A

2015年12月11日

A

U

V

В		В
С	2015年12月11日	С
	<u>上午 10 時 11 分恢復聆訊</u>	
D	出席人士:許偉強大律師及鄭欣琪大律師,為外聘律師,代表食水含鉛超	D
E	標調查委員會	Ε
F	Mr Ian Pennicott 資深大律師及林定韻大律師,由孖士打 律師行延聘,代表中國建築工程(香港)有限公司	F
G	何沛謙資深大律師及殷志明大律師,由羅夏信律師事務所延 聘,代表香港房屋委員會	G
Н	王鳴峰資深大律師、陳樂信大律師及羅頌明大律師,由律政司	Н
I	延聘,代表水務署署長	Ι
J	鍾耀明大律師及許佐賓大律師,由的近律師行延聘,代表保華 建築營造有限公司	J
K	林國輝大律師,由孖士打律師行延聘,代表瑞安承建有限公司	K
L	黃佩琪大律師及李頌然大律師,由顧增海律師行延聘,代表有 利建築有限公司、明合有限公司及伍克明	L
Μ	譚俊傑大律師,由何謝韋、李偉業律師事務所延聘,代表啟晴	Μ
Ν	邨及葵聯二邨公屋居民代表 Lee Pui Yi、Chong So Nga 及 Lui Hui Ping	Ν
0		0
Р	MR PENNICOTT: Good morning, Mr Chairman. You will recall at the end of the session yesterday afternoon you posed	Р
Q	a number of questions to Mr Lam, the witness, asking for further information on a number of issues regarding	Q
R	the VPBs and VPKs. Overnight, it appears that Mr Lam has been very busy and industrious, and he's provided	R
S	those instructing me with a number of documents. I don't know whether you have been given copies of them	S
Т	yet or not?	Т

- 1 -

主席:Not yet.

U

V

Transcript by DTI Corporation Asia, Limited

2015年12月11日

食水含鉛超標調查委員會

А

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Η

Ι

J

Κ

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

A

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Н

Ι

J

Κ

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

MR PENNICOTT: Mr Chairman, the documents -- I have given them to Mr Khaw earlier this morning -- I think they are being distributed to everybody else now -- can I just tell you what they are? I'm not proposing to ask any questions, but just to tell you what they are.

The single sheet of paper, at my suggestion, what Mr Lam has done is he's added to his tab 6 table the five remarks that appear at the bottom of the page, and has sought to address certain of your questions by those remarks.

My understanding is the second clip of documents, starting with a memo dated 11 April 2011 -- I just need to explain these. My understanding is, but obviously the witness will confirm, that he refers to those memos in support of the dates he gives in the remarks. But there is a slight glitch, if I may just explain this.

If you look at the first memo of 11 April 2011, what Mr Lam sent to those instructing me was the memo, plus -- and you see the first item ticked, the delivery notes, and those delivery notes are attached, and that was what was sent through to those instructing me.

Those instructing me noticed that there were other ticks, therefore other documents, attached to this memo. So we have asked for those additional documents. They have been retrieved and they are currently being copied. So you don't have all the attachments to the memo; you only have the delivery notes.

If you go on in the bundle, this clip of paper, a few pages, you will find another memo of 28 July 2011. Mr Chairman, the story is the same, that the memo has been provided together with the delivery notes, but it appears that in fact there are pages 7 to 59 -- again, those documents have been retrieved, they are being copied, but they are not here at the moment.

Finally on this topic, if you go on again in the

V

- 2 -

v

А

B

Κ

L

Μ

2015年12月11日

A

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Н

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

V

- clip, further back in the bundle, you will see another С memo of 2 June 2012. Again, it is the same story. We have the memo, we have the delivery notes, but pages D 5 to 41, again, have been retrieved and are being copied. Е So we are giving you what Mr Lam gave us. We are, F as it were, retrieving the balance of the attachments. 主席: Thank you. G MR PENNICOTT : Then lastly, Mr Chairman, Mr Lam has provided Η us with four photographs, which again, as I understand it, he relies upon for I think one of the dates that Ι he gives. No doubt he will be able to explain that. I wasn't proposing to look at the photographs. Ι J understand that they are photographs taken in the Yau Lee Wah factory in Shenzhen on 21 October 2010. These
 - photographs were given to the Secretariat on a USB stick. I believe they have been uploaded to the system. I have to say, they are better viewed on the screen than they are in hard copy.
- But obviously if anybody has any questions for MrNLam arising out of that, these are the documents he
has provided us with and I have now, hopefully, brieflyOexplained.

Р	中國建築工程(香港)有限公司("中國建築")(紅磡邨第二期和啟晴邨
Q	<u>的總承建商)的第六證人:林繼煌(中國建築屋宇裝備工程師(啟晴邨))</u> <u>宣誓繼續作供</u> <u>許偉強先生繼續盤問</u>
R	問:係,林生。
S	答:係,早晨。
Т	問:就住你新提交嗰啲資料,就有幾個問題想同你澄清一下嘅啫。
U	答:好,好。

V

- 3 -

A

A

V

В			В
С	問:	你嗰個新嗰個附表,下面有個 remark 嗰度,就如果我咁樣睇係咪啱 呢,就係話如果你 1、2、3 項嗰度, 嗰啲 VPB,如果冇寫到"with	C
D		plumbing"嘅,就係冇 plumbing 嘅,係咪呀?	D
Е	答:	1、2 係, 3 就有嘅。	E
_	問:	3 係有嘅, 係咪?	
F	答:	係喇,因為去到後期嗰啲就有。	F
G	問:	後期嗰啲就有㗎嘞,係。	G
Н	答:	係,可能表示得唔係好太清楚,唔好意思。	Н
Ι	問:	好。即係3嗰個 VPB,都係 with plumbing 嘅?	Ι
J	答:	係。	J
K	問:	4 嗰個就冇問題, 係咪呀?	K
L	答:	係喇。	Ŧ
L M	問:	好。我哋呢度睇到,就係如果我哋睇番嗰啲 memo,就見到大概係 呢度我哋有嘅文件,就係有 4 月嗰張 memo。4 月嗰張 memo,就 2011 年 4 月 11 號第一張,見到嘛?	L M
Ν	答:	二零係,見到。	Ν
0	問:	係嘞。呢個入面就有附上啲 delivery notes 嘅,嗰啲 delivery	0
Р		notes,我哋而家知道嗰啲送貨單係即係就住有利華嗰個工場做好咗 嗰啲組件,就送上嚟即係啟晴嗰個地盤嗰度嘅,係咪呀?	Р
Q	答:	係,正確。	Q
R	問:	呢度講緊 3 月,3 月時候嘅送貨單。跟住第二張 memo,我哋睇到就 係有 7 月 28 號,2011 年。	R
S	答:	係。	S
Т	問:	入面有啲 7 月嘅送貨單嘅。如果我哋就咁講 7 月嘅送貨單先, 呢啲預	Т
U		製組件送到嚟即係啟晴嗰個現場,都已經係即係包埋有銅喉嘅,係咪 呀?	U

V

- 4 -

A

 \mathbf{V}

A

V

В		B
С	答:7 月嗰張,first VPK 就冇嘅,同埋如果 2 座 8 樓,係未有做水喉 嘅。	С
D	問:嗰個就未有嘅,係咪呀?	D
Ε	答:未有嘅,未有。	E
F	問:如果我哋再睇後少少,2012 年 6 月 2 號嗰張,就呢幾張附上嘅送貨 單,係咪有包到銅喉?	F
G	答:佢有包到銅喉嘅。	G
Н	問:有個呵?	н
Ι	答:實物有包到銅喉,不過個送貨單我睇唔到有呢啲字。	I
J	問:就睇唔到嘅。因為嗰陣時就即係已經係有即係有包括即係做緊預 製組件嗰個部分係有銅喉嘅部分㗎嘞。因為你嗰個附表嗰度就講話即 係5月嗰陣時,你啱啱講第3項。	J
К		K
L		L
М	問:就係5月嗰陣時都即係有一批VPB係有plumbing嘅? 答:係。	Μ
Ν		N
0		0
Р		Р
Q		Q
R		R
S	一位 project manager Ben Poon 就寫嘅,如果找哋睇到最後嗰	S
Т	好細細隻字,有啲 initial,應該都有埋你 initial,JL 嘅 initial 嘅,係咪呀?	Т
U	答:係,正確。	U

- 5 -

A

B

С

D

E

F

G

Н

I

J

K

L

М

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

2015年12月11日

A

V

問:呢度我哋睇番呢封信,都係講緊就係話你哋 propose 去 install —	G
啲 additional items for VPB for comment 同埋 approval	С
嘅。即係呢度都係講緊話 2011 年 9 月嘅時候,係咪仲傾緊話有關嗰 個 VPB 就係嗰啲銅喉究竟係房委會係咪即係可以 approve,都仲係 傾緊呢樣嘢嘅,係咪呀?	D
答:係,啱。	Ε
問:即係話用邊一隻料,嗰啲仲傾緊嘅?	F
答:係。	G
問:如果我哋睇另外一張,就係另外一張就係講 VPK 嘅,就係 37779。	н
答:見到。	Ι
問:呢張就係 2011 年 11 月 28 號嘅,都係同樣 Ben Poon 出,你都有 initial 嘅。	J
答:係。	K
問: 呢個就係講緊個 VPK, 即係嗰個廚房嗰啲裝置, 就係當時都有呈交緊 畀房委會, 就係對某啲嘅物料要佢哋審批嘅咁樣, 係咪呀?	L
答:係。	Μ
問:我就想問一問你啲日子嘅啫,就係呢度我哋見到 2011 年 11 月 28 號,	Ν
就仲係就住例如 VPK 用啲咩嘢物料,仲同房委會嗰陣時做緊啲審批 嘅?	0
答:係。	Р
問:我想問下,點解即係我哋啱啱睇到嗰啲單據,就係再早期,例如 3 月、7月嗰陣時,就已經有預製組件已經送咗嚟呢?	Q
答:因為呢個係我哋 propose additional 加落嗰個 VPK 嗰度嘅,之前	R
IIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIII	S
	Т
問:明白。	U

v

U

- 6 -

A

v

В			B
C	答:	咁所以就出現咗嗰個 table,就係話低層嗰啲冇做水喉,高層有做水 喉。	С
D	問:	即係如果我哋睇到,例如如果係 10 月、11 月之前, 佢哋送嚟啲預製	D
Ε		組件,就係跟原合約嘅即係嗰個模式去做嘅?	Ε
F	答:	係喇。	F
C	問:	就未有話即係喺封信度講嗰啲附加嗰啲物料嘅, 係咪呀?	G
G	答:	係喇,係喇。	G
Н	問:	好,唔該。我就想問一問,就係嗰個如果你睇 S1,S1。呢個就係 雋景建材就131。S1 131。	Н
Ι	答:	係。	Ι
J	問:	呢個係雋景建材就佢畀我哋嘅有關嘅一啲單據嘅,我知道因為你哋公	J
K	1 -	司可能就有。除咗我哋尋日傾過嗰啲 delivery note,即係喺個 memo 嗰度嗰啲,你哋公司就有特別去 keep 即係大部分即係有關啲	K
L		水喉工程嘅 delivery notes 嘅,係咪?	L
М	答:	冇。	М
Ν	問:	我哋睇一睇呢張,我想理解一下你知唔知道有咁嘅情況嘅,如果我哋 睇 131,就係雋景建材個發票,就畀何標記嘅。	N
0	答:	係。	0
Р	問:	呢一度我哋見到嗰個發票嗰個日子,就係 2011 年 10 月 8 號嘅,如 果我哋 10 月 8 號,睇番你剛才嗰張附表,就 10 月 8 號就應該條講	Р
Q		緊你個附表第 2 項,即係嗰個 VPK deliver 咗之後嘅事嚟嘅,應該?	Q
R	答:	10月8號,第4項,係咪呀?	R
	問:	係嘞,係嘞。	
S	答:	誒	S
Т	問:	2011年10月8號,即係你嘅第2項。你個附表 remark 第2項,	Т
U		即係 first VPK deliver 咗去個 site 之後嘅事嚟㗎嘞。	U

