

2016年1月11日

上午10時05分恢復聆訊

出席人士：石永泰資深大律師及許偉強大律師，為外聘律師，代表食水含鉛超標調查委員會

諾頓羅氏富布萊特香港胡文俊律師及康錦煒律師，代表張達欽及金日工程有限公司

麥高義資深大律師及許佐賓大律師，由的近律師行延聘，代表保華建築營造有限公司

Mr Ian Pennicott 資深大律師及林定韻大律師，由孖士打律師行延聘，代表中國建築工程（香港）有限公司

何沛謙資深大律師及殷志明大律師，由羅夏信律師事務所延聘，代表香港房屋委員會

林國輝大律師，由孖士打律師行延聘，代表瑞安承建有限公司

陳樂信大律師，由律政司延聘，代表水務署署長

李頌然大律師，由顧增海律師行延聘，代表有利建築有限公司、明合有限公司及伍克明

許偉強先生：唔該。

金日工程有限公司（“金日”）（中國建築（紅磡邨第二期）及保華（榮昌邨和東匯邨）的分判商）的第四證人：許宏新（金日地盤管工（紅磡邨第二期和榮昌邨））宣誓繼續作供
許偉強先生繼續盤問

問：許生，上個禮拜四我哋就有討論過即係關於你對嗰個無鉛焊料嗰個認知，我上個禮拜四同你講過。我喺呢度想同你跟進番呢有幾點嘅。你上個禮拜四，你就盤問--即係我盤問你嗰陣時，你一開就講話係呢個鉛水事件，即係今年--舊年7月，之後你先至第一次聽過有關無鉛焊

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

料呢樣嘢嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：係。但係你都同我哋講，就話喺呢件事之前，其實你一路都係認為即係所有個錫料，焊料，即係做食水喉嘅用焊料，都係無鉛嘅，係咪？

答：冇錯，係。

問：係咪？唔。我想問下你，就係你話呢件事之前，你都幾肯定所有焊料，或者你講嘅錫條，都係無鉛嘅。

答：係，冇錯。

問：有冇人講過畀你聽㗎？

答：嗯，冇人講，但係我都覺得佢畀得我嘅應該係適合用，無鉛嘅。

問：即係都係你自己認為...

答：係嘞。

問：...佢係無鉛嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：你有冇曾經--即係鉛水事件之前，有冇曾經同人商討過，就係話「喂，究竟呢啲咁嘅焊料，係啲咩嘢成分㗎」，有冇商討過㗎？

答：冇，冇，冇。

問：一般嚟講，你哋喺地盤收到焊料或者用焊料嘅時候，你同啲工人點樣去形容呢樣嘢，焊料，點講㗎？

答：錫條囉。

問：都係錫條嘅，係咪？

答：係。

問：許生，我想問下，你就加入呢個金日工程公司之前，認唔認識張達欽先生㗎？之前。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：之前，之前唔認識。

問：唔認識？

答：咦，之前呀？

問：嘎。

答：即係今日工程呵？

問：係呀。

答：識呀，識呀，識呀。

問：識嘅，嘎。

答：嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：幾時開始識佢㗎？

答：因為我都係舊公司嗰度做，佢又喺舊公司做經理，就可能識佢喇。

問：舊公司？

答：嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：係咪？

答：嘎。即係知道呢個人囉，唔係好熟嘅。

問：即係你話你嘅舊公司就有同張先生間公司有來往嘅，就識佢嘞，係咪咁嘅意思呀？

答：嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：嘎。咁你加入金日工程公司之前，認識咗張先生大概幾耐嘅，有冇十年呀？

答：冇，諗，...

問：冇？

答：幾年嘅喇。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：幾年嘅。加入金日工程公司之前認唔認識翁先生，翁國財先生？

答：都係一樣，都係同張生差唔多。

問：咩嘢都係差唔多？

答：都係識得嘅。

問：都係識得嘅？

答：嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：點識㗎？

答：以前我係佢伙記嚟㗎嘛。

問：以前你係佢伙記呀？

答：係。

問：哦。

答：係。

問：即係喺舊公司嘅時候，翁生係你上司呀？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：舊公司係咪都係做水喉工程㗎？

答：係，冇錯。

問：咁即係話，咁喺舊公司同翁生都係識咗有幾年時間咁呀？

答：有，有幾年。

問：幾年嘅呀？

答：應該有五、六年嘅。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：五、六年嘅。咁係咪同時間喺舊公司都識得林麗瓊女士㗎？

答：冇咁熟，都知道有呢個--因為佢係喺寫字樓做文職嘅，唔係好--接觸好多。

問：即係話舊公司嘅時候，你嘅同事就係有翁生，亦都有林小姐嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪？係咪？

答：係。

問：咁你同林小姐即係識得嘅時間，應該同你同翁生識得嘅時間都差唔多喇，差唔多長嘅，係咪？

答：差唔多喇。

問：咁你哋三位呢係咪差唔多同時間就轉去呢個金日工程公司嗰度做㗎？

答：我記得我就早過翁生少少。

問：即係唔係好耐啫，幾個月咁上下時間？

答：係喇，差唔多，係喇，一年或者一年...

問：係咪？即係...

答：或者一年半載嘅喇。

問：咁以你所知，林小姐都同翁生都差唔多時間加入金日工程公司嘅？

答：應該係。

問：係咪？

答：係，應該係。

問：我想問一問你，就係有關於嗰個--星期四問到你關於就係話鉛水事件發生之後，咁照計公司入面都有即係大家商討，「啊，究竟發生咩嘢事呀」咁樣，係咪？你都有過講話即係大家有商議過嘅。

答：其實我哋都有同佢寫字樓點樣商議。我都喺地盤。我哋喺地盤嘅。地

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

盤，就同嗰啲伙記就研究啫。

問：地盤同啲伙記研究啫，係咪？

答：係呀，好少話返公司呀，我哋。

問：好少返公司嘅？

答：嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：慢慢嚟。鉛水事件發生之後，有冇同張生傾過，欸，話「會唔會我哋訂啲貨有問題呀」，呢樣嘢呀？

答：應該冇。

問：冇呀？

答：冇。

問：肯定？

答：冇，係，肯定。

問：我記得你上個禮拜四就同我講，就話即係有同過啲同事傾過，咁啲同事就講到一嚟嚟咁樣嘅。

答：係，同事係我地盤嗰啲伙記。

問：地盤啲伙記？

答：係嘞。

問：係。有冇同公司採購部嘅職員，即係包括林小姐、周（譯音）小姐，佢哋講過呢件事？

答：我淨係打過電話問過 Patrick Wong。

問：Patrick Wong？

答：係嘞。

問：你打畀佢嘅時候，係咪都係即係舊年 7 月左右嘅事情？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：即係呢件事發生之後。

問：之後，都係--因為呢件事，我哋知道曝光係大概係7月份嘅喇，...

答：係。

問：...都係嗰段時間左右嘅，係咪？

答：應該講係榮昌邨嘅之後。

問：係。即係知道佢有事嘞？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪？

答：嘅。

問：知道佢牽涉在內嘞？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：你同 Patrick Wong 喺電話嘅傾，佢打畀你咁，定係你主動搵佢嘅？

答：我打畀佢。

問：你打畀佢係咩嘢原因？

答：就係因為--主要就想問佢，即係呢樣嘢有冇真真正正遞過辦。

問：有冇咩嘢話？

答：有冇遞過辦畀房署批核。

問：遞過辦，係咪？

答：係，係嘞。因為我之前從來都唔知道呢隻嘢係經過房署批准嘅。

問：你問黃生，Patrick Wong，...

答：係。

問：...就話「喂，呢個焊料有冇曾經遞過辦嘅」？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係嘞。

問：你問佢之前，你完全唔知道焊料需要遞辦嘅？

答：唔知。

問：唔知嘅？

答：唔知。

問：但係你知道有遞辦呢個程序嘅？

答：我知道遞辦呢個程序，但係呢隻嘢有冇遞辦，我就唔知。

問：好。咁你就第一樣嘢你問佢嘅，就係話「喂，呢個焊料有冇遞辦嘅」？

答：係嘞。

問：咁佢點答你呀？

答：佢之後佢當然話有喇。

問：唔好講之後先喇。

答：嘎。

問：你一打電話畀佢，問佢嘅時候，佢點講呀？

答：佢就即係點呀，又好似想答，好似唔想答咁樣，但係最終佢都係話「有呀，有遞辦嘅。」

問：即係喺個電話中都同你講有遞辦嘅？

答：係呀。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：咁你有冇再問佢關於呢個--即係公司，「喂，究竟當時訂啲咩嘢料呀」，呢樣嘢呀？

答：嗯，都唔使問喇。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：唔使問呀？

答：嘎，嘎，都--你指係呢啲錫條啲吖嘛，係咪？

問：係呀。

答：係嘞，都唔使問，你都知道都過咗啲嘞，已經知道係嘅嘢喇，係咪先？

問：知道嘅嘢？

答：係喇。

問：咁你知道--即係你打畀黃先生嘅時候，你已經知道你哋公司係訂咗啲唔啱規格嘅焊料嘅，係咪？

答：係喇，你都出咗事嘞。

問：吓？

答：都出咗事，知道呢隻嘢係含鉛啲嘛。

問：係。即係當時大家喺度係研究緊，「喂，究竟出咗啲咩嘢問題㗎」？

答：唔，唔，唔。

問：有人同你講過話「喂，我哋訂啲料唔啱呀」，咁呀？

答：冇，冇邊個講㗎。

問：喂，唔係㗎，許生，你啱啱話「喂，都知道咩嘢事喇，唔使問佢有冇訂錯貨喇。」咁我啱啱問你就係有邊個同你講，話「喂，你哋公司訂錯貨呀」，咁呀？

答：公司就有邊個同我講，但係我睇到新聞之後，同啲伙記傾番，都大家都全部都知道晒啲嘞。

問：知道乜嘢呀？

答：知道呢隻 50 力係有問題囉。

問：知道呢隻 50 力有問題？

答：係嘞。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：點樣知道呢隻 50 力有問題呀？

答：點樣知道呀？

問：嘎。50 力有...

答：即係...

問：首先，50 力有咩嘢問題呀，你哋覺得？

答：即係佢覺得--佢哋--出面做咗係--用咗呢隻先至出事㗎嘛，係咪先？
係咪？

問：欸，咪住先。你點知係因為呢隻而出事呀，當時？

答：點知呀？

問：嘎。

答：其...

問：可以有好多原因㗎嘛，當時，...

答：係呀，係有好多原因。

問：...係咪？又未有呢個委員會，係咪？

答：其實睇新聞喇，都成日都有播㗎喇，係咪先？佢直情燒埋畀我睇㗎，
係咪先？係咪呀？

問：新聞有播。你睇到新聞有冇特別講 50 力呢隻嘢有問題呀？

答：嗰陣時真係--嗰陣時未講嘅。

問：我想搞清楚你嘅口供先。你就話同啲工人大家傾，...

答：係嘞。

問：...就知道呢隻 50 力有問題㗎嘛，你當時係，...

答：唔，唔，唔。

問：...啱啱係咁同我講㗎嘛。我想問下你，50 力有咩問題呀？呢個我個

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問題嘞。

答：50 力有咩嘢問題？

問：係呀。你當時點解知道 50 力有問題？

答：當時真係唔知。啲人講開咗先至知。

問：邊個同你講開呀？

答：嗰啲伙記，因為一--個陣時一發生之後，差唔多全香港、九龍都通晒天嘞，係咪先？啲伙記全部都--都有啲聯繫，傾開咪知道囉。

問：咁佢哋點同你講話 50 力有問題呀？

答：即係佢哋覺得話「我覺」--即係覺得應該係就係呢隻嘢有問題嘞，因為佢仲--個陣唔只係話係呢隻 50 力嘅，應該仲話嗰啲龍頭、水喉閘掣，仲有好多樣嘢㗎嘛。

問：話龍頭？

答：係，係，係。

問：仲有咩嘢話，水喉閘掣？

答：水喉閘掣，係嘞。都仲係--即係都有問題㗎嘛，係咪先？

問：你停一停先。首先講咗 50 力先。當時，我想問下，你哋啲工人大家傾嘅時候，你哋講緊--即係籠統地咁講話「焊料可能有問題」咩，...

答：係嘞。

問：...定係直情講到明「喂，呢隻 50 力出現咗問題」呀？

答：即係覺得可能就係呢隻嘢有問題㗎喇，呢個多數都。

問：有講到 50 力出嚟嘅？

答：有講 50 力，絕對對冇。係講錫條，係嘞。50 力係之後，係做番呢啲口供先至知道係有「50 力」呢個字眼嘅。

問：你聽清楚我個問題，...（聽不清），即係之前、之後，我哋想搞清楚啫。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：你當時，你講緊，就係同啲工人傾，...

答：係。

問：...佢哋就有特別提到「50力」呢個名嘅，...

答：冇嘅，冇嘅。

問：...佢哋淨係講錫條...

答：錫條，係...

問：...可能有問題？

答：係嘞，係嘞。

問：好嘞。你聽到錫條有問題嘅時候，咁你當時有冇即刻諗到你哋公司用啲錫條可能有問題呀？

答：應該諗到喇。

問：吓？

答：諗到喇，自己都用緊。

問：當時你個心中有冇記番起有用過50力呢樣嘢呀，當時？

答：「50力」就有諗呢個字眼，係嘞，係嘞，就知道用咗--用緊呢隻錫條。

問：即係你話你當時就有特別話諗「啊，公司用咗50力」，不過就諗緊公司用嘅錫料可能有問題？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪？

答：錫條喇，係喇。

問：所以你就打畀Patrick Wong嘞？

B

B

C

答：係嘞。

C

D

問：係咪？

D

E

答：係嘞。

E

F

問：咁你問咗佢話有冇上辦喇，係咪？

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：咁佢就--你話佢初初係支吾以對，跟住就答咗你有喇吓。

H

I

答：係。

I

問：跟住有冇再跟進番，「喂，當時大家落個啲 order，買焊料呀，會唔會出咗問題呀」咁，有冇傾過呢方面嘅嘢㗎？

J

答：冇傾嘅，因為我--啲 order 我落嘅，有啲貨係嚟到地盤，我都知道，有啲有--兩樣都有，都知道係嘅嘢㗎喇。

J

K

問：咁你當時有冇同黃生講，話「喂，當時係我落 order 個嗰；喂，採購啲人點訂貨㗎？」有冇去傾呢個問題呀？

K

L

答：冇傾㗎喇。

L

M

問：冇傾嘅？

M

N

答：傾都冇意思㗎喇，係咪先？

N

O

問：好。你成個電話，同 Patrick Wong 呢個電話，就就咁問咗佢，話「喂，呢啲焊料有冇上辦呀」，冇其他嘢㗎嘞？

O

P

答：嘍。

P

Q

問：吓？

Q

R

答：冇㗎喇

R

S

問：直...

S

T

答：主要就我--我就係想證實，知道有冇遞辦呢樣嘢啫，係，所以我就問佢呢樣

T

U

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：遞辦呢樣嘢，點解你特別要想知呢？

答：因為若果係真真正正若果係遞辦，因為我--若果我知道，我絕對會跟辦嘅。

問：係。咁佢同你講咗遞辦喇，係咪？

答：嘎，嘎。

問：即係如果有遞辦嘅話，你就話你絕對應該要跟辦做㗎嘛？

答：係嘞，我絕對跟辦嘅。

問：咁好明顯就話遞咗辦之後，冇人同你跟進喇，公司？

答：應該係咁講。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：咁你當時有冇話同 Patrick Wong 傾，「喂，有冇搞錯呀，點解遞咗辦，我都唔知嘅」？

答：我會...

問：有冇傾呀？

答：應該都會咁講囉，係。

問：唔好講應唔應該先。你記一記有冇咁講？有冇同佢講過話「喂，有冇搞錯呀，遞咗辦，我都唔啱」？類似咁嘅嘢，有冇質詢下佢呢？

答：應該都--有，有，有。

問：吓？有...

答：都有。

問：有，係？

答：唔。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：喺個電話度有講嘅？

答：我都會鬧佢嘅，會。

問：有鬧佢添？

答：係呀。

問：係咪？唔。咁佢點回應呢？

答：佢點樣回應呀，當時呀？

問：噯。

答：我覺得好似--佢都冇乜答我㗎嘞，唔聲、唔聲咁樣。

問：冇答你呀？

答：係呀。

問：冇答你。成件事上面喇，許生，你都覺得--如果佢遞咗辦，冇話畀你聽嘅，你有做錯嘅？你有做錯㗎嘛？

答：我覺得我有做錯。

問：你有做錯㗎嘛，你自己？

答：係嘞，係，係呀。

問：除咗同黃生傾過遞辦，你又鬧過佢話，喂，點解遞咗辦之後唔話畀你聽之外，...

答：係，係。

問：...仲有冇同公司其他邊位職員傾過呢件事？

答：冇㗎喇，佢一講咗之後，知道係出事㗎喇，傾都有意思㗎喇。

問：唔好講傾有冇意思先。

答：噯。冇。

問：有冇？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇。

問：冇。你做你嘅證人口供之前，有冇話同公司，喂，啲同事傾一傾，「喂，呢件事，我哋而家要去委員會嗰度畀口供喎，喂，點呀？有冇啲咩嘢資料我要知嘅」，有冇傾一傾呀？

答：唔，唔。

問：傾下總會有啲，係咪？

答：若果傾呢啲就會有多少，係。

問：傾邊啲話？

答：傾啲供詞啲。

問：供詞啲，係咪？

答：唔。

問：咁你當時同邊個傾呀，同公司？

答：同林小姐都會傾下喇。

問：同林小姐都有傾喇，係咪？

答：嘎，嘎。

問：同林小姐，咁你仲有冇問過佢關於上辦啲嘢呀？

答：冇喇喇，啲啲。啲啲唔問喇喇。

問：同林小姐傾，最主要傾啲咩嘢呀，供詞方面？

答：睇下點樣係同律師溝通，搵邊啲律師呀啲。

問：就住你哋 order 咗究竟有啲乜嘢焊料，有冇同林小姐傾下呢？

答：冇喇喇。

問：有冇同林小姐跟進下，「喂，你其實當時知唔知佢哋上咗辦喇？喂，原來要落呢隻料個喎」？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：應該當時就有嘅。

問：嗯？

答：冇嘅。

問：從來冇同林小姐傾過呢樣嘢？

答：係。我覺得同 Patrick 傾已經足夠㗎喇，因為我係對 Patrick 一個之嘛。

問：就你嚟睇，即係話 Patrick Wong 就做漏嘢喇？

答：應該可以咁講，應該做漏嘢。

問：你知唔知道翁生都係有負責遞辦㗎？

答：知道佢同 Patrick Wong。

問：咁你都會同唔同意，如果係咁，遞咗辦之後冇同你跟進，翁生都有責任呢？

答：佢冇同我跟進，應該佢都有責任囉。

問：係咪？

答：係喇。

問：以你所知...

答：但係主要通知我，應該就係 Patrick Wong 囉。

問：係。但係你知道翁生係有負責遞辦㗎嘛？

答：知道，知道。

問：係。咁你亦都知唔知道你哋大老闆張生係知道呢隻焊料有遞辦呀？佢知唔...

答：佢呀？去到佢咁高層次，應該就可能佢真係未必知道。

問：即係你唔知佢知唔知？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：係咪？

答：係呀。

問：有冇同翁生傾過，「喂，遞咗辦，點解唔話我聽呀」？

答：冇喇喇，都係知道之後都唔會--講都有意思喇喇，冇傾，唔傾喇喇。

問：做口供之前，有冇同翁生傾過呀？

答：冇傾，唔傾。

問：你剛才話做口供之前有冇同林小姐傾過吓嘛？

答：係嘞，係嘞，係。

問：淨係同林小姐一位啫？

答：淨係林小姐，就係傾下睇下點解同律師做嗰啲...

問：交代番呢件事？

答：係嘞，同埋...

問：係咪？

答：係嘞，冇錯，冇錯。

問：周小姐呢，有冇傾過呀？

答：周小--冇周小姐呀。莫小姐。

問：係，對唔住，莫小姐。

答：嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：係。

答：冇，冇。

問：都有？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇，冇，冇，冇。

問：淨係同林小姐啫，係咪？

答：係。

問：當時同林小姐傾個陣時，林小姐有冇同你講話「喂，個陣時你叫我落咩嘢貨，我咪落咩嘢貨囉，我都唔知㗎」，佢有冇同你講呢啲呀？

答：都係--應該都係咁講喇。總之佢就話我哋--係喇，係喇。

問：我想知道你同林小姐講乜呀。

答：講乜？

問：但係你咁--都係咁講呢？我唔知你同佢講咗啲乜呀。我想清楚啲理解下你同佢講啲乜嘢。

答：係嘞。

問：有冇同佢講過話，你同佢溝通嘅時候，佢有冇同你提過話「喂，許生，喂，你個陣時咁落單，打電話嚟，我就咁落單，我都唔知㗎」咁？佢點講呀？佢--即係佢個...

答：好似佢都有講過，佢話「喂，你哋打番嚟，講乜我就落乜㗎喇。」

問：咁你呢，你當時個態度係點呀，聽完佢咁講？

答：態度呀？冇乜態度㗎喇，你過--都過咗去㗎嘞。

問：咁你有冇話佢咩，話「喂，有冇搞錯呀，你哋喺 office 知道係上咗咩嘢辦，知道批咗啲乜，你哋自己都唔查下嘅」，咁你有冇咁樣話下佢呀？你話咗黃生嘞，有冇話下林小姐呀？

答：林小姐其實根本上佢係職位高過我嘅，我係應該冇乜權力話佢囉。

問：就算冇話佢，有冇同佢跟進下，話「喂，遞咗辦，咁你知唔知㗎」，有冇問下佢呀？

答：好似有呢--呢樣嘢真係冇問佢㗎。

問：吓？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇問佢呢樣嘢㗎。

問：冇問過呢樣？

答：嘎。

問：仲有傾過啲咩嘢，同林小姐？

答：差唔多喇，都係呢啲啫，都係，好簡單啫，都唔係--因為我主要唔係接觸佢--唔係針對--唔係面對佢。

問：好。啲料呢，通常啲錫料就連埋其他做食水喉啲用料、部件，即係嚟到現場，一般嚟講都--你係聯絡人嚟㗎嘛，喺個工地現場。

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：因為我哋見到啲單，例如有收貨單，都會寫咗聯絡人就係許生你嘅。

答：係，冇錯。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：我想了解下，就係通常啲貨物進場嘅時候，你一定會知嘅，係咪？

答：會知，佢--個供應商會通知我嘅，打電話。

問：就係話嚟到現場之前，佢哋事先會通知咗你先嘅？

答：係，之前...

問：係咪？

答：都係--個司機，送貨司機。

問：送貨司機會通知你，...

答：係，係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：...話「喂，喂，許生，噏，今日有啲咩嘢貨」？

答：幾時、幾時到。

問：幾時到咁？

答：係。

問：咁你會知道有啲咩嘢貨㗎嘛，係咪？

答：唔知㗎，佢淨係送貨咋。

問：送貨啫？

答：係呀。

問：即係送乜嚟，就唔知嘅？

答：唔知。

問：係咪？

答：係呀。

問：咁你知道咗之後，需唔需要通知番地盤，總承建商嗰邊嘅同事，話「喂，幾時送貨嚟呀」咁？

答：其實唔--呢啲細微嘅嘢，唔使通知佢。嗰啲...

問：唔使通知佢嘅？

答：係。大型嗰啲，譬如銅喉或者係成個貨櫃嚟嗰啲，因為需要地方擺呀，嗰啲先至會通知佢，總承建商，畀個位嚟擺啫。呢啲細微嘅嘢其實唔需要嘅。

問：如果你知--即係你見到當時--咪住先吓。你話細微嘅嘢就唔使通知佢。

答：係。

問：大嚟嗰啲就要講畀佢聽，等佢知道點擺㗎嘛。

答：係嘞，係嘞。

B

B

C

問：係咪？

C

D

答：係。

D

E

問：咁即係話供應商打畀你，話佢會送啲嘢去地盤現場嘅時候，咁你應該知道佢係送啲咩嘢嚟個囉喎？如果唔係，你點樣去分...

E

F

答：分好先。

F

G

問：...邊啲大嚟，邊啲細嚟呀？

G

H

答：唔係，大型，佢就會--即係會預早通知囉，係囉，提早一日通知囉，大型嘅囉，係囉。提早一日通知，因為地盤都要--若果要--問佢，同佢擺申請，都要提早一日通知，擺位嘅。

H

I

問：即係你話如果大型嘅貨物，...

I

J

答：係嘞。

J

K

問：...佢就會預先通知你。

K

L

答：係嘞。

L

M

問：你亦都知道啲啲咩嘢嚟嘅？

M

N

答：係，大型啲啲會知。

N

O

問：係咪？

O

P

答：知，會嘅

P

Q

問：知嘅？

Q

R

答：啲啲會知，啲啲話畀我聽，係。

R

S

問：係，係。

S

T

答：係。

T

U

問：咁如果例如焊料啲啲呢？

U

V

答：啲啲唔使㗎嘞，啲啲。

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：從來冇通知你，事先通知你嘅？

答：唔會嘅。

問：係咪？

答：會--係呀。

問：但係焊料會唔會同啲大型啲咁嘅物料，有時係一齊送嚟㗎？

答：可能冇賴埋都唔出奇，冇埋都唔出奇。

問：但係電話度，通知你嘅時候，就有特別去講...

答：唔會㗎嘞，唔會，唔講㗎嘞。

問：...其他啲嘢，即係呢一類型啲焊料？

答：唔會講㗎嘞。

問：就唔講嘅？

答：淨係講啲大型啲貨啫，濕碎佢唔同你提㗎嘞。

問：好。啲物料到現場嘅時候，咁你都曾經有收過焊料㗎，即係你會喺個地盤現場有曾經收過焊料呢樣嘢嘅？

答：應該我有收過，但係好...

問：有收過咩嘢？

答：...--都好少。

問：好少呀？

答：係，因為都係...

問：好少。

答：因為都係啲咁伙記收。

問：伙記收？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係呀。

問：係咪？

答：係呀，多數都係伙記收，因為成個地盤咁大，我要行開行埋，係其實係唔可以長駐喺地下嘅。

問：即係你唔可以成日喺嗰個地去收貨嘅，...

答：係嘞，係嘞。

問：...係咪咁嘅意思？我想你睇一睇啲單先，S1。

答：即係呢個？

問：79 開始。如果我哋睇下啲送貨單先。

答：係。

問：81 頁。

答：係。

問：睇到嘛？

答：知，知，見到，見到，見到，81 頁，得。

問：81 頁，就係「紅磡村」，呢個就特別係講緊即係馬坑嗰個地盤嘅。睇到嘛？

答：見到。

問：咁聯絡人都係寫咗你，許生，本人喇。

答：係。

問：睇到嘛？

答：係。

問：咁呢度就係有一張送貨單，就係講緊有三種物料嘅。

答：唔。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：睇到喇？

答：係。

問：有英國 FRY 松香膏。

答：係。

問：呢隻 FRY 松香膏，你見過㗎呵？

答：呢啲係收咗貨，相信我有見過喇。

問：即係如果你有收貨，就見過？

答：係，係，係。

問：黃色一罐--一罌罌嘅？

答：係，冇錯，嗰個--嗰個，係，松香膏，係，冇錯。

問：喺現場嗰陣時睇過嘅？

答：係，係。

問：係咪？好嘞。

答：其實松香膏就其實冇乜分嘅，不鏽都係用開呢隻料嘅。

問：係，唔緊要，我唔係問你--嘎，即係如果--你可以睇一睇嘅。

答：係。

問：即係呢個？

答：係，係，冇錯。

問：係咪？

答：嘎。

問：黃色盒嘅，...

