIRMAN: For these sample flats, presumably they would C
inform the boss, the proprietor, to be in charge?

D I would assume they would inform the proprietor? D

E A. Yes, I had a reliable employee there. E

F CHAIRMAN: You were not there? F

G A. Not very often. G

H CHAIRMAN: But according to your statement, you had to roll H
up your sleeves and connect the pipes yourself. But for
I the sample flats, you handed it over to your colleagues? I

J A. Yes, most of the time. I was involved, though. J

K CHAIRMAN: Yes, please carry on. K

L MR LI: HD staff came along and they would ask who the boss L
was?

M A. No, they didn't ask. M

N Q. HD staff didn't have to see you there? N

O A. Why would they want to see me? O

P Q. Well, for the sample flats. P

Q A. They wouldn't insist on anyone doing it. Q

R Q. Your workers can do it? R

S A. Say again, please? I am not with you. S

T Q. For the sample flats, it was you or your workers who did T
it?

U A. Yes, yes. Right. U

V Q. The HD staff came along, they would ask for the boss? V

A. No, they wouldn't ask for me.

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	Q. Would they ask for you?	C
	A. No, they didn't ask for me. They asked for Yau Lee.	
D	Q. They didn't have to see you, did they?	D
E	A. I don't understand. Why see me? They came along. If	E
F	there was anything, they would talk to Yau Lee, and	F
G	Yau Lee then talked to me or Ng Hak Ming would talk to	G
	me, for any changes.	
H	Q. You said a moment ago that to make these sample flats,	H
	it would take a couple of days?	
I	A. Yes.	I
J	Q. In these couple of days, you would be on the site	J
	anyway, somewhere?	
K	A. Sorry?	K
L	Q. You would be on site for these couple of days?	L
	A. Yes, I was there.	
M	Q. You said you would be all over the place, but you would	M
N	pop into the sample flat?	N
	A. Yes, I would.	
O	Q. In this sample flat, did you see your workers tin	O
P	soldering these joints, and when they did so, did you	P
Q	see them bending the solder strip and then solder onto	Q
	the joints?	
R	A. That I don't remember.	R
S	Q. You don't remember? How did you go about doing it	S
	yourself, before you were the boss?	
T		T
U		U
V		V

A. When you bend it, it's -- because there is an angle that you have to solder. If it is straight, you can't stick it in. If you bend it a little bit, then you can solder this bend. I'm not sure whether they did so in the sample flat.

Q. So you saw people soldering; some would bend the strip, some wouldn't?

A. I didn't notice that.

Q. You didn't notice it, but yourself, what about yourself?

A. I would bend it myself sometimes.

Q. Please have a look at the photos when they are in action. P1, number 37. Please have a look.

Can you see a left hand there, holding up something; can you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. The right hand is holding a torch?

CHAIRMAN: Let me get a question here. You said you are not sure whether the one in the striped outfit is you. That's number 28. You are not sure whether this is your goodsself?

A. I don't recognise.

CHAIRMAN: My question is: have you got an outfit like this?

A. No, I don't.

CHAIRMAN: All right. Fine.

There are loads of photos here, in these few dozen

photos: 1, 2, you have to use the components. Are these plumbing components that were used in Choi Fook Estate?

MR LI: Page 240, photos 1 and 2.

CHAIRMAN: There are a number of components there, the fittings there, 1 to 5, and 6 and 7. They look like them?

A. Yes, they look like they were.

CHAIRMAN: Moving on, 9 through to 16; is this part of the sample flat in Choi Fook Estate?

A. I don't remember.

CHAIRMAN: You don't remember? All right then.

Photos 49 through to 55, all these procedures -- let's brush aside who those people are -- are these part of the processes in Choi Fook Estate? Let's not talk about who these people are. Is this a part of the process?

A. Yes, it looks like this is part of the process in Choi Fook.

CHAIRMAN: All right. You have seen all these photos, 1 to 50. Let's not talk about who these blokes are. Do you agree that from 1 to 55, all these photos are taken of the Choi Fook Estate site?

A. From memory, I don't think I remember.

CHAIRMAN: So you are saying that these pictures were not taken of Choi Fook Estate? You don't agree that this is

Choi Fook Estate photos?

A. I'm not sure. I'm not sure.

CHAIRMAN: You're not sure? You have only one single

housing estate under your belt.

A. Well, after so many years, after a decade or so.

MR LI: These were taken in 2009.

CHAIRMAN: Ten years? 2009 through to 2011 or something.

A couple of years ago.

So your answer is that from these pictures, you are
not sure whether they were taken from Choi Fook Estate?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Please carry on.

MR LI: Let's go back to photo 37. It's okay if you don't
recognise them. I would just like to put a question to
you regarding the procedures.

In photo 37, can you see that -- let's assume that
this is from the sample flat -- there is a beam on the
ceiling, and the worker is actually tin soldering the
joint, isn't he?

A. It's so blurred, I can't really see it.

Q. Okay. Fine. I have something bigger for you. I will
let you see the big photos. (Handed).

Please give the duplicates to Members. (Handed).

Mr Siu, can you see that? It's clearer now, isn't
it? Is it the beam?