 \mathbf{V}

- 7 -

Α

2015年12月11日

A

V

B B 答:啱,啱。 С С 問:如果我哋睇呢個 S1 131,我哋就見到就根據雋景建材嘅資料,就有 D D 一批叫做「英國 50 力扁錫條」,就 110 磅嘅, 睇到嘛? Ε 答:係。 Е 問:佢下面有一個送貨地址係咁樣寫嘅,佢就送貨地址,佢都係寫「啟德 F F 1A 區 1 期及 2 期 一 水喉」, 呢個都係--我哋理解都係啟晴邨嗰個 地盘, 係咪呀? G G 答:係。 Н Η 問:但係佢零零舍舍,佢呢度就寫「中國建築(深圳有利華廠用)」嘅。 Ι Ι 答:係。 J J 問:如果我哋再睇番你嗰個更新嗰個附件嗰個表,第4項嗰度,你都係話 個 first VPB with plumbing 就 delivered to site 就喺 10 Κ K 月嘅,即係同呢張單係差唔多時間嘅,2011年。 L L 答:係。 Μ 問:我想首先問下你,如果嗰個發票--如果我哋講緊呢個發票,雋景建材, Μ 先唔好理錫條定係咩嘢先。如果呢個發票係講緊有關即係水喉工程嘅 物料,而佢係寫咗送貨地址係啟晴,但係特別註明「中國建築(深圳 Ν Ν 有利華廠用)」咁,你覺得係即係點解會有咁嘅情況? 0 0 答:因為我就唔係第一身嘅,我用我係 main con.嘅角度嚟理解喇。 Р Р 問:明白,我明白,係。 Q Q 答: 嗰個送去有利華廠--即係何標記要喺有利華廠用嘅嘢, 會先送咗落地 盤,然之後由地盤運番上廠。 R R 問:哦。即係話如果何標記要喺深圳嗰邊用嘅物料,就先要送咗嚟地盤, 然後再運去呢個深圳嗰度嗰個工場嗰度做嘅? S S 答:係。 Т Т 問:即係呢個係你當時嘅做法,係咪呀? U U

v

Transcript by DTI Corporation Asia, Limited

- 8 -

2015年12月11日

Α

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Η

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

B

С

D

Ε

F

G

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

0

R

S

Т

U

Α

答: 係嘞。

問:點解會有咁嘅做法呢,點解唔直接就運去深圳嗰度呢?

答: 呢個據我理解, 就係牽涉到個關稅個問題, 但係詳情我就唔係好清楚。

- 問:我想你睇一睇有一份文件,係 B5.7。B5.7 11948,睇下會唔會即 係幫助到我哋理解當時嘅情況啫。B5.7 11948, 呢封信就係你哋公 司喺 2011 年 8 月 8 號就畀何標記嘅,或者我都即係簡單咁讀一讀出 嚟封信,你可以睇一睇。
- 「本公司就係喺中標之後就知道貴公司,即係何標記,預算盡量 Η 將所有預制廚廁內的來去水喉同埋潔具安裝於有利華廠完成;本司其 後立即向房署申請是項安排,跟住就有通知到貴司,除咗合約要求嗰 啲安裝潔具外,就可以在預制廚廁內安裝銅喉同埋排水喉,咁樣嘅。

即係呢個就係個背景。然後你哋都係同--你講話你哋要求過何標 記就住銅喉嗰啲資料就供房署審批,直至到「2011年1月,本司知 會貴司就係必須在房署最後一次審視廠房前,就完成所有預制廁所內 安裝供房署審批,可惜」--因為佢嗰陣時遲咗,最終就即係「仍未有 銅喉資料而擱置,及後本司多次催促貴司呈交銅喉資料,直至到 2011 年7月21號,貴司先至能夠確認個銅喉嘅牌子」等等,你哋去到差 唔多7月先可以同房署嗰度呈交嗰啲物料嗰啲資料嘅。

答:係。

- 問:跟住又講排水喉、喉碼等等。如果我哋睇下到跟住過兩段之後,見唔 見到「本司」呀?
- 答:係。
- 問:「本司於 2011 年 3 月,有利華開始大手生產預制廁所時已通知貴司, 需派人到有利華廠安裝潔具」,跟住就「但直至 2011 年 6 月 30 日, 本司才得到有利華確認貴司正式進廠安裝」。即係呢個亦都係即係有 少少話佢遲咗派人去即係有利華嗰邊去睇, 係咪呀?
 - 答:係。
 - 問:再隔多一行,隔多一段,呢度係咁講嘅,「另外根據合約,所有由 貴 司所供應的物料應由 貴司負責運送到有利華廠」,即係呢個就係應 該係咁做嘅。

-9-

U

A

2015年12月11日

A

v

В			В
С	答:	係喇。	C
D	問:	但直接運送去有利華廠嘅。但係為咗減省呢個運輸成本,「有利華將 以代運形式將有關物料送到內地,但 貴司必須將所有嘅報關文件於 五十五中日充,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	D
Ε		五十天內呈交」。我想問一問,即係你剛才講嗰樣嘢,係咪同呢個有 關?	Ε
F	答:	係。	F
G	問:	嗄,好。	G
н	答:	頭先我所講嘅,就係佢要送咗落嚟地盤,然之後就係運上大陸。咁所 講運上大陸呢個動作,就係呢度提到嗰個代運形式,	Н
Ι	問:	代運形式。	Ι
J	答:	由呢個有利華去負責嘅。	J
K	問:	就由有利華負責?	K
L	答:	係嘞。	L
М	問:	呢個主要嘅原因,都係即係去減呢個運輸成本嘅?	М
N	答:	係嘞。因為可能每個嗰個判頭有少少嘢,嗰個判頭有少少嘢,每人 一車就貴咗,我哋會合埋一齊,一次過送。	N
0	問:	明白。如果我哋再睇多有兩張發票嘅啫,就係喺 S1 嘅 135。	0
Р	答:	係,見到。	Р
Q	問:	你見到都係即係類似嘅情況嘅應該,睇下嗰張單先。	0
Q	答:	見到。	Q
R	問:	呢個就你理解,都係即係差唔多同一個模式嘅情況,都係即係如果	R
S		係送水喉嗰啲物料嚟,又係送到即係啟晴個現場,然之後先至再即 係因為用代運嘅形式,然之後先至再送去有利華個廠度嘅,係咪呀?	S
Т	答:	係。	Т
U	問:	好。仲有一張嘅,137,你都可以睇一睇。139。	U

V

Transcript by DTI Corporation Asia, Limited

- 10 -

В		B
С	答:139,見到。	С
D	問:係嘞。我想你確認一下,係咪都係即係同樣嘅情況嘅啫。	D
Е	答:我相信都係同樣嘅情況嘅。	E
F	問:係嘞。如果你見到 140,就係個送貨單嚟嘅。	F
•	答:係。	Ľ
G	問:係嘞。你相信都係即係類似嘅情況,係咪呀?	G
Н	答:係。	Н
I	問:好。我跟住我都想同你跟進番尋日就係主席問你有關預製組件之前, 我同你討論過嗰個問題,就係有關嗰兩張即係比較近期搵到嗰兩張	Ι
J	memo °	J
K	答:係。	K
L	問:我知道你就係話可能 9 月份嘅時候,你哋公司開始就住鉛水事件調查 嘅時候,就你有搵過啲有關嘅資料,但係當時就搵唔到呢兩張 memo 嘅,係咪呀?	L
Μ	答:係。	Μ
Ν	問:可能同你即係用個 keyword search 有少少分別,有原因有嗰個	N
0	關係。你最近例如做你嘅證人口供之前,你就再搵,喺你個公司紀錄 度就搵到呢兩張 memo,係咪呀?	0
Р	答:係。	Р
Q	問:如果我哋睇第一張先,1370。	Q
R	答:係。	R
S	問: 係。1370 嗰度, 就係呢個係 6 月 14 號, 2012 年嘅, 我哋尋日都睇 過, 即係你都有 initial 到嘅, 係咪?	S
Τ	答:係。	Т
U	問:我想問下你,你就係當時你一搵到呢一張嘅時候,係咪?	U
V		V

- 11 -

B 答:係。 С 問:後面嗰幾張送貨單,我哋講緊應該有--一路到--1371 開始,就一路 D 去到 1392 嘅。 Е 答:係。 問:你當時搵到嘅時候,就係即係連續咁樣喺你嘅電腦度睇到,應該都係 F 連續咁樣落嘅, 係咪呀? 即係呢啲資料。 G 答:一份 document 嚟,一份。 Н 問:一份 document 嚟嘅? 答: 係, 一份。 Ι 問:就係有晒呢啲咁嘅送貨單咁樣,係咪呀? J 答:係。 K 問:你見到嘅時--你搵到嘅時候,你有冇通知邊一位同事? L 答: 搵到, 通知邊位呀? 唔係好記得邊位。因為... Μ 問: 唔係好記得。 Ν 答:...我有好多同事亦都跟進緊。 0 問:Okav,冇問題。當你搵到呢份嘅時候,有冇即係即刻就有印象呢樣嘢 係咩嘢嚟嘅,即係呢份文件? Р 答:冇印象嘅。 Q 問:都有印象? R 答: 冇印象。 S 問:但係詳細啲,你--跟住你睇落去喇,當然。 答:係。 Т 問:你有睇過,跟住先你做你嘅證人口供㗎嘛? U