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：...我而家指緊呢個。

答：係。

問：FRY 嘅 Powerflow Flux，松香膏。

答：唔。

問：呢個都喺地盤現場都睇過好多次喇？

答：唔，唔。

問：係咪？

答：其實不鏽都用開佢。

問：不鏽都係用呢隻嘅？

答：嘎。

問：睇下第二行喇，咁係寫住「英國 FRY 無鉛錫線」。

答：係。

問：係咪？睇到嘛？

答：見到。

問：「20 網」咁樣，跟住後面就有啲冷膠墊片呀咁。呢度就寫住「收貨客戶」，「金日工程公司」喇，下面。見到嘛？

答：唔。

問：下面嗰個簽名，係咪你簽名嚟㗎？

答：應該係，應該係我簽名。

問：係你簽名嚟嘅？

答：係。

問：係嘞。咁我睇多一張，92。

B

B

C

答：90頁？

C

D

問：92呀。

D

E

答：92，係。

E

F

問：都係雋景發出嘅送貨單。

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：係咪？

H

I

答：唔。

I

J

問：咁呢度都係講緊「紅磡村二期」嘅。

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：睇到嘛？

L

M

答：見到。

M

N

問：亦都係畀你哋公司，聯絡人亦都係你本人嘅。

N

O

答：係。

O

P

問：睇到嘛？

P

Q

答：見到。

Q

R

問：咁呢度就寫住，第一樣，就係「50力扁錫條」，咁就「165磅」，咁樣嘅，睇到嘛？

R

S

答：唔。

S

T

問：咁下面嗰度就有個「收貨客戶」，「金日工程公司」喇，咁就有個簽名嘅。

T

U

答：唔。

U

V

問：嗰個係咪你簽名嚟嘍？

V

答：呢個唔係。

B

B

C

問：呢個唔係你簽名嘅？

C

D

答：呢個係我伙記簽嘅。

D

E

問：伙記簽？

E

F

答：係。

F

G

問：邊位呀？

G

H

答：唔講得唔得㗎？

H

I

問：吓？

I

J

答：唔講得唔得㗎，伙記？

J

K

問：唔講？

K

L

答：嘎。

L

M

問：我哋想知道...

M

N

答：想知道呀？

N

O

問：係呀。

O

P

答：唔緊要，唔緊要。呢個應該係一個伙記，叫做黃銳康（譯音）。

P

Q

問：黃...

Q

R

答：黃銳康先生。

R

S

問：...銳康呀？

S

T

答：係。

T

U

問：係咪你哋公司嘅同事㗎？

U

V

答：我啲伙記。

V

問：你自己啲伙記㗎嘅？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：就佢唔屬於公司嘅，係咪？唔屬於金日工程嘅？

答：點講呀？其實所有伙記都係金日工程嘅，但係佢係屬於我管轄囉。

問：你管轄？

答：係。

問：你就住嗰個地盤請番嚟嘅工人之一，可唔可以咁講？

答：係，可以咁講，係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：出糧，邊個出畀佢嘍？

答：都係金日工程。

問：咁即係話你喺個地盤現場嘅時候，就一係就你簽收，如果你本人在場嘅時候？

答：但係有一方面就--我喺度，我就會收。若果我唔喺度，我就會睇下邊個喺--方便，喺嗰個範圍，就幫佢收喇。其實冇指定邊個嘅。

問：明白。

答：係。

問：咁我想知道，你啲工人收貨之前，你有冇同佢哋講話「喂，點樣你先會簽名呢」，定係總之有貨嚟，就喺張送貨單度簽名，定係你會唔會同佢講話「喂，都要 check 下啲貨齊唔齊先至簽名嘅」？有冇畀過啲咩嘢指示畀啲工人嘍？

答：會 check 貨啫，check 齊唔齊，冇錯。

問：吓？

答：會 check 下，睇下齊唔齊囉。

問：要 check 下，睇下齊唔齊？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係嘞，係嘞。

問：即係要數下啲貨？

答：係嘞，要數下。

問：係咪？

答：或者要數下幾多盒咁樣囉。

問：牌子呢，使唔使對？

答：牌子唔對㗎嘞。

問：唔對㗎嘞？

答：唔對㗎嘞，知道係乜嘢料，同埋有數量，最主要數量。

問：即係睇個盒數，最主要？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪？

答：係，同埋個數量啱唔啱啫。

問：即係呢個就係你畀啲工人嘅指示？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：你自己呢？你自己係咪都係咁做㗎，如果你自己去簽收嘅話？

答：其實我都係咁樣。

問：吓？

答：都係咁樣。

問：唔。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：你都係唔睇牌子嘅？

答：唔睇㗎嘞。

問：所有物料你都唔睇牌子嘅？

答：唔睇㗎嘞。

問：咁總之見到盒，差唔多咁上下數目嘅，...

答：係。

問：...咁就簽嘞，係咪？

答：因為之後--因為送貨嗰陣時佢會好急嘅，一人嚟佢就--車就要走㗎嘞，擺低喇，到時先慢慢，慢慢到時先研究囉。

問：如果你唔對牌子，你點知嗰隻物料係即係符合呀？

答：唔對牌子呀？其實做開咗之後呢，大概都知道佢邊隻牌嘅，都知道嘅。

問：唔係，我知。你大概知道即係你哋要用咩嘢喇。

答：係。

問：但係你就係話連個牌子個--淨係睇個盒嘅數量，...

答：係。

問：...連個牌子你都唔會去睇嘅，咁你點知道嚟嗰啲貨係，喂，啱㗎？點知呀？用咗都唔知個囉嗰，到時。

答：牌子呢--譬如好似彬記（譯音）咁，銅喉咁；若果佢彬記嚟嘅，就係嗰隻，彬記嗰隻牌子吖嘛，就啱嘅，一定啱嘅。如果銅喉呢，如果第二間公司送嚟，唔係彬記，我哋知道係錯嘅。即係係嗰間公司送嚟，就係啱嗰隻牌子嘅。

問：咁即係話，如果你係雋景訂貨，總之係雋景送嚟，你就當佢係啱㗎嘞？

答：雋景嗰啲全部五金嘢，唔使點樣跟㗎嘞，嗰啲。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：唔使點跟㗎嘞？

答：係呀，五金嘢。

問：唔好講五金先吓。如果你話彬記，送㗎㗎㗎。

答：係嘞。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：咁你就覺得係彬記送㗎嘅，就㗎嘞嘞，「我都唔使再 check㗎嘞」？

答：㗎嘞嘞，一定。係嘞，㗎嘅，一定㗎嘅。

問：係咪就係咁呀？

答：係，係呀。

問：而你確實亦都唔會再睇下係咪「喂，係咪呢隻牌子有送㗎嘅」，你哋唔會睇嘅？

答：唔睇㗎嘞，彬記佢--佢做開嗰隻牌子㗎嘞。

問：跟住就打開出嚟用㗎喇嘛？

答：係呀。

問：係咪？唔。焊料嘞，就你所講嗰啲...

答：係。

問：可以嘛？

答：可以，可以，得。

問：焊料嘞，就係你所講嗰啲可能細眉細眼啲嘅，小五金，你所講嘅。

答：係，可以咁講喇，係喇。

問：係咪？咁嚟到現場嘞，咁嗰啲係雋景擺㗎喇喇。

B

B

C

答：係，冇錯。

C

D

問：係咪？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：你亦都唔會再睇牌子，就收貨㗎喇嘛？

F

G

答：唔睇㗎嘞。

G

H

問：係咪？咁好嘞，呢啲數咗貨之後，就會打開嚟即刻用嘅？

H

I

答：唔。

I

J

問：係咪？

J

K

答：係。

K

問：我想問下你，就係你剛才都見過，即係有啲單，有啲送貨單嚟，你簽嘅，就寫住「無鉛錫線」喇。

L

答：唔。

L

M

問：係咪？咁我哋都見到有唔少單，除咗紅礮地盤，東匯同埋榮昌都有啲送貨單係講 50 力扁錫條嘅咁。

M

N

答：係呀。

N

O

問：係咪？

O

P

答：係。

P

Q

問：咁即係話其實你當時喺個地盤嘅時候，你星期四都有同我哋提過喇，即係話，欸，都知道有兩溝個喎。

Q

R

答：係呀。

R

S

問：係咪？

S

T

答：係。

T

U

問：呢個兩溝呢樣嘢，就想同你了解一下。你話喺地盤嗰度有兩溝喇。首先，如果你睇單嘅話，就咁純粹睇單，送貨單，你當時做緊地盤嘅時

U

V

V

B

B

C

候都知道憑單嚟到睇有啲係錫線、有啲係錫條，呢樣嘢你知道嘛？憑單去睇。

C

D

答：憑單，當時都睇到嘅，係喇。

D

E

問：睇到㗎嘛？

E

F

答：係。

F

G

問：係咪？

G

H

答：係。

H

I

問：當時你憑單睇到有啲係錫線、有啲係錫條，兩隻所講嗰個形容或者個牌子都是不同㗎嘛，係咪？一個50力，一個係FRY，寫住「無鉛錫線」嘅咁，好唔同喇，兩隻，係咪？

I

J

答：唔。

J

K

問：係咪？

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：咁你當時有冇去諗話「啊，呢兩隻嘢係唔一樣嘅」？

M

N

答：嗰個形狀就唔一樣。

N

O

問：形狀咩嘢話，唔一樣？

O

P

答：就唔一樣，但係我認知嚟講就係做嗰個物料嗰個--即係嗰個物質就一樣嘅。

P

Q

問：你之前一路就同我哋講，就話你以前即係例如考大工牌，咩嘢嘅時候，一路都係用嗰啲一條條嗰啲錫條㗎，...

Q

R

答：係。

R

S

問：...銀色嗰啲咩嘛，扁身嗰啲咩嘛，係咪？

S

T

答：唔。

T

U

問：即係我嗰日畀你睇，係呢啲嘅？

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係吖。

問：係咪？咁好嘞，你見到，你一路都係稱之為「錫條」㗎。

答：係吖。

問：係咪？咁你睇到啲單嘅時候，寫住「無鉛錫線」嘅時候，有冇特別去睇下，「欸，會唔會有啲咩嘢唔同呢，呢個錫線」？

答：冇，冇㗎嘞，嗰陣時。嗰陣時唔識佢呢啲嘢，總之冇，我哋就真係有咩嘢就用咩嘢。

問：送到嚟嘅貨，你就話見到有兩溝。

答：係。

問：係咪？我係講緊未用啲料之前，擺喺個工地度嘅，通常啲貨送到嚟嘞，例如呢啲錫條又好，綠色一卷卷啲嘢又好喇，先會擺喺邊㗎？

答：都係擺喺個架步嗰度。

問：擺喺架步嗰度嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪？即係攤晒出嚟嘅，...

答：係。

問：...喺個地板？

答：擺埋一面。

問：擺埋一面？

答：係。

問：咁即係你好清楚--例如我哋講緊紅礮邨地盤咁講，你都喺架步度曾經見過有兩種唔同嘅焊料。

答：有，有。

問：係咪？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：有。

問：同時間兩種擺咗喺度？

答：係呀。

問：係咪？唔。形狀好唔同咁樣，我哋見過。

答：係呀。

問：呢個就係一條條嘅，就有嘢，咁樣捲住嘅。嗰個就係綠色一卷卷嘅。
你當時有冇諗話「喂，呢兩隻嘢，...（聽不清）嗶」？

答：冇諗㗎喇，冇就用㗎喇。

問：冇就用㗎嘞？

答：係呀。

問：你唔會去諗㗎嘞？

答：係呀。因為你知--都唔知道佢嗰隻係含鉛嘅。

問：冇話諗住話，喂，打番公司，話「喂，點解有兩焊料唔同嘅」，...

答：又有。

問：...要同公司問一問佢，話「喂，究竟應該用邊隻先至啱呀」，有冇
曾經諗過呢樣嘢？

答：嗰陣時又好似冇乜諗嗶，因為我覺得呢隻都係好普通啫。

主席：聽唔到，再講多次。

答：佢係一個好--即係點呀？好普通嘅嘢囉，唔係好重視佢囉。

黎先生：好唔同樣個嗶，兩隻。

答：係唔同樣㗎。

B

B

C

黎先生：吓？

C

D

答：但係嗰陣時係唔...

D

E

黎先生：用起上嚟都好唔同個喎。

E

F

答：其實一樣，用起上嚟一樣。

F

G

黎先生：時間爭好遠個喎，燒起上嚟。

G

H

答：唔同，一樣，差唔多。燒--每樣...

H

I

黎先生：差唔多定一樣呀？

I

答：我可以話畀你聽，每一樣好，燒落去嗰個時間相差都係三至五秒嘅，所以我哋做嗰陣時係一樣嘅，唔係爭得好遠嘅。

J

黎先生：你有冇做過呀？

J

K

答：我梗係有做過喇。

K

L

M

問：呢兩隻焊料嚟講...

M

N

主席：但係如果有分別嘅，咁點解唔用錫線呢？

N

O

答：我就唔明佢哋送錫線嚟，一啲錫條嚟。

O

P

主席：唔係，我哋--即係許生，我哋去到今時今日聽到嘅證供，就係話做公屋嘅工程就得一隻錫線嘅啫，係人都知㗎嘞。

P

Q

答：係人都知呀？

Q

R

主席：係嘞。

R

S

答：。我覺得應該就唔係。

S

T

主席：吓？

T

U

答：喺--就喺...

U

V

V

B

B

C

主席：咁如果你又話冇分別嘅，即係兩者都有分別嘅，咁無端端點解要用另外一隻呢？

C

D

答：咁呢樣我真係唔知。

D

E

主席：吓？

E

F

答：真係唔知。

F

G

主席：真係唔知。好，唔。

G

H

答：嘎。

H

I

問：你話你就知道即係--你自己都用過呢兩隻喇。

I

J

答：有。

J

K

問：係咪？

K

L

答：唔。

L

M

問：就住我哋而家講緊呢兩個地盤，喺個地盤施工嘅時候，你有冇親自用過呢兩隻呀，你自己？

M

N

答：我自己呀，都有，有。

N

O

問：有幫手做過燒焊工序嘅？

O

P

答：少少啲啲就會有，譬如做辦。大量啲啲唔需要我做㗎嘞。

P

Q

問：「做辦」，你嘅意思係...

Q

R

答：即係做辦房啲啲。

R

S

問：做辦房？

S

T

答：係喎。

T

U

問：就你會幫手嘅，係咪？

U

V

答：係，我會跟進，間中都會落手嘅。

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：係嘞。做辦房嘅時候，咁都要用到呢啲焊料喇。

答：係呀。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：好嘞，咁你做辦房嗰陣時，你點樣取捨呀？你做辦房嗰陣時已經睇到有呢兩隻焊料存在嘅，係咪？

答：做辦房嗰陣時呀？譬如做辦房嗰陣時，我覺得應該嚟嗰陣時應該就一--可能會一隻，一隻料啫。

主席：聽唔到，再講。

答：啱啱開始嗰陣時，因為佢未開工吖嘛，佢第一批，一樣係用吖嘛，係咪先？都係嚟一種啫。

主席：用一種？

答：嘎，嘎。

問：邊隻呀，嗰陣時？

答：但係我就唔知佢嚟邊種先。

問：吓？

答：唔知佢嚟咗邊種先。若果係錫條，嚟錫條嘅，照擺錫條做辦。嚟錫線，照擺錫線做辦。就係咁樣嘞。

問：得。你就話你--例如我哋講緊紅礮邨先。

答：係。

問：你有參與過真係例如做辦房，係咪？

答：係，係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：咁都要用焊料？

答：係。

問：咁你就話你應該係淨係做辦房嗰陣時，你先至會正式參與嘅啫，...

答：係。

問：...跟住就有乜點真係參與...

答：因為嗰陣時...

問：...燒焊工作，係咪咁呀？

答：係，嗰陣時我個工作太大，唔需要我㗎嘞，因為我...

問：就唔需要你嘞？

答：...太多嘢跟進，係。

問：係。

答：係。

問：咁你當時做辦房嘅時候，你而家記番起，你當時係用邊隻嘅呢？好唔同㗎嘛，一隻係咁樣，另外一隻係捲埋嘅。

答：其實唔記得㗎，...

問：捲埋嘅。

答：...咁多年。

問：吓？

答：唔記得㗎嘞，真係唔記得㗎嘞。

問：捲埋嘅。

答：兩樣都有用，但係你話「做辦房嗰陣時，你記唔記得真係用邊隻呢」，真係唔記得。

問：好。你記唔記得喺呢兩個地盤，你曾經有用過呢一隻呢？

B

B

C

答：紅磡邨就有。

C

D

問：紅磡邨有？

D

E

答：唔。

E

F

問：你記得有用過嘞？

F

G

答：有。

G

H

問：係咪？

H

I

答：絕對有。

I

J

問：你用呢隻嘅時候，我想問下你係點用㗎？你...

J

K

答：一樣之嘛。

K

L

問：你聽我講。

L

M

答：嘎，嘎。

M

N

問：你聽我問埋先吓。

N

O

答：嘎，嘎，嘎。

O

P

問：你會係將一卷啲線搵出嚟，切開一條條去焊咩，...

P

Q

答：唔使切，唔使切。

Q

R

問：...定係就咁攤住佢嚟燒呀？

R

S

答：呢個就咁，唔使切。

S

T

問：唔使切嘅？

T

U

答：唔使，呢個唔使切。

U

V

問：唔使切嘅？

V

答：唔使切。

問：你做嗰陣時就係直情攤住咁一卷？

B

B

C

答：係嘞，係嘞。

C

D

問：就咁樣做嘅？

D

E

答：係嘞。

E

F

問：係咪？

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：有冇見過工人攞住呢一隻嚟到做呀，喺紅磡邨？

H

I

答：有。

I

J

問：有呀呵？

J

K

答：有，係，有。

K

L

問：佢哋又點做呢？佢哋係跟你嘅做法吖，就咁攞住一卷...

L

M

答：都係咁，都係咁嚟嘞。

M

N

問：等等先，慢慢嚟。

N

O

答：係，係，係，係，係。

O

P

問：攞住，都係咁樣做？

P

Q

答：我話畀你聽...

Q

R

問：定係有冇剪開佢一條條呢？

R

S

答：我--有--都會有，但係好少，因為個個人做，手法唔同嘅。佢有啲就會搵晒出嚟，捲一紮嚟做嘅。

S

T

問：搵晒出嚟，就捲一紮？

T

U

答：係嘞，係。

U

V

問：咁搵晒出嚟，係咪都係...

V

答：就唔--即係捲一卷仔，唔使咁多，就有咁重。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：即係有啲工人就搵咗佢出嚟？

答：係，係嘞。

問：咁係咪都會剪開佢一槓槓先至捲呀？

答：會，都會剪，係，個工人...

問：即係冇理由--即係如果你係搵晒出嚟，...

答：係，係，係，會，會。

問：...如果唔剪嘅，就不如使搵喇？

答：係嘞，就算佢冇嘢剪，佢都擺嘢揸斷佢嘅。

問：吓？

答：即係若果有鉸剪去剪，佢都擺嘢揸斷佢嘅。

問：哦，揸斷佢，係。

答：係，係，係。

問：咁就擺一個適當長度，咁就捲住咁用嘞？

答：係嘞，就有咁重囉，係。

問：以個工作效率嚟講，你嘅經驗，用邊隻比較高啲呀，效率？

答：講真啲句，若果話用呢隻，應該就...

問：邊隻，你講緊？綠色呢隻，一卷卷？

答：綠色呢隻呢...

問：綠色講緊，係咪？

答：...就乾手淨腳。

問：乾手淨腳呀？

答：係嘞。

B

B

C

問：點解講「乾手淨腳」呢？

C

D

答：其實呢隻做落去就靚仔啲。

D

E

問：靚仔啲呀？

E

F

答：係。

F

G

問：點解呢？

G

答：因為佢用嗰下就同嗰隻就爭少少喇，就好走啲，好入啲。

H

問：呢隻就...

H

I

答：好入啲。

I

J

問：...好走啲？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：係咪？

L

答：係嘞。

M

問：嗰隻就難啲？

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：嘎。

O

P

答：係。

P

Q

Q

R

主席：嗰隻乜嘢話？

R

S

答：嗰隻...

S

T

問：呢隻好走啲。你講嗰隻，一條條呢一隻就難啲，係咪？

T

U

答：係，難少少喇，就唔係好少，...（聽不清）

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：難少少？

答：係，係。

問：有啲燒焊工人就話如果用呢一隻，呢隻錫條，即係一條條嗰個，唔係講緊綠色吓。呢一隻錫條就嗰個虛耗會大啲，你同唔同意？

答：虛耗乜嘢呢？個時...

問：即係會咗咁啲--即係做緊嗰個...

答：係嘞，係嘞。

問：...燒焊工序嘅時候會咗啲料會咗得比較多啲。

答：會，會，會，會，會，會，會，會，因為佢剩低嗰個尾就攞嘍嘍。

問：係。

答：呢隻就一路用落去吖嘛，就唔使有個尾吖嘛。

問：明白。我想問下你哋嗰嗰個--如果講緊紅磡邨，我而家淨係講紅磡邨先。响個現場做緊呢啲工程，你會唔會接觸中國建築嘅科文嘍？

答：會。

問：會？

答：會。

問：有一位叫李鴻輝先生，你都認識嘅，係咪，李生？

答：李鴻輝？我唔知你指邊個，因為我淨係啞--知道佢，就全名就唔會知道佢嘅，淨係知道叫輝哥呀。

問：輝哥？

答：嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎，嘎。

問：「輝哥」有冇聽過呀？

答：唔知係咪嗰個輝哥啫。

B

B

C

問：「輝哥」有聽過嘅？

C

D

答：係。

D

E

問：係咪？

E

F

答：輝哥係應該係副老總嚟嘅。

F

G

問：副咩嘢話？

G

H

答：副老總嚟嘅。

H

I

問：副老總？

I

答：係，你講李鴻輝，係咪應--唔知係咪嗰個喇。因為全名我就多數都唔知佢咩嘅，係知道佢個單名。

J

問：有冇一位科文叫做「輝哥」，有冇聽過呀？

J

K

答：「輝哥」呀？好似又有嘞。

K

L

問：吓？

L

M

答：好似冇嘞。科文就有--副老總就有。

M

N

問：我想問下，喺個工地嗰個現場嘅時候，會唔會即係有中國建築嘅同事，同你哋講解下用啲乜嘢物料呀，呢樣嘢嘅？

N

O

答：唔--冇嘍嘞。

O

P

問：吓？

P

Q

答：冇嘍嘞。

Q

R

問：肯定有？

R

S

答：冇嘍嘞。佢哋--根本上我覺得佢哋都有呢啲常識。

S

T

問：完全唔講呀？

T

U

答：係呀。水喉屬於一個好專業嘅部門，其實根本上佢哋都未必有呢啲常識喇。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：冇啲咩嘢話？

答：冇呢啲水喉呢方面嘅常識。

問：哦，即係你話佢哋唔識嘅，呢樣嘢？

答：佢自己唔識，我覺得。

問：即係純粹係靠你哋嘅啫？

答：係嘞，我哋先至叫做專業咁嘛。

問：我而家講緊嘅就係話做食水喉用啲咩嘢物料，包括焊料，...

答：唔會

問：...佢哋會同你講解下？

答：唔會，唔會，唔會，佢哋唔...

問：從來冇嘅？

答：從來冇。

問：因為我都想你睇一睇就係李生之前嗰呢一個委員會啲口供，我就想你睇一睇；睇完之後，想問你啲問題嘅。

答：係。

問：好唔好？如果我哋去番謄本嘅第三，係第二十四日。

主席：不如你直接讀出嚟喇。

許偉強先生：好。

問：或者我讀出嚟，...

答：係，好吖。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：...你睇下吓。咁呀佢呢度就係話，呢度佢就話--即係我有問佢嘅，就係話係咪會有啲訓練，有啲 training，咁呀亦都係有啲講解、有啲訓練，就住每一個範疇，即係例如管工或者係啲工人都會畀一個咁樣嘅 briefing，即係一啲講解，咁嘅意思。咁李生當時就話係嘅。咁我就再問嘞，就係嗰個 briefing，我係講緊第 10 頁，謄本嘅第 10 頁，係嘞，"G"嗰度再落少少，我而家去到嘅係"I"下面嘅，唔該，係嘞。咁我就講嘞--你可以睇到嘛，許生？

答：係，睇到，睇到，係，睇到。

問：咁我話「嗰個 briefing，係咪我哋--係咪即係每一個範疇分開進行嘅？即係例如水喉呢，咁就會有個 briefing；咁就其他項目呢，會有一個 briefing 咁，就唔係話全部夾埋一齊咁做，係咪呀」咁。「唔係一齊咁」，呢個就係李生嘅答案嘞，「係分開做嘅」。咁我再問嘞，「如果例如做水喉嘅講解嘅時候，係咪大概將會做水喉嘅工程之前就做呢個講解呢」咁。咁佢就答嘞，「其實佢有每一行嘅工人進場嗰陣時都會講解一次。」跟住我再問嘞，「我首先想問下先，就係通常你話嗰個範疇嘅工作進行之前就會有呢啲咁嘅講解。咁我哋知道，一般嚟講，啲食水喉嘅工程都係成個工程較後期先至開始做嘅。咁即係話如果佢第一日開始就做呢個水喉工程呢，當有啲工人嚟咗嘞，咁就會喺現場做一個講解？」咁佢就咁講嘅，佢就話「唔係，係喺個寫字樓就講解先嘅。」跟住我問嘞，「喺個寫字樓講解先。即係話例如金日，佢嘅水喉匠會唔會嚟呢？」「答：水喉匠，即係佢會打理咗之後佢嗰位林先生會喺度。」

許偉強先生：主席，因為我今朝睇番呢個謄本嘅時候，就發覺佢同英文嗰個版本係有啲出入。英文個版本就係寫咗「許宏新先生」嘅。英文嘅版本就係英文版本嘅都係第 9 頁嗰度嘅。咁我今朝亦都再聽番嗰個謄本嘅紀錄，個謄本嘅紀錄個中文就應該係講番「許宏新先生」嘅，呢度，嘍。

問：咁呢度其實--許生，佢呢度就係講緊話你會喺度嘅，佢直情講咗你個名出嚟嘅，「許宏新先生」。

答：我會喺度。

問：你會喺度嘅。首先，你睇咗呢度喇，我想問一問你，就係佢所謂嗰個

B

B

C

喺寫字樓做個講解，第一，呢個係中國建築嘅口供，...

C

D

答：係。

D

E

問：...有冇呢啲咁嘅講解呢，首先？

E

F

答：我覺得就有呢個講解。

F

G

問：你覺得有？

G

H

答：係，若果有...

H

I

問：我就想問下你實際上係有定係冇呢？

I

J

答：冇。若果係有，就係每個伙記第一日嚟，入職訓練係訓練--安全訓練
啫。

J

K

問：係咩嘢話？

K

L

答：係安全訓練。

L

M

問：安全訓練？

M

N

答：係，第一日入職，所有伙記都要做呢個動作嘅，但係只係講安全，就
唔話講--特別講水喉呢 part 嘅。

N

O

問：唔會話特別講水喉呢 part？

O

P

答：唔會。

P

Q

問：即係你嘅意思就話如果喺現場所謂嘅講解，水喉嗰方面係冇嘅，零嘅？

Q

R

答：講安全啫。

R

S

問：淨係講安全嘅啫？

S

T

答：係嘞。

T

U

問：係咪？你跟住慢慢我哋睇落去，仲有少少嘅啫，好唔好？

U

V

答：好。

V

問：咁呢度你就話--因為佢講咗你個名吓嘛，咁然後，喺後尾嗰度，我問

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

嘞，「咁張達欽先生有冇嚟㗎，嗰啲講解？」咁話「唔記得清楚佢有冇嚟。」咁後面，「喺個寫字樓度，大概有幾多工人喺度做呢個 briefing？」「因為佢工人唔係一次過一批嚟嘅，就分批嚟嘅，每次嚟例如五個或者十個，每次就做五個、十個咁做囉。」「就每一次都係咁做？」「係。」「咁每次都係彭（譯音）先生做嘅？」彭先生就係佢哋嗰位叫做即係...