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C CHAIRMAN: Which photo? C

D MR LI: Number 37. D

E CHAIRMAN: Thank you. E

F A. I am not sure whether it's a beam. F

G MR LI: Whatever. Now, in the sample flat or in actually G

H doing the work, you need to do soldering; right? H

I A. Yes. I

J Q. If you turn over to the solder materials and the bends, J

K page 245, photo 23 -- can you see it clearly? K

L A. Yes, it's clear. L

M Q. Can you see this: the left hand, is it the bend solder M

N material? N

O A. It looks like that. O

P Q. And the right hand holding a can of gas and a torch? P

Q This is what you said, they bend the solder material Q

R around the pipe, so as to do the tin soldering. R

S CHAIRMAN: Near the wall, it's difficult to do soldering, S

T the part that is near the wall? T

U A. Usually, water leakage is at that place. U

V CHAIRMAN: You can't solder that part. V

A. It's difficult to do the soldering. It depends on your V

experience.

MR LI: So, if it is on the ceiling, if you need to do

soldering and the pipe is near the wall and you have to

get it around the pipe, you hold up your arms, it is

quite tiring, and you also have to get a stool or
a ladder; you still have to hold up your arms?

A. Yes, of course we have to hold up our arms to do
soldering.

CHAIRMAN: Now, photo 32, I want to ask you -- now, this is
a joint. This is a valve; right?

A. It is the hole control switch.

CHAIRMAN: Now, they have a switch, and inside, there is
also another one, so you don't need to open the door,
they just close the valve. On the right-hand side -- or
rather, on the left-hand side, it is the white tube. It
is a copper tube with plastic sheath. What's the reason
for the plastic wrapping?

A. I don't know the reason. Maybe because of dew. During
the wet season, there might be dew.

CHAIRMAN: Is it hot water or cold water? Is it because
it's a hot water pipe?

A. No, it's a cold water pipe.

CHAIRMAN: But there can be a difference?

A. Yes, there will be dew, and when it's inside the flat,
they will use pipes with plastic jackets.

CHAIRMAN: Then, between the pipe and the valve, there is
soldering; right?

A. Right.

CHAIRMAN: We see some white matter.

A. That is steam tape. Steam tape. Sort of a screw, we.

CHAIRMAN: Just screw it in, it's a sort of a screw, and

then you need to put the steam tape.

A. Right.

CHAIRMAN: For large parts, you use the screw-type joints?

A. Well, for big or small joints. Now, for this type, it's

a kind of screw joint, and we therefore need to screw it

in.

CHAIRMAN: Now, this main valve connecting to the pipe, and

if you are to do welding, soldering, that would be

difficult?

A. You have to cut the plastic jacket.

CHAIRMAN: It would be difficult to do soldering. Now, you

can do soldering in the front, but what about the back,

which is facing the wall?

A. As I said, you can bend the solder strip, and then you

can melt the solder strip. You can melt the solder

strip, and the soldering material will be melted. Well,

they can use a small mirror to check whether the

soldering is proper.

CHAIRMAN: Well, if there is any water leakage, usually it

is at the back that is leaking; right?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Please go on.

MR LI: Now, concerning the photos, I asked you about the

C procedures or steps.

C

D Page 241, photo number 6, number 5 and number 7,

D

E they just show the materials?

F A. Yes.

E

G Q. Number 5 and number 7, they are the materials; correct?

F A. Yes, correct.

F

G Q. Now, number 6, the worker is holding something, and
H there is a yellow can.?

G

H A. That should be the solder paste.

H

I Q. They put it on the joint?

I

J A. Yes, paste it, put it on the pipe and also the
K component.

J

K Q. Number 8, he took it away. The next page, photo
L number 9, you see him pasting something on the joint.

L

M A. Yes.

M

N Q. What is he doing?

O A. Who is doing what?

N

P Q. Well, he is putting something on the joint?

O A. Just putting the solder paste on the joint.

O

P Q. I need your help to explain. We don't understand.

P

Q Now, photo number 10. The two pipes are connected;
R right?

Q

R A. Correct.

R

S Q. What is he doing on the wall?

S

T A. Put the piping to the T location.

T

U

U

V

V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	CHAIRMAN: The photos are not arranged according to the steps.	C
D	MR LI: Number 11, they are putting the paste on the	D
E	T joint, and then number 12, paste it on the other tube	E
F	or other pipe, and then followed by photo number 10; right?	F
G	A. Should be.	G
H	Q. Over the page, photo number 13. Now, this worker is working on a vertical pipe. There was a T joint.	H
I	A. Well, he is putting on the braces. He is tightening the	I
J	braces. It's for stationing or stabilising the short pipe.	J
K	Q. What about photo number 14?	K
L	A. He is holding a torch, LPG torch.	L
M	Q. And number 15, is he putting on the paste?	M
N	A. Well, he is trying to fit the pipe.	N
O	Q. Number 16, holding the torch; number 17, holding the torch, soldering the T joint; right? Is it so?	O
P	A. Yes, it is.	P
Q	Q. Number 18, you can see a solder strip being bent and then soldered to the T shape. Is it common practice? So the material is bent, and then put the torch there?	Q
R	A. Well, it's for easy operation. If it is a stick strip, you cannot get inside; you cannot get to the back.	R
S	Q. You bend it because you have to get to the back. But	S
T		T
U		U
V	- 30 -	V

C you can see a strip that is about 1 foot, the left hand
D holding the strip, the right hand holding the torch; is
E it common practice?

C
D
E

F A. As to the length of the strip, each solder strip is
G about 2 feet, so if you have used some of the strip,
H then it will become shorter.