2015年12月11日

Α

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Н

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

V

v

А

食水含鉛超標調查委員會

 \mathbf{V}

V

В		B
С	答:係。	С
D	問:當你詳細啲睇落去嘅時候,你當時記唔記憶到「啊,點解我要即係喺 呢個 memo 度即係點解有呢個 memo?」首先?	D
Ε	答:當其時我都唔記得嘅。	E
F	問:當其時唔記得?	F
G	答:直到我問番胡永來(譯音),先至有少少印象係曾經發生過件咁嘅事。	G
Н	問:即係你搵到之後,就應該係先就同 WLW 就傾過?	н
I	答:我都好後期先同佢傾嘅,即係唔係	Ι
1	問:好後期嘅?	1
J	答:係喇。	J
K	問:例如你搵到呢個之後,大概隔咗幾耐同佢傾?	K
L	答:隔咗幾耐,唔係好記得。	L
Μ	問:唔係好記得?	М
Ν	答:唔好意思,唔好意思。	N
0	問:你同佢傾嗰陣時,佢就話番畀你聽「啊,可能係啲咩嘢嚟嘅」咁樣, 係咪呀?	0
Р	答:係嘞。佢就話曾經有一次就係 clerk of works 嗰邊,但係唔記得	Р
Q	係佢哋嗰組人嘅邊一位,就要求佢就呈交番嗰啲送貨單,關於水喉 嘅,佢就做咗呢個動作,就係咁樣。	Q
R	問:明白。當時你為咗做咗你嘅證人口供,有冇話去問下 WLW 就係話「喂, 仲記唔記得當時,喂,我哋點解要遞呢份嘢呀?」有冇特別去問佢?	R
S	答:佢答我就係話房署嘅 clerk of works 嗰 team 人嘅□頭要求,但	S
Т	係實際邊個就唔記得。	Т
U	問:係。知道係房署要求,有冇話特別去問下佢「喂,點解有咁嘅要求呢?」 當時?	U

- 13 -

A

В		B
С	答:冇。	С
D	問:方問佢嘅?	D
Е	答:方問。	Е
F	問:點解唔問下佢呢?即係既然你口供嗰度都要解釋呢兩張 memo 嘅,點 解唔問下佢呢?	F
G	答:哦,唔係,應該係咁講,sorry,我誤解咗,應該係話胡永來當時冇 問房署點解要上呢份嘢。	G
Н	問:哦。即係如果係咁解,係咪即係胡永樂(胡永來?)係同你講,	Н
I	答:係嘞。	I
J	問:佢都冇問房署?即係你有問到胡永樂(胡永來?)話「喂,知唔 知點解要遞上去呀?」咁?	J
K	答:係喇。	K
L	問:佢就同你講話「喂,房署話」佢冇問過房署,係咪呀?	L
Μ	答: 係嘞。因為其實房署作為我哋嘅客戶, 有啲嘢如果我哋做到嘅, 我哋 都會做。	Μ
N 0	問:明白。如果你而家即係時光倒流,即係記憶番即係當時 2012 年 6 月 14 號,你就同 WLW 傾過,呢一個 memo 當時出之前,應該會有幾多	N O
Р	個人睇過呀?	Р
1	答:你講出之前?	r
Q	問: 係喇,我	Q
R	答:Initial 嗰幾位	R
S	問:Initial 嗰啲人一定有睇過,係咪?	S
Т	答:係。	Т
U	問:一定有睇過。至於你自己嚟講,先問咗你先,你當時 initial 呢個 memo 嘅時候,除咗呢個 memo,你都會有擸過下後面嗰啲附件㗎	U
V		V

- 14 -

А

B

Ι

J

Р

S

Α

B 嘛,... С С 答:係。 D D 問: ... 係咪? 同樣地應該就係話, 如果係咁, 有一、二、三、四, 四個 Е 人 initial 咗嘅, 係咪呀? Е 答: 係, 第一個應該就係 Derek Ma。 F F 問:第一個係…… G G 答:Derek Ma,即係簽名嗰個。 Н Η 問: Derek Ma, 係嘞, 係嘞。第二個係 Patrick Leung? Ι 答:係。 J 問:第三個,你;第四個係 WLW。咁就四個人都有睇過,就你記唔記得當 時從來有任何人對於呢啲單上面嗰啲內容發出啲咩嘢疑問? K K 答:冇。 L L 問:肯定有? Μ Μ 答:冇。 Ν Ν 問:因為如果我哋就咁睇,1373 都幾清楚睇到,就係有兩隻錫料,一隻 係你哋所知嘅"FRY",無鉛錫料;一隻就係--第二項嗰個,就係「英 0 0 國 50 力扁錫條」。 答:係。 Р 問:你尋日都有同我講過,就話你都唔知有呢隻扁錫條呢樣嘢添,條咪呀? Q Q 答:係。 R R 問:四個人都對呢啲錫料,即係或者係水喉物料係有認識個喎,四個人睇 S 過一份文件,都有一個人有任何疑問呀? Т 答:因為我哋其實會專注番喺佢有批咗嘅嘢,我哋見到就會認為冇問題。 Т 譬如有啲嘢,我可以舉第二個例,1392。 U U 問:係。 v V

- 15 -

A

В		B
С	答:1392,佢送咗一拃嘢落嚟,我最終會睇咩嘢呢?安裝咗落去係咩嘢。	С
D	問:係。	D
Е	答:我話畀你聽,我都唔知呢個係咩嘢嚟嘅,但係最終嘅 final product,我知道佢安裝咗啲乜嘢嘅,我會。	Е
F	問: 1392 唔同嘅,1392 我就咁睇嗰張單,我都唔知入面嗰啲貨品係咩 嘢嚟㗎嘛, 係咪呀?	F
G	答:係。	G
Н	問:但係	Н
I	答:同樣情況,50 力扁錫條,我唔會懷疑佢攞嚟燒銅喉。	Ι
J	問:如果你唔會懷疑你攞嚟燒銅喉,如果你見到呢個 50 力扁錫條,你會 覺得佢係攞嚟做咩嘢用途嘅呢?	J
К	答:正如嗰 1392,我都唔會估佢做咩嘢用途。	K
L	問:唔係,你剛才話你如果睇到「50力扁錫條」,你唔會懷疑佢係攞嚟做 銅喉。	L
Μ	答:係。	М
Ν	問:但係即係以你嘅理解,因為你對嗰啲物料嘅規格係有認識㗎嘛,係咪?	N
0	答:係。	0
Р	問:你會覺得「喂,咁佢會攞嚟做咩嘢嘅」?	Р
Q	答:我唔清楚。	Q
R	問:當時有冇諗過?	R
S	答:冇。	S
Т	問:好。再睇下另外搵到嗰張,1394。	Т
	答:係。	
U	問:1394 就係較後期少少,就過咗大概個零禮拜喥嘅,就另外一張 memo,	U
V		V

- 16 -

А 食水含鉛超標調查委員會 2015年12月11日 Α B B 呢個就係都係 Derek Ma 簽嘅。 С С 答:係。 D D 問: 都係 Derek Ma, 另外有邊位係 initial 呀? Е Е 答:CL,就係Louis Li。 F F 問:Louis... G G 答:即係後面搬印嗰個 AQCC。 Η 問: 係嘞。 Η 答: KL,就係 Kaiser Lee,... T Ι 問: Kaiser Lee。 J J 答:...我之前都證供嗰度有提嘅。 K K 問: 係嘞,知道,知道。我想問下, 呢一張 memo 出嗰陣時, 你有冇機會 L 睇過? L 答: 呢張我就有睇。 Μ Μ 問: 冇嘅? Ν Ν 答: 呢張我冇睇。 0 0 問:但係同樣地,例如 Derek Ma 咁,佢都兩份都睇過,你嘅記憶,佢亦 都有就住呢啲咁嘅單據,當時提出啲咩嘢疑問? Р Р 答:冇。 Q Q 問:再想同你跟進一下,就係啱啱我哋咪睇話嗰個--有啲送貨單--有啲發 R R 票,同埋有啲送貨單就寫到明就係話即係雋景攞嚟嘅材料,就有寫話 送去呢個啟晴,亦都括住話係即係有利華廠嘅。我想問下你,呢啲物 S S 料送到啟晴現場嗰陣時,就住呢啲物料,你知唔知有冇任何入閘紙? Т 答:唔清楚。 Т 問: 唔清楚。出閘呢? U

V

U

В			B
С	答:	都	С
D	問:	即係上深圳嘅時候,你哋有冇紀錄?	D
E	答:	呢個因為唔係我 follow,唔好意思,我唔係好清楚。	E
Б	問:	你睇一睇你哋你呈交嘅相片嗰度嘅第四張相。	-
F	答:	係。	F
G	問:	首先我想問下,呢張相都係你哋喺即係有利華嗰個工場嘅其中一個部 分影㗎喇。	G
Н	泫:	// 影味啊。 係喺深圳影嘅。	Н
Ι	—	係嘞,深圳影嘅。我想問下,呢個係咪工場嘅其中一個專門擺放啲物	Ι
J	口 ・	你嘞,床听影吼。我怎问下,呢@你听工场嘅具中 個等门擺放啲初 料嘅地方嚟架?	J
K	答:	係。	K
L	問:	知唔知邊個影㗎, 呢張相?	L
M	答:	因為我哋啲相,BS department 嗰啲全部集中晒喺一個地方嘅,所 以就方紀錄邊個影,不過我睇番啲相,我當日係有上到去嘅。	L M
N	問:	你有上到去嘅?	N
0	答:	係喇。	
	問:	知唔知點解要影呢張相?	0
Р	答:	因為嗰個係較早期佢哋啱啱開咗嗰個倉,即係話有利華闢咗個位置畀	Р
Q		佢哋擺物料,我哋同佢同埋即係何標記同埋有利華夾過「哦,呢個 位置 okay 嘞。」佢哋擺咗物料,我哋只不過習慣上影番個 record	Q
R		嘅啫。	R
S	問:	明白。我想問下,就係係咪所有有關例如呢啲咁嘅預製組件嗰啲用嘅 物料,都會擺喺呢度,呢個地方?	S
Т	答:	如果係何標記供應嗰啲,就會擺喺度嘅。如果係中國建築供應,例如	Т
U		潔具嗰啲,就擺喺另外一個地方。	U
V			v

- 18 -

А 食水含鉛超標調查委員會 2015年12月11日 Α B B 問: 唔。 С С D D 主席:有冇咩嘢特別嘅原因,呢度嗰兩卷係特登擺咗出嚟呢? Е Е 答:Sorry, 聽得唔係... F F 主席: 嗰個 computer 嗰度睇得清楚啲。嗰度有兩卷--綠色嗰兩卷, 有冇 咩嘢特別原因,特別要拆咗個箱擺咗出嚟? G G 答:其實影嗰刻,我哋都唔知點解嘅。 Н Η 主席:係。 Ι Ι 答:或者咁講,影嗰一刻,我都冇留意係有呢兩卷嘢喺度,... J J 主席:得。 Κ K 答:...只不過係 random 咁樣,哦,見到佢堆咗堆貨喺度,影一個 record 嘅啫。 L L 主席:好,唔該。 Μ Μ Ν Ν 問: 呢張相, 你就應該係 2011 年 10 月嗰陣時影㗎喇。 0 0 答:係。 問: 係嘞。你話 10 月 21 號吖嘛? Р Р 答: 係嘞, 係嘞。 Q Q 問: 係嘞。我哋啱啱就睇過有啲雋景建材嗰啲發票, 即係講就係有關啲錫 R R 條嘅,就係當時係送去啟晴,你都講話因為你哋同意咗用個代運形 式,所以由啟晴就何標記都會再運番去即係嗰個深圳嗰個工場嗰度, S S 係咪呀? 答:係。 Т Т 問:假設有呢啲咁樣嘅錫條即係運咗去啟晴,跟住又運上去深圳嘅,應該 U U 都會擺放喺即係呢啲咁嘅地方嘅,係咪呀? V

А

B

С

Α

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Η

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

答:係。

問:唔。

D

Е

F

G

Η

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

主席:呢度隔籬嗰三盒,就係 Powerflux 嚟㗎嘛,係咪呀?