答：代表。

問：係嘞，AQCC 嘅，叫做。咁彭先生，你認識嘛？

答：識。

問：識。

答：係。

問：咁佢話「係。」「每次都係彭先生做嘅？」「咁每次你都喺在場？」我問李先生。咁佢話「喺度。」「係咪？好。咁你哋都知唔知道嗰個物料係分 PLU1、PLU2」等等，咁跟住嗰個就唔使講嘞。

咁跟住如果我哋去到第 12 頁嗰度。12 頁，我大概喺“J”嗰度，就講緊松香膏嘅。睇到嘛？“J”嗰度。

答：“J”，係。

問：「問：...松香膏嘅」，見到嘛？

答：係。

問：咁呀「嗰啲你都收過啲相嘅？」「見過。」「實物，你自己有冇見過呢？」「見過。」「喺做講解嗰陣時，嗰啲實物有冇擺出嚟畀啲工人睇㗎？」「冇。」「咁就靠相？」「係呀」咁。「係咪」--咁我就再問佢嘞，「咁就係--我想問下你，就係嗰個講解過程，綠色一卷卷嗰個錫線嗰啲相呢，係咪每次都有畀工人睇㗎？」「每次都有。」「每次都有嘅？你畀工人睇嗰啲相嘅時候，彭先生有冇去解釋，啊，呢隻物料嘅成分呀？」「冇解。」「有冇講過話『喂，呢隻係無鉛焊料嚟㗎』？」「無鉛焊料有講。」跟住話「有講呀」--「有講嘅？」「有講。」「每一次都有講？」「每次都有講。」「每一次都有講。彭先生講嘅？」「係。」「咁每次講大概幾耐呀？」「大概十五至二十分鐘」咁樣。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

呢度係咁講喇。即係呢度佢就話彭先生就會同工人講解下有關啲物料，又畀相佢哋睇嘅。

首先，彭先生有同工人講解有關物料用啲乜，呢樣嘢你同唔同意？

答：我唔同意。

問：彭先生講解嘅時候有畀啲相畀工人睇，就住呢個綠色一卷卷都有畀工人睇嘅，你又同唔同意？

答：我唔同意。

問：你從來冇見過啲咁嘅事情？冇定有呀？

答：我真係唔覺見過囉。

問：唔覺見過？

答：唔。

問：我哋而家講緊當時你話有呢啲咁嘅安全訓練喇。

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：嗰啲安全訓練，係咪都係彭先生做㗎？

答：唔係，係安全部。

問：安全部做嘅？

答：係。

問：有冇見過彭先生同工人做過任何嘅講解，briefing，嗰啲呀？

答：譚先生係咪...

問：彭先生。

答：哦，彭先生。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：彭先生，對唔住。

答：彭先生，唔覺冇囉。

問：唔覺有，唔。

答：係。

問：嗰啲咁嘅安全講解，你所講嘅，畀啲工嘅，你在唔在場㗎？

答：唔在場㗎嘞，因為入職訓練，佢哋每個人第一日嚟就係一定去畀佢安
全部做個入職課程，就可能做個零、兩個鐘嘅喇，就係--獨立做㗎嘞，
第一日嗰班伙記。

問：就同所有工人一齊講嘅？

答：第一日入職嗰啲伙記。

問：第一日入職？

答：唔理邊個行頭嘅，就「壅」埋一堆，就上嗰個人職課程。

問：咁有冇機會就係如果彭先生真係有同工人講解過呢啲有關物料即係嗰
個係咪無鉛，或者畀過相佢哋睇，有冇機會你係唔知嘅呢？

答：我覺得有可能我唔知囉。

問：點解咁肯定？

答：因為嗰度係--水喉嚟講吓，我就係嗰度地盤嘅主管嚟嘅。咁佢若果有
呢啲嘢，冇理由唔通知我嘅。

問：喺地盤嗰啲做食水喉嘅工人，係咪都即係跟咗你都好多年㗎喇？

答：有少部分。

問：少部分？

答：係，有幾...

問：有啲就可能係就住嗰一次新請返嚟？

答：係嘞，係嘞。

B

B

C

問：係咪？

C

D

答：即係趕貨嗰陣時就係周圍搵人嘞。

D

E

問：你啱啱同我講過話做樣辦嘅時候，你可能有時自己會參與，自己會參與去做嗰個燒焊工程嘅。

E

F

答：嘎。

F

G

問：你有冇話特別就住燒焊工程點樣做法，同啲工人，去過啲指示佢哋嘅？

G

H

答：唔使㗎嘞，因為嗰啲全部都係師傅，佢哋識做㗎嘞。

H

I

問：識做㗎嘞？

I

J

答：係呀。

J

K

問：係咪？亦都從來冇提過用啲咩嘢料？

K

L

答：冇。

L

M

問：係咪？

M

N

答：冇。

N

O

問：喺嗰個工地現場，如果大家需要去提到焊料嘅，焊料吓，會點解形容呀，喺工地現場？

O

P

答：都係叫「錫條」。

P

Q

問：錫條？

Q

R

答：錫條。

R

S

問：你就算見到有呢一隻單度寫住「無鉛錫線」，你見到同你以前睇啲啲，即係我而家綠色一卷卷啲啲吓，就同你以前睇啲啲銀色一條條嘅，冇咁樣捲埋一齊嘅，係唔同都好喇，你如果喺形容呢個綠色一卷卷，都會叫佢做「錫條」嘅？

S

T

答：係，都係「錫條」。

T

U

問：係咪？

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係嘞。

問：我想問下你，因為我哋之前都聽過翁先生同埋林小姐嘅口供，咁我哋亦都知道就係你哋公司，即係金日，就曾經就遞過啲假單，即係假嘅送貨單畀呢個保華嘅，係有四張假嘅呢個送貨單。呢樣嘢你知唔知呀，你自己？

答：知道，聆訊之後我先至知囉。

問：聆訊？

答：係，呢幾日，早幾日。

問：早啲幾日？

答：係。

問：你先至知？

答：嘎。

問：之前呢，之前有冇公司--喺公司度聽到有關啲個消息呀？

答：冇。

問：完全冇？

答：冇。

問：你話之前喺聆訊有聽過呢個四張假單啲個問題喇。

答：唔。

問：咁你有冇同公司啲咩嘢人查證下，究竟發生咩嘢事呢？

答：都唔到我哋去查證喇。

問：冇，從來都冇問過？八卦下都有八？完全冇呀？嗯？

答：冇。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

許偉強先生：我有其他問題。

主席：唔該。有冇人有問題呀？冇人有問題。

好呀，唔該你，許先生，畀完口供。

答：好。好，唔該晒。

主席：下一位係邊一位呀？

胡先生：主席先生，我而家傳召鄒先生，係呢一個鄒師明先生，係金日工程東匯邨嘅地盤管工。

主席：好呀。

金日工程有限公司（“金日”）（中國建築（紅磡邨第二期）及保華（榮昌邨和東匯邨）的分判商）的第五證人：鄒師明（金日地盤管工（東匯邨））以本地話宣誓作供

主席：請坐。

答：唔該。

胡先生主問

問：係，鄒先生，就住今次調查委員會呢個事情，就你喺 2015 年 12 月 3 日做咗一份書面證詞嘅。咁我而家向你讀出你書面證詞嘅內容。

答：係。

鄒師明就羅文錦律師樓 2015 年 11 月 20 日信函所提出問題所作的書面證詞

- A
- B
- C 1 本人是金日工程有限公司（“金日工程”）所承判的東匯哪水喉工程的地盤管工。本人任職水喉行業超過三十年，亦是水喉科的註冊熟練技工。
- D 2 本人負責根據地盤施工進度向金日工程採購人員落柯打，要求所需數量的焊料送到地盤，再由金日工程的採購人員向東匯郡的焊料供應商即雋景建材有限公司（“雋景”）訂購。
- E
- F 3 本人在今次事件發生前並不知道用於接駁食水喉管的焊料需為無鉛。
- G 4 本人向金日工程採購人員落柯打，指示所需數量之焊料及到貨期。由於水喉行業普遍認為焊料屬於較次要的物料，在今次事件發生前，行業（包括本人）一般並未在意市場上焊料會有可能含鉛的情況，本人當時亦不知道市面上有含鉛焊料，故落柯打時並無特別提及到貨之焊料應與公司遞交房屋署的樣辦相同或焊料需為無鉛。
- H
- I
- J 5 本人當時根據地盤施工進度以電話向金日工程採購人員落柯打指示所需的焊料數量及需送到地盤的日期，再由金日工程採購部向雋景落單，雋景便會安排運輸直接將所需貨品送到地盤。由於向供應商訂貨是由金日工程的採購人員負責，本人並沒有直接聯絡或接觸雋景。於預備此書面證詞時，本人有向金日工程的採購人員查問，但他們表示已忘記有否向雋景提過焊料會用於接駁食水喉管。
- K
- L
- M 6 焊料供應商由金日工程所選擇，本人並不知道金日工程為何會選擇雋景作為焊料供應商，只知道雋景多年以來一直為金日工程的其中一個供應商。本人理解金日工程亦不清楚他們何時開始使用雋景作為焊料供應商。
- N
- O 7 因為不是由本人直接向雋景落單訂貨，而是由金日工程採購部負責，所以本人並沒有需要就訂貨向金日工程報告。雋景送貨時會附上送貨單，本人從金日工程採購部理解到，送貨後雋景會發單給金日工程作付款之用。
- P
- Q 8 本人對錫線和錫條的分別並不清楚，亦不知成份有何不同，只知道兩者都是用作銅喉及配件燒焊接駁之用。由於本人對錫線和錫條的分別並不清楚，而在今次事件發生前，行業一般並未在意市場上焊料會有可能含鉛的情況，而本人當時亦不知道市面上有含鉛焊料，所以並無特別留意實際採用的是錫條或是錫線。
- R
- S
- T 9 本人在今次事件發生前並不知道有“50 力扁錫條”，這個牌子，亦不清楚這個牌子是否含鉛。雋景沒有向我推介過這個牌子。由於之前本人並不知道錫條和錫線的成份不同，故沒有特別留意施工時用的是錫線
- U
- V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

還是錫條，本人亦不肯定本人曾參與的其他公共屋都曾否使用“50 力扁錫條”，或其他錫條。

10 本人並不知道向雋景購買的及實際所用的錫條是否含有鉛成份。

11 水喉行業在今次事件發生前普遍認為焊料屬於較次要的物料，本人當時並不清楚錫線與錫條的分別，只覺得錫線和錫條的用途一樣，亦沒有特別留意市場上焊料會有可能含鉛的情況，本人故此沒有留意所購及地盤實際所用的焊料是否含鉛。

12 每個地盤開工初期都要先做辦房（當中包括焊料樣辦）給總承建商及房屋署批核，其後施工期間，總承建商及房屋署亦會不定時巡視，但本人不知道總承建商及房屋署是否有檢查或留意用了哪種焊料及其是否含鉛。

鄒師明

2015 年 12 月 3 日

問：鄒先生，你願唔願意採納我剛才所讀出嘅書面證詞作為你呢一個調查委員會入面嘅證供？

答：願意。

問：我有少少問題想問一問你，第一就係話，你打電話返公司落 order 嘅時候，你係會點同公司嘅採購嘅人員講嘍？你話會--你係會即係焊料--你要 order 焊料嘅時候，你會點同佢哋講嘍？

答：畀錫條呀。

問：你會係叫佢哋訂錫條嘅？

答：係，全部訂錫條。

問：點樣話？

B

B

C

答：錫條呀。

C

D

問：淨係錫條？

D

E

答：嘎。

E

F

問：全部都係錫條？

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：咁另外呢，就係話你有冇指定牌子㗎？

H

I

答：冇。

I

J

胡先生：主席我有其他問題。

J

K

主席：唔該。

K

L

胡先生：唔該。

L

M

許偉強先生盤問

M

N

問：鄒生，你個證人口供都講你有個水喉科嘅大工牌㗎。

N

O

答：係。

O

P

問：係，幾時考㗎？

P

Q

答：應該九幾年喇，唔夠二零零幾，應該九幾。

Q

R

問：九幾，九幾年？係咪呀？

R

S

答：應該九幾年呀。

S

T

問：哦，咁都即係差唔多擺咗個牌都有二十年嘅喇？

T

U

答：差唔多十幾、廿年。

U

V

問：唔。

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：嘅。

問：咁我哋知道考個大工牌都要考你嗰個燒焊㗎？

答：係呀，工藝。

問：係嘞，嗰陣時考個大工牌做燒焊嗰陣時呢，你係咪都係做銅喉㗎嗰陣時？

答：有。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：嗰陣時做燒焊係用邊隻焊料呀？

答：錫條。

問：錫條？

答：係，全部錫條。

問：錫條，即係如果我哋而家講緊呢啲銀色一條條。

答：係嘞，係嘞。

問：就係呢啲嘞？

答：……（聽不清），嘅。

問：係咪呀？綠色一卷卷嘅有冇見過呀？

答：冇。

問：見過？

答：嗰陣時冇。

問：嗰陣時冇。

答：嘅。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：第一次見過呢個綠色一卷卷嘅係幾時呀？

答：近呢--呢四、五年。

問：呢四、五年？

答：嘎，呢四、五年。

問：係咪呀？唔，喺咩嘢情況下，認識到呢隻綠色一卷卷嘅諗焊料㗎？

答：嗰陣就做私人嘅嗰時呢都有。

問：做私人？私人項目？

答：私人項目。

問：即係做緊食水喉嗰陣時？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪呀？

答：係嘞。

問：嗰陣時係咪你都係做緊呢個金日㗎？金日工程公司呀？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：都係嘅？

答：唔。

問：咁呢一個你話做緊私人項目，四、五年前，第一次接觸到呢一隻，邊個畀你睇㗎？

答：即係送貨嘅嘢，近呢四、五年送呢隻嘢。

問：送貨㗎嗰陣時就擺咗呢隻料㗎嘞？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係嘞。

問：係咪呀？之前呢，就一路都係用緊啲一條條白色嘅？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪呀？

答：之前都係用錫條。

問：唔，好嘞，咁你第一次做私人項目嘅時候，見到呢隻綠色一卷卷呢，有冇啲人講過話呢隻就係無鉛咁樣呀？

答：冇，不嬲都話，講咗話錫線。

問：錫線？

答：係嘞。

問：嘎，咁就好，明白，咁個陣時啲人就叫呢一隻做錫線？

答：係，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？咁你喺嗰陣時就應該開始呢就第一次就有呢個錫線同埋錫條嘅分別嘞。

答：係，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？嗰陣時第一次知嘅？

答：就唔知道有含鉛，有冇含鉛。

問：就唔知有冇含鉛，係咪呀？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：就知道嗰個稱呼係唔同嘅？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？唔。第一次聽到話有無鉛焊料呢樣嘢係幾時呀？

答：都係冇聽過，聽過錫線呢個。到而家呢就呢單嘢有含鉛嗰時呢，嚟到

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

知道。

問：先至知？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪呀？

答：冇錯。

問：好嘞，咁我哋都聽到其他啲人嘅口供喇，咁我想問番你少少關於你嗰個工作經驗嘅。

答：係。

問：你幾時加入呢個金日工程嘍？

答：應該差唔多 2000 年呀。

問：2000 年？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：係，應該差唔多。

問：即係做咗十五、六年左右？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔。加入金日工程之前，認唔認識張先生嘍？

答：唔認識。

問：唔認識。

答：唔。

B

B

C

問：認唔認識許生㗎？許宏新？

C

D

答：唔認識。

D

E

問：都唔識？

E

F

答：都唔識。

F

G

問：唔，翁國財呢？

G

H

答：唔認識。

H

I

問：唔，林小姐呢？

I

J

答：唔認識。

J

K

問：都唔認識？

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：唔。加入金日工程之前，對金日工程所有員工都唔識嘅？

M

N

答：唔識嘅。

N

O

問：係咪呀？

O

P

答：嘍，唔識嘅。

P

Q

問：即係新人咁樣人去咁呀？

Q

R

答：係。

R

S

問：唔。你就住我哋而家講緊嗰三條邨呢，榮昌、東匯同埋紅磡。

S

T

答：係。

T

U

問：你係負責邊條邨㗎？

U

V

答：東匯。

V

問：東匯？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：淨係東匯啫？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？唔。你一加入呢個金日之後呢，你係咪都會負責話打電話上去寫字樓，即係要 order 啲料呀，咩嘢嘢，即係焊料呢，都係你負責嘅，...

答：係。

問：...係咪一開始都係㗎？

答：係，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？

答：冇錯。

問：如果講緊 2000 年嘅呢，你就未正式接觸過綠色一卷卷啲錫線㗎嘛？

答：係，冇錯。

問：一開始嘅時候。

答：嘎，嘎。

問：係咪呀？

答：唔。

問：我哋如果講番你知道咗有呢一隻錫線，綠色一卷卷嘅，之後呢，你喺公司工作嘅時候，當你要打電話返公司 order 呢啲咁嘅焊料嘅時候，你剛才答你律師問題嘅時候就話，你 order 都係講緊錫條嘅？

答：錫條，係。

問：淨係講錫條？

答：係，冇錯。

問：從來唔會提到錫線嘅？

答：唔會。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：咁我咁樣解釋啱唔啱呢？就係一路以嚟呢，你知--就算你知道咗有呢隻錫線，四、五年前，一路同公司落 order 嘅時候呢，你都係認為公司呢係落呢一隻銀色一條條個隻嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：嘎，從來唔會覺得係落緊呢個綠色一卷卷嘅。

答：係，即係簡單情形，即係而家呢，公司遞咩嘢辦呢，我都唔知呀，所以我打咗錫條，佢哋公司就知道我用咩嘢辦呀，你落咩嘢咪送咩嘢嚟囉。

問：係。

答：即係咁樣。

問：即係你嘅意思係話遞咩嘢辦，你就唔知嘅？

答：唔知。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔。你幾時第一次有聽過話原來就住啲焊料呢，係有遞辦個嗰咁，幾時第一次聽過呢樣嘢呀？

答：呢樣嘢就有問過，就係寫字樓遞辦啲啲呢，全部啲啲呢都係寫字樓先知。

問：我知道。

答：即係我地盤就唔知。

問：我知道，我就話...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：知道佢有遞辦，遞咩嘢辦呢，邊樣材料就唔知喇。

問：唔，你今日嚟畀口供喇。

答：係。

問：咁你今日嚟畀口供之前，你係都知道其實公司呢係有就住焊料呢，有遞辦呢樣嘢嘅。

答：呢樣就唔清楚。

問：你唔清楚？

答：唔清楚。

問：冇問過？

答：係，冇問...

問：冇問過？

答：...冇問過。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：你有冇同許生傾過話，呢啲焊料有冇遞辦㗎？有冇傾過下呢樣嘢呀？

答：冇㗎。

問：傾都有傾呀？

答：冇傾過。

問：唔。咁呢個鉛水事件喺舊年呢七月發生之後呢，咁有冇公司嘅同事同你傾過，嗰陣時落 order，落咗啲咩嘢 order 係關於呢個焊料，有冇問過你？

答：發生咗有。

問：發生之後有問過你嘅？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：有。

問：係咪呀？

答：問我用咩嘢材料嘅--落單落咩嘢嘢，我都直接同佢講係錫條。

問：係。

答：嘎。

問：邊個問你呀？

答：翁先生。

問：翁生？

答：係嘞。

問：佢喺寫字樓問你㗎，定係打電話問你呀？

答：打電話。

問：佢問你落 order 嗰陣時落咗乜嘢料？

答：係嘞，當時用咩嘢料。

問：等陣先，用咩嘢料㗎，定係問你落咗啲咩嘢 order 呀，關於焊料？

答：係嘞，就...

問：唔係...

答：...所以都講咗，用咩嘢--落咩嘢 order。係。

問：搞清楚先。

答：唔。

問：佢問你係話你哋用咗邊隻料，定係話你落 order 嗰陣時落咗邊隻料呀？

答：唔係，佢而家問呢，你嗰個地盤呢，而家呢件事發生咗呢，問嗰個地盤，用嗰個錫條定係錫線，用咩嘢材料，我直接答佢呢，嗰時我記得

B

B

C

呢，就係全部落錫條嘅。

C

D

問：咪住先，翁生問你嘅時候，呢個呢應該都係講緊幾個月前嘍，係咪呀？

D

E

答：係，係，發生咗嗰陣時。

E

F

問：發生之後喇，係咪？

F

G

答：嘎，嘎。

G

H

問：咁佢有提過焊--錫條同埋錫線...

H

I

答：係嘞。

I

J

問：...兩樣嘢嘅？

J

K

答：係，冇錯。

K

L

問：係咪呀？

L

M

答：唔，唔。

M

N

問：咁佢就問你，用咗邊隻料？

N

O

答：係。

O

P

問：係咪？

P

Q

答：係。

Q

R

問：即係地盤確實用咗咩嘢料。

R

S

答：係。

S

T

問：係咪呀？

T

U

答：係，冇錯。

U

V

問：咁你點同佢講嘍？

V

V

答：我直接問咪用咗錫條囉。

問：錫條。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：咁佢有冇就住你打番電話去公司 order 咩嘢料呢？

答：就...

問：問你有冇同你跟進下呢？

答：有。

問：都有嘅？

答：都係錫條。

問：都係錫條咁樣？

答：係，冇錯。

問：唔。咁佢當時有冇同你提過話要用無鉛嘅錫料呢？即係無鉛嘅焊料呢？

答：有。

問：有嘅？

答：嘎。

問：唔，咁佢有冇問你知唔知要用無鉛焊料呀，有冇問你呀？

答：有，我就答覆佢，你嗰個辦，我都記唔到，即係我打電話想佢用錫條，就係公司先知用咩嘢辦咁嘛。

問：咪住先，你話個辦記唔到？

答：嘎。

問：記唔到？

答：唔係記唔到，即係我見唔到你用咩嘢材料呀，嗰個辦。

問：見唔到？

答：係嘞，冇錯嘞。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：即係見唔到佢哋上咗啲咩嘢辦？

答：係。

問：你嘅意思係咪咁呀？

答：係嘞，係嘞，冇錯。

問：唔。咁當時翁生係咪即係都好心急呀？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：都好想知道個情況係點呀？

答：係呀，驚你--你有冇事呀，即係咁樣。

問：驚--睇下有冇事？

答：係嘞。

問：即係公司有冇事？

答：嘍，即係而家...

問：係咪呀？

答：...直接講嗰個地盤睇下有冇事，問我即係直接用咗咩嘢材料，我直接答佢錫條，嗰個時候。

問：唔，好。

答：用咗，係用咗。

問：唔，咁當時翁生有冇話，即係責備你話點解你唔知要用無鉛焊料㗎？有冇咁呀？

答：驚...

問：有冇責備你呀？

B

B

C

答：冇呀，諗住點解唔叫--冇冇遞辦呀，用嗰個辦呀，用番房署嗰個，我唔知有個遞辦咁嘛。

C

D

問：係。

D

E

答：即係我直接講用錫條。

E

F

問：我嘅問題就係話翁生當時有冇有啲責備你咁呀？

F

G

答：有，有。

G

H

問：有嘅？

H

I

答：有。

I

J

問：佢點講呀？

J

K

答：佢話「點解唔係照番房署嗰啲，我遞辦嗰隻呀」咁樣。

K

L

問：唔，咁你呢，你同佢解釋？

L

M

答：我解釋畀佢聽，我唔知道你遞辦用咩嘢嘢，之後先知。

M

N

問：你唔知佢遞辦用咩嘢嘢嘅？係咪？

N

O

答：係嘞，冇錯。

O

P

問：唔。

P

Q

答：直接就我全部用錫條。

Q

R

問：咁佢接唔接受你呢個解釋呀？

R

S

答：亦都接受。

S

T

問：接受嘅？

T

U

答：接受。

U

V

問：跟住冇再跟進落去嘞？

V

答：冇嘞。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：冇嘞？

答：係。

問：唔。除咗呢一個同翁生個對話呢，你有冇其他今日工程嘅職員呢，就向你了解，究竟當時用咗啲咩嘢料，或者係落咗啲咩嘢 order 咁呀？

答：冇。

問：冇嘅？

答：唔。跟住仲有一個老闆有打過電話嚟問過。

問：唔。

答：即係發生咗嗰時呀。

問：好。

答：係有打過。

問：我想問下你呢，記唔記得當時翁生打個電話畀你嗰陣時呀，即係一次咋嘛，係咪呀？

答：係呀。

問：一次啫？

答：嘎。

問：係咪呀？記唔記得朝早定係夜晚呀？

答：應該晏晝嘅。

問：晏晝嘅嘅？

答：應該晏晝嘅。

問：嗰陣時你喺邊呀？

答：我喺地盤。

問：喺地盤嘅？

B

B

C

答：嘅，我喺地盤，應該食飯時間，嗰陣時。

C

D

問：食飯時間。

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：食飯時間通常幾點呀？

F

G

答：我哋都十二點吓嘛。

G

H

問：十二點。

H

答：十二點，佢十二點先打電話嚟，通常有時呢，做緊嘢呢，地盤收唔到電話，收唔到電話，佢食飯時間先接收到。

I

問：食緊飯嗰陣時佢打畀你？

I

J

答：係嘞。

J

K

問：係咪呀？

K

L

答：應該就有記錯就係呢個時間嘅。

L

M

問：唔，當時有冇其他即係工人在場呀？佢打緊畀你嗰陣時？

M

N

答：都有，坐住食飯，有。

N

O

問：吓？

O

答：側邊呀，應該都有嘅。

P

問：都有嘅？

P

Q

答：嘅，其他工人都有，其他行業都有，就係嗰度㗎喇。

Q

R

問：唔，好。咁你呢個電話，翁生打完畀你之後呢，有冇--你有冇同許生溝通下，話翁生問過我呢啲嘢嗎。

R

S

答：冇，冇，呢樣嘢冇。

S

T

問：冇，都有？

T

U

答：係，冇。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：冇同公司任何一位人再傾過？

答：冇。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔。除咗電話之外，呢個電話之外，翁生有冇再就用啲咩嘢焊料個問題呀，電話又好，見面又好，再同你跟進過呢個問題㗎？

答：有，見面有，地盤佢--地盤有--有重新講過。

問：見面再重新講過？

答：係嘞。

問：即係呢個亦都係講完個電話之後嘅事嘞？

答：係，之後嘅事。

問：隔咗幾耐呀？

答：應該個零禮拜嘅。

問：個零禮拜嘅？

答：係，佢走入地盤嗰陣時。

問：走入去東匯嗰個地盤？

答：唔係東匯，我而家做緊呢個地盤...

問：啊，係，係，係，係，即係走入嗰個...

答：係。

問：...當時你做緊嗰個地盤...

答：係，冇錯。

問：...嗰個喺邊度呀？

B

B

C

答：油塘。

C

D

問：油塘。

D

E

答：係。

E

問：係，咁當時佢主動嚟搵你呀？

F

答：係。

F

G

問：咁佢問你啲...

G

H

答：淨係問嗰個焊料實際係咪正式，有冇記錯落錫條定錫線，我都話一直答佢都係錫條。

H

I

問：都係問緊錫條同埋錫線？

I

J

答：係嘞，係嘞。

J

K

問：係咪呀？

K

L

答：係嘞。

L

M

問：唔。咁仲有冇傾啲咩嘢呀？

M

N

答：冇喇。

N

O

問：吓？

O

答：佢最集中就係呢個含鉛嗰個錫線嗰個問題，其他啲啲冇問。

P

問：唔，當時傾嘅時候呢，有冇話有啲咩嘢文件睇到㗎？

P

Q

答：冇。

Q

R

問：冇嘅？

R

S

答：冇呀。

S

T

問：就咁口...

T

U

答：口頭。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：口頭講下嘅啫？

答：係，係，我打電話畀佢，佢打嚟都係口頭上。

問：唔。知唔知點解佢要再問你呢樣嘢呀？

答：即係而家佢要證明嘛，即係...

問：佢電話同你講過之後，...

答：係，即係...

問：...點解要再喺現場搵你去講呢樣嘢？

答：係，證明我正式落咗咩嘢，用咗咩嘢材料，佢要證實㗎嘛，即係咁樣情況。

問：證實呢樣嘢？

答：係嘞。

問：係咪呀？

答：冇錯。

問：咁佢有冇話番畀你聽，佢有冇同公司其他職員問過，落咗咩嘢料呀咁呀？

答：呢樣又...

問：有冇...

答：呢樣唔清楚。

問：冇，淨係問你呢個問題啫？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：好快㗎咋嘞，嗰個...