F
G
H

I Q. Is it the strip you refer to?

I

J A. Yes.

J

K Q. No need for number 19. Number 20 is still soldering the
L T joint; right?

K
L
M

N Number 21, bent strip, soldering the back of the
O T joint.

N
O
P

Q Number 25, putting on the brackets; right?

Q

R A. Yes, putting on the brackets. Sometimes, the brackets
S are to be fitted by screws. It's a kind of sand wall.
T We need to use the electric drill to do this.

R
S
T
U

V Q. Do you need a special electric drill?

V

W A. What do you mean by "special"?

W

X Q. Concerning the drills, the drill heads, do they need to
Y be special ones?

X
Y
Z

AA A. Nothing special.

AA

AB Q. Say, when you go to the site, do you bring along the
AC drills?

AB
AC
AD

AE A. Yes, we do.

AE

AF Q. Yes, including the tools?

AF

AG

AG

AH

AH

AI

AI

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	A. Yes. That's what we mean by including the tools.	C
D	Q. Photo number 44, page 250, please. Perhaps number 43	D
E	first. Now, I see a wooden rod. It's pushing something	E
F	into the wall. What is it?	F
G	A. I don't understand what it is.	G
H	CHAIRMAN: Is it to put the piece of plastic into the hole?	H
I	MR LI: What's the purpose of putting the plastic in?	I
J	CHAIRMAN: Mr Li, you should know this.	J
K	A. This is provided by Ming Hop.	K
L	CHAIRMAN: Have you ever drilled a hole in the wall before?	L
M	MR LI: Frankly speaking, I saw my father do that.	M
N	Then, as for the following, working on the cement.	N
O	Do you know Chan Wai Fong?	O
P	A. Who?	P
Q	Q. Chan Wai Fong.	Q
R	A. I should know him.	R
S	Q. Is he your employee?	S
T	A. Seems to be.	T
U	Q. Did he work at the Choi Fook Estate site?	U
V	A. He should have worked on that site.	V
	Q. Please refer to 243, number 13. Is this man Chan Wai	
	Fong?	
	A. No. No.	
	Q. Are you sure, or you can't remember?	
	A. It's quite blurred.	

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	Q. I will show you the big photo, then. (Handed).	C
D	Now look at the big photo. Is this Chan Wai Fong?	D
E	A. No.	E
F	Q. Now, there is a worker identity card and there is a photo here. I can supplement a bigger document.	F
G	Please have a look at this work permit. Chan Wai	G
H	Fong, is he your staff?	H
I	A. Yes.	I
J	Q. Number 13 in the picture, is that the same person?	J
K	A. It doesn't look like the same person.	K
L	Q. Are you telling lies, Mr Siu?	L
M	A. It doesn't look like the same one.	M
N	Q. When the sample flat was built, you were responsible for procuring the solder materials?	N
O	A. Yes.	O
P	Q. These pictures were taken of Choi Fook Estate. The solder materials were procured by you?	P
Q	A. Yes.	Q
R	Q. So photo 28, page 246 ...	R
S	CHAIRMAN: Chan Wai Fong did work on your site. I am looking at page 159 of P1. Counting from the top, the seventh name is Chan Wai Fong. That's page 159 of P1. You've got that?	S
T	A. Yes.	T
U		U
V		V

C CHAIRMAN: So he did work on your site, at Choi Wan Road
site.

C

D MR LI: Let's go back to photo 28, page 246. Have a look at
E this. The yellow tub is the solder paste; is that
F right? FRY is the brand name, isn't it?

D

E

F A. What brand?

F

G Q. The yellow tub of solder paste.

G

H A. I don't understand English.

H

H Q. You don't understand even the letters of the alphabet?

I A. Some of them.

I

J Q. F-R-Y.

J

K This is a smaller version. Have a look at this,
please. (Handed).

K

L I would like to show you this yellow tub. Is it the
M solder paste? Smaller than the one in the picture,
N isn't it? You have seen these available on the market,
the big and small versions?

L

M

O A. Yes.

N

O Q. But you tend to buy the larger one?

O

P A. That's large.

P

Q Q. Yes, cheaper for the larger tub.

Q

R A. Cheaper for the larger tub? I never asked around.

R Q. But the one in your hand, can you see that?

R

S (A 30-second pause).

S

T A. I can't see that.

T

U

U

V

V

Q. Photo 28, someone holding the solder wire, a green roll, and also in the other hand is the solder paste.

On this site, if solder wire is used, in the light of your experience, they would use this kind of solder wire; they pull out the wire, cut them in measured length.