許偉強先生:Powerflux,係,唔。我冇其他問題。

- 主席:好。係,Mr Ho。
- - 主席:係。
 - 何先生:我哋曾經睇過晒呢一--我唔知係咪一百張,即係總之呢四盒 memo,就只有--真係只有嗰兩張係有講話有啲錫料嗰啲咁嘅嘢嘅 啫。其他嗰啲,就係嗰啲 6210,有啲其他嘅運送單嗰啲咁樣。即係 不如主席,咁樣,如果你唔介意,我就當呢啲已經係呈交咗畀委員會, 除非你想我哋--即係我唔係好想又印出嚟,因為...
 - 主席:唔好印囉,係呀。
 - 何先生: ...變咗太過嘥。因為全部--其實真係全部都唔關事。
- 主席:咁咪唔使印囉,係呀。
- 何先生:嗄,咁好唔好呀?如果你要 electronic copies,我睇下需唔 需要。

- 20 -

主席:如果有人需要睇嘅,咪...

何先生: 係喇, 喺晒呢度。

U 主席: 喺晒度。

v

В		B
С	何先生:喺晒嗰四個大	С
D	主席:得。	D
Е	何先生:真係只係	E
	主席:咁都唔使攞嚟做證據喇,如果嗰啲都冇關嘅。	
F	何先生:我哋房署嘅同事已經睇過,真係全部都冇關。	F
G	主席:得,好。	G
Н	何先生:好唔好呀?	Н
I	主席:好。	I
J	何先生:咁就嗰兩位喺 memo 上面,我哋睇番嗰個 F2 1394 嗰度,有兩 位房署嘅 clerk of works,嗰位常生同埋一位胡生,我哋都問過	J
К	佢哋,佢哋都唔記得點解會有呢兩張 memo 走咗入去。即係嗰兩張點 解會有涉即係有埋呢個有焊料嘅走入去,佢已經冇咁嘅印象。	K
L	主席:冇記憶。	L
М	何先生:我相信我就唔會當呢個係問題去提問,因為佢都唔會知道。	М
Ν	主席:都冇人答到。	N
0	何先生:嗄。	0
Р	主席:係囉。	Р
	何先生:咁誒	r
Q	主席:咁咪冇問題囉。	Q
R	何先生:即係呢個我可唔可以係當已經係即係我個指示就係咁樣,除非	R
S	委員會想跟進,我就聽從委員會嘅講法。	S
Τ	主席:即係換句話嚟講,總之就係有兩張就係去咗嗰個 memo 嗰度。至於 咩嘢原因,實際上而家都冇人知,因為佢都答唔到。	Т
U	何先生:係嘞,所以我就唔打算提問形式去問佢。	U
V		v

- 21 -

А 食水含鉛超標調查委員會 2015年12月11日 Α B B 主席: 係囉, 咁咪--係囉。 С С 何先生:因為常生同胡生都唔記得。 D D 主席: 係喇, 咁啲證據咪就係冇人知道點解擺咗入去囉, 係囉。 Е Е 何先生:咁即係誒... F F 主席: 係囉。 G G 何先生:係。 Η 主席: 係囉。 Н 何先生:咁就咁處理咗呢一樣,我就唔需要提問。 Ι Ι 主席:好。 J J K K 何先生盤問 L L 問:另外我想問嘅就反為係一個好簡單嘅問題啫。 Μ Μ 答: 係, 請講。 Ν Ν 問: 係,林生,你 BSE,你對於物料就應該係熟悉嘅? 0 答:係。 0 問:我想你睇番兩張--紅磡邨同埋啟晴邨,你哋入嗰個物料審批--呢個 Р Р Fry 99C 嗰個物料審批,你哋係夾埋嗰個 job reference 喺度嘅? Q Q 答:係。 R R 問:我想你睇 15.1, bundle 15.1 嘅 37822。見到嘛? 答:等等,唔好意思。 S S 問:你畫面其實都見到㗎嘞。 Т Т 答:哦,見到。 U U

V

A

A

v

В		B
С	問:就我想你睇下呢度,慢慢咁樣 scroll 落去,如果我哋個畫面。上半 頁,就係大部分都係一啲私人屋苑嚟嘅。	C
D	答:係。	D
E	問:私人發展商嚟嘅,係咪呀?	E
F	答:係。	F
G	問:一路落到去中間喥,就係房署?	G
Н	答:係。	Н
I	問:就一路再落啲,係喇。	Ι
1	答:見到。	1
J	問:去到後七、八行,就係 ASD 嘅項目嚟?	J
K	答:係,見到。	K
L	問:係嘞。所以用呢個呢隻 Fry 99 無鉛,就係愛嚟焊呢啲銅喉㗎喇?	L
Μ	答:我嘅理解,係。	М
Ν	問:即係除咗房署嘅項目之外,建築署嘅項目都有,亦都私人發展商嘅項 目都有用嘅,對嘛?	N
0	答:如果根據呢份 job reference 就係。	0
Р	問:我亦都想睇埋紅磡嗰份,好唔好呀?10.4,26095。係嘞,亦都係一	Р
Q	樣,你上呢一個 job reference 嘅時候,你見到譬如好似年份, 就 2008 年呀,一路即係嗰幾年間。譬如好似澳門嘅項目,就亦都見到 呢度大概一半喥呢版嘅一半喥都係私人項目嚟,係咪?	Q
R	答:見到。	R
S	問:跟住再落少少,就係房署嘅項目?	S
Т	答:見到。	Т
U	問:然後再底下,有四項就係建築署嘅項目?	U

 \mathbf{V}

- 23 -

Α 食水含鉛超標調查委員會 2015年12月11日 B 答:係。 С 問:又係嘞, 呢啲--其實呢一個咁嘅做法, 都係私人項目都相當多係用呢 D 個咁嘅做法,對嘛? Ε 答:根據呢份job reference,就係。 問: 係嘞。唔該晒。 F G 主席:我想知道點解你成日話要根據呢個 job reference,有啲咩嘢特 Η 別嘅原因? 答:其實咁講,我本身對於嗰個錫料,之前就唔係咁熟悉嘅,之前我聽蕭 Ι 牛或者梁牛所講,佢有啲咁嘅實際經驗。我好坦白咁講,我之前冇留 意呢樣嘢嘅,所以我只可以根據呢樣嘢,我畀唔到我本身嘅經驗啫。 J K 何先生:哦,唔該。 L Μ 主席:哦,得。 Ν 0 仲有冇人有問題?Mr Pennicott,有冇覆問? Р MR PENNICOTT: Mr Chairman, I have no re-examination, but just to report to you that the documents attached to Q the three memos that are referred to are now here. I don't know whether Mr Khaw wants to have a quick look R at them, just to see that nothing arises, before the witness is formally released. It's a matter for him. S 許偉強先生:我現時相信嗰啲 copies 係即係正確嘅版本,但係如果我哋 有時間,我自己睇一睇。 Т 主席:不如我 stand down 十五分鐘,畀你望一望,好唔好呀? U

Α

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Н

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

V

Α

2015年12月11日

Α

B B 許偉強先生:好,好,好。 С С 主席:跟住十五分鐘之後,我哋睇下仲有冇問題問。 D D 許偉強先生:好嘅。 Ε Е 主席:我哋暫時休庭十万分鐘。 F F G G 上午 10 時 58 分聆訊押後 Η Η 上午 11 時 24 分恢復聆訊 出席人士如前。 T Ι J J 許偉強先生:主席先生,委員先生,就我喺嗰個小休嗰陣時都睇過有關嘅 K K 文件。今朝早我知道可能呈交嘅時候,如果兩位可以睇一睇,就住第 一 set 嗰個文件, 即係 2011 年 4 月 11 號嗰個 memo, 喺佢嗰個介 L L 紹入面有啲咩嘢 record 嘅時候,就見到有 delivery notes,我 呦今朝睇過嘅 delivery notes。後面都有一個叫 form 01 同埋 Μ form 05 quality control list checked by 個 Μ manufacturer's PQCC 嘅, 呢度我喺剛才休息嗰陣時, 就問咗 Mr Pennicott 就畀埋嗰啲 copies, 我哋頭先 check 過嘅。就住嗰啲 Ν Ν checklist 嘅 copies,我哋睇到有可能有兩個 point,都想問一 問番林牛嘅。 0 0 主席:好。 Р Р Q Q 中國建築工程(香港)有限公司("中國建築")(紅磡邨第二期和啟晴邨 的總承建商)的第六證人:林繼煌(中國建築屋宇裝備工程師(啟晴邨)) R R 宣誓繼續作供 許偉強先生進一步盤問 S S 問:我唔知林生有冇一份? Т Т 答:我有。 U U V V

- 25 -

А 食水含鉛超標調查委員會 2015年12月11日 Α B B 問: 有嘅。林生, 如果我哋睇下第一個 memo... С С D D 主席:我擺咗喺我 chambers,同我去個 chambers 攞番出嚟,唔該。 Е Е F F 答: 係, 即係 5 座 2 樓嗰份? G G Η 主席: 問喇, 問住先。 Н 許偉強先生:好。 T Ι J J 問:我想問下你,就係就住先係講緊 2011 年 4 月 11 號個 memo 先,係 Κ K 咪呀? L 答:係。 L 問:我哋都見到之前較早時我哋見過啲 delivery notes,我就知道嗰 Μ Μ 個 memo 都有附埋嗰啲咁樣嘅有啲 checklist 嘅, 係咪呀? Ν Ν 答:係。 0 0 問:就就住嗰個即係我哋講嘅 manufacturer 嘅 PQCC,即係應該係 project quality control co-ordinator , 佢就做咗啲 Р checklist,如果我哋睇下呢一沓文件裏面嘅其中有一、兩張嘅 Р checklist,我想同你搞清有幾點嘅,如果我哋睇下--冇 page Q number 嘅話, 睇一睇先, 係喇, 可能要搵一搵, 因為而家方 page Q number,就難講啲,如果你搵下有一張係應該喺中間嘅,2011年2 月 12 號嘅,有一張 checklist。 R R 答:「第十五條生產線」 嗰度? S S 問: 係喇, 2011 年 2 月 12 號, 搵到嘛? Т Т 答:我見到有一張... U U V V

А

G

Η

Ι

J

K

L

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

V

A

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Η

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

- B
 C
 問:有一張,應該如果你見到,就係一開始佢嗰個 checklist 下面有手寫嗰啲字,首先睇下上面先,上面手寫嘅字就應該係產品類型寫住「廁所」嘅,檢測日期就係 2011 年 2 月 12 號,「第十五條生產線」,下面如果你見到喺個鐵模--嗰個表入面個「鐵模」底下,就應該有個 v2,細草 a 嘅,見到嘛? 係咪呀?
 E
 F
 - 問:如果我哋就咁睇呢個,就我哋見到呢個表就應該係即係有利華嗰邊做 嘅,係咪呀?
 - 答:係。
 - 問:如果我哋首先睇下個表上面,有利華,寫住「石矢預制件,落石矢前 檢查」,呢個石矢即係我哋所知道嘅石屎,係咪呀?
 - 答:係。
 - 問:「預制組件廠」, 呢啲就係佢嗰個一個 standard form 嘅 checklist 嚟嘅, 係咪呀?
 - 答:係。
 - M 問:如果我哋睇下面有個 chop 嘅,見到嘛?
 - 答:係。
 - 問:有個印咁嘅嘢嘅,睇到就係"The material delivered & constructed/shop drawings", 嗰 個 係 應 該 "submissions/testing", "analysis of testing results conform with specification and drawings.", 跟住 "Checked and certified by"一個有利華嗰個 Concrete Precast 嗰個 Products Company Limited,有位應該係姓劉嘅 先生,應該係 PQCC 嚟嘅,佢係負責去即係簽呢一份文件嘅。
 - 答:係。
 - 問:我想知道,就係首先你尋日喺答主席問題嘅時候,都有提過呢個有利 華呢個廠其實最主要都係提供嗰個工場出嚟嘅,係咪呀?