答：係嘞，係嘞。

問：...嗰個會談好快㗎咋嘞？

B

B

C

答：係，好快㗎咋。

C

D

問：係咪呀？

D

E

答：嘎。

E

F

問：幾耐嘍呀？

F

G

答：都差唔多幾分鐘嘍喇。

G

H

問：唔。

H

答：佢又趕住要去第二度呀，就傾完佢要趕住走。

I

問：你要趕住走，佢要趕住走呀？

I

J

答：唔係，翁生趕住走。

J

K

問：唔，好。嗰啲焊料呢，到地盤現場嗰陣時呢，即係我哋講緊東匯嗰個地盤現場喇。

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：送到嚟嘅時候，你會負責收貨㗎？

M

N

答：係，冇錯。

N

O

問：係咪呀？

O

P

答：係。

P

問：你會唔會簽收啲送貨單㗎？

Q

答：會。

Q

R

問：都會嘅？

R

S

答：都百分就--差唔多一百嘍係我收㗎喇，所有至到而家地盤都好少伙計收嘅。

S

T

問：係咩嘢話？咩嘢...

T

U

答：多數都係我收嘅。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：多數都係你收嘅？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？

答：百分之九十九都係我。

問：百分之九十九都係你收嘅？

答：嘎，都係我收嘅。

問：唔。你收啲啲材料喇，如果例如焊料嚟到嘞，你收貨嘅，你之前雋景會唔會通知你話，會有焊料嚟喇，叫你收貨㗎？

答：冇，唔會。

問：唔會？

答：即係有材料落到地盤，都唔會通知分邊樣打邊樣嘢。

問：係。如果我哋睇一睇，就住東匯--等陣先，就住呢個東匯邨個個送貨單，如果睇下 S1 嘅 512 頁㗎。

主席：S1？

許偉強先生：S1 嘅 212 頁。

答：212 呀？

許偉強先生：係嘞。

答：係。

問：呢個送貨單呢，見到嗎？見到嗎？

答：見到，見到，見到。

問：係嘞，咁就都係個客戶名稱，呢個都係，首先係雋景送嚟㗎喇...

B

B

C

答：等陣先。

C

D

問：...咁呀客戶名稱寫住「金日工程公司」喇。

D

E

答：係，冇錯。

E

F

問：見到嗎？

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：聯絡人寫住鍾生同埋鄒生嘅。

H

I

答：係，冇錯。

I

J

問：咁呀鄒生就係你本人喇？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

問：鍾生係咪另外一位工人呀？

L

M

答：係，冇錯。

M

N

問：係咪呀？

N

O

答：冇錯。

O

P

問：都係你--都係金日工程嘅職員嚟嘅？

P

Q

答：係。

Q

R

問：係咪？咁你就話多數呢，九十幾個 per cent 呢，都係--九十--百分之九十幾呢都係你收貨嚟嘞。

R

S

答：係，冇錯。

S

T

問：咁好似呢個就係你嘅簽名喇，係咪呀？

T

U

答：係。

U

V

問：咁你見--你收貨嘅時候呢，你會見到例如嗰啲咁嘅，如果假設係焊料咁講先喇。

V

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：焊料嘅都係一盒盒咁嚟嘍嘛。

答：係，冇錯，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？

答：冇錯，一盒盒。

問：一盒盒咁嚟嘍。

答：係。

主席：呢個，我想問呢，呢個 212 頁嗰個第三個貨品呢，銀焊枝。

答：係。

主席：你愛嚟做咩嘢嘍？就你所知？

答：呢啲銀焊枝呢就三吋以上呢，八十以上呢，我用呢--呢隻銀焊枝嚟燒嘍。

主席：唔。

答：嗰啲喉呀，即係大喉嗰啲呢，細條用番錫條。

主席：咁呢度寫住銀焊枝，咁你就知道佢係...

答：就燒嗰啲大喉嘍。

主席：燒大喉我知。

答：係嘞，冇錯。

主席：咁你知唔知佢嘅成分係咩嘢呀？

答：唔知。

主席：唔知嘍？

答：知道佢燒喉啫。

B

B

C

主席：哦，咁你知唔知佢係銀嚟㗎？

C

D

答：知，有兩--一個銅，一個銀咁嘛。

D

E

主席：係。

E

F

答：兩樣都燒得㗎嘛，...

F

G

主席：銀焊...

G

H

答：...都係一樣。

H

I

主席：咁佢有冇鉛㗎？

I

J

答：唔知。

J

K

主席：咁另外嗰個 50 力呢？咁你知唔知佢係咩嘢呀？

K

L

答：50 力未見過㗎。

L

M

主席：未見過呀？

M

N

答：嗰時候知道係錫條咋㗎。

N

O

主席：哦。

O

P

答：嘎。

P

Q

主席：咁你即係 50 力，個力字你又唔知咩嘢意思嘅？

Q

R

答：唔知，唔知。

R

S

主席：呢個銀焊枝就知道係銀嚟㗎嘞？

S

T

答：係嘞，一個銅，一個銀。

T

U

主席：得，繼續㗎。

U

V

問：咁如果我哋睇下其中一張發票呢，...

V

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：...就如果我哋睇下 210 頁吖。

答：210 呀？

問：唔。

答：呢張呀？

講者（無法辨別）：係。

答：係。

問：鄒生，首先呢，我咁樣講啱唔啱呢，一般嚟講呢，你都係收到送貨單嘅啫？

答：係。

問：你好少會睇到發票嘅。

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：啱。

問：如果我睇到呢張發票呢，咁上面呢，就係寫住「英國 50 力扁錫條」嘅咁。

答：唔。

問：一般嚟講，如果有發票嘅話呢，都應該係有送貨單嘅。

答：唔。

問：即係我哋知道，咁我想問下你，你收東匯邨個送貨單嘅時候呢，你都會睇下張單係寫啲乜嘢㗎嘛，即係你會望一望㗎？

答：單就有，而家呢我都落--早排呢排用咗咩嘢嘢呢，落咗咩嘢嘢呢，來到嗰個數量，好似錫條幾多盒，我對啱都係有簽番嘞。

問：係，冇錯，冇錯。

答：邊樣材料，係。

B

B

C

問：咁好似如果好似 212 頁咁咩，送貨單嚟到，咁你都會望一望張送貨單係講緊啲乜嘢，...

C

D

答：有冇個樣嘢。

D

E

問：...係咪呀？

E

F

答：係，係嘞。

F

G

問：有啲乜嘢。

G

H

答：係，冇錯。

H

I

問：跟住你先會簽收㗎？

I

J

答：係嘞，冇錯。

J

K

問：係咪呀？

K

L

答：係，啱。

L

M

問：咁我係想知道呢，一樣嘢嘅啫，就係你喺東匯邨，簽啲送貨單嘅時候，你記唔記得你簽啲送貨單呢，有啲呢都係寫住「50 力扁錫條」㗎？

M

N

答：唔...

N

O

問：記唔記得呀？

O

P

答：唔記得。

P

Q

問：唔記得？

Q

R

答：係。

R

S

問：唔，即係話你例如你簽個送貨單之前，你會唔會對下，送咗啲咩嘢嘢嚟呀。

S

T

答：對。

T

U

問：會對㗎嘛？

U

V

答：對。

V

B

B

C

問：係咪呀？

C

D

答：對嗰個數量。

D

E

問：對嗰個數量嘅啫，...

E

F

答：係嘞。

F

G

問：...係咪呀？

G

H

答：嘎。

H

I

問：即係對下有幾多盒？

I

J

答：係嘞，...

J

K

問：係咪呀？

K

L

答：...冇錯，冇錯。

L

M

主席：就唔會對咩嘢貨，係咪咁嘅意思？

M

N

答：唔會，唔會，啲錫條來到，有幾多盒就--對到幾多盒就會簽㗎喇。

N

O

問：亦都唔會睇牌子嘅？

O

P

答：唔會。

P

Q

問：係咪呀？

Q

R

答：嘎。

R

S

主席：咁你喺東匯邨，想問下呢，有冇試過兩溝用呀？

S

T

答：冇。

T

U

主席：冇呀？

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：記--照我記憶就有，由做辦房到尾都係用錫條。

主席：唔，即係有試過兩溝用？

答：嘅。

問：你自己有冇喺東匯邨呢，做燒焊個工序呀？

答：有。

問：有嘅？

答：嘅。

問：辦房有冇做呀？

答：有。

問：唔，除咗辦房之外呢？

答：其他都有。

問：其他你都有幫手做嘅？

答：嘅，其他都有。

問：唔。所有你負責做嘅燒焊嘅工程呢，你都係用銀色呢啲一條條嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：係，冇錯。

問：記唔記得呢啲一條條，有冇呢啲咁嘅盒送嚟㗎？

答：有，一盒一盒。

問：咁樣嘅形狀嘅盒？

答：係，一盒。

B

B

C

問：記唔記得呀？

C

D

答：記得。

D

E

問：記唔記得上面有貼紙寫住「英國 50 力扁錫條」呀？

E

F

答：唔多覺。

F

G

問：唔多覺？

G

H

答：唔多覺。

H

I

問：係咪呀？

I

J

答：係。

J

K

問：但係記得呢，有啲咁樣長身嘅盒？

K

L

答：係嘞，冇錯嘞，一樣嘅。

L

M

問：打開就係呢啲一條條嘅？

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：你喺東匯現場呀。

O

P

答：唔。

P

Q

問：現場嘅時候呀。

Q

R

答：唔。

R

S

問：你有冇曾經見過，唔係話你--唔使話你有冇用先吓，有冇見過呢啲綠色一卷卷嘅？

S

T

答：冇，冇。

T

U

問：從來冇見過？

U

V

答：冇，嗰時冇。

V

問：唔。你喺今日工程呢工作喇，呢段期間呢，除咗東匯，你有冇都負責過其他啲公共屋邨嘅工程㗎？

B

B

C

答：有。

C

D

問：都有嘅？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：講唔講得出名呀？

F

G

答：好似虎地嗰邊呀，葵涌嗰度都有。

G

H

問：邊度話？

H

I

答：葵涌呀。

I

J

問：葵涌？

J

答：嘅，同埋屯門嗰邊。

K

問：屯門？

K

L

答：嘅。

L

M

問：係咪呀？

M

答：屯門嗰個虎地呀。

N

問：咁嗰兩個工程入面呢，有冇見過呢啲咁嘅綠色一卷卷嘅...

N

O

答：冇，冇。

O

P

問：都有？

P

Q

答：嘅。

Q

R

問：都淨係見過銀色一條條啫？

R

答：係嘞，我就...

S

問：係咪呀？

S

T

答：...全部錫條係嗰隻。

T

U

問：唔。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：即係換句話嚟講，你除咗係...

答：呢幾年，呢四、五年。

主席：四、五年私人項目見過呢個...

答：就開始，係。

主席：...綠色之外，你喺咁多次嘅公屋工程裏面，從來都有見過呢個綠色？

答：冇，冇。

主席：冇？

答：嘍。

主席：做辦房又冇，乜都有？

答：乜都有，所以用到潛意識嘞，都係全部錫條。

主席：好呀。

問：我想問下你呢，你剛才就講過話翁生就喺事件即係發生咗之後，打過電話一次畀你，又上過去一個地盤，就搵過你。

答：係。

問：就傾關於錫條、錫線嘅事情嘅，係咪呀？

答：係，冇錯。

問：我想問下你呢，你做你而家呢份口供嘅時候呢，做口供做緊嘅時候，或者之前，有冇再同番金日工程任何一位人士傾番呢個焊料嘅事情呀？

答：冇。

問：冇嘅？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇。

問：係咪呀？做完口供之後，到你今日嚟呢個調查委員會畀口供嘞。

答：係。

問：中間呢段時間，又有冇人同你傾過關於，即係公司入面，有冇人同你傾過關於呢啲錫條呀、錫線呀個分別呀，用咗邊隻呀嘅事呢？

答：老闆有。

問：吓？

答：老闆。

問：老闆有，係咪呀？

答：張先生有。

問：張生有同你講過？

答：係嘞，冇錯嘞。

問：張生當時都係想理解番個情況喇？

答：係，係，冇錯，冇錯。

問：你講老闆有同你傾過呢，呢個應該係咪呢幾個禮拜嘅事呀？

答：即係鉛水事件正式有啲時，即係東匯呀，驗出嚟有啲陣時都開始問，傾過呢樣嘢。

問：傾過呢樣嘢嘅？

答：係嘞，冇錯嘞。

問：唔，即係都係同翁生問你嗰個時間...

答：一樣。

問：...差唔多？

答：差唔多，差唔多。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：差唔多。

答：即係正式佢--我落咗咩嘢材料去做，我直接講番畀佢聽。

問：慢慢嚟吖。

答：係。

問：張生就係話，佢都係翁生咁上下差唔多時間...

答：係。

問：...嚟到問你嘅？

答：係，打電話...

問：打電話問你嘅？

答：打電話問。

問：打電話問你，問過你幾多次呀？

答：都有兩、三次呀，畀起正式話...

問：有兩、三次㗎？

答：有兩、三次呀，係呀。

問：兩、三次都係打電話嘅？

答：都係同佢傾呢樣嘢。

問：唔，好嘞。當時張生打畀你嘅時候呀...

答：唔。

問：...佢有冇即係好勞氣呀？

答：有，責怪我哋，點解唔用番正式嗰隻嘢，我都...

問：直情話你？

答：嘎。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：即係話你嘅？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？唔，咁你又點解釋畀佢聽呀？

答：即係我解釋畀佢聽，我而家--你房署遞辦，有冇遞辦我唔知，我落就係落錫條呀，就係呢樣嘢。

問：慢慢嚟先吓。

答：嘎。

問：佢話佢有責備你。

答：係。

問：就話落錯料，係咪？

答：嘎。

問：咁佢當時有冇同你解釋話，其實我哋冇人過辦㗎，要用邊隻㗎，有冇講呀？

答：有。

問：有？

答：有。

問：係咪呀？咁佢話要用邊隻呀？

答：佢話用錫線囉。

問：錫線？

答：嘎。

問：佢當時有冇特別去提無鉛錫線呀？

答：有。

問：要用無鉛呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：佢話嗰個錫線，佢話而家綠色呢卷就無鉛。

問：無鉛嘅，係咪呀？

答：嘎。

問：唔。咁佢當時係咪好嬲呀？

答：係。

問：好嬲呀？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？咁你就解釋畀佢聽，就話你唔知道人咗辦係乜？

答：冇錯，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：咁跟住佢點呀？佢個反應係點呀？

答：佢咪就係咁樣責怪囉。

問：唔。

主席：佢話咩嘢話？聽唔到呀。

答：即係責怪我，點解你唔跟番嚟做，我呢樣嘢跟番你個遞辦呢，你寫字樓先知，我--冇冇遞辦我唔知。

主席：係。

答：落單我就落錫條呀，即係咁樣，我直話直講，我做咗咩嘢嘢就話番畀佢聽囉。

問：我想問下你呢，張生第一次打畀你...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：...責備你喇，話落錯咗料嗰可能，落錯咗 order 嗰。

答：係。

問：呢個呢，係翁生打畀你，第一次，講關於錫條、錫線呢樣嘢...

答：係。

問：...之前定係之後呀？

答：之後。

問：之後？

答：之後呀。

問：即係翁生搵你先嘅？

答：係，冇錯，冇錯。

問：係咪？

答：佢第一時間就翁生搵先嘅。

問：唔，翁生搵你之後大概隔咗幾耐張生先至搵你呀？

答：應該有個零禮拜。

問：個零禮拜嘅？

答：嘍，應該有個零禮拜。

問：即係差唔多係...

答：即係上上下下喇，嗰陣時咁。

問：唔，即係差唔多係翁生第二次話同你傾，就係佢嚟到地盤搵你同你傾？

答：係。

問：嗰段時間呢...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：都係嗰段時間。

問：...就係張生搵你嘞？

答：係嘞，冇錯。

問：張生第一次搵你係翁生第二次搵你之前定之後，記唔記得呀？

答：呢個又唔記得清楚。

問：唔係好記得。

答：嘍，唔記得清楚。

問：唔，咁你剛才就話喺電話度同張生解釋咗，你都唔知上咗辦嘅咁。

答：係。

問：咁佢又點呀？佢點回應呀？

答：都係勞氣囉。

問：勞氣？

答：嘍。

問：都係話你唔啱㗎嘞？

答：係，都係...

問：係咪呀？

答：係呀，都係責備囉，即係咁囉。

問：哦，咁你有冇當時覺得點解老闆會咁樣責備你呢，你都唔知發生咩嘢事，有冇你當時個心情會唔會咁諗呢，我唔知上咗辦個嘢，你仲鬧我，好似唔係咁...

答：唔係，自己都有--有啲心唔安樂㗎，你咁樣鬧法咁樣鬧，我直接落咗咩嘢就咩嘢，嗰個自己啲心都會有啲唔舒服㗎嘞，唔使講喇。

問：有啲唔舒服㗎嘞，係咪呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：老闆有冇經常鬧你㗎？

答：冇。

問：呢次算唔算係其中一--即係...

答：係。

問：係好罕有嘅一次鬧你？

答：係，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？

答：係，冇錯。

問：唔，咁你嘅心中都唔舒服喇，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔，咁你當時有冇覺得，再需要澄清下呢，因為你講咗嗰個解釋之後呢，老闆都好似繼續責備你㗎，咁你覺得仲需唔需要搞清楚件事呢？

答：冇喇，自己都係--落咗嗰樣就係嗰樣，我都話咗畀佢聽㗎喇。

問：吓？

答：我話落咗錫條就係錫條㗎喇嗰陣時。

問：係...

答：都係自己有--有責任錯㗎喇，嗰陣時，係咪呀？

問：唔好，你呢度唔好講住，你話當時都落咗錫條喇？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：嘎。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：件事就有得返轉頭㗎喇，都落咗，...

答：係呀，冇錯喇，定咗局喇。

問：...都用咗喇，係咪？

答：嘎。

問：但係對你自己嚟講，你都想--即係唔好--你都唔想喺老闆面前佢覺得你做錯嘢㗎？

答：係。

問：啱唔啱？

答：嘎。

問：老闆又唔係經常話你㗎嘛，呢次係好少有地話你㗎。

答：冇錯。

問：咁你有冇覺得，再需要澄清下，話真係唔關我事個㗎，點解你唔再澄清下呢？

答：冇，我就係講呢樣嘢，就係我就落咗錫條，你遞咩嘢辦我唔知，即係我照單，我需要咩嘢材料我就照打電話上去嘞，呢樣我就解釋畀佢聽嘅。

問：唔。

答：係。

問：咁但係你之前呢，你又講話都係覺得自己有責任？

答：嘎。

問：係咪呀？

答：係囉，即係大佬，你既然落得都係有啲--唔啱啲啲咪有責任囉。

問：即係你覺得自己都做錯嘢嘅？

答：呢咁--咁樣有呢樣嘢出嚟就係自己都係錯㗎喇。用錫條。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：點解自己有錯呢？你又唔知遞邊隻料做嗰個錫--嗰個焊料嘅，咁你又一路都係淨係知道錫條嘅，點解覺得自己有做錯呢？

答：唔係，你而家就呢單鉛水事件出來嗰陣時呀，你落咗錫條都係定為錯㗎喇，係咪呀？

問：唔係，唔好講公司先。

答：嘅。

問：我哋唔好講公司，大圍係有做錯先。

答：係。

問：我講緊你自己本人。

答：係。

問：你自己本人覺得你有冇責任先？

答：責任就有，除非你用咗錫條都係有責任㗎喇，定為喇。

問：你覺得你自己有冇落錯 order 呢？

答：當時嗰時就有。一路，行家一路用嚟都用錫條嘅。嗰時當時都係有。

問：好嘞...

答：發生咗就自己嗰個感覺都係咁㗎喇。

問：冇錯嘅？自己有錯㗎嘛？

答：係嘞，冇錯嘞。

問：係咪？好肯定呢樣嘢吖，係咪呀？咁你話張生打畀你，好勞氣，怪責你。

答：唔。

問：你解釋畀佢聽，你都唔知上咗辦，要落邊隻料。

答：係，冇錯。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：佢都好似唔係好信咁呀？

答：係，冇錯。

問：都仲係鬧你。

答：嘎。

問：咁你自己明明冇錯咁嘛，咁你唔覺得需要再同老闆解釋咩？

答：都係解釋呢樣嘢喇，你一個老闆，我一個下屬，冇得好嗌㗎喇，我哋就係解㗎--解釋到--係解釋呢樣嘢畀佢聽㗎喇。

問：即係老闆就算唔--唔聽你嘅解釋，你都要哽咗佢㗎嘞？

答：都係呢樣嘢。

問：係咪咁呀？

答：係嘞，都係--我都係落咗錫條呀。

問：唔，好嘞，你話張生就都打過幾次同你傾呢件事？

答：係。

問：係咪？啱啱我哋講咗第一次啫。

答：係。

問：咁呀第二次係幾時，佢再問番你呢件事呢？

答：應該都係有個零禮拜，冇記錯...

問：之後？

答：...記得我就好似有記佢打過三次嚟問，正式係唔係...

問：總共打過三次嚟？

答：係。

問：我哋講咗第二次先吓。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：噏。

問：第二次同第一次隔咗幾耐呀？個零禮拜呀？

答：應該個零禮拜嘍。

問：唔。

答：你知道老闆嗰個人呢，責任心好大，所以要搞清楚，問清楚呢樣嘢，就咁樣樣。

問：好，好，問埋你第一次先，第一次你記唔記得佢打嚟嗰陣--打畀你嗰陣時呢，你喺--你話你喺邊度呀？

答：都係食飯時間。

問：都係喺地盤嘅？

答：地盤呀。

問：都係食飯時間？

答：都係地盤。

問：都係十二點幾嗰啲時間？

答：係嘞，冇錯，一般我哋做管工呢，有時我周圍行呢，有電話收唔到嘛，收唔到嘅，...

問：明白。

答：...多數係食飯嗰段時間，搵我都係嗰個時間搵呀。

問：好嘞，唔。第二次老闆再再打畀你，...

答：係。

問：...係唔係你都喺地盤嗰陣時？

答：都喺地盤，係，我都喺地盤。

問：係咪都係咁上下時間呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：都係。

問：唔。

答：差唔多時間呀。

問：好嘞，咁佢嗰次打嚟又點呢？

答：又係問呢樣，正式吖。

問：吓？

答：你記唔記--有冇記清楚正式係用錫線定錫條。都係重複呢樣嘢，三次都係呢樣。

問：有冇記清楚錫條同埋錫線，但係你應該第一次同佢講嗰陣時，都同佢講得好清楚㗎嘛？

答：都講過，係嘞，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔。當時咁佢嘅語氣又點呢？係咪都係責備你咁嘅語氣呢？

答：都溫和啲囉

問：溫和。

答：既然第一次到嗰度呢都--佢再嘗試了解係咪正式係落咗錫條，佢呢一樣嘅。

問：即係最惡死係第一次，第二次就溫和啲？

答：係嘞。第二、第三次就溫和㗎嗰陣時。

問：溫和啲，好嘞。第二次再問你落咗錫條定係錫線。

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：咁當時老闆有冇再提「無鉛」呢兩個字呢？

答：冇嘞，嗰陣時呀，又係總言之... (聽不清) 用咗咩嘢材料嗰陣時呀，
嘎。

問：唔。咁你嘅答覆呢？

答：都係錫條。

問：都係錫條，係咪呀？

答：嘎，三次都係錫條嘅，答覆佢。

問：唔。咁佢有冇--你講完錫條之後，咁佢仲有冇再跟進呀？

答：都有嘞。

問：咁好快㗎咋嗰，嗰個電話會談？

答：係呀，一陣間咋嘛。

問：好快就有嘞？

答：係呀，嘎，一分鐘多--多--左右嗰陣時講嘢。

問：唔，好。

答：嘎。

問：咁第三次又隔咗幾耐呢？

主席：其實呢--對唔住呀，鄒生，其實你老闆都唔使問你個嗰，老老實實，
因為你入咗金日咁耐，你都未用過錫線。

答：佢唔係，你知道我老闆嗰個責任心好重㗎嘛，...

主席：唔係，我講，.....

答：...主要搞清楚呢樣嘢，... (聽不清) 用佢話。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：即係你入咗去金日咁耐，你都未用過錫線㗎嘛。

答：係。

主席：你由頭到尾咁多年都係淨係 order 一樣嘢㗎咋嘛。

答：係，冇錯。

主席：咁佢唔使問你㗎。

答：嘎。

主席：佢問上高落 order 嗰啲小姐咪已經--都唔使問添嘞。

答：佢而家都係--老人家都係問清楚佢睇下有冇... (聽不清) 用呢，嘎。

主席：即係問都無調咩，得一樣嘢㗎咋嘛，問嚟做乜嘢？

答：唔。

主席：唔需要問㗎。

答：嘎。

主席：係咪呀？因為得一樣嘢咋嘛，你咁多年都係，喂，我跟開你公司嘅做法，做開咁多年都係做--叫啲一隻貨物，永遠都係送啲一隻貨物，冇錯過呀，冇嘢好問㗎。

答：佢而家老人家個心情又唔係咁嘅呢，嘎，即係咁講。

主席：我知呀，唔，得，繼續咩，嘎。

問：好，最後問一問你，第三次嘞。

答：係。

問：第三次又同第二次隔咗幾耐呢？

答：都係差唔多時間呀，好似--唔記得，好似唔夠一個禮拜。

問：都係唔夠一個禮拜？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：嘅。

問：又係食晏嗰陣時打嚟呀？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：冇錯，都係食晏時打嚟，反正我都係多數食晏。

問：咁個語氣都係溫和啲嘅？

答：溫和好多呀。

問：溫和好多嘅？比第二次更...

答：嘅，即係第一次佢本來就係語氣冇咁樣，第二、第三次都溫和好多呀
嗰時。

問：即係第三同埋第二次個語氣都差唔多嘅？

答：係嘞，冇錯呀。

問：唔。咁佢又點再問你呢又？

答：因為幾樣嘢，你金日係咪落番個樣嘢囉，即係總言之兩次都係重複呢
樣嘢。

問：噏，咪住先吓，第三次，佢有冇提別提到錫條同埋錫線呀，有冇講呀？

答：冇，冇嘞，嗰陣時冇嘞。

問：冇呀？

答：嘅，冇嘞，第一次有嘅。

問：咁佢點講呀，記唔記得番起佢點講呀當時？

答：佢當時咪問我「嗰時咩嘢正式你東匯嗰個--東頭--嗰陣時唔係東匯，
係東頭邨。...

問：係，東頭邨，係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：...有冇--落錫線定錫條，你要搞清楚先呀，記得係唔係呀？」

問：噏，你...

答：噏，我答覆佢都係錫條。

問：你剛才就話佢應該冇再講錫條，同埋錫線㗎嘞。

答：冇講，係。

問：你啱啱又話「喂，究竟係錫條定係錫線呢？」究竟佢冇講錫條同埋錫線呀，第三次？

答：佢而家第三次都係搞清啲啲材料呀，用咗咩嘢呀，我都係答覆佢都係錫條呀，嗰陣時。

問：唔。

答：噏。佢... (聽不清) 住呢樣嘢咋嘛，噏。

問：佢冇同你講喂，點解要再三追你呢件事呀？

答：冇。

問：冇嘅？

答：冇，噏。

問：咁你係答番佢同樣個答案？

答：同樣答案，三樣都係同樣答案。

問：跟住佢又收線嘞？

答：係嘞，冇錯，噏。

問：係咪呀，就有嘞？

答：冇嘞。

問：唔。你喺呢一個--今日你畀呢個--即係你今天嚟到喇，...

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：...畀證供之前呢，咁有冇你自己同啲採購部嘅同事了解下當時落 order 嘅情況係點呀？例如同林小姐有冇傾過吓之前？

答：冇，冇。

問：一句都冇講過？

答：冇。

問：冇講過？

答：係。

問：完全？

答：冇。

問：肯定？

答：係。

問：肯定？

答：冇。

問：莫小姐呢？

答：冇。

問：都冇？

答：係。

問：唔。除咗嗰兩次同阿翁生傾講話落咗啲咩嘢 order 呢件事呢，...