A. In the sample flats, they use the solder wire are used?

Q. (Chinese spoken).

A. I'm not sure whether the Housing Department watched us do it, but they used the same solder wire.

Q. Are you saying that if the Housing Department staff was there, you wouldn't use this green type of solder wire?

A. Yes.

Q. Nobody ever stopped you?

A. No.

Q. Is that a lie?

A. No.

Q. This morning, having seen the photo, you said you haven't got an outfit like this. Yesterday, when you looked at this picture, you said you couldn't recognise this person. In answer to this question yesterday, you didn't say that you didn't have this outfit. Why didn't you say, "It wasn't me"? Last night, you thought about it, you contemplated it, and then you said this is not you. Why?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	A. I didn't remember having taken this picture.	C
	Q. What about this outfit?	
D	A. The outfit, I never wore an outfit like this.	D
E	Q. Why didn't you say yesterday, "I didn't have this	E
F	outfit, I never wore this outfit, it couldn't have been	F
	me"? Why didn't you say so yesterday?	
G	A. Because you didn't ask me about the outfit.	G
H	Q. You saw the photo. You have been looking at the photo	H
	with due care. (A 30-second pause).	
I	Mr Siu?	I
J	A. What's that?	J
	Q. Are you with me? Have you got my question?	
K	CHAIRMAN: No, he was saying: why didn't you say	K
L	categorically yesterday in answer to his question, "It	L
M	wasn't me, I haven't got an outfit like this"? That's	M
	what he was asking.	
N	A. Well, because I wasn't asked about the outfit yesterday.	N
	How was I supposed to answer it?	
O	MR LI: In the sample room, you saw someone taking photos.	O
P	A. Sorry?	P
Q	Q. When you were in the sample room, you saw someone having	Q
	taken photos.	
R	A. In the past? What do you mean?	R
S	Q. In Choi Wan Estate, when the sample flat was being	S
	built, did you see someone taking photos?	
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	A. I'm not sure about anyone taking any picture. I didn't notice.	C
D	Q. You didn't notice whether someone was taking any pictures? Did you or did you not see someone?	D
E	A. I didn't pay attention to anyone taking any pictures.	E
F	The site was so large. People were milling around.	F
G	I didn't notice. I didn't follow any particular person.	G
H	Q. Did you see anyone taking pictures?	H
I	A. No, I didn't.	I
J	Q. Photo 28 was you, wasn't it?	J
K	A. No, it wasn't me.	K
L	Q. Photo number 50, photo 52 also, on page 252. This is you, isn't it?	L
M	A. No, not me.	M
N	Q. Let's move on, then. Photo number 8, page 241. Let's enlarge that before you. Let's show you one of them first. (Handed).	N
O	Can you see, on the bottom left-hand corner, there is a container of some kind, the bottom left-hand corner? There is also the LPG gas cylinder for hot	O
P	podge, and there is the green round bit at the end?	P
Q	A. Yes.	Q
R	Q. So it was this green solder wire that was used in the sample flat; is that right?	R
S	A. I'm not sure whether this picture was taken from	S
T		T
U		U
V		V

Choi Wan.

Q. Answer my question.

CHAIRMAN: Well, he said he wasn't sure whether the pictures were taken from Choi Wan.

MR LI: This green material here, before July 2015, before the lead in water incident, you had never seen it?

A. I have never used it.

Q. You had never seen it, you had never used it. When you purchased these materials from the hardware shop, did you ever see this green material?

A. No, I didn't notice.

Q. When you ordered the materials from Prosperity or Wo Hing -- I'm sure you know these two shops?

A. Wo Hing, I never ordered anything. Prosperity, yes. I ordered everything from Prosperity.

Q. When you ordered things from Prosperity, in particular the solder wire, when you ran out of solder wire, did Prosperity ask you to use this green model?

A. I never ran out of solder wire, never.

Q. You never ran out of solder wire, so you never used -- you never had this green brand delivered to the site?

A. No.

Q. On this Choi Fook Estate site, when you have been working there, did the Yau Lee people address you as "Siu"?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	A. Yes.	C
D	Q. There was a Charles Yee from Yau Lee. Did you address this guy as Charles Yee?	D
E	A. I don't remember. I don't know the Yau Lee people very well.	E
F	Q. You don't know the Yau Lee people very well?	F
G	Charles Yee, you don't remember?	G
H	A. I don't remember this name.	H
I	Q. For this Choi Fook Estate site, did you hand over the green-brand solder wire and the yellow solder paste to this person called Charles?	I
J	A. No.	J
K	Q. Did you hand over any of the materials to Yau Lee?	K
L	A. No.	L
M	Q. All right then. Let me turn to something else. When the soldering materials were ordered and	M
N	delivered to the site, would the workers be picking up	N
O	the materials and get on with their work?	O
P	A. They would take however many they needed and they would go up with more materials, upstairs. They wouldn't come	P
Q	down until the lunch break.	Q
R	Q. They wouldn't like to come down for more materials?	R
S	A. Yes, because they are working upstairs.	S
T	Q. They would collect enough quantity to the area where they work?	T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	A. Yes, they would get more than they needed.	C
D	Q. When it was a rush job, the workers would be scrambling for these materials, wouldn't they?	D
E	A. No, I don't think so.	E
F	Q. And the materials would be running out very quickly?	F
G	A. How do you mean?	G
H	Q. The materials were delivered and the workers would be coming down and collecting the materials and went back to where they worked, so they got what they needed; they would empty all these materials?	H
I	A. They wouldn't.	I
J	Q. Now, you pay the workers; right? You need to give a name list to Ming Hop; right?	J
K	A. Correct.	K
L	Q. Now, you said that these employees are your employees, and some also have MPF information on the list; right?	L
M	A. Correct.	M
N	Q. And only these people will receive the salaries; right? Those who appear on the list will get a salary; right?	N
O	A. Yes, indeed.	O
P	Q. Now, in the past, when you were an employee, concerning labour plus material, was there any situation in which it wasn't labour and material inclusive? Did you ask your boss?	P
Q	A. I have never asked my boss.	Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	Q. But did you come across when there is not enough material and the main contractor has not ordered?	C
D	A. No, I have not come across that.	D
E	Q. Every time, you have adequate materials?	E
	A. Yes, indeed.	
F	Q. Now, labour plus material inclusive, do you find it more convenient than not having that arrangement?	F
G	A. I have not done any statistics on that.	G
H	Q. You order materials on your own. Is it very fast?	H
I	A. When they ask for quotation, they ask me to include materials. I have never tried not including materials. Therefore, I don't know the difference.	I
J	Q. With regard to Choi Fook Estate, when it was being built, you knew that you should not use materials containing lead?	J
K	A. I didn't know.	K
L	Q. You knew you should use materials required by the Housing Department; was it correct?	L
M	A. Well, I know.	M
N	Q. Ng Hak Ming told you this; right?	N
O	A. He didn't tell me.	O
P	Q. Then how did you know?	P
Q	A. The foreman told me.	Q
R	Q. Ming Hop's foreman told you?	R
S	A. Yes.	S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	Q. Including soldering materials --	C
	A. They didn't mention soldering materials.	
D	Q. Although you knew you had to comply with the Housing	D
E	Department's requirement?	E
F	CHAIRMAN: What sort of requirements? The pipes, the big	F
	things, are not your business.	
G	A. The Housing Department required the steam tape.	G
H	CHAIRMAN: Why didn't they allow other materials?	H
I	A. They didn't allow the "ma gang". In the past, they used	I
J	the "ma gang" and then they added the steam tapes. In	J
	the early stage, it was "ma gang" plus the plaster, for	
	the lead pipes. I mean for the iron pipes, not --	
K	CHAIRMAN: Iron pipes, okay.	K
L	A. Iron pipes.	L
M	MR LI: Now, you call them iron pipes?	M
	A. We call them lead pipes.	
N	Q. Galvanised pipes?	N
	A. No, lead pipes.	
O	Q. But did you refer to galvanised lead pipes?	O
P	A. Right.	P
Q	Q. I put to you that in the Choi Fook site, you know you	Q
	need to use the green-label solder material.	
R	A. I didn't know.	R
S	Q. For some reason, you didn't use that and you used the	S
	solder strips?	
T		T
U		U
V		V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C A. No. C