答:如果水喉,就係。

U

A

В		B
С	問:水喉,主要提供個工場出嚟嘅,因為如果水喉嘅話,就即係嗰個即係 工作、材料都係何標記嗰邊提供㗎喇。	С
D	答:係。	D
Ε	問:我想問下嗰個有關呢度,有一個喉管,睇到嘛?	Е
F	答:係。	F
G	問:最右邊,即條差唔多去到最右邊嗰度。	G
Н	答:係,見到。	н
I	問:有個喉管,都有 check 到嘅,寫住「不穩固」,入面就打咗個記號 咁樣嘅,睇到嘛?	I
J	答:係。	J
K	問:呢個係個以你所知,呢個喉管係講緊啲咩嘢喉管呀?	K
L	答:我理解,呢個就係講緊燈喉,即係	L
	問:燈喉?	
Μ	答:係喇,for 電器用。	Μ
Ν	問:如果係咁講,即係話呢一個文件上面呢個 checklist 人面就應該係	Ν
0	有一啲有關即係水喉工程嘅項目嘅,係咪呀?	0
Р	答:正確。	Р
Q	許偉強先生:好。我冇其他問題,唔該。	Q
R	計単独元生・灯。找り其他问題,唔該。	R
S	主席:想問一問,係咪因為水喉,就唔需要 check㗎?	S
		5
Т	答:其實主席,呢個係有利華廠嘅標準 form 嚟嘅,通常預製件會有燈喉 要做埋落去嘅。	Т
U	主席:係,我明。	U
V	- 28 -	v
	- 20 -	

A

2015年12月11日

A

答:所以係佢哋安裝,佢哋會 check 埋。水喉方面,唔係佢哋安裝,佢 哋唔會 check。 主席:水喉方面就完全就係何標記自己話得就得,唔得就唔得喇?	C D
主席:水喉方面就完全就係何標記自己話得就得,唔得就唔得喇?	n
	U
答:係喇,何標記睇完,就係我哋上去 random check,同埋送到落嚟地 盤,我哋同佢 check。	Е
主席:得,好,唔該。	F
	G
請問仲有冇人有問題?Mr Pennicott?冇問題。	н
	Ι
好,唔該晒你,林先生。	J
答:好。	K
主席:可以離開,唔該晒。	L
答:好,唔該主席。	М
主席:今日就我哋個聆訊就係咁多。	Ν
何先生:主席,聆訊完畢之前,我有個簡單申請,我哋今日有兩份嘅證人 口供,條今日本來條今日到期嘅,就係黃 Bay,黃比先生同埋 ST	0
Chan,我哋其實已經做到差唔多完成,不過我哋想有多少少時間,可	Р
主席:可以,可以,星期一晏晝,得。	Q
何先生:唔該。	R
主席: 方反對?	S
許偉強先生:冇反對,冇反對。	Т
主席:我哋就星期一就係冇聆訊嘅?	U
	 答: 係喇,何標記睇完,就係我哋上去 random check,同理送到落嚟地 盤,我哋同佢 check。 注席:得,好,唔該。 請問仲有冇人有問題?Mr Pennicott?方問題。 好,唔該哂你,林先生。 答:好。 主席:可以離開,唔該唒。 答:好,唔該主席。 主席:今日就我哋個聆訊就係咁多。 何先生:主席,聆訊完畢之前,我有個簡單申請,我哋今日有兩份嘎證人 Ц供,係今日本來係今日到期嘆,就係黃 Bay,黃比先生同埋 ST Chan,我哋其實已經做到差唔多完成,不過我哋想有多少少時間,可 唔可以提到禮拜—嘅下午先提交嗰兩份口供? 主席:可以,可以,星期—晏畫,得。 何先生:唔該。 主席:冇反對? 許偉強先生:冇反對,冇反對。

V

- 29 -

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Η

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

U

С

D

E

F

G

Н

Ι

J

Κ

L

Μ

Ν

0

Α

B

許偉強先生:星期一冇聆訊嘅,因為我哋要同 Prof Bellinger 要進行 會面,本來個時間表就係安排咗跟住嗰個總承建商就會係瑞安嘅,佢 亦都有三位證人,如果順住次序嚟講,就一位係區生,一位係程生, 另外一個尹生(溫生?),應該係順住咁嘅次序,佢哋作供都係將會 係喺呢個 Prof Bellinger 作供完畢之後,就佢哋開始作供。

主席:好。Mr Lam,你估計,當然喇,cross-examination 我哋唔知 幾長,你估計如果譬如而家睇落去,Prof Bellinger 可能係--我 諗兩日,你哋就當然 subject to 究竟有幾多人有問題想問 Prof Bellinger。

林先生:係。

主席:你估你哋嗰方面 in-chief 要幾耐喥呀?

何先生: In-chief?

主席:三個人,係呀。

何先生:三個人 in-chief,我諗其實三個人嘅 chief,應該就咁讀,我 諗係--因為兩份係比較短嘅,係一份長啲啫,我相信...

主席:即係唔係好長嘅之嘛,我記得。

何先生:唔係好長,我哋冇咁長。

- 主席:即係有機會喺我哋 break 之前,都可以做埋瑞安嘅?
- 何先生:Morning break之前,讀...
- P 主席:當然 subject to 嗰啲...
- **Q** 何先生:我唔知道...
- R 主席:...length of cross-examination。
- s 何先生:我知,我 break and 食飯,應該係可以嘅,我相信可以。
- 主席:好。 T

何先生:睇下啲同事合唔合作。

- U
- V

v

Α

B В 主席:好。 С С 許偉強先生:我諗因為我哋預計 Prof Bellinger 應該兩天之內完成, D D 我就諗緊如果我哋真係咁好彩喺星期三半日就完成咗嘅,我相信瑞安 可能都要準備定即係嗰個證人星期三... Е Е 主席:四、五,係呀。 F F 許偉強先生: ...都要係即係出席咗先。 G G 主席:係,即係有機會星期三都要開始㗎喇。 Н Н 許偉強先生:係。 主席:Okay,好,我哋星期二再見,唔該。 Ι Ι J J 2015年12月11日 K K 上午 11 時 34 分聆訊押後 L L М Μ Ν Ν 0 0 Р Р Q Q R R S S Т Т U U V V

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	Friday, 11 December 2015	С
	(10.12 am)	C
D	(Transcript of simultaneous interpretation	D
Е	except where otherwise specified)	Ε
	MR LAM KAI WONG (on former affirmation)	
F	MR PENNICOTT: (In English) Good morning, Mr Chairman.	F
G	You will recall at the end of the session yesterday	G
н	afternoon you posed a number of questions to Mr Lam, the	Н
11	witness, asking for further information on a number of	п
Ι	issues regarding the VPBs and VPKs.	Ι
J	Overnight, it appears that Mr Lam has been very busy	J
	and industrious, and he's provided those instructing me	Ŭ
K	with a number of documents. I don't know whether you	K
L	have been given copies of them yet or not?	L
	CHAIRMAN: (In English) Not yet. (Handed).	
Μ	MR PENNICOTT: (In English) Mr Chairman, the documents	Μ
Ν	I have given them to Mr Khaw earlier this morning	Ν
0	I think they are being distributed to everybody else	0
0	now can I just tell you what they are? I'm not	0
Р	proposing to ask any questions, but just to tell you	Р
Q	what they are.	Q
-	The single sheet of paper, at my suggestion, what	x
R	Mr Lam has done is he's added to his tab 6 table the	R
S	five remarks that appear at the bottom of the page, and	S
T	has sought to address certain of your questions by those	
Т		Τ
U		U

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Η

Ι

J

Κ

L

М

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water

Α

B

С

D

Е

F

G

Н

Ι

J

K

L

Μ

Ν

0

Р

Q

R

S

Т

Day 26

remarks.

My understanding is the second clip of documents, starting with a memo dated 11 April 2011 -- I just need to explain these. My understanding is, but obviously the witness will confirm, that he refers to those memos in support of the dates he gives in the remarks. But there is a slight glitch, if I may just explain this.

If you look at the first memo of 11 April 2011, what Mr Lam sent to those instructing me was the memo, plus -- and you see the first item ticked, the delivery notes, and those delivery notes are attached, and that was what was sent through to those instructing me.

Those instructing me noticed that there were other ticks, therefore other documents, attached to this memo. So we have asked for those additional documents. They have been retrieved and they are currently being copied. So you don't have all the attachments to the memo; you only have the delivery notes.

If you go on in the bundle, this clip of paper, a few pages, you will find another memo of 28 July 2011. Mr Chairman, the story is the same, that the memo has been provided together with the delivery notes, but it appears that in fact there are pages 7 to 59 -- again, those documents have been retrieved, they are being copied, but they are not here at the moment.

- Т
- U

V

U

V

- 2 -

А Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation Α Commission of Inquiry into B Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 26 B Finally on this topic, if you go on again in the С С clip, further back in the bundle, you will see another D D memo of 2 June 2012. Again, it is the same story. We have the memo, we have the delivery notes, but pages 5 Е Е to 41, again, have been retrieved and are being copied. F F So we are giving you what Mr Lam gave us. We are, as it were, retrieving the balance of the attachments. G G CHAIRMAN: (In English) Thank you. Η Н MR PENNICOTT: (In English) Then lastly, Mr Chairman, Mr Lam Ι Ι has provided us with four photographs, which again, as I understand it, he relies upon for I think one of the J J dates that he gives. No doubt he will be able to Κ K explain that. I wasn't proposing to look at the photographs. I understand that they are photographs L L taken in the Yau Lee Wah factory in Shenzhen on Μ Μ 21 October 2010. These photographs were given to the Secretariat on a USB stick. I believe they have been Ν Ν uploaded to the system. I have to say, they are better 0 0 viewed on the screen than they are in hard copy. Р Р But obviously if anybody has any questions for Mr Lam arising out of that, these are the documents he Q Q

R

S

Т

U

V

Transcript by DTI Corporation Asia, Limited

explained.