答：唔，係。

問：...喺你今日嚟畀證供之前，有冇再同阿翁生商討過關於呢啲焊料嘅問題呀？

答：冇。

問：冇？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇。

問：唔。知唔知道公司曾經有人呢有畀過四張假單出嚟呀？

答：唔。

問：知唔知呀？

答：唔知。

問：從來都唔知？

答：唔知，係來上庭呢度聽到，我就知嘞。

問：唔。

答：嘎。

問：聽到之後有冇話同公司任何人去了解一下呢件事呀？

答：冇。

問：冇。

答：佢高層嗰啲嘢，我哋低層都唔會過問嗰啲嘢㗎喇。

問：唔，係。

許偉強先生：冇其他問題。

主席：有冇人有問題呀？

黎先生：我想問一個問題嘅。阿鄒生。

答：係。

黎先生：你頭先講過就話嗰啲私人樓呢，喺金日做嗰啲呢，係有用呢係錫線嘅。

答：係，呢幾年係有呀。

B

B

C

黎先生：咁你知唔知點解有個分別，點解私人樓就用錫線，公屋就用錫條呢？

C

D

答：唔係，私人--我哋落料呢，打番嘅都係錫線。

D

E

黎先生：私人樓？

E

F

答：嘎，都係錫線。

F

G

黎先生：係用錫線？

G

H

答：用咗咩嘢--帶咩嘢辦呢，佢就落番咩嘢版畀我做所有嗰啲材料，即係咁。

H

I

黎先生：哦，即係喺嗰個公司決定咗私人樓用錫線，就用錫線？

I

J

答：嘎，係嘞，冇錯嘞。

J

K

黎先生：嘎，嘎。

K

L

答：即係咁樣情形呀。

L

M

黎先生：咁你覺得兩...

M

N

答：而家每樣材料個大辦我哋都唔知，我哋落 order，好似個銅配件。嘎，你用咗邊間，我打落去用咩嘢數量，咪邊間帶個辦，咪送邊間啲嘢來囉。

N

O

黎先生：Okay。

O

P

答：即係咁樣，嘎。

P

Q

黎先生：唔噃。你自己有冇用過錫線㗎？

Q

R

答：有。

R

S

黎先生：自己做有用過？

S

T

答：有，呢幾年都有喇，嘎。

T

U

黎先生：就係私人樓嗰陣時？

U

V

答：風煤呀、銀焊枝呀，乜都有喇呢幾年。而家...

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

黎先生：咁用起上嚟，兩種有冇分別呀？

答：錫線同埋錫條冇咩嘢分別嘅。

黎先生：冇咩嘢分別？

答：噯，問題錫條呢，一過咗火就容易流，就用料犀利啲，錫線就有咁嘅料，即係咁嘅情形。

黎先生：唔，唔。即係冇咁嘅料？

答：係嘞，佢個火呢，錫條呢火溫呢就低啲㗎嘛，低啲你一過左火呢，嗰啲錫條全部走晒嘞。

黎先生：唔，唔。

答：即係咁樣情形嘞。

黎先生：好，唔該。

答：噯。

主席：我想跟進下嘅，你係咪想跟進呀？

許偉強先生：係。

主席：不如我問完先喇，睇下你--我想問下你，噯，你就頭先答阿黎先生個問題。

答：係。

主席：你嘅意思，即係喺嗰個私人項目...

答：係。

主席：...你呢，打電話上去畀公司嘅時候呢，你都係話要錫條嘅，不過公司就送咗呢啲咁樣樣，一卷卷嘅錫線嚟，係咪咁呀？

答：係，冇錯，冇錯。所以呢，整到番來呢，送到來嗰陣時呢，嗰陣我會問呀，打番電話問番呀，你話帶咗呢隻辦嘅，又用番呢隻。

主席：咁跟住公司就話畀你聽啊，我哋入咗呢一隻辦，...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係嘞。

主席：...所以呢，雖然你就話要錫條，不過公司都係送錫線畀你。

答：係。

主席：就呢個就私人項目？

答：係。

主席：咁公屋項目呢，你就打電話上去，都係叫錫條。

答：係。

主席：不過呢，送嚟嘅呢就唔係呢一啲一卷卷嘅項目？

答：係。

主席：即係唔係一卷卷嘅呢個錫線。

答：係。

主席：就送嚟啲就變咗一盒盒啲錫條嘞？

答：係。

主席：係咪咁樣嘅情況呀？

答：係，冇錯，冇錯。

主席：唔。

答：佢呢幾年就開始用呢隻嘞，呢四、五年，嘎。

主席：所以你嘅意思就話，即係無論公屋又好、私人嘅項目又好，你呢就從來都唔知道公司究竟係交咗啲乜嘢辦上去畀個承建商嘅，個總承建商嘅？

答：係嘞，冇...

主席：即係就你嚟講？

答：...--冇錯，冇錯。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：咁所以你每一次就係根據--即係究竟嚟啲乜嘢貨呢，就純粹係公司就點樣樣同個供應商就去訂啲傾嚟嘞？

答：係嘞，冇錯。你用咩嘢辦咪我哋用咩嘢囉，嘎，即係咁樣。

主席：即係就住你嚟講呢，你就只係需要知道錫條同埋個數量，就係咁多嘞？

答：係嘞，冇錯嘞。

主席：唔，得。

許偉強先生補問

問：一個問題啫，就係你剛才話嚟私人嘅項目嗰度，有見到呢啲喇。

答：係。

問：我想問下你私人項目嘅時候呢，喺現場呀，地盤呀，有冇同時間見到綠色一卷卷，同埋銀色一條條一齊㗎？

答：冇，冇。

問：唔會嘅？

答：房委絕對唔會呀。

問：淨係一隻嘅啫？

答：係嘞。呢幾年呢你用咩嘢材料，就係批咗嗰隻送來呢，你係嗰隻就係嗰隻㗎，都唔會溝呀。好似而家--頭先我做東匯嗰個錫條都係，呢度係錫條，都唔會溝。即係咁樣，即係... (聽不清) 咗咩嘢嚟，你--公司送嚟都係用嗰隻㗎嘞。

問：唔。你有見過嚟任何其他例如公屋嘅工程入面呢係用兩溝嘅錫料嘅？

答：冇。

問：公屋冇？

答：我本身我做就係冇。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：你自己有參與過就有？

答：係嘞，冇錯嘞。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔該。

林國輝先生盤問

問：我有幾條問題想問一問你。你可唔可以去一去睇睇 P1 嘅 5，page 係 242，有啲圖片我想畀你睇睇。鄒生，呢度就係佢哋做辦房嘅時候，或者做呢個模擬嘅時候呢，就做咗呢啲咁嘅工序，係一啲圖片嘅啫。我想你睇睇 245，21 同埋 23 兩個圖片。

答：係。

問：見唔見到呀？

答：見到，見到。

問：如果你見到嘅時候，你睇見呢佢哋--呢個工人做嘅時候呢，佢係擺咗枝--我唔知呢個係焊條定係焊線，但係總之係擺咗一條出嚟，...

答：係。

問：...cut 咗出嚟做嘅，係咪？睇唔睇到？

答：睇到，嘎。

問：如果你去做私人項目嘅時候用呢個焊線呢，都係會咁樣 cut 咗出嚟咁樣去做嘍嘛，係咪？

答：係，冇錯。

問：呢個係一個普通嘅工序，...

答：係。

B

B

C

問：...就係會--亦都係會攤住一個手套？

C

D

答：係。

D

E

問：而係會做，就唔怕有任何熱力嘅，係咪呀？

E

F

答：係，冇錯，冇錯。

F

G

問：無論你係做焊條或者焊線，呢個都係同樣嘅工序嚟嘅？

G

H

問：即係 cut 咗出嚟，然之後咁樣樣做？

H

I

答：係，啱。

I

J

問：因為方便咁嘛，係咪？

J

K

答：係。

K

L

林國輝先生：主席，我有其他問題。

L

M

主席：唔該晒，鄒先生，畀完證供，你可以走得，唔該。

M

N

答：好，唔該晒，唔。

N

O

主席：唔。仲有冇證人嚟？有嘍，係咪呀？

O

P

許偉強先生：跟住應該係阿 Patrick Wong。

P

Q

主席：哦，得，我哋休息十分鐘先，好唔好呀？

Q

R

許偉強先生：好，好。

R

S

上午 11 時 59 分聆訊押後

S

T

中午 12 時 16 分聆訊繼續

T

U

出席人士如前。

U

V

V

胡文俊先生：Mr Chairman, Mr Commissioner, 我而家傳召黃錦文先生，係金日工程嘅工程人員。

金日工程有限公司（“金日”）（中國建築（紅磡邨第二期）及保華（榮昌邨和東匯邨）的分判商）的第六證人：黃錦文（金日工程人員）宣誓繼續作供

胡文俊先生繼續主問

問：黃先生。

答：係。

問：喺呢一個文件夾 L1 入面第 134 頁。就呢一個調查委員會嘅程序呢，就係作咗一個書面證詞嘅。我而家向你讀出你嘅書面證詞。

答：係。

黃錦文就羅文錦律師樓 2015 年 12 月 10 日信函所提出問題所作的書面證詞

1 本人是金日工程有限公司（“金日工程”）的工程人員，主要負責聯絡項目工程的相關單位及做糧單上糧，亦有參與寫字樓的日常文職工作。

2 本人中五畢業，於 1996 年加入金日工程。本人有時候會幫忙林麗瓊女士或莫慧賢女士接聽地盤管工落水喉物料柯打的電話，本人會向林麗瓊女士或莫慧賢女士轉述地盤管工的要求，再由她們向相關供應商下訂單。本人並不負責向供應商採購水喉物料。

3 紅磡邨二期、東匯邨和榮昌邨（“三個受影響屋邨”）水喉工程的焊料，不是由本人負責向雋景建材有限公司（“雋景”）採購，金日工程與雋景之往來文件／訂單加了本人的名字主要是提供多一個聯絡人方便雋景與金日工程聯絡。但按本人記憶本人實際上並沒有參與三個受影響屋邨就採購焊料或向雋景下相關訂單的工作。

4 本人在今次事件發生前知道用於接駁食水喉管的焊料需為無鉛。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

5 由於許宏新先生及鄒師明先生並沒有就三個受影響屋邨向本人落焊料柯打，本人不清楚當時許宏新先生和鄒師明先生落柯打時的確實指示。

6 本人並不負責向雋景採購焊料，因此本人並不清楚金日工程向雋景採購焊料的細節。

7 見上文(6)，本人並不清楚當中細節。

8 本人不清楚為何選擇雋景作為金日工程的焊料供應商，只知道雋景一向是金日工程的小五金供應商之一。

9 本人知道在金日工程採購部向雋景訂購焊料後，雋景會直接聯絡地盤管工，再安排運輸將焊料送到地盤。

10 本人在今次事件發生前並沒有為意“英國 50 力扁錫條”這個牌子，雋景也沒有向本人推介此牌子。

11 本人沒有參與其中，所以不知道當中細節。

12 本人在今次事件發生前並不知道“英國 50 力扁錫條”這個牌子，亦不知道其成份及其是否合鉛。

13 許宏新先生及鄒師明先生沒有就三個受影響屋邨向本人落焊料柯打，向雋景採購焊料亦不是由本人負責，因此本人並不清楚金日工程就三個受影響屋邨採購焊料的細節。

另外，就 4 份由本人于 2015 年 7 月 17 日通過電郵發送予保華建業的“送貨單”，本人記得當日翁國財先生不在寫字樓，他打電話給我告訴我有一些文件要提供給保華建業，並指示我把他書桌上的幾份文件掃描並以電郵發給保華建業的人員。本人事前沒有參與他們相關的溝通，當時根本不知道文件的來源、保華建業要求文件的目的是否亦沒有理會文件內容，只是按翁國財先生的指示發送文件而已。

問：黃先生，呢一份係你十二月二十三號，二零一五年嘅書面證詞。就呢一份證詞，你有冇其他嘢補充？

答：冇嘢補充。

問：你願唔願意接受呢一份書面證詞為你調查委員會程序入面嘅口供嘅證

B

B

C

據？

C

D

答：我願意，願意。

D

E

問：Okay。

E

F

胡文俊先生：我有一、兩條問題，阿主席先生。

F

G

G

H

問：第一就係，黃先生你可唔可以講一講呢，喺你嘅意識入面呢，你有冇意識到市面上係有含鉛焊料呢樣嘢㗎？

H

I

答：冇。

I

J

問：另外就係有關翁國財先生幾日前嘅證供呢，入面就提及到就係話佢遞交呢一個關於物料嘅文件畀房屋署審批嘅時候，就係通過你就係去做一個材料表嘅。

J

K

K

L

答：唔。

L

M

問：嘎，咁我想問一問呢，就係話而家喺文件夾 L1 入面，你可唔可以睇一睇 L1，第 155 頁。第 155 至到 160 頁，呢一個係咪就係你準備有關於紅磡邨二期嘅物料表？

M

N

N

O

答：係呀，冇錯。

O

P

問：另外就係翁國財先生叫你準備嘅物料表，係咪？

P

Q

答：係，冇錯。

Q

R

問：畀房署審批嘅？

R

S

問：或者再睇一睇呢個物料表，就係話呢，呢個物料表呢就列出咗呢，係就呢一個紅磡邨二期嘅水喉工程所需要嘅物料嚟嘅。

S

T

答：唔。

T

U

問：就喺呢個物料表最右邊嗰行，有一個--有一行就叫做 "Approval

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Date”，見唔見到？

答：係，見到。

問：呢一個日子呢，係咪就係話房屋署審批完嗰個物料之後，嗰一日審批咗個物料，就由翁國財先生話番畀你聽已經審批咗，咁你就寫番個日子喺樹？

答：係，冇錯。

問：係咪咁嘅情況？

答：喎。

問：另外，就係喺 161 頁，請你睇一睇，由 161 頁到 163 頁，呢一個係咪榮昌邨嘅嗰個物料表？

答：係，喎。

問：唔該晒。另外呢，請你睇一睇第 164 頁到 166 頁，請你確認一下呢個係咪東匯邨嘅物料表。

答：係，喎。

胡文俊先生：主席先生，我有其他問題。

主席：唔該。

許偉強先生盤問

問：黃生，你 1996 年加入金日工程公司喇。

答：係呀。

問：係咪呀？

答：係呀。

問：所以都做咗差不多有二十年嘞。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：十零--廿--係喇，差唔多。

問：係咪呀？

答：係呀，係呀。

主席：除咗中學畢業之外，有冇再進修呀？

答：冇呀，冇。

主席：就係中五畢業嘞？

答：係呀，就係中五畢業囉，係呀。

問：冇讀過啲咩嘢 bookkeeping 嗰方面啲啲咁嘅課程呀？

答：冇呀，冇。

問：1996年加入呢個金日工程公司呢，係咪你第一次呀，就係接觸到即係同水喉行業有關嘅工作呀？

答：係，第一次。

問：唔。加入金日工程公司之前呢，認唔認識阿張達欽先生呀？

答：唔認識。

問：唔。認唔認識阿翁國財先生呀？

答：唔認識。

問：林麗瓊女士呢？

答：都唔認識。

問：莫小姐呢？

答：唔認識。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：唔。喺你 1996 年加入呢一個金日工程公司呢，...

答：唔。

問：...係咪一開始嘅時候呢，都係從事緊一啲即係呢啲文職呀有關訂材料呀呢啲咁嘅工作㗎？

答：唔係。一開始我做糧單先嘅。

問：糧單，係咪呀？

答：係呀，payment 啲啲，係呀。

問：唔，即係出糧畀工人？

答：唔係，地盤進度啲啲。

問：哦，地盤進度嘅糧單。

答：係呀，即係交界建築啲啲，係呀。

問：唔，係。幾時開始有負責關於購買材料啲方面嘅工作㗎？

答：唔好意思，聽唔清楚。

問：幾時呢，正式開始呢，喺金日工程公司入面係負責有關例如採購材料啲啲工作㗎？

答：我有採購材料。

問：冇嘅？

答：冇嘅。

問：係咪呀？

答：係呀。

問：唔。睇下你個證人口供，就講有關寫字樓日常文職工作喇，係咪呀？

答：係。

問：呢啲係包括邊類型嘅工作呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：幫阿翁生聯絡客人喇、同埋做下糧單喇、同埋幫佢打啲表呀嗰啲囉，係呀。

問：唔，好呀。我哋講下打呢個表先。

答：好，好。

問：剛才我哋睇過呢，就係就住呢個物料呈交呢，咁你都會負責即係做一個列表嘅。係咪呀？

答：係，會。

問：唔。我哋聽過翁先生嘅口供呢，首先，你會負責係準備一個表出嚟。係就住邊啲物料需要呈交樣辦呢樣嘢係做個表出嚟嘅，係咪？

答：係，係，做個表。

問：我哋啱啱就睇過 L1 嘅 155 頁。

答：唔。

問：如果我哋純粹而家睇一睇，就住紅磡邨呢個做例子吓，好唔好呀？

答：唔，好。

問：呢一個表呢，應該係咪就係話喺呢一個第一-物料嘅樣辦去總承建商之前，你已經開始做呢個表嚟嘞。

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：一開始會做呢個表先，係。

問：唔。每個地盤呢，都會有一個類似嘅表嘅？

答：每個地盤都會有。

問：唔。咁我想知道，就係就住呢一個表嚟講，用啲咩嘢物料、牌子、來源地等等嘅，同埋呢啲料係作啲咩嘢用途嘅呢啲咁。你係透過啲乜嘢資料嚟到打呢個表出嚟嘞？

答：哦，一開始呢，阿翁生有話畀我聽嘅。佢用番舊啲表呢，咁呀叫我

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

打番一個--執番一個表出嚟嘅。佢都有話畀我聽點樣執嘅，譬如可能水喉嘅大路嘢喇，可能水喉嘅種類、製嘅用咩嘢款喇。我會大約打番呢一拵嘢畀佢睇下先。

問：好。

答：係呀，唔。

問：你話用番舊啲表喇。

答：係。

問：就係舊啲表，就係有關做公共屋邨，即係都係同房署有關嘅表咁呀？

答：係，冇錯。

問：舊啲表呢，係咪都係你負責做㗎，一開始嘅時候？

答：一開始唔係㗎。

問：唔係嘅？

答：翁生畀我㗎，係呀。

問：哦，翁生畀你嘅？

答：係呀，係呀。

問：即係有第二啲人做過先？

答：係呀，做過㗎。

問：然後就一路用住啲舊嘅表？

答：係，一路沿用住囉，係。

問：舊啲表知唔知邊個做㗎？

答：咁我唔知呀，係呀。

問：唔，好。即係你一開始做啲陣時已經有舊表跟㗎嘞，係咪呀？

答：係呀，有舊表跟㗎，唔。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：唔，好嘞。咁你跟住啲舊表喇，然後翁生會同你商討下有冇啲需要同舊嗰個要作更改嘅？

答：商討就冇。多數我做完之後交界佢呢，佢會話畀我聽邊啲要改，邊啲唔啱，咁樣囉，係呀。

問：唔。佢話畀你聽，佢會唔會 mark 番啲你個草擬個表嗰度呀，定係佢會口頭同你咁講呀？

答：佢多數口頭㗎，多數口頭同我講㗎，係呀。

問：好。我哋睇下紅磡呢個表先喇。

答：唔。

問：如果就咁睇呢個表呢，我想問一問你，有冇就住焊料呢，就啲呢個表度有寫到㗎？

答：你講焊料呀？

問：係嘞，即係做食水銅喉嘅焊料呀？

答：呢度冇寫到。

問：呢度冇寫到呀呵？

答：係呀。

問：唔。

答：呢度冇寫到。

問：如果就住紅磡邨呢個工程呢，...

答：係，係。

問：...我哋知道紅磡邨呢，另外同佢差唔多一齊進行呢，都有個馬坑嘅工程嘅，你記得嗎？

答：記得。

問：咁我想問下呢，除咗紅磡邨會有呢一個 material submission 呢個表呢，馬坑呢會唔會都有個類似嘅表㗎？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：都有㗎，...

問：都有。

答：...喺我印象有。

問：係咪呀？

答：係，係。

問：而家應該會搵得番出嚟㗎呵？

答：我嘗試過搵，但係我唔見呀，係呀。

問：哦，唔見。

答：我淨係見到呢一個啫，係呀。

問：唔，好。咁如果我哋睇下紅磡邨呢個喇，啱啱同你講緊喇。

答：唔，係。

問：呢一個表就似乎冇就住焊料呢，係咪特別列咗出嚟㗎？你睇一睇。

答：我而家睇呀係囉，係呀，係呀。

問：係咪呀？

答：係呀，冇錯。

問：唔，好。咁如果我哋睇下榮昌邨嗰個項目。

答：係。榮昌邨...

問：161頁。

答：161，係。

問：唔。寫住西邨道，即係我哋知道都係榮昌邨個工程喇，係咪？

答：係，係，冇錯。

問：我想你睇一睇呢一度呢，有冇可以睇到有關做食水銅喉焊料嘅項目

B

B

C

呀？

C

D

答：有啲。

D

E

問：係，喺邊度呀？

E

F

答：有，喺 item 38 個度囉。

F

G

問：38，係。

G

H

答：係呀，係呀。

H

I

問：唔，好。咁如果我哋再睇埋呢一個東匯邨。

I

J

答：係。

J

問：呢個如果就住無鉛錫線嘅，就係講緊第 43，即係 165 頁個 165 頁個度，係咪呀？

K

答：唔，係。

K

L

問：唔。

L

M

答：係囉，43 item 個度有囉，係呀。

M

N

問：好。我想問下呢，你做呢啲表之前呢，...

N

O

答：係，係。

O

P

問：...你自己有冇見過呢一個無鉛錫線嘅樣辦，一定見過嘍以前？即係呢隻。

P

Q

答：我見過--係，"FRY"咁嘛，見過。

Q

R

問：係嘞，見過嘅？

R

S

答：係，見過。

S

T

問：你第一次見過呢一隻無鉛錫線呢，大概係幾時嘅呀，第一次？

T

U

答：大概呀？

U

V

問：唔。

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：我又唔係咁清楚，唔係咁記得啱，係呀，都好耐吓㗎嘞。

問：約莫呢，有冇十年呀，第一次？

答：十年呀，我諗五--係囉，五、六、七年嘅喇。

問：五、六、七年。

答：應該大約咁樣喇，係呀，大約咁上下喇，係呀。

問：係咪都係即係你做緊啲啲有關房署嘅工程嗰陣時呢，係第一次見到
㗎，或者係其他工程㗎，記唔記得呀？

答：房署。

問：房署嘅工程？

答：房署見到，係。

問：唔。第一次見到呢一隻物料嘅時候呢，係咪都知道佢係無鉛㗎？

答：知，知道。

問：知道嘅？

答：知道。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：亦都係好清楚即係呢一隻焊料呢，係攞嚟做即係食水喉嘅用途嘅？

答：用途就唔--我知道佢--都知道嘅，係呀，都知道嘅，...

問：都知道，係咪呀？

答：...都知道嘅，係呀，都知道嘅。

問：唔。咁你亦都知道，即係要用無鉛都係即係因為鉛對人體有害喇，呢
個你都應該清楚？

答：我都清楚，知道，知道。

B

B

C

問：係咪呀？唔。

C

D

答：係呀。

D

E

問：做食水喉用呢啲無鉛嘅焊料呢，都係唔想話可能有鉛嘅即係物質喇，即係走咗入食水喉嗰度喇，係咪呀？即係呢個常識應該都可以咁講喇。

E

F

答：咁我就唔知嘞，係呀。咁…

F

G

問：就有特別去諗，係咪呀？

G

H

答：係呀，冇特別注意呀，係呀。

H

I

問：但係好清楚，第一次見到呢隻呢，都知道佢係無鉛嘅？

I

J

答：係，我知道係無鉛嘅。

J

K

問：係咪呀？唔。

K

L

答：係呀，冇錯。

L

M

問：好嘞。咁你做呢啲表，然後你知道要用啲乜嘢物料喇，係咪呀？

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：然後阿翁生嘅口供呢，就係話你會負責就同供應商嗰邊就擺啲物料個樣辦嚟，同理擺啲物料嗰啲文件嚟，就去交界總承建商嘅。你同唔同意呀？

O

P

答：唔同意。

P

Q

問：唔。咁我想問下你嘞，你做咗呢個表喇，咁你知道邊啲物料要遞交上去，即係遞交嗰啲樣辦上去就畀房署批核喇。

Q

R

答：係，係。

R

S

問：係咪？咁嗰啲樣辦喺邊度擺番嚟㗎？

S

T

答：樣辦我諗係雋景喇。

T

U

問：係吖。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係，係呀。

問：邊個去負責找雋景話叫佢攞啲樣辦畀你哋呢？

答：我諗係翁生喇。

問：翁生本人？

答：係囉，我諗喇，係呀。

問：本人？

答：係囉。

問：係咪呀？

答：係囉。

問：你有冇曾經試過參與過就係話問雋景去攞呢啲物料嘅樣辦呀？

答：有。

問：都有嘅？唔。

答：有。因為有陣時翁生冇時間，佢會打畀我，叫我問雋景攞啲辦番嚟㗎。

問：叫你去攞，係咪？

答：係呀，係呀，叫番嚟咁樣。

問：唔，好。噏，就住呢三條邨呢，紅磡、東匯、榮昌。你記唔記得就住呢三條邨呢，係你本人吖，定係翁生呢，就問呢個雋景去攞樣辦㗎？

主席：乜嘢樣辦呀？

許偉強先生：就住如果焊料嘅樣辦，記唔記得係邊個去攞㗎？

答：咁我唔記得嘞，係呀。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：唔記得？

答：唔記得嘞，係呀。

問：唔。有機會係你，或者翁生，只會係你哋兩個是但一個嘅啫？

答：係呀，冇錯。

問：係咪呀？

答：係呀。

問：係咪翁生負責遞上去，即係將啲啲有關嘅樣辦，包括焊料嘅樣辦呢遞上去畀總承建商嘍？

答：係。

問：唔。你有冇試過參與過呢個過程呀，自己？

答：拎過去，有。

問：有？

答：係，有搵過去，係。

問：唔。就住呢三條邨呢，你有冇負責搵過去總承建商嗰度呀？

答：但係都係有翁生喺度嘅，我幫佢搵住個辦囉，係呀，咁樣囉，係呀。

問：唔。即係唔會你自己一個人擺上去總承建商度嘅？

答：唔會。

問：唔會嘅？

答：唔會，係呀，冇錯。

問：好嘞，啲辦跟住批咗落嚟嘞。一般嚟講總承建商係咪會有信發畀你哋，通知你哋啲辦批咗邊啲落嚟嘍咁？

答：據我所知呢，就批咗之後呢，總承建商呢，就會出個 memo 嘅，咁呀疊埋一拵批咗嘅文件喇。

B

B

C

問：係。

C

D

答：就放喺我哋地盤，好似叫白鴿籠嘅地方囉。阿翁生會落去，收到呢咁呀會搵番嚟畀我去更改個 schedule，咁樣囉，係呀。

D

E

問：即係個 pigeonhole--即係個--係咪呀？

E

F

答：係喇，係喇，冇錯，係喇，係喇，係呀。

F

G

問：唔。如果你睇下呢，即係如果當係一個例子咁喇，如果你睇下 F2，F2 972 頁。我哋見到呢度有個備忘錄喇。

G

H

答：係。

H

I

問：972，一個 memo 嘅。

I

J

答：係。

J

K

問：就係中國建築，即係總承建商佢哋交界你哋嘅。

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：咁我哋見到呢度講緊紅磡邨二期，同埋馬坑公園個項目喇。

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：睇到嘛？

O

P

答：睇到。

P

Q

問：交界金日喇。

Q

R

答：係。

R

問：然後下面嗰個內容就寫係「關於：樣辦呈報及審批」嘅，睇到嘛？

S

答：係，睇到。

S

T

問：咁亦都有講，就話諗 Powerflow Flux 同埋嗰個 Lead-Free Solder "Fry" 嗰個喇，係咪呀？

T

U

答：唔。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：呢個就係話報批嗰個--即係上交咗去嗰個材料喇。

答：係。

問：然後就係話上列各項--剔咗嗰度喇，就上列各項樣辦呢，就已經得到房署嘅批准喇咁。睇到嘛？

答：唔，唔，睇到，睇到。

問：係喇。咁呢個就係即係你剛才所講嘅 memo 喇，係咪呀？

答：係，冇錯。

問：即係類似嘅 memo 喇？

答：類似喇，係呀，冇錯。

問：即係就住可能不同嘅物料呢，都有唔同嘅 memo 嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？呢啲咁嘅 memo 呢，佢擺嚟你哋金日公司呢，係咪呀？佢係用咩嘢形式擺畀你哋㗎？即係 fax 畀你哋，定係搵你交畀你哋，定係點㗎？

答：佢會通知翁生去搵。

問：唔，係。

答：冇 fax、冇 e-mail 畀我哋嘅，係呀。

問：會唔會通知你本人㗎？

答：唔會。

問：唔會嘅？

答：唔會嘅，係呀。

問：唔。

答：係呀。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：就一定係翁生擺到咗之後你先至會知道嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：咁每一次翁生收到之後，係咪都會同你講嘍？

答：佢同我講話批咗一炸料囉，係呀，叫我睇下囉，係呀，update 番個表囉，係呀。

問：佢會將呢啲文件都會交番畀你嘅？

答：會，會。

問：係咪？

答：係，冇錯。

問：你就係用呢一份文件入面啲啲資料，或者係就住咁多種物料嘅有關呢啲備忘錄入面嘅資料就繼續跟進番你個 form 嘞？

答：係。

問：即係打番例如幾時嗰個樣辦係已經 approve 咗嘞？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係，冇錯，啱。

問：亦都會講番 approve 嘅日期喇？

答：係，會。

問：係咪？

答：會打番落去。

問：係。好嘞，咁你打咗呢個咁嘅嗰個 schedule 喇？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：出嚟之後，嗰個 schedule 係擺喺公司邊度㗎？

答：多數我交界翁生嘅。

問：交界翁生？

答：係呀，交界翁生。

問：交番畀翁生？

答：係呀，交番畀翁生。

問：翁生算唔算係你上司呀，喺公司入面嚟講？

答：算，一定係。

問：算呵？

答：係呀，係呀。

問：咁即係如果喺個公司個架構嚟講，個大老闆就係張生喇？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：翁生就係你上司喇？

答：係。

問：林小姐呢，林小姐算唔算係你上司呀？

答：林小姐呀？

問：嘎。

答：都算嘅。

問：都算？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係呀，都算嘅，係呀。

問：阿莫小姐呢，算唔算係你上司呀？

答：唔算。

問：就唔算？

答：係呀，唔算。

問：即係如果你要聽指示嘅話，即係你都會聽林小姐同埋翁生嘅指示工作嘅？

答：翁生多囉。

問：翁生比較多啲？

答：係呀，係呀，冇錯。

問：張生本人多唔多直接畀你指示㗎？

答：唔會，好少。

問：唔多嘅？

答：係呀。

問：大部分嘅指示都係翁生？

答：係，冇錯。

問：係咪？

答：喎。

問：好嘞，咁你做完嗰個列表喇，咁你就畀翁生喇？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：咁跟住你知唔知道佢會將個表擺去邊度呀？

答：佢應該會交界總承建商。

問：交界總承建商？

答：係，係。

問：點解要交界總承建商呢，嗰個表？

答：因為一開佢哋都要知道我哋有啲咩嘢材料要入嚟嘛，咁我覺得翁生會交界佢囉，係呀。

問：我係講緊話你睇完呢啲備忘錄之後做嗰個表呀。

答：哦，你講備忘錄，做完個表之後？

問：係嘞，即係備忘錄，知道咗你嗰啲物料幾時批，批咗邊隻，跟住你就會打番喺你原先已經做好咗嘅嗰個表度喇，...