D Q. You used the solder material, but you didn't inform Ming Hop? You didn't inform Ming Hop what material you D
E used? E

F A. I brought it there. I put it there. I didn't hide it. F
G I didn't do it stealthily. G

H Q. And you also say Housing Department staff were present? H
I Sorry. Now, after you bought the material, you didn't I
J give the receipts to Ming Hop? J

K A. They didn't ask for the receipts. K

L Q. Finally, a simple question. Now, you prepared this L
M written testament, written statement. Now, in preparing M
N for the statement, was there a certain of period of time N
O Mok Hoi Kwong was with you, or did you talk to Mok O
P Hoi Kwong? P

M A. No. M

N CHAIRMAN: This is obtained by the Commission's lawyers. N

O MR LI: Thank you. I have no questions. O

P CHAIRMAN: Do you have any allegation? P

Q MR LI: No, no, not at all. Q

Q Cross-examination by MR LAM Q

R MR LAM: I have two questions. Let's go to the photos. R
S Please look at photo number 23. S

S Now, according to your statement, concerning photos S
T 21 and 23, even though it is a worker who you didn't T
U U
V V

recognise, he used the tin strip or solder strip, or solder wire. Let us not consider what it is. They cut it and then they used it; right? They cut it first?

A. In this photo, I am not sure whether they cut the strip or not. When they use it, it's about 2 feet long and then when you used it, it is consumed. Then it becomes shorter.

Q. When it was used, it was 2 feet long. Assuming that was the one you used, you hold it in your hand; right?

A. Yes, hold it in the hand.

Q. Did you see anyone holding a whole reel of wire, doing the same?

A. No, I have never seen it before.

Q. Now, if you are holding a whole reel, it is not convenient for the worker to operate; it's so heavy. Is it so?

A. Well, I have not used it before. I don't know.

MR LAM: I have no further questions.

CHAIRMAN: Does anyone have any questions?

Cross-examination by MR TAM

MR TAM: Mr Siu, concerning paragraph 5 of your statement, I have two questions with regard to the Choi Fook Estate project. Did you have a subcontractor?

A. No.

Q. You also said you had been a sub-sub-subcontractor. Did

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

you find a sub-sub-sub-subcontractor?

A. No.

MR TAM: Paragraph 5.

CHAIRMAN: I see it.

MR TAM: I have no further questions.

CHAIRMAN: You didn't get a sub-sub-subcontractor? Workers

under your name were more than 110.

A. The wastage was high. Some worked a few months or even
some ten days and then left.

CHAIRMAN: All were casual workers, 114 of them; right?

A. Well, the wastage is high. They come today, they leave
tomorrow.

CHAIRMAN: So it's on a daily basis?

A. Yes. One day's work, one day's pay.

CHAIRMAN: One day come, the other, they go. That's how it
goes.

Now, you know the Housing Department has the
requirement of 15 per cent/85 per cent. So how can you
ensure the correct proportion?

A. I try to get those who have the qualified plumber
licence.

CHAIRMAN: You try your best only; right? Well, if you
don't have enough hands, then you will employ whoever
comes along.

A. But if you get someone who doesn't understand what to

do, then I will not employ him.

CHAIRMAN: There may be someone who has an intermediate
plumber licence.

A. Well, all of them are qualified plumbers.

CHAIRMAN: Are you going to find Charles? If you are going
to find Charles, then let's have confrontation.