- 3 -

has provided us with and I have now, hopefully, briefly

Cross-examination by MR KHAW (continued)

MR KHAW: Mr Lam, in relation to the new documents you have

v

R

S

Т

U

Α	Annex	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		A
В		ission of Inquiry into Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	B
С		provided, I would like to seek clarification with you	ı on	С
		a few points.		
D		In the new annex, there is a remark underneath it		D
E		Am I right in understanding this: for items 1, 2, 3,		Е
_		VPB, if it doesn't carry the remark "with plumbing"		
F		it goes without plumbing?		F
G	A.	1 and 2, non-plumbing, yes, but 3, with plumbing. At	C	G
		the later stage, there is plumbing. Perhaps I have n		
Н		marked the documents too clearly.		Н
I	Q.	VPB, item 3, is with plumbing. Item 4 is all right.		I
J		Well, let's refer back to the memos. There is a memo		Ŧ
J		April, 11 April 2011; can you see that?		J
K	A.	Yes.		K
L	Q.	There are delivery notes attached. We know that the	3e	L
-		delivery notes are related to the parts manufactured		L
Μ		Yau Lee Wah and they were delivered to the Kai Ching		M
Ν		site; is that right?		N
	A.	Yes.		
0	Q.	Then we have the March delivery notes. And the second		0
Р		memo, 28 July 2011.		Р
-	Α.	Yes.		
Q	Q.	There are also July delivery notes.		Q
R		Let's look at the July delivery notes first. For		R
S		these prefabricated parts, they were delivered to the	Э	G
3		Kai Ching site, and they came with the copper pipes;		S
Т				Т
U				U
~				U
V				v

Α	Annex	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В		nission of Inquiry into s Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26 B
С		that right?	С
	A.	For the first, the VPK July delivery note, there was	
D		pre-installed plumbing. Then 8th floor, block 2, no	D
E		plumbing yet.	E
_	Q.	Well, let's take a look at the latter memos. The 2	
F		2012 delivery note.	F
G		For the several delivery notes attached, do the	G
Н		parts come with the copper pipes?	Н
	A.	Yes, yes, the physical objects actually come with	п
Ι		pre-installed pipes, but then these were not shown in	n I
J		the delivery notes.	J
	Q.	So, because at the time of the construction, the	
K		prefabricated parts come with pre-installed plumbing	; К
L		right? In your attachment, you said in May you re	efer L
		to item 3 there is a batch of VPB which has	
Μ		pre-installed plumbing. So, for the May 2012 deliver	M M
Ν		notes, they should be for VPB with plumbing as well?	Ν
0	A.	Yes, correct.	0
0	Q.	Can I refer you to B15.1, page 37759. On this page,	0
Р		this is a letter from your company to the HA, dated	Р
Q		21 September 2011. There is a project manager,	Q
		Ben Poon, who wrote this letter.	-
R		Let's look at the initials towards the bottom. "	JL" R
S		is your initial; is that right?	S
T	A.	Yes.	_
Τ			Т
U			U
V			v
			•

Α	Annex.	Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		A
В		ission of Inquiry into Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	В
С	Q.	This letter is about your proposals for installation		С
D		additional items for VPB, for comment. So in Septemb	er	D
_		2011, you were still discussing whether copper pipes		D
Ε		should be installed at VPB, would that be approved by	7	E
F		the HA. Are you still discussing that?		F
	Α.	Yes.		
G	Q.	What kind of material would you be using, you are st	ill	G
н		discussing?		н
	Α.	Yes.		
Ι	Q.	Let's take a look at another page. It's on VPK.		Ι
J		Page 37779.		J
	A.	Yes, I see that.		
K	Q.	That is dated 28 November 2011. It was again written	ı by	K
L		Ben Poon, with your initial. Now, VPK, that was seek	ing	L
		the HA's approval of certain materials; is that right	:?	
Μ	A.	Yes.		Μ
Ν	Q.	Now, I would like to clarify on certain dates. This	is	Ν
0		28 November 2011. You were still discussing on the		0
0		materials to be used for VPK, and approval was still		0
Р		being sought. But then why is it the case that the		Р
Q		delivery notes that we saw earlier, in say March and		Q
C		July, and some prefabricated parts had already been		×
R		delivered to the site? Why was that the case?		R
S	Α.	This was the proposal for additional materials or it	ems	S
		to be put in the VPK, and for the previous parts		
Т				Т
U				U

Transcript by DTI Corporation Asia, Limited

 \mathbf{V}

- 6 -

Α	Annex	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В		ission of Inquiry into Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26 B
С		manufactured, we were abiding by the original contrac	ct
		for manufacturing of the components. That went with	out
D		pre-installed plumbing.	D
E		So, for this other letter, that was actually on	E
_		additional items to be put on the VPB and VPK.	
F	Q.	Now, before October and November, the components	F
G		delivered on site, they were in compliance with the	G
		requirements in the original contract, and those did	
Н		include the additional items mentioned in these two	Н
I		other letters; right?	I
J	A.	Yes.	J
J	Q.	For S1, this has to do with Prosperity Construction.	J
K		S1/131, please. That's from Prosperity. That is the	K
L		receipt, delivery note. I don't believe that you hav	re L
		these delivery notes. You don't keep most of the	
Μ		delivery notes related to plumbing works.	Ν
Ν		So let's take a look at this particular one.	N
-		I would like to understand whether you know about th:	is.
0		On page 131, that's the invoice from Prosperity to	0
Р		Ho Biu Kee. The date is 8 October 2011.	Р
0		Let's turn back to the attachment just now, on	
Q		8 October 2011, in your attachment, item 2, "the firs	Q
R		VPK delivered" that was after that; right?	R
S	A.	Okay, 8 October.	S
	Q.	Item 4; is that right?	-
Т			Т
U			U
V			V

A	Annex	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		A
В		nission of Inquiry into s Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	В
С	Α.	Yes.		С
-	Q.	8 October 2011. So, after remark 2, "the first VPK"	,	
D		after that was delivered to the site. If we look at		D
Ε		S1/131, according to Prosperity's information, there	is	Е
Б		this 50D solder strips, 8 pounds. The delivery addre	ess	-
F		is Kai Tak site 1A, Phases 1 and 2, and it says here		F
G		categorically that China State Construction Shenzhen		G
Н		Yau Lee Wah for use by these companies.		
п		Let's take a look at your updated attachment,		Н
Ι		item 4. First VPB with plumbing was delivered to the	5	Ι
J		site in October, so more or less the same time as th	is	J
U		delivery or this invoice, in October 2011.		J
K		This is an invoice from Prosperity. Let's not ta	lk	K
L		about whether they are solder strips or what. This		L
		invoice is related to plumbing materials and the		
Μ		delivery address is Kai Ching, and it states		Μ
Ν		categorically it's for use by Shenzhen Yau Lee Wah,		Ν
0		China State Construction. Why was that written there	e?	
0	A.	I will try to understand it from the perspective of	the	0
Р		main contractor. Ho Biu Kee has materials to be used	d in	Р
Q		Yau Lee Wah. The materials should be first delivered	d to	0
Q		the site, and then from the site delivered again to		Q
R		Yau Lee Wah.		R
S	Q.	So does it mean for materials to be used by Ho Biu K	iee	S
		in Shenzhen, the materials would first be delivered	to	
Т				Т
U				U
V				V
•		8		v

Α	Annex:	Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	A	A
В		ission of Inquiry into Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	B
С		the site first, and then delivered or transported to	the (С
D		factory in Shenzhen for use? That was the approach undertaken; is that right?	I	D
E	A.	Yes.	I	E
	Q.	Why was that the kind of arrangement? Why didn't the	∋у	
F		take it directly to Shenzhen?	I	F
G	Α.	Well, to my understanding, that has to do with the	(G
Н		customs tax or tariff. I don't have the details with		
п		me.	ł	H
Ι	Q.	Well, let me refer you to another document. B5.7.	I	I
J		Page 11948 of B5.7. Perhaps this might be helpful.	ı	J
		That's a letter from your company to Ho Biu Kee dated		
K		8 August 2011.	I	K
L		Let me read you this letter:	I	L
		"After getting the tender, I understand that		
Μ		Ho Biu Kee will be having the fittings to be installe	≥d	M
Ν		by Yau Lee Wah. We have informed you that other than	· ·	N
0		the fittings in the contract, the copper pipes and		~
0		drainage pipes can be installed in the prefabricated	(0
Р		units. You would make available the information to t	.he I	Р
Q		Housing Department for scrutiny. Before the inspecti		Q
C		all the precast installation will be completed for	,	×
R		scrutiny by the Housing Department. However, that wa	.s I	R
S		suspended because there wasn't sufficient information	ı, S	S
		and it wasn't until 22 July 2011 that the information	1	
Т			ï	Т

U

 \mathbf{V}

U

Α	Annex.	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В		ission of Inquiry into a Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26 B
С		could be submitted to the Housing Department."	C
D		The next two paragraphs:	D
2		"Our company, in March 2011, mass-produced the	L
Ε		precast units at Yau Lee Wah, and we had to have the	E
F		installation at Yau Lee Wah factory, and it wasn't u	ntil F
r		30 June 2011 that Yau Lee Wah gave the confirmation.	" F
G		That's about the delay regarding inspection. The	G
Н		next skip one paragraph:	Н
п		"According to the contract, all the materials	E
Ι		supplied by your company should be delivered to the	I
J		Yau Lee Wah factory. However, in order to save the	J
J		transportation costs, Yau Lee Wah will deliver the	J
K		materials to the mainland, but the customs documenta	tion K
L		should be submitted within 50 days."	L
		What you said, has it got to do with this practic	e?
Μ	Α.	As I said, they will have them delivered to the site	e and N
Ν		then they will be transported to the mainland. For t	this N
0		transportation to the mainland, that is Yau Lee Wah'	
0		responsibility.	C
Р	Q.	The main reason is to save on the transportation cos	sts? P
Q	Α.	Yes, the subcontractors may have bits and pieces and	l we
τ.		just get them all together.	
R	Q.	There are two more invoices that I would like to sho	w R
S		you. S1/135.	S
	Α.	Yes.	
Т			Т
U			U
V			v

Α	Annex	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		A
В		nission of Inquiry into s Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	B
С	Q. A	It is a similar situation. Yes.		С
D	Q.			D
E		delivered to the Kai Ching site for onward submissio	n,	Е
		transportation to the Yau Lee Wah factory.		
F		There is one more, on page 139.		F
G	A.	Yes, I've got 139.		G
Н	Q.	Can you confirm that the situation is the same?		
п	Α.	I think it is the same situation.		н
Ι	Q.	Page 140 is the delivery note. So a similar situati	on	I
J		there?		J
	A.	Yes.		
K	Q.	Let me follow up on the question raised by the chair	man	K
L		about the precast units. I also took the two memos v	ıp	L
		with you, the two memos that you have found recently		
Μ		In September, because of the investigation into the	lead	Μ
Ν		in water incident, you tried to find the memos but y	ou	N
0		couldn't find them. Maybe there was a problem with t		0
0		keyword search.		0
Р		Before preparing your witness statement, you trie	d	Р
Q		to search the records and you couldn't find these tw		Q
		memos.		×
R		Page 1370, let's have a look at this first.		R
S	A.	Yes.		S
	Q.	Page 1370, dated 14 June 2012. We looked at it		
Т				Т
U				U