答：係呀，係呀，我會，係，冇錯，係。

問：...打番落個電腦度，...

答：係呀。

問：...呢啲 approve 咗嘞，approve 咗邊日咁？

答：係。

問：呢個表，做完之後，你係咪會交界翁生呀？

答：係呀，會交界翁生，係呀。

問：咁佢會擺去邊呢？

答：咁我唔知呀。

問：佢唔需要再擺去個總承建商嚟喇，因為都批咗喇，已經，啲料？

答：係喇，咁應該冇喇，係呀，冇錯，係呀。

問：咁佢會擺去邊呀？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：佢可能放喺佢檯面啫。咁我唔知佢搵去邊，係呀，係呀。

問：你喺公司，咁你平日都係坐寫字樓多啲嘛？

答：唔，冇錯。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：你應該唔去地盤視察啲喇？

答：唔會，係呀。

問：就住嗰三個地盤工程，你都有去到地盤現場視察啲嘛？

答：冇。

問：你喺公司工作嘅時候，有冇曾經見過你呢啲打開咗話，啊，approve
咗，幾時、幾時 approve 嘅，啱啱我哋睇嗰啲表呀，有冇見過呀，
喺公司？

答：冇。

問：有？

答：有見過。

問：係咪？

答：係呀。

問：你見過嘅話，喺公司邊一部分見到呀？

答：我檯面囉。

問：你自己檯面？

答：係呀，我自己檯面喇，係呀。

問：好嘞，你打完呢啲表，交咗畀翁生之後，你自己會唔會同公司任何人，
話畀佢哋聽，「喂，有呢張表做好嘞咁，知道邊啲物料係已經批核咗
嘅」，...

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇...

問：...你會唔會去做呢樣嘢㗎？

答：唔會呀，我淨係同翁生講咋。

問：唔會嘅？

答：係呀。

問：係靠翁生？

答：係呀。

問：係咪？

答：係呀。

問：咁你又知唔知呢一個咁嘅表做好咗，即係話已經有咗嗰啲批核嘅日期、批核嘅物料咁樣嘅，呢個表，林小姐知唔知㗎？

答：唔知呀，佢應該唔知。

問：佢應該唔知？

答：唔。

問：點解你會話佢應該唔知呢？

答：因為我個 schedule，我有陣時 update 嗰陣時我放喺檯面喇，咁我唔知佢睇唔睇到喇，係呀。

問：唔知？

答：我就冇--係嘞，我一定就有話畀佢聽嘅。

問：係。

答：係呀，係呀，咁樣囉，係呀。

問：咁樣講你同唔同意，你係負責制訂一個咁嘅表喇？

答：係。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：係咪？亦都要亦都花啲時間就住啲備忘錄，每一次就住啲咩嘢料批
咗，幾時批嘅，你要再三睇過之後先至確實啲個表㗎嘛，先可以做到
出嚟㗎嘛。

答：係，冇錯。

問：你覺得啲個表個用途係咪等公司，起碼公司嘅同事，尤其是係採購嘅
同事，佢知道，喂，應該去落啲咩嘢 order，買咩嘢料呢，同唔同意？

答：唔同意。

問：唔同意？

答：係，唔同意。

問：呢張表，咁有咩嘢意思呢？

答：呢個表我係對住翁生做㗎嘛，我交代畀翁生聽㗎之嘛，即係有啲咩嘢
批咗，有啲咩嘢。

問：啱。

答：咁我覺得翁生會決定㗎喇，啲嘢。係呀，我覺得係咁樣喇，係。

問：係。對你嚟講，你自己都喺公司做咗差廿年喇？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：即係唔會無端白事需要做一个咁嘅表㗎，一定有個目的㗎？

答：一定有原因，一定有原因。

問：係咪？

答：係，冇錯。

問：你個表其中一個主要嘅內容就係寫番出嚟邊啲物料當時呈交咗個樣
辦，樣辦有冇被批核，幾時批核咗，呢啲都係重要資料㗎嘛？

B

B

C

答：唔，冇錯。

C

D

問：係咪？

D

E

答：係。

E

F

問：你做咗公司成廿年，咁你會唔會咁樣認為呢，就係呢個咁嘅表，有呢啲咁嘅資料嘅，做咗出嚟都係等公司可以知道，就住嗰項工程佢需要去大批購買啲咩嘢料，同唔同意？

F

G

答：我有咁諗過。

G

H

問：好嘞，...

H

I

答：我有咁諗過。

I

J

問：咁就住你嚟講喇，唔好--即係我啱啱剛才都話喇，冇理由無中生有，就做一個咁嘅表出嚟㗎。咁你認為嘞，做一個咁嘅出嚟，係做咩嘢用途嘅呢？

J

K

答：我做個表出嚟，我覺得翁生要知道有啲咩嘢材料係批咗，有啲咩嘢係我幾時入到囉，我交代畀佢囉，係呀，咁樣囉。

K

L

M

問：好嘞，你覺得翁生係需要知道有啲咩物料係批咗？

M

N

答：係。

N

O

問：係咪？

O

P

答：係。

P

Q

問：需要知道有啲咩物料批咗都係好--即係常識嚟講，雖然我唔喺你公司度做嘢吓，...

Q

R

答：係，冇錯。

R

S

問：...都應該會知道，喂，知道邊啲物料批咗，其實都係要清楚，等大家知道，...

S

T

答：係吖。

T

U

問：...喂，到時要用啲咩嘢料，係咪？

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係吓，差唔多。

問：係咪？

答：係呀，應該喇。

問：採購部亦都要知道你哋用咩嘢料嚟到訂貨㗎，同意嘛？採購部冇理由完全乜都唔知嘅情況之下冇任何根據咁去訂貨㗎，同意嘛？

答：咁我唔知喇。因為我認為翁生可能會同佢哋講啱，係呀，咁樣囉。

問：好，好。？

答：係呀。

問：你自己本人就好清楚知道邊啲物料批核㗎喇？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：冇錯。

問：呢個冇...

答：係，啱嘅。

問：冇懷疑㗎喇？

答：唔。

問：係咪？你自己本人有冇曾經同林小傾過有關呢啲表入面嘅內容？

答：冇。

問：完全冇？

答：完全冇。

問：一次都冇？

答：一次都冇。

B

B

C

問：咁多年都有？

C

D

答：冇。

D

E

問：冇？

E

F

答：唔。

F

G

問：咁你覺得林小姐係點--即係你就覺得如果林小姐要知道嗰個表嘅內容就一定係透過翁先生㗎嘞？

G

H

答：係。

H

I

問：咁你又做過咁多年，喺寫字樓，有冇見過例如翁先生同林小姐交代番，嘍，邊啲物料批咗嘅事情呀？

I

J

答：冇為意呀，係呀。

J

K

問：吓？

K

L

答：冇為意聽佢哋講過呢啲嘢。

L

M

問：完全冇？

M

N

答：冇。

N

O

問：有冇話留意過翁先生同埋莫小姐傾有關邊啲物料批咗嘅事呀？

O

P

答：冇。

P

Q

問：有冇喺寫字樓曾經聽過翁生講任何關於批咗料嘅事呀？

Q

R

答：我有留意呀，係呀，冇留意佢哋講嘢，係呀。

R

S

問：好。我想問下你，就住呢個落 order，我哋聽過幾個證人嘅口供，都係知道喺地盤現場，當時你哋有啲管工就會打電話返嚟去落 order，就住如果係要焊料嘅，就會地盤嘅管工就會同你哋公司嘅職員去落 order 嘅咁。我想問下你，就住嗰三個地盤，你有冇收過呢方面，就住焊料落 order，即係地盤嘅管工話畀你聽要落啲乜嘢 order，你自己有冇呀？

S

T

U

答：有啲印象聽過。

U

V

V

B

B

C

問：有啲印象，係咪？

C

D

答：係。

D

E

問：邊個同你講㗎？

E

F

答：邊呀呀？

F

G

問：唔。

G

H

答：咁我又唔清楚嘞，唔記得嘞，係呀，係呀，係呀。

H

I

問：會唔會有機會係許宏新呢？

I

J

答：有機會，有機會。

J

K

問：有冇機會係鄒生呢？

K

L

答：都有機會呀。

L

M

問：都有機會？

M

N

答：係呀，都有機會。

N

O

問：應該都係嗰啲兩位嘅啫，落 order 嘅？

O

P

答：多數喇，係呀，佢--主要係。

P

Q

問：仲會有邊個會有負責落 order 㗎？地盤管工。

Q

R

答：其他嘅管工喇，係呀，冇錯。

R

S

問：仲有邊個呀？

S

T

答：仲有邊個？

T

U

問：你認識嘅，除咗許生同埋鄒生之外？

U

V

答：應該冇嘞。我淨係聽過佢兩個講。

V

問：即係一係佢...

答：係呀，一係鄒生，一係許生嘅。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：一係阿許，一係就係阿鄒㗎嘞？

答：冇錯。

問：係咪？

答：係呀，冇錯。

問：如果許生同你落 order 嘅時候，咁佢會點同你講話要啲咩嘢焊料呀？

答：佢多數都係講要啲錫線同埋錫條，或者佢有陣時講「誼，我要啲焊料呀」，咁樣囉，係呀。

問：停一停先吓。

答：係。

問：你話佢會講「錫線」？

答：係。

問：亦都會講「錫條」嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：就住即係你聽到佢如果講「錫條」喇，你會認為係乜嘢焊料呀，錫條？

答：都係 F-R-Y 囉。

問：都係 F-R-Y？

答：係。

問：錫線呢？

答：都係 F-R-Y 囉。

問：即係佢講兩隻唔同嘅名出嚟，你都唔會覺得佢係講緊兩樣嘢嘅？

B

B

C

答：唔會，係。

C

D

問：點解呢？

D

E

答：我覺得佢淨係得一隻 F-R-Y 㗎咋。

E

F

問：你嘅認知淨係得一隻嘅啫？

F

G

答：係，冇錯。

G

H

問：係咪？

H

I

答：係。

I

J

問：鄒生如果佢落 order，佢又會點講呀？

J

K

答：都係講「焊料」、「錫線」、「錫條」咁樣喇，類似咁樣喇，係呀。

K

L

問：都係類似？

L

M

答：係。

M

N

問：如果我哋講緊，如果佢哋落 order 嘅時候，要落幾多呀，嗰個單位呢，係佢哋點講㗎？

N

O

答：佢哋呀？多數都係叫一箱或者一盒咁樣喇，係呀，幾多盒，幾多盒，幾多箱。

O

P

問：幾多盒？

P

Q

答：係呀。

Q

R

問：咁即係呢個咁嘅分別，你話錫條同埋錫線，呢個咁樣唔同嘅講法喇，你聽咗幾多年呀？喺公司做。

R

S

答：好多年喇，係呀。

S

T

問：好多年？

T

U

答：係呀，係呀，我諗四、五年喇，係呀，我成日都聽佢哋咁講，係呀。

U

V

問：係。咁你聽到呢啲咁嘅「錫條」、「錫線」，對你嚟講就分別，全部都係講緊 FRY 嘅，係咪？

V

B

B

C

答：係，冇錯，係。

C

D

問：咁你聽到之後會唔會同番林小姐--因為你自己本身唔係採購部㗎嘛，係咪？

D

E

答：唔，唔，唔。

E

F

問：你都會同番林小姐或者莫小姐，話番畀佢哋聽，即係我哋所講 pass 番個 message 畀佢聽，...

F

G

答：係，係。

G

H

問：...就話「喂，冇地盤管工落呢啲 order 㗎」咁，係咪？

H

I

答：冇錯，係。

I

J

問：咁你 pass 番個 message 畀林小姐嘅時候，你又會點講呢？

J

K

答：我照講番佢哋嗰樣嘢囉。係呀，即係譬如可能講「錫線」嘅，我就話番畀佢聽「錫線」；「錫條」，我就話番畀佢聽「錫條」，係呀，咁樣囉。

K

L

問：你有冇同佢哋係講“FRY”㗎？

L

M

答：冇，冇提過。

M

N

問：冇提過嘅？

N

O

答：冇提過。

O

P

問：有冇提過無鉛㗎？

P

Q

答：冇。

Q

R

問：冇嘅？

R

S

答：冇提過。

S

T

問：同林小姐嘅交談入面，即係例如大家要知道要落幾多料，焊料呀咁嘅？

T

U

答：唔，唔。

U

V

問：林小姐有冇曾經同你提過“FRY”呢個牌子？

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：冇。

問：「50力」呢？

答：都有。

問：「50力扁錫條」呢？

答：冇提過。

問：冇提過？

答：冇提過。

問：莫小姐都係，一樣？

答：都係，一樣。

問：好。我想問下你，就係你知唔知道公司每一次喺地盤收到啲焊料之後，
供應商會送啲送貨單、發票畀你哋公司；呢樣嘢你知嘅？

答：唔，知，知，知。

問：你都會有機會睇過啲啲文件嘅？

答：冇，冇睇過。

問：有時唔好話細仔去研究喇，雋景送嚟啲啲單據，你都會攞下嚟，會唔
會？

答：唔會。

問：從來唔會睇嘅？

答：從來唔會睇。

問：從來唔會？

答：係，從來唔會。

問：咁你點知佢有呢啲單據送嚟？邊個話畀你聽呀？

答：我自己到雋景間唔時都有一沓有信封入住寫住送貨單咁嘅嘢，我見到

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

呢啲咁嘅信囉，係呀。

問：有見過？

答：係呀，有見過，係呀。

問：亦都見過寫住抬頭係寫住送貨單嘅？

答：係呀，類似啲咁樣唔，係呀，咁樣，係。

問：但係你就唔會仔細去睇入面啲內容嘅？

答：唔會，唔會，我一定唔會睇，係呀。

問：你知唔知道公司啲紀錄，即係啲文件紀錄，係 keep 幾耐㗎？

答：唔知呀，係呀。

問：林小姐證人口供就話啲公司啲紀錄，通常每年做完啲會計核數就會攞㗎嘞。呢樣嘢你知唔知呀？

答：唔知。

問：唔知道？

答：唔知道，係呀。

問：鉛水事件發生之後，即係我哋講緊舊年，即係 2015 年，7 月發生之後，老闆有冇同你傾過，「喂，有冇機會係呀我哋落錯咗啲焊料呀，呢樣嘢呀」？

答：7 月之後呀？

問：唔。

答：佢好似有一段時間唔喺香港，好似冇講過，係呀。即係話--即係冇見到佢，係呀

問：冇見到佢？

答：係呀，冇見到佢，係呀。

問：我講緊 7 月到而家呢？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：哦，7月到而家？

問：唔。

答：佢都好似問過我一次嘅，係呀。

問：一次？

答：問講一次嘅，係呀。

問：佢喺邊度問你呀？

答：公司。

問：嗰陣時係咪都係7月左右嘅事呀？定係...

答：7月，我唔記得嘞，但係佢係返咗嚟叫我，問一問我啲嘢嘅，係呀，咁樣囉，係呀。

問：即係你知道鉛水事件發生咗嗰段時間，佢就本人就唔喺香港。呢樣你知㗎嘛？

答：係，呢個知，係呀，係呀。

問：知唔知佢去咗邊呀？

答：唔知呀，係呀。

問：唔知？

答：我唔知佢去咗邊。

問：離開咗幾耐呀？

答：唔記得嘞，係呀，我有留--我有為意，係。

問：你話之後佢同你傾番喇？

答：係。

問：咁都係大概--即係我啱啱問你，都係大概7月嘅事？

答：係，大概7月嘅事喇。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：係咪？

答：係呀。

問：佢點問你呀，張生？

答：佢問我「嗰啲焊料有第二版㗎咩」，咁樣囉，係呀。你話「有呀」，咁樣囉。

問：即係當時佢問你嗰陣時，佢連焊料有冇第二版佢都唔知？

答：我覺得係咁囉，係，我覺得佢咁問，係囉。

問：係咪？

答：係囉，係呀。

問：有冇第二版？

答：係呀。

問：咁你話有，係咪？

答：係呀，我話有。

問：咁跟住呢，佢點講呀？

答：跟住佢話「翁生知唔知㗎？」咁我話「諗，知嘅，我有畀個 schedule 佢」，係呀，咁樣囉。

問：佢特別問翁生知唔知嘅？

答：係呀，係呀。

問：係咪？

答：係呀，冇錯。

問：仲問公司其他職員知唔知呀？

答：冇喎。據我所知，淨我問我啫。

問：淨係問翁生啫？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係，哦，即係你話--哦，係呀，淨係問翁生囉，係呀。

問：淨係問翁生？

答：係呀，淨係問翁生啫，係呀。

問：咁你話你點答話？

答：我話知呀，我畀個 schedule 佢，應該翁生知嘅，係呀，咁樣囉。

問：翁生係知嘅？

答：唔。

問：咁耐以嚟，由7月到而家，張生係咪淨係問過你一次呀？

答：係呀，問過我一次嘅，係呀。

問：當時佢有冇話，即係覺得你本人做錯嘢呀？

答：冇，冇咁覺得。

問：當時佢嘅語氣係點嘍？

答：佢好似好叻咁囉。咁問我，淨係問我呢樣嘢囉，即係話「唉，諗，有第二版嘍？」我話「諗，有呀。」好平和咁樣囉，係呀，好平和。。

問：打電話畀你嘅？

答：唔係，唔係，唔係，唔係，講錯。

問：喺公司？

答：喺公司嘅，係呀，喺公司，係。

問：佢問你嘅時候，仲有咩嘢人喺度呀？

答：冇呀，得我同佢，係呀。

問：嗰日其他人去咗邊呀？

答：唔係，佢叫我入房，問我嘅，係呀。

B

B

C

問：傾咗幾耐呀？

C

D

答：好耐咋，一、兩分鐘喇，係呀。

D

E

問：咁大概喺嗰個時候，咁翁生有冇同你提過話「喂，畀承建商嗰邊都有追問過調查呢件事呀」，有冇同你傾呢樣嘢？

E

F

答：冇同我傾過。

F

G

問：冇？

G

H

答：冇。

H

I

問：你完全唔知道？

I

J

答：我完全唔知道。

J

K

問：翁生由七月到而家，有冇同你傾過呢個係買焊料嘅問題呀？

K

L

答：冇，冇同我傾過。

L

M

問：完全冇？

M

N

答：完全冇。

N

O

問：完全冇。你有話認為需要同翁生跟進，喂，點解嗰陣時佢知道咗邊啲物料係批咗，包括焊料嘅，但係竟然會落錯貨嘅咁，你唔覺得有需要...

O

P

答：冇呀。

P

Q

問：...要搵佢傾咩？

Q

R

答：冇呀，有需要呀。

R

S

問：冇？

S

T

答：係呀，冇呀。

T

U

問：係咪？

U

V

答：係呀。

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：林小姐呢，有冇同你傾過呀，7月到而家？

答：冇傾過。

問：完全冇傾過？

答：完全冇傾過。

問：莫小姐呢？

答：冇。

問：冇？

答：冇。

問：你做你份證人口供嘅時候，或者之前，有冇再同公司任何人士去了解一下多啲有關呢件事嘅情況，等你可以有清楚啲嘅資料去做呢份證人口供呀？

答：冇。

問：冇？

答：冇。

問：淨係你自己一個人...

答：係，我自己做。。

問：...搵晒所有個資料出嚟嘅，係咪？

答：係，冇錯。

問：我想問一問你，就住有一件事，就係7月16號，呢個就係喺翁生嘅個證人口供嗰度亦都有提過，林小姐個證人口供都有提過嘅。

答：係。

問：我哋先睇下你嘅證人口供先吓。

答：唔，唔。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：你嘅證人口供，就喺 135 頁，L1，135 頁。

答：係，冇錯。

問：睇到嘛？

答：睇到。

問：就係你呢度咁講嘅，「另外，就 4 份由本人于 2015 年 7 月 17 日通過電郵發送予保華建業的“送貨單”，本人記得當日翁國財先生不在寫字樓，他打電話給我告訴我有一些文件要提供給保華建業，並指示我把他書桌上的幾份文件掃描並以電郵發給保華建業的人員。本人事前沒有參與他們相關的溝通，當時根本不知道文件的來源、保華建業要求文件的目的等亦沒有理會文件內容，只是按翁國財先生個指示發送文件啫」咁樣。呢個就係你講 7 月 17 號嘅事嘞？

答：係。

問：就係翁生就打電話畀你？

答：係。

問：係咪？

答：係。

問：就話即係有啲文件要提供畀保華嘅？

答：係，冇錯。

問：翁生嗰個口供就咁講嘅，喺 145 頁。

答：係。

問：145 頁嘅第 6 段。

答：係。

問：睇一睇吓。

答：唔。

問：都係講番嗰日喇，7 月 17 號。

B

B

C

答：唔。

C

D

問：翁生就話佢喺另外一個地方處理緊啲查詢，唔喺寫字樓。咁同你嘅講法都一致嘅。

D

E

答：唔。

E

F

問：翁生就話「我沒有使用電子郵件的習慣，而金日工程只有一個電郵地址」，就係呢個嘞。

F

G

答：係。

G

H

問：咁話「當日保華有個 John Ma 先生嘅電郵就係傳送到金日工程這個電郵地址的。當時我就」--佢話「當時我就唔喺寫字樓，應該是黃錦文」，即係你本人喇，「睇到 John Ma 嘅電郵，然後打電話告訴我 John Ma 以電郵問我要文件，問我是否將我辦公檯上的文件發給 John Ma。」

H

I

I

J

J

K

答：唔。

K

L

問：Okay?

L

M

答：唔。

M

N

問：呢度就係咁講。跟就話「我辦公檯上的文件即林女士準備的要求保華，所以我就指示黃錦文把那些文件發給畀保華嘞」咁樣。

N

O

答：唔。

O

P

問：睇到嘛?

P

Q

答：睇到。

Q

R

問：以翁生所講，就話當時就因為你收到 John Ma 嗰個電郵，所以就--佢又唔喺寫字樓喇，咁你就打電話畀佢，就同佢講，就話，啊，有呢個咁嘅人，咁就叫你要畀啲文件啲，咁樣。首先如果我睇下呢個電郵吓。如果我哋睇下 G2, 1194。睇下下款先，下面嗰度，呢度就有一個電郵，我哋見到喺嗰個文件上面嗰個日子，就 7 月 17 號大概 2 點 41 分。

R

S

S

T

T

U

答：係。

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：下午，係咪呀？

答：唔。

問：就咁寫喇，“Dear Mr YUNG, As spoke, could you please furnish us records of the captioned for our information in response to recent HDconcern.”睇到嗎？

答：睇到。

問：咁“Thanks!”，寫住“John”喇咁。

答：唔。

問：呢個就係你哋所--即係你--你嗰度都有講過話即係保華嗰個電郵呢，就係呢個電郵咩嘍？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？呢個係你當日收到嘅？

答：唔，翁生...

問：你喺公司度都收到喇？

答：翁生通知我話有個電郵囉，我睇到囉，係呀，係呀。

問：好，翁生點會知道有個電郵呀？佢唔喺公司？

答：係呀，但係佢打番嚟，佢同我講話，John Ma send 咗 e-mail 過嚟咩嘍，咁我唔知係咪 John Ma 打畀佢喇，即係我覺得啫，係呀。

問：好嘞。

答：係呀。

問：我等一等呢度先。

答：好，得。

問：因為呢度呢，你嗰個版本呢，即係你講嗰個證供呢，就同翁生有少少出入。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：係。

問：第一樣嘢呢，就係翁生所講嘅呢，就話當時呢，係你睇到個電郵之後，...

答：係。

問：...你打畀佢，話有呢個電郵，需要處理啲文件嘅。

答：係。

問：你嗰個講法呢就話，唔係嗰，翁生活畀你知有啲文件呢要畀保華。

答：係。

問：所以呢，佢就話佢嘅講法呢，就係話你打畀佢。

答：唔。

問：你講嘅講法呢，就係話...

答：佢打畀我。

問：...佢打畀你。

答：係。

問：你而家睇完呢兩個版本之後，可唔可以話畀我哋聽，究竟係邊個打畀邊個呀？

答：我印象中呢，我記得呢係佢打番嚟搵我嘅。

問：唔。

答：係嘞，佢話畀我聽嘅。

問：好嘞。

答：係。

問：佢打番嚟搵你呢，佢已經同你講緊 John Ma 嗰--佢首先，佢打番畀你嘅時候，...

B

B

C

答：唔。

C

D

問：...係下晝嘅，係咪呀？

D

E

答：唔，應該係喇，應該係喇。

E

F

問：係咪呀？

F

G

答：係呀，係呀，實際時間...