MS WONG: Last night ... (Chinese spoken).

INTERPRETER: Sorry, the speaker is not coming through.

MS WONG: As for Charles Yee, we tried to find him last
evening. He is not working with Yau Lee, he is working
with another company. He will only come by a quarter to
one at the earliest. He can only arrive at a quarter to
one, since he has another meeting.

CHAIRMAN: How long will that take for his evidence? How
much?

MS WONG: About 15 minutes.

CHAIRMAN: Okay. We will take a break.

Further cross-examination by MR KHAW

MR KHAW: I have a supplementary question.

Mr Siu, just now the chairman and the lawyer of
Yau Lee asked you about the sample flat, whether you
should be personally present, and you answered the
question and you said that sometimes your employees
would take care of that.

A. Mainly the employees.

Q. Now, you said that you had to go to the ceiling or the rooftop to make holes. The chairman said that it should not be more important than looking after the sample flat. What do you mean by making holes on the rooftop?

A. Before they put in the concrete, we have to keep the holes, we have to open the holes. Otherwise, it will be a serious problem. Now, if we make mistakes with the sample flat, we can change it.

Q. What do you mean by the roof?

CHAIRMAN: The roof -- the ceiling or the roof?

A. Say if they put concrete on the 5th floor, then it will be the ceiling of the 5th floor. We just follow the floor.

CHAIRMAN: I don't understand. The roof?

A. No, the ceiling.

CHAIRMAN: If you put up two storeys, then everything is fixed and you don't need to go to the rooftop to watch?

A. Well, I have to follow that up. The floors may vary. Say on a special floor, there may be pressurising valves. We don't have that on every floor.

CHAIRMAN: Okay. Please go on.

MR KHAW: I have no further questions.

A. I think for pouring concrete, I have to keep the holes or make the holes, before they can pour concrete.

CHAIRMAN: Yes, I understand, otherwise they will fill up

the hole. But it's not every time when the sample flat is put up, then there is pouring of concrete?

A. When they don't need me, then I will go to the sample flat.

CHAIRMAN: Okay. We will have a break. Quarter to one?

Ask him to come earlier. If he can, inform us.

MS WONG: Yes, we will inform you.

CHAIRMAN: Mr Siu, please do not leave. Please stay. We will have a break.

(The witness withdrew)

(11.31 am)

(A short adjournment)

(12.44 pm)

MS WONG: Thank you, Chairman. My next witness is Mr Yee Yat Ming, Charles.

CHAIRMAN: Can I have the ID card to have a look, please.

Mr Yee, please make an affirmation or oath.

MR CHARLES YEE YAT MING (affirmed)

CHAIRMAN: Please take a seat.

Examination-in-chief by MS WONG

MS WONG: Mr Yee, what is your occupation?

A. Planning engineer.

Q. With whom are you working?

A. The Nam Fung Group.

Q. Did you work with Yau Lee?

A. Yes, I did.

Q. When?

A. 2007. December 2007. Until 2003.

CHAIRMAN: 2013?

A. Apologies, May 2013.

MS WONG: When you were working with Yau Lee, was your place
AQCC, architectural quality control co-ordinator?

A. Yes, correct.

MS WONG: Chairman and members, you may refer to I1/255,
Mr Wong's statement: "Yee Yat Ming", AQCC.

After joining Yau Lee, was it the only work site,
Choi Fook Estate?

A. Correct.

Q. According to your understanding, Yau Lee contracted out
the project to Ming Hop?

A. Correct, to Ming Hop.

Q. Then Ming Hop subcontracted to Hang Lee and the sole
proprietor is Siu Kin Wong. Were you aware of that?

A. Yes, I am.

Q. Can you identify him?

A. Yes, this gentleman (indicating).

Q. Okay. I show you some photos, starting from P1/240.

Can you see this? Please start from page 240, all
the way to 252. Please read them from 240 to 252.

A. Yes, I am reading it.

Yes, I've finished.

Q. Okay, you have finished reading it.

Now, if you look at the date, they were taken on
27 March 2009. Can you recognise whether these photos
were taken from Choi Fook Estate?

CHAIRMAN: I think you only worked on Choi Fook Estate?

A. That's the only housing estate.

CHAIRMAN: Were they Choi Fook Estate?

A. Yes, demonstration photos.

MS WONG: Now, you just said that it was for demonstration.

What do you mean by "demonstration"?

A. Yau Lee did it this way. Now, in doing the works of
a project, we had a demonstration at the start, together
with the Housing Department. We showed them -- we
follow the models, the specifications, the samples.
After the demonstration was approved, then we started
the work.

CHAIRMAN: You can go slowly. You are referring to
demonstration. Do you refer to the timber mock-up flat
or sample flat?

A. Sample flat.

CHAIRMAN: Okay. Please go on.

MS WONG: Now, can you remember the demonstration? Was

Mr Siu present?

A. Yes, he was.

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* **A**

B Commission of Inquiry into Day 21
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water **B**

C Q. Now let us look at the photos. In the photos, who is **C**
Mr Siu?

D A. Yes, I can see him. Page 246, photo number 28. **D**

E Q. The one holding the green-label wire and the FRY **E**
Powerflux tub. Why can you recognise him?

F A. Well, I saw him quite often and I recognise the outfit, **F**
and also the figure. I see the photo, I recognise him.