 \mathbf{V}

Α	Annex	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		A
В		ission of Inquiry into E Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	В
С		yesterday.		С
	A.	Yes.		
D	Q.	When you found this document there are a couple o	f	D
Ε		delivery notes; page 1371 through to page 1392.		Е
	A.	Yes.		
F	Q.	You found them and you saw them in your computer, an	d	F
G		they were in a sequence?		G
	A.	Yes, they were in one single document. Yes, they we	re	
Н		included in one single bundle.		Н
Ι	Q.	When you found them, did you notify anybody?		Ι
J	A.	When I found them, who did I notify? I don't quite		J
9		remember who. There were so many colleagues.		J
К	Q.	Fine. When you found this document, did you know what	at	K
L		this was all about?		L
	A.	No, I didn't have much memory.		
Μ	Q.	Then you read on, you read in detail, in preparation	for	Μ
Ν		your witness statement. When you read it in detail,	did	N
0		you remember why there was such a memo to start with	?	-
0	A.	I didn't remember at the time, until I asked Mr Wu,	and	0
Р		then the memory started coming back and I remember w	nat	Р
Q		happened.		Q
×	Q.	So, when you found the document, you talked with WL.		Y
R		How long did you leave it before you talked to him?		R
S	A.	I don't quite remember.		S
	Q.	When you talked to him, he told you what this is all		
Τ				Т
U				U

- 12 -

V

 \mathbf{V}

Transcript by DTI Corporation Asia, Limited

Α	Annex.	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В		aission of Inquiry into a Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26 B
C	δ	about? Yes, he said that the clerk of works there was	C
D	Α.	a clerk of works but he did not remember who there	e D
Е		was a clerk of works that requested the submission of	E
		the invoices regarding the plumbing materials.	2
F	Q.	When you prepared the witness statement, did you ask	F
G		why such submission was needed?	G
	A.	He said in reply that the Housing Department clerk of	
Н		works made a request, although he didn't remember who	н
Ι	Q.	Yes, I remember it was an HD request, but did you as	ς Ι
J		him why there was such a request?	J
J	A.	No, I didn't.	U
К	Q.	Why not? Why didn't you ask him? You had to explain	in K
L		your witness statement these two memos. Why didn't y	ou L
		ask him?	
Μ	A.	Sorry, let me put it this way. I've got it wrong.	М
Ν		Wing Loi didn't ask HD why this had to be submitted.	Ν
0	Q.	Well, Wing Loi told you that he didn't ask the Housin	-
0		Department. You asked Wing Loi why such a submission	0
Р		was needed, and he said to you that he didn't ask the	e P
Q		Housing Department.	Q
·	A.	Yes. The Housing Department is our client. We would	
R		what they ask us to do, if possible.	R
S	Q.	Let's turn the clock back. Back in 2012, 14 June, yo	ou S
		talked with Wing Loi. Now, before this memo was issu	
Т			Т
U			U

 \mathbf{V}

Α	Annex	: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		A
В		aission of Inquiry into s Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	В
С		how many people could have seen it; do you know?		С
	A.	Before issuance, there was some initialling, and tho	se	
D		who initialled it must have seen it.		D
Ε	Q.	What about you; at that time, when you initialled on		E
		this memo, you must have read the attachment.		
F	A.	Yes.		F
G	Q.	Also, there were four initials there. The first one	is	G
Н		Derek Ma?		TT
11	A.	Derek Ma is the first one, yes.		Н
Ι	Q.	Then Patrick Leung and the third one is you. The for	ırth	Ι
J		one is "WLW". Four of you have read the document. D	0	J
ŭ		you remember anybody raising any questions about the		J
K		documents?		K
L	A.	No.		L
	Q.	You are sure?		
Μ	A.	No.		Μ
Ν	Q.	If you look at these documents, 1373, it is quite cl	ear	Ν
0		from this that there are two types of solder material	ls.	0
0		The first one is the FRY lead-free. The second one i	.S	0
Р		the 50D solder strip, and you told us that you didn'	z –	Р
Q		know much about this. You had four people initiallir	ıg	Q
-		the delivery notes, and four of you have read the		x
R		document, and none of you raised any question at all		R
S	A.	We focused our attention on what has been approved,	and	S
		we thought that there were no problems. Say, for		
Т				Т
U				U

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	instance, 1392.	С
D	Q. Yes.	D
D	A. 1392, they sent a lot of materials here. What we would	D
Ε	look at would be whether they have been installed.	Ε
F	I tell you, I don't know what this is all about, but	F
_	I know about the final product.	Ŧ
G	Q. 1392 is different. 1392, I don't know what these items	G
Н	are all about.	Н
	A. By the same token, 50D solder tin wire, I wouldn't doubt	
Ι	that they would use this for the copper pipes.	Ι
J	Q. Now, what do you think this 50D solder wire would be	J
	for?	
K	A. Like 1392, I wouldn't have any doubts about the usage.	K
L	Q. Now, when you looked at the 50D solder strip, you said	L
	they wouldn't use this for the copper pipes, and you	
Μ	know something about the specifications. What do you	Μ
Ν	think they used these strips for?	Ν
	A. I don't know.	
0	Q. Did you ever think about it?	0
Р	A. No.	Р
0	Q. Let's have a look at the other one, 1394. This is about	0
Q	a week or so later. This is another memo, also signed	Q
R	by Derek Ma. So Derek Ma there, who initialled on the	R
S	document.	S
~	A. CL is Louis Li, AQCC, a witness stamp there. KL is	3
Т		Т
U		U
		C
V	17	V

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	Kaiser Lee. He appeared in this statement.	С
	Q. When this memo was issued, did you have a chance to look	
D	at it?	D
Ε	A. No, I didn't see it.	Ε
	Q. Well, Derek Ma has looked at those memos. From your	
F	recollection, did Derek Ma say anything about these	F
G	delivery notes?	G
	A. No.	
Н	Q. Just now, we looked at some invoices and delivery notes,	Н
Ι	which stated clearly that these are materials from	Ι
J	Prosperity Building delivered to Kai Ching, and that was	T
J	for use by Yau Lee Wah.	J
K	When the materials were delivered to the Kai Ching	К
L	site, do you know that there is any type of gate	L
	receipt, so to speak, for these materials?	2
Μ	A. No, I don't know about that.	Μ
Ν	Q. What about going out of this site? Is there any record	Ν
	of them going out of the site?	
0	A. No, I didn't follow up on those matters, so I don't	0
Р	know.	Р
0	Q. You submitted some photos. Let's take a look at the	0
Q	fourth photo, photo 4.	Q
R	First of all, I would like to ask you, this photo	R
S	was taken at Yau Lee Wah; is that right?	S
5	A. Yes, taken in Shenzhen.	3
Т		Т
U		U
-		U
V	16	V

A	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	A
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	Q. Is this part of the workshop where materials will be stored?	C
D	A. Yes, correct.	D
Е	Q. Do you know who took this photo?	
L	A. BS department's photos were all stored in one place. We	Ε
F	had no record on exactly who took it. But when looking	F
G	at these photos, I think I know that I was there	G
	on site that day, when the photos were taken.	
Н	Q. Do you know why the photo was taken?	Н
Ι	A. Because earlier on, Yau Lee Wah had made available this	I
Ŧ	area for storing the materials, and together with	
J	Ho Biu Kee and Yau Lee Wah, we said this place is right	J
K	for storing materials, so they put the materials in, so	К
L	we took a photo for record purpose.	L
	Q. I understand. For all these prefabricated parts, all	
Μ	the materials used for these parts will be stored here;	Μ
Ν	is that right?	Ν
0	A. For materials supplied by Ho Biu Kee, then that would be	0
0	stored here, but for other parts, like sanitaryware	0
Р	supplied by China State Construction, that would be put	Р
Q	in another place.	Q
-	CHAIRMAN: Sorry, I couldn't get your question. I can't	×
R	hear. There were two rolls in green package.	R
S	A. Well, the carton boxes opened up, and we didn't know	S
Ŧ	why. When the photo was taken, I didn't know that there	_
Τ		Т
U		U
V		V
	17	

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	А
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	were these two rolls of materials. I didn't pay special	С
	attention to these two rolls of material.	
D	MR KHAW: The photo was taken in October 2011; is that	D
Ε	right?	Ε
	A. Yes.	
F	Q. 21 October?	F
G	A. Right.	G
Н	Q. Just now, we took a look at the invoices of Prosperity	
11	relating to solder strips which were delivered to	Н
Ι	Kai Ching first, and then you said that you agreed on	Ι
J	the arrangement that these materials would be	J
U	transported by Ho Biu Kee from the site to the Shenzhen	J
K	factory.	K
L	Now, for these solder strips delivered to Kai Ching	L
	and then afterwards to Shenzhen, would these materials	
Μ	be stored in this place?	Μ
Ν	A. Yes.	Ν
0	CHAIRMAN: Well, the three carton boxes next to them are the	
0	Powerflux.	0
Р	MR KHAW: I don't have any further question.	Р
Q	CHAIRMAN: All right. Mr Ho?	Q
×	Cross-examination by MR HO	Q
R	MR HO: Thank you, Chairman.	R
S	I would like to submit materials, rather than asking	S
	questions, because there is not much point of me asking	
Т		Т
U		U
X 7		
V	10	V

A	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 26	В
С	questions. In paragraph 8 of the witness statement, it	C
	sets out two memos, and paragraph 8(i) says that over	
D	100 such memos were submitted to the HA.	D
Ε	I have retrieved the four boxes of memos already, so	Ε
	for any party who would like to take a look at the 100	
F	memos, they are welcome to do so.	F
G	I would be placing the memos here, four boxes	G
	altogether. We have read through all these memos, in	
Η	these four boxes. There were only just two delivery	Н
I	notes which said that there were solder strips. The	Ι
	other memos have to do with 6210 specifications and so	
J	on.	J
K	So, Chairman, if you don't mind, I would assume that	К
L	these materials have been submitted to the Commission.	L
-	I don't want to photocopy these memos because it would	L
Μ	be rather a waste in copying them.	Μ
Ν	CHAIRMAN: Yes. All right. I agree. If anyone would like	Ν
	to take a look, then they can come and help themselves.	
0	MR HO: These are all in these four big cartons.	0
Р	CHAIRMAN: That would not be adduced as evidence because	Р
0	most of them are not related; right?	
Q	MR HO: Yes.	Q
R	CHAIRMAN: All right.	R
S	MR HO: F2/1394, there were two project clerks of works	S
	mentioned from the HA. We have asked them and they told	5
Т		Т
U		U
V		V