G

H

問：係咪應該係呢個電郵所講，2點41分左右之後嘅事呀？

H

I

答：應該係喇。

I

J

問：唔。

J

K

答：係，應該係喇，係呀。

K

L

問：你話佢打畀你呢，即係佢主動打畀你喇。

L

M

答：唔，唔。

M

N

問：佢就話有啲文件要交畀保華。

N

O

答：係。

O

P

問：呢度係你個口供就咁寫㗎。

P

Q

答：冇錯，啱。

Q

R

問：但係你之前呢就話畀我聽，佢打畀你嗰陣時呢，佢已經知道有一個電郵發咗畀佢呀？

R

S

答：唔係。

S

T

問：唔係？

T

U

答：唔係，佢打畀我嗰陣時，我先知咁嘛，係呀。

U

V

問：係嘞。

V

答：係呀。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：即係佢打畀你，你同佢講有個電郵？

答：唔係。

問：佢有冇講到？

答：冇，...

問：冇？

答：...冇講到，係呀。

問：你可唔可以講一講畀我聽，佢打畀你，就話有啲文件要交畀保華。

答：係。

問：你有冇同佢講話你收到一個 John Ma 嘅電郵呢？

答：冇講過。

問：咩嘢話？

答：冇講過。

主席：你嗰日收咗幾多個電話呀請問？

答：冇講過。

主席：你嗰日收咗幾多個電話？

答：我嗰日？

主席：係呀。

答：收咗幾多個電話？

主席：收到--即係 John--即係呢個翁先生呀，總共嗰日打過幾多次電話畀你先？

答：佢呀？佢嗰日都打過好多次畀我。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

主席：好多次電話嘅係？

答：係呀，係呀，打過返嚟好多次。

問：好，咁你呢度你嘅口供嗰度話佢打畀你，告訴我有一些文件要提供給保華建築。

答：唔。

問：咁呢個電話呢，係咪就係第一個佢打畀你嘅電話呀？

主席：呢個唔係，應該係咪呀？

答：唔係。

問：唔係嘅？

答：佢之前都打過去喇。

問：之前已經打過嚟嘞？

答：係呀。

問：唔。

主席：呢個電話係夜晚黑九點幾鐘之前少少打畀你嘅，係咪呀？

答：佢嗰日都打咗好多電話畀我，我都唔記得咗喇。

主席：係呀，因為我哋知道...

答：係呀，啲時間，係呀。

主席：因為我哋知道個 e-mail 係九點幾鐘 send 出去㗎嘛。

B

B

C

答：唔，唔，唔。

C

D

主席：咁呢一個話畀你聽個檯頭前面有呢啲咁樣嘅文件，即係叫你 send 出去，咁係咪即係大約嗰個時候呀？

D

E

答：之前喇，係呀，之前喇。

E

F

主席：係囉，即係...

F

G

答：係呀，之前喇，係呀。

G

H

主席：之前幾耐呀？即係 9 點鐘之前？

H

I

答：應該 6 點之後佢冇打過畀我喇，係呀，佢 6 點之前打過畀我嘅。

I

J

主席：6 點之前打過畀你？

J

K

答：係呀，因為我喺寫字樓嘅嗰陣時，係呀，係呀，咁樣囉，係呀。

K

L

主席：6 至 9 你都喺寫字樓嘅？

L

M

答：係呀。

M

N

主席：唔。

N

O

答：係呀，冇錯。

O

P

問：6 點之前打畀你？

P

Q

答：係，冇錯。

Q

R

問：咁樣即係話 6 點之前打畀你呢個時間...

R

S

答：係。

S

T

問：...你都已經知道有份件喺佢檯頭㗎喇？

T

U

答：係。

U

V

問：係咪？

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：知道。

問：六點幾嗰陣時，你都係知道呢啲文件係需要發畀保華㗎喇？

答：係，知道。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔。咁你知道咗之後，阿翁生有冇同你講呢啲文件係好急住要畀保華
㗎？

答：冇提到。

問：冇提到？

答：冇提過。

問：完全冇提？

答：冇提過。

問：有冇同你提話係因為呢個鉛水事件呀？

答：冇講。

問：冇講？

答：冇講畀我聽。

問：完全唔知係咩嘢呀你？

答：完全唔知，係呀。

問：嘎，唔。

答：冇錯，喎。

問：好嘞，六點幾鐘你知道有份文件嘞，佢要你交畀保華嘞。

答：唔。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：點解你九點幾之後先--九點--九點鐘之後先至交界佢呢？

答：哦，因為嗰日我好多嘢做呀，係呀，我可能忘記咗呀。我記得我嗰日做到八點幾，我先記得起要 e 出去，所以我咪好忙咁樣 e 出去囉，九點幾。

問：翁生當時話叫你擺啲文件去送畀保華，佢有冇同你講用咩嘢形式交去呀？E-mail 畀佢吖，定係點呀？

答：佢冇叫我送去，佢淨係同我講話有個 e-mail 嘅，咁呀叫我 e 啲嘢畀過去嘅，e 番啲嘢過去嘅，...

問：E 啲嘢過去嘅？

答：...e 佢檯頭啲嘢，係呀。

問：唔。你話佢完全冇你講嗰個逼切性嘅？

答：冇講。

問：冇講？

答：冇講。

問：唔。所以你就睇啲唔記得咗嘞？

答：係呀。

問：係咪呀？

答：係呀，係呀。

問：唔。咁你 e 咗過去之後呢，有冇同阿翁生交代番你 e 咗去嘞咁呀？

答：冇。

問：冇？

答：冇，係呀。

問：翁生有冇再追你話「喂，啲文件擺咗去未呀？」咁呀？

答：冇呀，冇再追嘞。

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

問：都有？

答：係呀。

問：完全冇？冇跟進嘞？

答：冇呀，完全冇，冇呀，係。

問：咁呢幾份文件 e 咗出去之後呢，嗰啲文件你擺咗喺邊呀？

答：擺番喺翁生檯面囉。

問：擺喺翁生檯面？

答：原地囉，係呀，咁樣囉，唔。

問：唔。呢幾份文件呢，send 咗出去呢，除咗你同翁生即係溝通過喇，你有冇同其他任何人講發咗畀保華嘅呢份文件呀？

答：冇。

問：完全冇？

答：完全冇。

問：唔。張生都唔知嘅？

答：唔知。

問：林小姐都唔知？

答：唔知。

問：唔。你發出去嘅時候呢，自己都有望下嗰啲文件係咩嘢嘍嘅？

答：係。

問：係咪呀？

答：係。

問：唔。發咗出去呢份文件之後呢，直至到而家，即係都講有成五個幾月、六個月嘅事件喇。冇冇就住你發出呢個文件呢，同你公司任何人討論

B

B

C

過呀？

C

D

答：冇。

D

E

問：冇？

E

F

答：冇。

F

G

問：你知道--你知道--有四張送貨單呢係假嘅，你知道呢樣嘢嘛？

G

H

答：唔知。

H

I

問：直到而家你都唔知呀？

I

J

答：我做證人口供嗰陣時我就知囉。

J

K

問：你做證人口供嗰陣時知道？

K

L

答：係呀，知道。

L

M

問：係咪？

M

N

答：係呀。

N

O

問：你做證人口供嗰陣時，邊個話畀你知有假單呀？

O

P

答：律師囉。

P

Q

問：律師？

Q

R

答：係呀，律師話畀我聽囉，要答呢啲問題囉，係呀。

R

S

問：係。咁你就睇過嗰幾張假單嘞？

S

T

答：冇睇過，佢淨係話畀我聽啫。

T

U

問：律師淨係講畀你聽...

U

V

答：係，係。

V

問：...有四張假單？

答：係，係。

B

B

C

問：有同你講四張㗎嘛？

C

D

答：係，冇錯。

D

E

問：係咪呀？

E

F

答：係。

F

G

問：送貨單，係咪呀？

G

H

答：係，係。

H

I

問：唔。冇顯示過畀你睇話邊四張呀？睇都冇睇過呀？

I

J

答：冇。

J

K

問：冇呀？

K

L

答：係。

L

M

問：唔。

M

N

答：淨係問過我啫，係呀。

N

O

問：唔。咁你當時呢，即係話有四張假單呢，你當時會唔會意會到呢，其實就係你送去--同你送去嗰幾張單呢會有關係呀？

O

P

答：冇--我有咁諗啫，係呀。

P

Q

問：冇咁諗過？

Q

R

答：我有咁諗過，係呀。

R

S

問：律師話畀你知有呢啲咁樣嘅假單喇，嘎。

S

T

答：唔。

T

U

問：到而家為止呢，即係呢一刻呀，你係知道嗰幾張假單係咪就係你攞畀佢保華嗰幾張呀？

U

V

答：唔知。

V

問：都唔知？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：都唔知。

問：都唔知？

答：係呀，都唔知。

問：唔。你知道咗有假單之後，你知唔知道公司有冇調查過呢件事？

答：唔知。

問：唔。

答：我唔知。

問：唔知？

答：唔知有冇調查過。

問：唔知？

答：係呀。

問：你知道咗有假單之後，你唔覺得需要--你有冇同公司啲人--任何人講過呢件事？「喂，律師話有假單嗎？」有冇呀？

答：冇，我有講過。

問：完全冇？

答：完全冇，係呀。

問：律師冇同你講過話啲假單，係有機會係你發畀保華都有？連呢樣嘢都有講？

答：我記得就有嘞。

問：嗯？

答：我記得就有嘞。

問：唔。即係你做證人口供嘅時候，你都唔--完全唔知道嗰幾假單，嗰個送貨單--即係你當時交咗畀保華嗰幾張單，係有機會係假，你都唔知道㗎嘛？

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

答：唔知道。

問：係咪？

答：係呀。

問：你喺個證人口供，你睇番你 135 頁。

答：唔。唔。

問：最後嗰度。

答：135 頁呵？

問：係嘞。

答：係。

問：你呢度講特別就是就住 2015 年 7 月 17 號，透過電郵發畀保華個送貨單，特別係講呢樣嘢嘅。

答：係。

問：係。有咩嘢原因你要特別講呢樣嘢出嚟，喺你個證人口供？

答：噃因為我一見到抬頭嗰張就係送貨單咁嘛。

問：唔。

答：係，嗰份嘢裏面，有張送貨單囉，係呀，係呀。

問：唔係，我個意思係話有咩嘢原因特別你要就住呢啲送貨單--即係 7 月 17 號你交畀保華嘅送貨單，要特別就住呢樣嘢係加多一段說明呢？

答：哦，即係你話點解要說明送貨單呀？因...

問：即係點解要講呢件事出嚟呀？

答：哦。

問：7 月 17 號。

答：噃。因為翁生叫我將啲送貨單同埋有啲水務署嘅文件 e 畀佢咁嘛，咁

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

我印象裏面，同埋我望到佢檯面第一份都係送貨單，所以我咪照講送貨單。係呀。

問：唔。

許偉強先生：冇其他問題。

主席：冇人有問題。

好，唔該晒，走得。

答：好，得嘞。好呀，唔該你。

主席：唔。

我哋今日就聽住咁多證供先，我哋聽日再繼續，聽朝早，唔該。

2016年1月11日

下午1時21分聆訊押後

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C Monday, 11 January 2016 C

D (10.06 am) D

E (Transcript of simultaneous interpretation E

F except where otherwise specified) F

G MR HUI WANG SAN (on former affirmation) G

H Cross-examination by MR KHAW (continued) H

I MR KHAW: Good morning, Mr Hui. I

J Last Thursday, we talked about your knowledge of J

K lead-free solder. That was last Thursday. So I would K

L like to follow up on that with you. L

M Last Thursday, during the cross-examination, you M

N mentioned that since the lead in water incident in July N

O last year, you first heard about lead-free solder; O

P right? P

Q A. Yes. Q

R Q. You also told us that before the incident, you thought R

S all along that all soldering materials for plumbing S

T purposes were lead-free. T

U A. Yes. U

V Q. Well, you said that before the incident, you were quite V

sure that all soldering materials or soldering strips

were lead-free. Did anyone tell you that?

A. No. I thought that the materials provided should have

been lead-free.

Q. So that was your opinion; right?

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A. Yes.

Q. Before the lead in water incident, had you discussed with anyone the constituents of soldering materials?

A. No.

Q. Generally speaking, whenever sites receive or use solder, how would you describe the soldering material to the workers?

A. I would describe them as soldering strips.

Q. Mr Hui, before you joined Golden Day, were you acquainted with Mr Cheung Tat Yam?

A. Are you referring to before I joined?

Q. Yes?

A. Yes, I did know him.

Q. When did you first know him?

A. In our previous company, we worked together. I wasn't very close to this person.

Q. You said your previous employer had correspondence with Mr Cheung, that's why you knew him; right?

A. Yes.

Q. Before you joined Golden Day, how long had you known Mr Cheung for? Ten years?

A. Just a few years.

Q. Before you joined Golden Day, did you know Mr Yung Kwok Choi?

A. Well, it's the same.

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C Q. What do you mean? C

D A. Yes, I knew him. D

E Q. How did you know him? E

F A. I used to be his staff. F

G Q. Which means, in your previous employer, Mr Yung was your G
H supervisor; right? H

I A. Yes. I

J Q. Was your previous employer a plumbing company as well? J

K A. Yes. K

L Q. So, in your previous employer, you had known Mr Yung for L
M a few years; right? How many years was that? M

N A. Five to six years. N

O Q. Meanwhile, did you know Ms Lam Lai King from your O
P previous employer? P

Q A. I wasn't that close with her, but I knew her. I had Q
R some correspondence with her in the office. R

S Q. So, in your previous employer, Mr Yung and Ms Lam were S
T both your former colleagues; right? T

U A. Yes. U

V Q. So you have known Ms Lam for a similar time period as V
W Mr Yung; right? W

X A. Yes. X

Y Q. Did the three of you join Golden Day at around the same Y
Z time? Z

A A. I think I joined a little bit earlier than Mr Yung. A

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Q. Was it a matter of months?

A. Yes, probably one year or so.

Q. As you know, Ms Lam and Mr Yung joined Golden Day at
around the same time; right?

A. Yes.

Q. Last Thursday, we asked you about the situation after
the lead in water incident. So you did have some
discussions in the company on what to do; right?

A. No, we didn't discuss much with the office people. We
were at the work sites, and we discussed the issue with
the staff at the sites. We seldom come back to the
office.

Q. After the lead in water incident, had you ever discussed
with Mr Cheung on whether the materials ordered might be
problematic?

A. No.

Q. Are you sure?

A. Yes.

Q. Last Thursday, you told me that you had discussed the
issue with your colleagues.

A. The colleagues referred to my colleagues at the sites.

Q. Had you ever mentioned this issue with staff from the
procurement department, including Ms Lam and Mr Chau?

A. I only made a call to Patrick Wong.

Q. When you called him, was the call made at around July?

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A. The call was made after the lead in water incident.

Q. The lead in water incident was revealed in around July.

A. Yes.

Q. So you made the call around that time; right?

A. After the incident at Wing Cheong Estate, I made the call.

Q. In other words, you knew that there was an issue, and that you are involved, you made the call; right?

A. Yes.

Q. Over your phone conversation with Patrick Wong -- well, did you make the call or did he do it?

A. I called him.

Q. Why did you call him?

A. I wanted to ask him whether samples were ever submitted to the Housing Department. I never knew that this material was approved by the Housing Department.

Q. So you asked Patrick Wong if samples of the soldering material had ever been submitted, and before you asked him that question you never knew that samples had to be submitted for solder, and you knew that there are procedures for sampling submission; right?

A. Yes, I do, but I didn't know if this material had to be submitted.

Q. So the first thing you asked was whether this material had to be submitted.

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C A. Of course he said yes afterwards. C

D Q. Well, when you made the call and asked him this D
question, what did he say?

E A. He didn't give a concrete answer but at the end he said E
yes, samples were submitted.

F Q. Did you ask what kind of materials were ordered? F

G A. Well, I don't think I needed to ask that question. Are G
you referring to soldering strips?

H Q. Yes. H

I A. There's no need to ask this question. I

J Q. You knew you had got into trouble, so when you called J
Mr Wong, you knew that your company ordered

K non-compliant solder? K

L A. Yes, because we already went into trouble, so we knew L
that the solder ordered were leaded.

M Q. So at that time you discussed what kind of issues arose. M

N Did anyone tell you that the wrong materials were N
ordered?

O A. That's not necessary. O

P Q. Mr Hui, you said you knew what happened and there's no P
need to ask that question. So my question is, who told

Q you that the wrong materials were ordered? Q

R A. Well, no one at the company told us, but after R
discussing the issue with my colleagues, everyone knew.

S Q. What did you know? S

T

U

V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. We knew that WL50 was problematic.	C
D	Q. How did you know that the WL50D was problematic? First of all, what's wrong with WL50D?	D
E	A. They used this material and ran into trouble.	E
F	Q. Hold on a second. How did you know that this material was the root of the problem at that time. There were	F
G	a lot of possible reasons and there was no Commission at that time.	G
H	A. We watched the news quite often and we showed them the	H
I	news.	I
J	Q. Did the news specifically mention WL50D?	J
K	A. No, at that time.	K
L	Q. I would like to sort out your evidence. You said you discussed with workers and knew that WL50D was	L
M	problematic. My question is, what's wrong with WL50D?	M
N	A. Back then I knew.	N
O	Q. How did you know?	O
P	A. I really didn't know beforehand. I only knew when people talked with me.	P
Q	Q. Who?	Q
R	A. The staff, because all workers in Hong Kong and Kowloon talked about this.	R
S	(Chinese spoken).	S
T	Q. (Chinese spoken).	T
U	A. (Chinese spoken).	U
V		V

Q. (Chinese spoken).

A. (Chinese spoken).

Q. Let's talk about WL50D first. You were discussing with workers; did you just say in general soldering materials were problematic, or did you say specifically that WL50D was problematic?

A. I probably said that this was problematic.

Q. You mentioned WL50D?

A. No, certainly not. We talked about soldering strips, and it's only after we had the evidence that we knew WL50D was problematic.

Q. I just want to sort it out. You said that you were discussing with the workers, and they did not specifically mention WL50D, they only said that the soldering strips could be problematic. When you heard that, did you immediately think about the soldering strips your company was using?

A. Yes.

Q. Back then, did WL50D come to your mind?

A. No, no, there was no this name.

Q. So back then, you did not specifically think that your company was using WL50D but the soldering strips being used might be problematic and therefore you called Patrick Wong?

A. Yes.

Q. You asked him whether samples had been submitted. You said first he didn't give a concrete answer and then finally he said yes. Back then, did you follow up on whether there was something went wrong in issuing orders for soldering strips?

A. No. The orders were made by me. We already knew that we got into trouble.

Q. Did you say to Mr Wong, "I made the orders. How did the procurement department make orders?"

A. No, we didn't. It was pointless to discuss that.

Q. In your dialogue with Patrick Wong, you just asked him whether the soldering material had samples submitted?

A. No. I just wanted to confirm whether samples had been submitted, so I asked him.

Q. Submission of samples -- why did you want to know in particular?

A. Because if there samples were submitted I would adhere to the samples, for sure.

Q. He said samples were submitted, and if samples were submitted then you would for sure follow the samples. Obviously, after samples were submitted, no one from the company followed up with you.

A. Yes, that's the case.

Q. Then why did you say to Patrick Wong, "How come you didn't know samples had been submitted?"

A. I should have said so.

Q. No, no, no. Let's not talk about what you should. I'm asking, can you remember whether you said to him to this effect, "How come I didn't know that samples had been submitted?" Did you question him?

A. I think I should have scolded him.

Q. Ah, you scolded him. What was his response?

A. He didn't really answer me.

Q. He didn't answer you?

A. No.

Q. In the whole incident -- Mr Hui, if samples were submitted without your knowing, you had done nothing wrong?

A. No, I haven't.

Q. So you discussed with Mr Wong the submission of samples, and you scolded him for not telling you that samples had been submitted. Other than that, have you discussed with any staff in the company?

A. No. Once he had said that -- knew that we had got into trouble, it was pointless to discuss with anyone.

Q. Let's not say whether it's pointless. Have you ever discussed with anyone?

A. No.

Q. Before making this statement, have you discussed with anyone from the company, "Now, I have to give evidence

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	at the COI. Is there any information that I should know?"	C
D	A. Yes, a little bit.	D
E	Q. What?	E
F	A. Discussion on the statement.	F
G	Q. Whom did you discuss with in the company?	G
H	A. With Ms Lam.	H
I	Q. So you did discuss with Ms Lam. Did you ask her anything about submission of sample?	I
J	A. No, no longer.	J
K	Q. What was the main content of your discussion with Ms Lam?	K
L	A. How I communicate with lawyers, what lawyer to instruct.	L
M	Q. As far as the actual soldering strips ordered, did you discuss with Ms Lam?	M
N	A. No.	N
O	Q. Did you follow up with Ms Lam? Did you know back then that samples had been submitted?	O
P	A. No, no.	P
Q	Q. You had never discussed with Ms Lam?	Q
R	A. I think discussion with Patrick Wong is sufficient.	R
S	Q. So, from your point of view, it was Mr Patrick Wong's omission. Did you know that Mr Yung was also responsible for submission of samples?	S
T	A. Yes, I know, he and Patrick Wong.	T
U		U
V		V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Q. Do you agree with me that the fact that they didn't follow up with you after sample submitted, Mr Yung should be partly accountable?

A. Yes, he should be accountable too. But in the main it should be Patrick Wong who should inform me.

Q. You knew that Mr Yung was also responsible for submission of samples?

A. Yes.

Q. Did you know that Mr Cheung, your main employer, knew that samples were submitted?

A. Well, he is so senior, he may not know.

Q. So you are not sure whether he knew or not?

A. No.

Q. Did you say to Mr Wong, "How come you didn't actually know that samples had been submitted?"

A. No, it's useless to talk about that afterwards.

Q. And have you discussed with Mr Yung before the statement was prepared?

A. No.

Q. You said you had discussions with Ms Lam. She's the only one?

A. Yes, discussion with Ms Lam, talked about finding of lawyer.

Q. And what about Ms Chau; did you discuss with her?

A. There's no Ms Chau. Ms Mok.

Q. I beg your pardon, it should be Ms Mok.

A. No, I didn't.

Q. In your discussion with Ms Lam, did she say, "I ordered goods as you told me"?

A. Yes, yes, that was the case.

Q. I want to know what was your exact conversation with Ms Lam. You said, "Yes, that's the case". I would like to know what exactly was your conversation. In your communication with Ms Lam, did she say, "Mr Hui, you called me and made such orders, and I followed suit"?

A. I didn't know. I think she made similar remarks. She said that I made orders according to what you said.

Q. Then what was your attitude when you heard that?

A. Attitude? There was not much attitude. It was things gone.

Q. But did you say to her in your office, "You knew what samples were submitted and you knew what was ordered, and why didn't you check?" Did you say this to Mr Wong and Ms Lam?

A. Ms Lam is more senior than I am. I am in no position to tell her off.

Q. But even if you didn't scold her, did you follow up with her whether you knew that samples were already submitted?

A. No, no, I didn't ask her this, no.

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Q. What else was in your conversation with Ms Lam?

A. It's more or less these simple things, because I didn't really face her.

Q. Those soldering strips were delivered together with those plumbing parts. When they were delivered to the site, you were the contact person, because we saw your name, Mr Hui, on the delivery notes.

A. Yes.

Q. So, when the goods were delivered, you would know for sure?

A. The supplier would call me to let me know.

Q. So, prior to delivery, they would inform you?

A. The driver, the driver of the delivery van.

Q. So he would tell you when the goods would arrive?

A. No, no. They would only say that "goods would arrive today".

Q. And you didn't know what would be delivered?

A. No.

Q. And after you were informed, did you have to inform the staff of the main contractor?

A. No. These nitty-gritty things -- for the minor items, I didn't have to tell them. But for very bulky items, I would inform the main contractor to find space to store the big items. But the small items, I didn't have to tell them.

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Q. You talked about minor items, but for bulky items you had to tell them so they knew how to store them.	C
D	So the supplier would call you to tell you what goods would be delivered. That means you would know what would be delivered, otherwise how could you tell whether they were big or small items?	D
E		E
F		F
G	A. Yes. Well, for large items, they would inform me one day ahead, because I had to inform the site one day beforehand to get space.	G
H		H
I	Q. So, for large items, they would tell you one day beforehand and you would know what they were. What about soldering materials?	I
J		J
K	A. No, no.	K
L	Q. They would never tell you beforehand?	L
M	A. No.	M
N	Q. But will soldering materials be delivered together with bulky items?	N
O	A. Yes. Maybe.	O
P	Q. But they will not inform you on the phone?	P
Q	A. No, they will only inform me of the big items but not the sundry items.	Q
R	Q. When materials arrive at site, have you been there at the site to receive soldering materials?	R
S	A. Should be, but rather infrequently. Usually, it will be the staff who did it. Usually, the staff receive the	S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	goods. The sites are really big, so I'm not always there.	C
D	Q. So, in other words, you are not there all the time; you	D
E	are not always in a position to receive the goods?	E
F	A. Yes.	F
G	Q. Now let's look at the records. S1, starting from	G
H	page 79. Now let's look at the delivery notes on	H
I	page 81. Here it's about Hung Hom Estate and the	I
J	Ma Hang Headland Park site. Do you see that?	J
K	A. Yes.	K
L	Q. The co-ordinator is Mr Hui, yourself. This is	L
M	a delivery note, and there are three items. UK FRY	M
N	flux -- have you seen this item, the flux?	N
O	A. Yes, I saw them upon receiving the items.	O
P	Q. So those are in yellow tins?	P
Q	A. Yes.	Q
R	Q. You saw them on site?	R
S	A. Yes. This is the kind of flux we have always used.	S
T	Q. That's all right. I'm not asking you that question. It	T
U	looks like this (indicating), right, in a yellow can,	U
V	FRY Powerflow flux? So you have seen this item many	V
	times at the site; right?	
	A. Yes, we have always used this item.	
	Q. The second item, UK FRY lead-free soldering wire, 20	
	bundles. Then we have some plastic plates. The	

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

receiving party is Golden Day Engineering Co Ltd. Was
it your signature?

A. Yes, probably.

Q. Now let's look at another record, on page 92. Another
delivery note issued by Prosperity. It's also on
Hung Hom Estate Phase 2. You are also the receiving
party, and again you are the co-ordinator, and the first
item is UK WL50D, 165 pounds. Do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. Underneath, the receiving party is Golden Day
Engineering Co Ltd, and there is a signature. Was it
your signature?

A. No. It was my colleague's.

Q. Who was it?

A. Well, can I not disclose the name of that staff?

Q. You don't want to disclose the name, but we want to know
it.

A. The staff was called Mr Wong Yui Hong.

Q. Was it one of your colleagues?

A. Yes. He was my colleague.

Q. Did he belong to Golden Day?

A. Well, all staff belonged to Golden Day, but he was my
subordinate.

Q. So he was one of the workers employed by yourself for
this project; right?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. Yes.	C
D	Q. So who paid him?	D
E	A. Golden Day.	E
F	Q. In other words, at the work site, either yourself would sign, if you were present?	F
G	A. If I was present, I would receive the goods. If I wasn't, then I would see which of my colleagues were in a position to receive the goods.	G
H	Q. Before your workers received the goods, did you tell them when they should sign? Did you issue any instructions?	H
I	A. Yes, they had to check whether the deliveries were complete. They had to count the number of boxes, and so on.	I
J	Q. Did they have to check the brands?	J
K	A. No. As long as they knew the type of materials and quantities, then they could sign.	K
L	Q. So basically they look at the number of boxes; right?	L
M	A. Yes.	M
N	Q. So that was the instruction you gave to your workers. What about for yourself? Did you do the same? If you were the receiving party, you wouldn't look at the brands; right?	N
O	A. Right.	O
P	Q. So you would look at the items; as long as the	P
Q		Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

quantities look right, then you would sign?

A. The time was very short. The trucks would have to leave immediately.

Q. If you don't check the items against the brands, then how did you know that they were the right materials?

A. With experience, we knew what they looked like.

Q. So you had a rough idea what you needed, but if you only looked at the quantities but not the brands, how could you tell that the deliveries were correct?

A. For Tung Kee plastic tubes, then the brands delivered would always be right, but for the deliveries made by other companies, there might be mistakes or errors.