G Q. How did he call you? **G**

H A. "Charles". **H**

I Q. How did you address Mr Siu? **I**

J A. I addressed him as "Ah Siu". **J**

K Q. He said he didn't know you. In fact, you know him? **K**

L A. Yes, I do. **L**

M Q. Now look at the materials, photo number 28, on the **M**
right-hand side, the green-label reel; photo 31,
"lead-free". Now, we have enlarged photos for you.

N It's the same group of photos but they have been **N**
enlarged a little bit.

O Now we have enlarged photos for you. (Handed). **O**

P Photo number 8, photo number 9, and also number 15; **P**
8, 9 and 15. Can you see the toolbox?

Q A. In the toolbox, yes, green-label wires. **Q**

R Q. Concerning the solder material, were they used in the **R**
solder demonstration?

S A. Yes, indeed, using the same material. **S**

T

U

V

Q. Now, there was a demonstration. Did you bring samples to the department for material submission?

A. Yes, we did. We submitted the sample; it was exactly this one.

Q. When you did the material submission, who gave you the samples?

A. I can recall it was Mr Siu who gave me the samples.

Q. Mr Siu?

A. Yes, Mr Siu.

Q. Did you talk to him, what type of samples you wanted?

A. He gave me the sample. I will make the submission. It was approved.

CHAIRMAN: It was approved. After it was approved, did you tell Mr Siu?

A. Our procedure is that the paper will cover the subcontractor. That was Ming Hop.

CHAIRMAN: I know.

A. But whether I told Mr Siu it was approved, I cannot recall.

COMMISSIONER LAI: Concerning the sample, did Mr Siu give the sample to you or you asked for this sample?

A. We liaised with the subcontractor and asked for the sample. I didn't ask Mr Siu. I liaised with Ming Hop, and Ming Hop -- I asked Ming Hop to provide the sample for approval of the Housing Authority, and Mr Siu

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C brought the sample to me. C

D COMMISSIONER LAI: He gave this to you, the green-label one? D

E A. Correct. E

F MS WONG: Why can you remember so clearly it was the F

G green-label sample? G

H A. Well, I have a deep impression because at that time H

I I did the housing project. Before I contacted solder I

J materials, my understanding was the solder strips should J

K be strips rather than reels of wire. So I found that it K

L was a reel of wire. There were no samples with such L

M a sharp-green label. M

N MS WONG: Chairman, I have completed my main examination. N

O Cross-examination by MR KHAW O

P MR KHAW: Just now, you said that in Yau Lee, you only did P

Q the Choi Fook project. When you did the Choi Fook Q

R project, did you know that the Housing Department had R

S any requirement on solder materials? S

T A. Now, there were specifications, therefore I knew. T

U Q. Who told you? U

V CHAIRMAN: You read it? V

A. I read it. I also did the submission. The clerk of works asked whether it was lead-free. So I know that clearly. R

MR KHAW: I want to clarify this. The clerk of works talked to you "lead-free"? S

T

U

V

A. He checked we submitted the samples. The sirs asked us whether we understood the samples or not, and we saw the requirement.

Q. But the procedure was that you had to make arrangements for the sample submission, you had to prepare the materials and also the documents; it was your responsibility?

A. Yes, indeed.

Q. Now, when you prepared the documents, did you read the specifications of the Housing Department?

A. Yes, I did.

Q. Then, when you submitted the samples, you talked to the Housing Department staff; right?

A. Yes, on everything, on every one.

Q. Now, if you look at B15.3/38910. Here, from the paper, I can see this. It's about Choi Fook, the submission of samples.

If you turn to page 38911, in the middle, "For and on behalf of the Contractor", a signature. Now, Mr Zhu signed that; right? Is he your colleague?

A. Yes, he is.

Q. In submitting the documents, did you submit the documents for Mr Zhu?

A. I did the submission.

Q. He endorsed?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 21	
C	A. Right.	C
	Q. Both of you looked at the samples; right?	
D	A. Yes, correct.	D
E	Q. Now, you just said there was a need for the	E
	subcontractor to provide the sample of the solder	
F	material and you liaised with Ming Hop?	F
G	A. Right.	G
	Q. Who of Ming Hop did you liaise with?	
H	A. He was called Ah Wong.	H
I	Q. I want to ask you -- you talked to Ming Hop -- now, you	I
	had to make arrangements for sample submission?	
J	A. Yes, that was one of the steps.	J
K	Q. You didn't directly talk to Mr Siu?	K
L	A. No, I didn't.	L
	Q. Did you know why Mr Siu Kin Wong brought the sample to	
M	you directly instead of bringing that to Ming Hop?	M
N	A. I didn't know.	N
	Q. Now, let's go to the sample flat of Choi Fook Estate.	
O	Just now, we referred to that, for each floor, how many	O
	sample flats for each floor.	
P	CHAIRMAN: What do you mean? I want to know how many sample	P
	flats there are in Choi Fook Estate.	
Q	A. I cannot remember, but there will be representative	Q
	units.	
R	CHAIRMAN: So there will be more than one?	R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 21 B

C A. Yes, more than one. C

D MR KHAW: More than one; does it mean different layouts? D

E A. Different layouts. Different layouts or -- yes, layout, E
mainly the layout.

F Q. Just now, you looked at the photos. They were taken F
from the sample flat. Who took the photos?