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	us that they couldn't recall why these two memos were	C
D	requested and they do not recall why the item of solder tin strips were included in the delivery notes.	D
E	I will not ask any questions in that regard.	Ε
	CHAIRMAN: Because nobody would be able to answer the	
F	question.	F
G	MR HO: So that's my instruction from my client.	G
н	CHAIRMAN: In other words, there were two delivery notes	
Н	attached to the memo. Exactly why these were included,	Н
Ι	nobody would be able to give an answer.	Ι
J	MR HO: So I will not be asking questions on that side.	J
	CHAIRMAN: So nobody knows why that is included.	
K	MR HO: Let's deal with it that way then.	K
L	I have a simple question instead.	L
	CHAIRMAN: Yes, please.	
Μ	MR HO: Mr Lam, you are a BSE. You should be familiar with	М
Ν	<pre>materials; right?</pre>	Ν
0	A. Yes.	0
0	Q. Can I refer you to Hung Hom Estate and Kai Ching Estate.	0
Р	The job reference for FRY 99C was attached.	Р
Q	A. Yes.	Q
x	Q. Bundle B15.1, page 37822, please. Do you see it?	Y
R	A. Yes.	R
S	Q. You can see it on the screen.	S
T	Let's scroll down slowly. The first half has to do	_
Τ		Τ
U		U
V		v

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous InterpretationCommission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26		Α
В			Day 26 B
С	7	with private development projects; is that right?	C
D		Yes. When we go down further, then that's HA projects. T	hen, D
E		for the last seven to eight items, they are the ASD'	s E
		items or projects; do you see that?	
F	Α.	Yes.	F
G	Q.	For FRY 99C lead-free solder strips, they were used	for G
Н		these projects?	
п	Α.	Yes, that's right.	Н
Ι	Q.	So, apart from HA projects, the material was also us	ed I
J		for private development projects and also ASD's	J
		projects; is that right?	Ŭ
K	Α.	Yes. According to this job reference, that should b	e K
L		the case.	L
	Q.	Okay. Let's take a look at another job reference fo	r
Μ		Hung Hom. B10.4/26095. Yes. A similar case here.	Μ
Ν		When you have this job reference, the year is 2008,	so N
0		in those few years, for example, for some projects i	
0		Macau, around half of the projects on this page were	0
Р		really private projects?	Р
Q	Α.	Yes.	Q
-	Q.	Then further down, HA projects, HD projects, and the	
R		the last four projects were ASD's projects.	R
S	Α.	Yes.	S
	Q.	Again, so the material was also used in quite a numb	
Т			Т
U			U

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α				
В	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26 B				
С	of private projects as well?	C				
	A. Yes, according to this job reference, that's the cas	e.				
D	CHAIRMAN: I would like to know why you keep emphasising	D				
Ε	"according to this job reference". Why?	Ε				
T	A. Let me put it this way. I was not very familiar wit					
F	tin strips in the past, but according to Mr Siu and	F				
G	other colleagues, they did have actual operating	G				
Н	experience. Well, honestly speaking, I was not famil					
11	with solder strips, so based on my own experience	Н				
Ι	I couldn't say too much on the material.	Ι				
J	CHAIRMAN: Yes. Any further questions?	J				
u de la companya de la compa	MR PENNICOTT: (In English) Mr Chairman, I have no					
K	re-examination, but just to report to you that the	К				
L	documents attached to the three memos that are refer	red L				
	to are now here. I don't know whether Mr Khaw wants	to				
Μ	have a quick look at them, just to see that nothing	М				
Ν	arises, before the witness is formally released. It	'sa N				
0	matter for him.					
0	MR KHAW: (Chinese spoken).	0				
Р	INTERPRETER: Sorry, the speaker is not coming through.	Р				
Q	CHAIRMAN: Let's take a break and stand down for 15 minu					
¥.	and you can take a look. After 15 minutes we will see	Q				
R	if we have further questions for him.	R				
S	MR KHAW: Okay.	S				
	CHAIRMAN: 15 minutes' break first.	-				
Τ		Т				
U		U				

 \mathbf{V}

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	(10.59 am)	С
	(A short adjournment)	C
D	(11.25 am)	D
Е	MR KHAW: Chairman and Mr Lai, during the break I have read	Ε
	through the relevant documents. This morning, we	_
F	submitted these documents.	F
G	May I refer you to set 1, 11 April 2011, the memo	G
Н	issued on that day. There were records contained	Н
п	therein, there were delivery notes mentioned, there was	п
I	form 01 and form 05, control checklist by the AQCC.	Ι
J	During the break I have talked to Mr Pennicott on the	J
	checklist copies. There were two points that I would	-
K	like to clarify with Mr Lam.	K
L	Mr Lam, do you have the copy with you?	L
	A. Yes, I do.	
Μ	Q. Mr Lam, if we look at	Μ
Ν	CHAIRMAN: The documents are now in my chambers. Can you	Ν
0	bring them to me now?	0
U	Please continue asking your question.	0
Р	MR KHAW: The memo dated 11 April 2011. We saw some	Р
Q	delivery notes. There were checklists attached to the	Q
-	memo, on the manufacturing PQCC, project quality control	C
R	co-ordinator, and he prepared some checklists.	R
S	Let's take a look at one or two checklists in this	S
_	pile of documents and I would like to clarify certain	
Т		Т
U		U
V		v

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation			Α
В		aission of Inquiry into a Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	В
С		points with you.		С
D		There is no page number in the document. Let's t	ry	_
D		to retrieve it anyway. A checklist dated 12 February	7	D
Ε		2011.		E
F	A.	Production line number 15.		F
r	Q.	Yes. Did you get that, 12 February 2011?		Г
G	Α.	There is one		G
н	Q.	Yes. Under the checklist, there are words handwritt	en.	Н
		There were some handwritten words. The product		
Ι		described here is the toilet or bathroom, and it was		Ι
J		checked on 12 February 2011, production line number	15.	J
-		There is also iron moulds, V2a. Did you get that?		0
K	A.	Yes.		К
L	Q.	So this is a checklist compiled by Yau Lee Wah.		L
	A.	Yes.		
Μ	Q.	Yau Lee Wah prefabricated units, inspection before		Μ
Ν		concreting works were done. So it's written here, th	ne	N
		prefabricated factory. So this is a standard form of	Ē	
0		a checklist. There is a chop underneath, towards the	Э	0
Р		lower part. Do you see that?		Р
0	A.	Yes.		0
Q	Q.	"(In English) The material delivered & constructed/s	hop	Q
R		drawings/submissions/testing and/or analysis of test	ing	R
S		results conform with specification and drawings.		S
		Checked and certified by:		
Τ				Т
U				U
V				v

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		Α
В	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	В
С	Yau Lee Wah Concrete Precast Products Co	Ltd."	С
	A person by the name of Mr Lau, he should	l be the	
D	PQCC, and he was responsible for signing off	this	D
E	document.		Ε
_	So yesterday, in response to a question b	by the	
F	chairman, you mentioned about Yau Lee Wah. M	Yau Lee Wah	F
G	was really, in essence, making space availab	le for your	G
н	work?		
Н	A. Yes, as far as plumbing, the pipes are conce	erned, yes.	Н
Ι	Q. That's true. But for the works actually don	e, that was	Ι
J	undertaken by Ho Biu Kee; is that right?		J
J	A. Yes.		J
K	Q. There is this pipe towards the very right, p	oipes were	K
L	also checked, "Unstable". Then there was a r	nark there	L
	next to it; do you see that?		
Μ	A. Yes.		Μ
Ν	Q. Do you understand what kind of pipes were re	eferred to	Ν
	here?		
0	A. Well, to my understanding, that was really f	for the	0
Р	lighting, the pipes for the lighting.		Р
Q	Q. So, in other words, on this checklist, there	e was no item	Q
×	related to plumbing works; is that right?		Ŷ
R	A. Yes.		R
S	MR KHAW: I have no further questions.		S
	CHAIRMAN: Is it because of the fact that water	pipes don't	
Т			Т
U			U
V			V

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	have to be checked?	С
D	A. Chairman, this is the standard checklist of Yau Lee Wah. Now, for the precast units, they need to have the piping	D
Е	for the lighting. For water pipes, they didn't install	Е
2	it, they didn't check it.	Ľ
F	CHAIRMAN: So it's up to Ho Biu Kee to say whether it's good	F
G	enough?	G
н	A. Yes, after Ho Biu Kee, we would conduct a random check	н
11	and then on site we would conduct a check.	п
Ι	CHAIRMAN: Any further questions? Mr Pennicott? No	Ι
J	questions.	J
	Thank you very much. You are free to go now.	
K	WITNESS: Thank you, Chairman.	K
L	(The witness withdrew)	L
	CHAIRMAN: So this is it for today.	
Μ	MR HO: Chairman, before we end, I would like to make	М
Ν	an application.	Ν
0	There are two witness statements that are due today.	
0	There's Mr Wong Bay and ST Chan. We are almost done	0
Р	with them. By Monday afternoon, we should be able to	Р
Q	submit them.	Q
x	CHAIRMAN: Yes, fine. Monday pm, fine.	Q
R	MR HO: Thank you.	R
S	CHAIRMAN: No objection?	S
т	So no session on Monday.	-
Т		Т
U		U
V		V
	- 26 -	

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation	Α
В	Commission of Inquiry intoExcess Lead Found in Drinking WaterDay 26	В
С	MR KHAW: There's no hearing on Monday because we have to	С
D	talk with Prof Bellinger.	D
	The next main contractor will be Shui On. There will be three witnesses, Mr Au, Mr Ching and Mr Wan, in	2
E	this order. They will take the floor after	Ε
F	Mr Bellinger.	F
G	CHAIRMAN: Mr Lam, we are not sure how long the	G
	cross-examination is going to take, but by your	
Н	estimate, Prof Bellinger might take two days, of course,	Н
Ι	subject to the number of questions for Prof Bellinger.	Ι
J	So, by your estimate, how long do you think it's going	J
-	to take for the three witnesses?	0
K	MR LAM: We have to read out the statements. Two are rather	K
L	short.	L
м	CHAIRMAN: I don't think they are long. So we should be	
Μ	able to complete Shui On before we break for the	Μ
Ν	holiday. Of course subject to the length of	Ν
0	cross-examination.	0
	MR LAM: I suppose so Chairman. It depends on how	Ũ
Р	co-operative members are.	Р
Q	MR KHAW: Prof Bellinger, we are going to spend two days.	Q
D	With any luck, we can finish on Wednesday am, so chances	
R	are that we may start with Shui On on Wednesday.	R
S	CHAIRMAN: All right then. Let's meet again on Tuesday.	S
Т	(11.35 am)	Т
		_
U		U
V		\mathbf{v}

Α	Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation		Α
В	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	Day 26	В
С	(The hearing adjourned until 10.00 am on Tuesday, 15 December 2015)		С
D	on fuesday, 15 December 2015)		D
E			E
F			F
G			G
Н			Н
Ι			Ι
J			J
K			K
L			L
Μ			М
Ν			Ν
0			0
Р			Р
Q			Q
R			R
S			S
T			Т
U			U
V			\mathbf{V}