G CHAIRMAN: Well, I think that's meaningless. G

H MR KHAW: Okay. No further questions. H

I COMMISSIONER LAI: I have a question. Just now, you said I
that the clerk of works liaised with you. Were you and
J the clerk of works present at the same time? When the J
photos were taken, was the clerk of works present?

K A. I cannot recall who, but they also have ACOW and not K
L just COW. L

M COMMISSIONER LAI: Now, when the clerk of works asked you to M
submit the materials --

N A. No, no. N

O COMMISSIONER LAI: He talked to you, asked you to use O
lead-free solder material?

P A. Concerning the demonstration, we had to ask the clerk of P
works to come and check.

Q COMMISSIONER LAI: Did the clerk of works talk to you Q
R directly? R

S CHAIRMAN: You mean, the submission of samples? S

T COMMISSIONER LAI: Yes, submission of samples. T

U

V

A. Yes, we did talk. We did talk. We showed the documents, we showed the samples. He reviewed all the documents, to see whether they follow the spec. We have the set of samples, and then the documents and cross-check with the spec.

COMMISSIONER LAI: Were you reminded that you had to use the lead-free solder material by the Housing Department staff?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Mr Siu, have you got any questions for Mr Yee?
Please stand up.

Cross-examination by MR SIU

MR SIU: You didn't see the photos being taken. How did you know it was me in the photo?

A. I looked at the photo. I'm sure that it was him. He used to wear this outfit very often.

MS WONG: Chairman, we have some photos in which Mr Siu wore this particular outfit.

CHAIRMAN: Mr Siu, please carry on.

MR SIU: You talked about the reels of solder wire. Did I hand it over to you? Did you sign any document?

A. No.

Q. You are sure I handed over the solder wire to you?

A. I remember having talked to you at that time. You handed me the reel, the whole reel. I never submitted

this specimen, and I asked you to cut off some strips.

You said you had to submit the entire reel.

Q. I didn't get in touch with you too often on the site.

A. But you gave me a lot of the samples from Ming Hop.

Q. I never did.

CHAIRMAN: Would you agree with what he said?

A. No, I don't.

CHAIRMAN: Okay.

MS WONG: Chairman, we just found this photo. Can we

supplement the photo later on?

CHAIRMAN: Yes. Perhaps let me have a look first.

(Handed).

I will show it to Mr Lai.

I have a photo here, Mr Yee. Perhaps you might wish
to have a look. (Handed).

It seems that Mr Siu's face is in the picture and
the outfit.

A. Yes, that's him.

CHAIRMAN: Show it to Mr Siu, please. (Handed).

All right. So for this photo, Mr Siu, would you
agree that the gentleman in the picture is you?

You don't agree that it was you? Do you agree that
the gentleman in the picture is actually you?

MR SIU: I suppose so.

CHAIRMAN: Right, you suppose so. It seems that the outfit

C that you were dressed in is similar to the one shown in
the picture here. Do you agree? C

D MR SIU: (No audible response). D

E CHAIRMAN: Any further question on this one? E

F Mr Siu, any further question? No. All right. F

G Thank you. No more questions? Please supplement the
photo later on. G

H Mr Yee, thank you very much for coming. Thank you
very much indeed for testifying. You are free to leave
I now. I

J (The witness withdrew) J

K CHAIRMAN: Any more witnesses that you would like to
produce? K

L MS WONG: No. Thank you, Chairman. L

M MR KHAW: Chairman, this is how we propose. On Monday next
week, we will start with China State. I did talk with
N the legal team of other stakeholders. Let's see whether
O this is going to be a good arrangement. Next week, we
P will deal with the witnesses from China State. The
Q subcontractors and the licensed plumbers are not merely
R working for the China State projects and they may cut
S across a number of main contractors. So what we are
T proposing is that for the remaining three main
U contractors, we deal with them first and then we will
V deal with the subcontractors, and then the licensed

plumbers.

As to the order, we will have China State first and then Shui On and then Yau Lee and Paul Y. This is the sequence that I would like to propose now.

We understand that on the 14th, we have arranged for Mr Bellinger to testify, but Mr Bellinger only arrives on the 13th evening, so on the 14th, the legal team would like to have a meeting with Mr Bellinger first, so Mr Bellinger would like to start on the 15th, for Mr Bellinger to testify. This is the proposed way forward.

CHAIRMAN: All right. We will bring this session to a close. Let's meet again at 10 am on Monday. If you have any comments on this timetable, please make representation. Thank you all very much.

Mr Siu, basically, the evidence that we would like to take from you is completed, so on Monday, if you are interested, you may wish to come along, but if you don't really want to be present, by all means. Thank you.

(1.08 pm)

(The hearing adjourned until Monday,
7 December 2015 at 10.00 am)

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>		A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water		B
		Day 21	
C		INDEX	C
		PAGE	
D	MR SIU KIN WONG (on former affirmation)	1	D
E	Further cross-examination by MR KHAW	1	E
F	Cross-examination by MR LI (continued)	3	F
G	Cross-examination by MR LAM	43	G
H	Cross-examination by MR TAM	44	H
I	Further cross-examination by MR KHAW	46	I
J	(The witness withdrew)	48	J
K	MR CHARLES YEE YAT MING (affirmed)	48	K
L	Examination-in-chief by MS WONG	48	L
M	Cross-examination by MR KHAW	53	M
N	Cross-examination by MR SIU	57	N
O	(The witness withdrew)	59	O
P			P
Q			Q
R			R
S			S
T			T
U			U
V			V