Q. So, in other words, everything delivered by Prosperity would be assumed correct?

A. For small fittings delivered from Prosperity, we would assume it's right.

Q. For Bun Kee deliveries, you would assume that they were right?

A. Yes.

Q. And you wouldn't check whether the brands were correct?

A. No. Bun Kee was an expert in that brand.

Q. For soldering materials -- well, in other words, the sundry items you referred to, they were sundry items, so when the soldering materials arrived, they were delivered by Prosperity and you wouldn't check the

brands when you received the goods?

A. Yes.

Q. After receiving the items, they would be opened and used immediately; right?

A. Yes.

Q. In the delivery notes you just saw and signed by yourself, you saw the words "lead-free soldering wire". Apart from Hung Hom Estate, for Tung Wui Estate and Wing Cheong Estate, there are also delivery notes with the item WL50D. So, at the construction site, you told us last Thursday that you knew that in some cases both materials were used, and I would like to look into that.

You said, at the construction site, sometimes both materials were used. When we look at the delivery notes, when you were at the site, you knew that according to the delivery notes, there were both soldering strips and soldering wires; were you aware of that? According to the delivery notes.

A. Yes, I saw that.

Q. So, at that time, you saw that there were both soldering wires and soldering strips. So the brands and descriptions were different. One is WL50D and the other is FRY lead-free soldering wire. So these are very different. So, at that time, did you consider the fact that these two materials were different?

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A. Well, the shapes were different.

Q. The shapes were different?

A. But, as far as I know, the materials or textures were the same.

Q. Before, you told us that when you took the exam for the full trade test certificate, you had been using soldering strips; right?

A. Yes.

Q. Now, you have always called them soldering strips. When you look at the delivery notes, you saw -- when you saw the words "lead-free soldering wire", did you consider whether they might be different?

A. At that time, we didn't know about these things, so we used whatever we had.

Q. For the goods delivered, you saw that there were both items.

A. Yes.

Q. Now, before you started using the materials, when they were laid out in the construction site, whether for soldering strips or green rolls of solder, where would the materials be stored?

A. They would be placed in the workshops.

Q. They would be laid out in the workshops.

A. No, they would be placed at the corner.

Q. Now, for the Hung Hom Estate site, in the workshops you

had seen both types of solder, right, at the same time?

A. Yes.

Q. So, as we saw, the shapes were very different, so these
are strips and those are in rolls (indicating)?

INTERPRETER: Apologies, the speaker is not coming through.

A. I didn't consider that. I used whatever available.

MR KHAW: You wouldn't know that that material was

lead-free. Did you ever consider calling the office --
on the differences between both solder, did you try to
ask which material or item you should use?

A. No, we didn't think about that.

CHAIRMAN: Can you repeat that? I can't hear you.

A. It was a very ordinary item so we didn't pay much
attention.

COMMISSIONER LAI: But these two materials are very
different, look very different.

A. Yes, they look different.

COMMISSIONER LAI: The usage was very different.

A. Well, the usage was the same.

COMMISSIONER LAI: The time required for solder was very
different.

A. Well, similar, they were similar.

COMMISSIONER LAI: Was it the same or similar?

A. The time required for soldering, the difference is very
small, only 3 to 5 seconds, so the usage was similar.

COMMISSIONER LAI: Did you ever try it yourself?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: If there were no differences, why didn't you use soldering wire?

A. I didn't understand why both strips and wires were delivered.

CHAIRMAN: Mr Hui, now, from the evidence we have taken in so far, for public rental estate projects, only one type of soldering wire was used, everyone knows.

A. Everyone knows. I don't think so.

CHAIRMAN: You said there was no difference between both items, so what's the point of using the other item?

A. This I don't know.

MR KHAW: You said you had used both items yourself. For these two sites we are talking about, during the construction stage, did you personally use these two items?

A. Speaking from personal experience, yes.

Q. Have you ever carried out the soldering?

A. Yes, for some minor parts. For example, samples.

I didn't have to do anything in bulk.

Q. For the sample flats, you would help; right?

A. Yes, and I would carry out some steps first only.

Q. In creating the sample flat, you would use the soldering materials, so as you created the sample flat you knew

that both soldering materials existed; right?

A. For the sample flat, we probably just used one item. At the beginning, before the construction began, the first batch of soldering material could last a long time. I don't know which item arrived first. If the tin strips arrived first, we would use strips for the sample flat.

Q. For Hung Hom Estate, you were involved in the preparation of the sample flat and you had to use solder; right?

A. Yes.

Q. You said, when creating the sample flat, you would be involved, and afterwards you wouldn't be personally involved in a lot of soldering?

A. Because of heavy workload, I had a lot of things to take care of.

Q. When creating the sample flats, which item did you use? Can you recall that?

A. I don't remember. It was years ago. Both items were used, but for the sample flat, I cannot remember which item was used.

Q. At the two sites, do you recall ever using this type of solder?

A. Yes, I did for Hung Hom Estate.

Q. When you used this item, I would like to know how. Let

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C me finish first. Would you take out, cut out, segments C
from the roll?

D A. No, no. I just take it as it is. D

E Q. So you will just take this roll and do it, like this? E
(Demonstrating).

F A. Yes. F

G Q. Have you seen workers working with this item at Hung Hom G
Estate?

H A. Yes. H

I Q. And how did they do it? Did they follow your practice? I

J Hang on. Did they take this roll and do it this way J
(demonstrating), or did they cut it up into segments?

K A. Both. Quite varied. They have different practices. K

L Some may take out a whole length and then make it into L
a ball. So it's less heavy if they have --

M Q. So some workers would take them out and cut it up into M
segments? Well, if they did cut it up, they might as

N well not take it out. N

O A. Even if they didn't use scissors or they use a hammer to O
cut it.

P Q. So they took an appropriate length? P

Q A. Yes, not so heavy. Q

R Q. According to your experience, which one would be more R
efficient, for this item?

S A. (Chinese spoken). S

T

U

V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Q. Which item are you talking about? The one in green?	C
	A. Green. It's neat and tidy.	
D	Q. Why do you say neat and tidy?	D
	A. Because the finishing looks better.	
E	Q. Why?	E
	A. Well, this is a bit different from that one. It's	
F	easier, easier to run, that one is not so easy.	F
	Q. This one runs better (indicating), and this one not so	
G	good (indicating)?	G
	A. A little bit harder, but not too much.	
H	Q. Some soldering workers said, if this strip is used -- if	H
	this soldering strip is used, not the green one, but	
I	this one (indicating) -- the wastage would be bigger.	I
	Would you agree?	
J	A. Wastage?	J
	Q. Yes, in the process, more would be wasted.	
K	A. Yes, because the end would be thrown away.	K
	Q. I would like to ask, for Hung Hom Estate, when works	
L	were done at site, would you liaise with the foreman of	L
	China State?	
M	A. Yes.	M
	Q. Do you a certain Mr Lee Hung Fai?	
N	A. I won't know their full name. I may address him as	N
	Fai Gor. I don't know we are talking about the same	
O	Fai Gor.	O
P		P
Q		Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Q. (Chinese spoken).	C
D	A. Fai Gor is the deputy chief executive officer -- no, the chief -- the deputy foreman.	D
E	Q. Do you know a foreman called Fai Gor?	E
F	A. I don't think so.	F
G	Q. I would like to know, at site, whether there would be staff from China State to explain to you what materials to use?	G
H	A. No.	H
I	Q. For sure?	I
J	A. No. They don't really have that common, general knowledge, because plumbing is a very professional department. They may not have any general knowledge on plumbing works.	J
K	Q. So they don't know at all?	K
L	A. They don't.	L
M	Q. They rely on you entirely?	M
N	A. Yes. We are the professionals.	N
O	Q. We are talking about materials for plumbing systems. So they will never -- they have never talked to you about materials to use?	O
P	A. Never.	P
Q	Q. Mr Lee said something in this COI. I would like you to read them before I ask you questions. If we go to transcript bundle 3, Day 24 --	Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

C CHAIRMAN: Perhaps you read it out directly. C

MR KHAW: Yes, I will read it out.

D Here it says -- I asked him: D

E "Would training be given? Will there be training E
and briefing on different aspects for workmen and
F workers? F

G Answer: Yes." G

H Then I asked him again, on page 10 of the H
transcript, at G, a little bit further down, at I -- can
I you see it, Mr Hui? I

J A. Yes. J

Q. I asked:

K "So the briefing, was it done separately for K
L different areas, for instance for plumbing works there L
would be a specific briefing and for items another
M briefing, and they are not done together in the same M
N briefing? N

O Answer: Yes, they were done separately. O

P Question: When briefing is done on plumbing works, P
would it be before the plumbing works?

Q Answer: In fact, for workers of a particular trade, Q
when they enter the site, there will be a briefing.

R Question: You said that before the start of work of R
S a particular area of work, there would be a briefing. S
T We know that in general, for plumbing works, they T

usually start at a later stage of a project; right?

Answer: Yes.

Question: That is, if it's the first day of the plumbing works, when workers arrive, there will be a briefing at site; right?

Answer: No, the briefing is done at the office.

Question: At the office of, for instance, Golden Day, will the plumber also be there?

Answer: The plumber? That Mr Lam will be there."

This morning, when I read the transcript, I thought it was a bit different from the English transcript. There, it said "Mr Hui Wang San", and then I checked the Chinese audio recording. Indeed, it should be Mr Hui Wang San, and he said specifically that Hui Wang San would be there.

A. Yes.

Q. You would be there.

The so-called office or the briefing done at that office -- first, this is China State's statement. Were there such briefings in the first place?

A. I don't think there was such a briefing.

Q. Can I ask you, in effect, whether there was or not?

A. No. Training -- on the first day of joining, all workers will have to go through safety training.

Training or safety only, not specifically on plumbing

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C works. C

D Q. Not specifically on plumbing works. D

E A. No. E

F Q. So what you mean is, at site, for on-site briefing, F
there is none on plumbing works but just on safety?

G A. Just safety. G

H Q. Let's go down a little bit further, because your name H
was mentioned. Towards the bottom I asked:

I "Did Mr Cheung Tat Yam come to these briefings? I

J Answer: I could not recall clearly. J

K Question: How many workers would be present at the K
office?

L Answer: Usually, workers did not come in one go. L

M Every time they come in batches of five or ten. So we M
give briefings to every batch of five or ten.

N Question: Every time it's like this? N

O Answer: Yes." O

P Mr Pang, AQCC, do you know him? P

Q A. Yes. Q

R Q. He said every time the briefings were done by Mr Pang. R

S "Question: Were you present every time? S
Answer: Yes.

T Question: You know there are PLU1 and PLU2 T
specifications for the materials?"

U That we can skip. Let's go to page 12. Page 12, at U

V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C around J, I was talking about flux. Can you see at J, C
the question, I was talking about flux.

D "Question: Flux, can you see it? D

E "Answer: Yes. E

F Question: So you did receive photos. Did you see F
the actual item?

G Answer: I did. G

H Question: Were the actual samples shown to workers H
at briefings?

I Answer: No. I

J Question: So you rely on photos only? J

K Answer: Yes. K

L Question: I would like to ask you, at the briefing, L
those photos of green rolls of metal strips, were they
shown to workers every time?

M Answer: Yes, every time. M

N Question: When you showed workers these photos, did N
Mr Pang explain the composition of the material?

O Answer: No. O

P Question: Did he mention that they were lead-free P
solder?

Q Answer: Yes. Q

R Question: Every time? R

S Answer: Yes, every time this was said. S

T Question: It was said by Mr Pang every time? T

U

V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Answer: Yes.	C
	Question: How long would the briefing be?	
D	Answer: 15 to 20 minutes, roughly."	D
E	That was said in the transcript.	E
F	According to the evidence, Mr Pang would explain to workers the materials, showing them photos. First	F
G	Mr Pang would explain to workers materials, about the	G
H	materials. Do you agree to this?	H
I	A. No, I disagree.	I
J	Q. Mr Pang, in his briefing, would show workers pictures of these green rolls?	J
K	A. I disagree.	K
L	Q. You have never seen such things happening?	L
M	A. No.	M
N	Q. "Yes" or "no", please?	N
O	A. I really don't feel that I have seen such things.	O
P	Q. You told us there were safety training. Were they conducted by Mr Pang?	P
Q	A. No, by the safety department.	Q
R	Q. Have you ever seen Mr Pang giving any briefings to workers?	R
S	A. Mr Tam?	S
T	Q. Mr Pang.	T
U	A. I apologise. No.	U
V	Q. For these safety briefings you mentioned for the	V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

workers, were you present?

A. No. For induction briefings, they had to undergo an induction at the safety department. It would last one or two hours. The first batch of -- those who joined at the first day would attend the briefing. No matter which trade, they would have to attend an induction.

Q. If Mr Pang had explained to the workers, for instance, lead-free solder, is there any possibility that you were not in the know?

A. I don't think it's possible.

Q. Why are you so sure?

A. For plumbing works, I was the site supervisor. If they used such materials, there is no reason they wouldn't notify myself.

Q. For the workers you employed for the fresh water plumbing works, had they worked for you for many years?

A. A small percentage of them. Some of them were new recruits. So, when we needed to get work done, we would try to recruit people.

Q. You told us that you were sometimes personally involved in the soldering procedures for the sample flats. Did you issue any instructions to your workers on how to conduct the soldering?

A. No. It's unnecessary, because they are all skilled.

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Q. And you never mentioned the materials to be used; right?

A. Yes.

Q. At the construction site, as far as solder is concerned, how would you describe such soldering materials?

A. We would describe them as soldering strips.

Q. Even when you saw that on the delivery notes lead-free soldering wires were specified, and they were different as the green reels of solder you were used to seeing, would you still describe the green reels of solder as soldering strips?

A. Yes.

Q. We heard the evidence given by Mr Yung and Ms Lam, and we know that Golden Day had submitted fake delivery notes to Paul Y. There were four forged delivery notes. Were you personally aware of that?

A. I only knew about it a few days ago.

Q. How about prior to that? Had you ever heard about that from the company or the office?

A. No.

Q. You said during the Inquiry you heard about the four forged delivery notes. Had you tried to find out with anyone at the office what happened?

A. No, because that had nothing to do with us.

Q. Did you ever try to find out, out of curiosity?

A. No.

C MR KHAW: I have no further questions. C

CHAIRMAN: Any other questions?

D Thank you very much, Mr Hui. Your part is done. D

E (The witness withdrew) E

Next, who do we have?

F MR WU: Chairman, now I summon Mr Chau. Mr Chau See Ming, F

G the site supervisor for Tung Wui Estate. G

MR CHAU SEE MING (affirmed)

H CHAIRMAN: Please be seated. H

I Examination-in-chief by MR WU I

J MR WU: Mr Chau, for the hearing you came up with a written
K statement on 3 December last year. Now I will read out
your written statement: K

L "1. I am a site supervisor of Golden Day
M Engineering Co Ltd, responsible for the plumbing works
at Tung Wui Estate. I have been in the plumbing trade
N for more than 30 years, and I am also a registered
skilled worker in plumbing. N

O 2. I am responsible for making orders to the
P procurement staff of Golden Day, based on the site
Q progress, and I would demand the required quantities of
R solder to be delivered to the site, and after that the
procurement staff of Golden Day would order the
S soldering material from the supplier of Tung Wui Estate,
T in other words Prosperity Building Co Ltd. T

3. Before this incident, I did not know that the solder for connecting fresh water pipes must be lead-free.

4. I made orders to the procurement staff of Golden Day and specified the required quantities of solder and the delivery dates. Since it is generally believed in the plumbing trade that solder is a sundry item, before the incident the trade, including myself, was generally not aware that the solder available in the market might contain lead. At that time, I also didn't know that leaded solder was available on the market, so when I made the orders I did not specifically mention the fact that the solder delivered must align or the same be the sample submitted to the Housing Department and that they must be lead-free.

5. At that time, based on the site progress, I made orders to the procurement staff of Golden Day by phone and I specified the quantities of solder required and the delivery dates. After that, the procurement staff of Golden Day would order from Prosperity. After that, Prosperity would arrange for the required items to be delivered to the sites directly. Since the procurement staff of Golden Day was responsible for making the orders to the suppliers, I myself did not directly contact Prosperity. When preparing this written

statement, I made enquiries to the procurement staff of Golden Day, but they said they forgot whether they had mentioned to Prosperity that the solder used would be for connecting fresh water pipes.

6. Golden Day chose the supplier for soldering materials, and I didn't know why Golden Day would choose Prosperity as the solder supplier. I only knew that Prosperity had always been one of the suppliers of Golden Day. As I understand, Golden Day also did not know when they started using Prosperity as their solder supplier.

7. Since I did not personally make orders to Prosperity, it was done by the procurement department of Golden Day. I did not have to report to Golden Day, that is relating to ordering. When making deliveries, Prosperity would attach delivery notes, and according to the Golden Day procurement department, after delivery Prosperity would deliver an invoice to Golden Day for payment purposes.

8. I am not aware of the differences between solder wires and strips and I don't know whether there would be differences in their contents. I only know that both would be used for copper pipes and soldering purposes. Since I don't know the differences between soldering wires and strips, before the incident, the trade

generally did not pay attention to the fact that solder available on the market might contain lead, and at that time I didn't know that leaded solder was available on the market. That's why I didn't pay attention to the fact whether the items used were soldering strips or wire.

9. Before the incident, I didn't know about the brand WL50D, and I didn't know whether this brand contained lead. Prosperity did not recommend this brand to me. Beforehand, I did not know of the differences in content between soldering strips and wires, so I didn't pay attention to whether strips or wires were used in the construction. I wasn't sure whether the public rental estates I was involved in had ever used WL50D or other soldering strips.

10. I did not know whether the soldering strips procured from Prosperity and actually used at the sites would contain lead.

11. Before the incident, the plumbing trade generally considered solder a sundry item. At that time, I did not know the differences between soldering strips and wires. I felt that the uses were the same, and I didn't pay attention to the fact that solder available on the market might contain lead. Therefore, I did not pay attention to whether the procured and the

solder actually used contained lead.

12. At the beginning stage at each construction site, a sample flat was prepared for the approval from the main contractor and Housing Department. During the construction phase, the main contractor and Housing Department would make irregular inspections. But I didn't know if the main contractor or Housing Department had made inspections and paid attention to the actual solder used and whether they contain lead."

Mr Chau, would you accept the written statement I just read out as evidence for the purposes of this Commission?

A. Yes, I do.

Q. I have some questions for you. When you made these phone orders, when you ordered soldering material, how would you describe the item?

A. I would describe them as soldering strips.

Q. Soldering strips? All soldering strips?

A. Right.

Q. Did you specify the brand?

A. No.

MR WU: I have no further questions. Thank you.

Cross-examination by MR KHAW

MR KHAW: Mr Chau, in your witness statement, you said you had skilled worker registration. When did you take the

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	exam?	C
	A. Somewhere -- sometime in the 1990s.	
D	Q. So it's close to 20 years?	D
	A. 10-odd, 20 years.	
E	Q. We know that to take the trade test, you would be tested	E
F	on your soldering skills.	F
	A. Yes.	
G	Q. When you took the test, for that skilled, full trade	G
H	test certificate, were you using copper pipes?	H
	A. Yes.	
I	Q. And what soldering materials were used?	I
J	A. Soldering strips.	J
	Q. These soldering strips (indicating)?	
K	A. Yes.	K
	Q. Not about these green rolls (indicating)?	
L	A. Not back then.	L
	Q. When was the first time you saw these green rolls?	
M	A. In the recent four or five years.	M
	Q. Under what circumstances did you come to know this green	
N	roll of soldering materials?	N
O	A. In the private sector.	O
	Q. In private projects, working on the plumbing works,	
P	fresh water supply?	P
	A. Yes.	
Q	Q. So while you were working for Golden Day?	Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. Yes.	C
D	Q. You said four to five years ago, in a private project, you first came across this. Who showed you this?	D
E	A. It was delivered. This material was delivered.	E
F	Q. And prior to that you were using the silver strip?	F
G	A. Yes, that soldering strip.	G
H	Q. When in that private project, you saw this green roll for the first time, did someone tell you that it was lead-free?	H
I	A. No, I was told that it was soldering wire.	I
J	Q. Okay. Noted. This was called soldering wire.	J
K	A. Yes.	K
L	Q. And then, for the first time, you knew there was the distinction between soldering strip and wire?	L
M	A. I didn't know whether it was leaded or not.	M
N	Q. You just knew that the names were different?	N
O	A. Yes.	O
P	Q. When was the first time you heard of lead-free soldering materials?	P
Q	A. I never did. I only heard about soldering wires, and when this lead incident happened I knew about it.	Q
R	Q. We heard statements and evidence from other persons. I would like to ask about your experience. When did you join Golden Day?	R
S	A. In around 2000.	S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Q. So you have served the company for 15 to 16 years? Prior to joining Golden Day, did you know Mr Cheung?	C
D	A. No.	D
E	Q. Did you know Mr Hui Wang San?	E
	A. No.	
F	Q. Yung Kwok Choi?	F
	A. No.	
G	Q. Ms Lam?	G
H	A. No.	H
I	Q. Before you joined Golden Day, you knew none of the staff in the company?	I
J	A. No.	J
K	Q. So you were entirely new?	K
	A. Yes.	
L	Q. For the three estates in question -- Wing Cheong, Tung Wui and Hung Hom -- which one were you responsible?	L
M	A. Tung Wui.	M
	Q. Only Tung Wui?	
N	A. Yes.	N
O	Q. After you joined Golden Day, would you be responsible for calling your office? Were you responsible for that, starting from day one?	O
P	A. Yes.	P
Q	Q. In around 2000, you had not encountered the green rolls of soldering wires yet?	Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A. No.

Q. After you were made aware of these green rolls of soldering wires --

A. Yes.

Q. -- were you working for the company when you called your company to order soldering materials, in answering your lawyer's question you would say soldering strips?

A. Soldering strips.

Q. Only soldering strips?

A. Correct.

Q. You never used soldering wires; you never used the term?

A. Never.

Q. Is my explanation correct: all along, even though you already knew that there was this kind of soldering wires four or five years ago, you were of the view that when you made an order, when your company ordered, it would always be for soldering strips; it's never these green rolls of soldering wires? (Indicating)?

A. Yes, to put it simply, we would never know what samples were submitted. When we called the company, the company would order according to the samples submitted.

Q. So you didn't know what samples were submitted?

A. No.

Q. When was the first time you heard that for soldering materials, samples had to be submitted?

A. We never asked. Only the office would know about sample submission. We at the site wouldn't know. We knew that there was sample submission but we didn't know what samples were submitted.

Q. Now, you are here to give evidence. Before that, did you know that the company submitted samples for soldering materials?

A. I was not sure.

Q. You never asked?

A. Never.

Q. Did you discuss with Mr Hui whether samples were submitted for soldering materials?

A. Never.

Q. You didn't even discuss it?

A. Never.

Q. After the lead in water incident in July last year, did someone from the company discuss with you what orders were placed for soldering materials?

A. Yes, after the incident, I was asked what materials were used and what orders were made.

Q. Who asked you?

A. Mr Yung.

Q. At the office, or did he call you?

A. He called me.

Q. He asked you what orders were made, what materials were

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C used. C

D A. (Chinese spoken). D

E Q. Did he ask you about what orders were made or what materials were used? E

F A. He asked me what orders were placed. F

G Q. Did he ask you what material was used or did he ask you what was the material ordered? G

H A. All right, that was -- that incident, he asked me whether soldering strip or soldering wire was used, what material was used. I answered him, as far as I could remember, soldering strips were used. H

I Q. I think it was just a few months ago that Mr Yung asked you this. I

J A. After the incident. J

K Q. He did mention soldering strips and soldering wires, two things? K

L A. Yes. L

M Q. And he asked you which material was used? M

N A. Yes. N

O Q. He asked you what exactly was used for that site, and how did you answer him? O

P A. I said soldering strips. P

Q Q. Did he ask you what material was ordered by you by phone to the company? Q

R A. Yes, he did. R

S

T

U

V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C Q. And what did you say? C

D A. I said also soldering strips. D

E Q. Did he mention to you that lead-free soldering material E
should be used? E

F A. He did. F

G Q. Did he ask you whether you knew that lead-free soldering G
material should be used? G

H A. He did, and I said to him I didn't know what sample was H
submitted. I called the company and -- only the company H

I would know what material was in the sample. I

J Q. (Chinese spoken). J

K A. No, I did not see the sample. K

L Q. You did not know or you could not see what samples were L
submitted? L

M A. Yes. M

N Q. Was Mr Yung rather anxious? N

O A. Yes. O

P Q. He also wanted to find out the situation. P

Q A. He wanted to know whether there was any problem with P
that site and what material was used for that site. P

R Q. Did Mr Yung blame you for not knowing that lead-free Q
soldering material should be used? Q

S A. He grumbled a little bit, did I use the sample. R

T Q. No, my question is did Mr Yung blame you? S

U A. Yes, he did. T

V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Q. What did he say?	C
D	A. He said why didn't I use material according to the sample submitted.	D
E	Q. And how did you explain?	E
F	A. I said I didn't know what sample was submitted.	F
G	Q. Did he accept your explanation?	G
H	A. He did. He did.	H
I	Q. And he did not pursue further?	I
J	A. No.	J
K	Q. Apart from this conversation with Mr Yung, did any staff from Golden Day try to understand from you what material was used or what orders were placed?	K
L	A. No, no. Then there was another call. After the incident, there was another call.	L
M	Q. So Mr Yung only called you once; right?	M
N	A. Yes.	N
O	Q. Was that in the morning or in the evening?	O
P	A. It should be around in the afternoon.	P
Q	Q. And where were you?	Q
R	A. I was at the site. I was at site. I think it should be around lunchtime.	R
S	Q. What is the usual lunchtime?	S
T	A. 12 noon. He usually called us at noon, because when we were working, we couldn't answer the phone.	T
U	Q. So he called you when you were having lunch?	U
V		V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A. I think I should remember correctly, it was at lunch.

Q. Were other workers present?

A. Well, we were sitting eating together. There should be workers -- also workers from other trades, eating lunch there.

Q. Mr Yung gave you that call, and afterwards did you communicate to Mr Hui that Mr Yung asked about this?

A. No.

Q. You did not discuss with anyone from the company afterwards?

A. No.

Q. Apart from that phone call, did Mr Yung follow up with you on the use of the material, over the phone or face-to-face?

A. Yes, face-to-face at the site.

Q. And that's after that phone call?

A. Yes, after that phone call.

Q. How long was it afterwards?

A. A week or so afterwards. He came to the site.

Q. To Tung Wui?

A. No, to the site where I was working.

Q. Where was it?

A. Yau Tong.

Q. So he took the initiative to find you. What did he ask about?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. He asked whether I could remember correctly, did I order	C
	soldering strips or soldering wires, and I said	
D	soldering strips.	D
E	Q. So he was still talking about soldering strips or	E
	soldering wires?	
F	A. Yes.	F
G	Q. What else did you discuss?	G
H	A. No. We focused on the issue of leaded metal soldering	H
	strips.	
I	Q. During your discussion, were any documents shown?	I
J	A. No, just over the phone.	J
K	Q. Did you know the reason why he had to follow up with you	K
	at the site afterwards, after the phone call?	
L	A. To confirm with me what material was used.	L
M	Q. To confirm that?	M
	A. Yes.	
N	Q. Did he tell you whether he had checked with any staff in	N
	the company what material or what order was ordered?	
O	A. No, he didn't.	O
P	Q. So the conversation was very short?	P
Q	A. Very short.	Q
R	Q. How long?	R
	A. Just a few minutes, because he was in a hurry.	
S	Q. You or he was in a hurry?	S
T	A. Mr Yung was in a hurry to go.	T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Q. When the solder was delivered to the Tung Wui Estate	C
D	site, when they were delivered, you would receive the	D
E	goods?	E
F	A. Right.	F
G	Q. Would you sign on the delivery notes?	G
H	A. Yes, and I received most of the goods.	H
I	Q. Can you repeat that?	I
J	A. Most of the time, well, 99 per cent of the time,	J
K	I received the deliveries.	K
L	Q. For the materials delivered, for example solder, and if	L
M	you were the receiving party, would Prosperity inform	M
N	you ahead that some soldering materials were about to be	N
O	delivered?	O
P	A. No, they wouldn't notify which materials would be	P
Q	delivered.	Q
R	Q. For the delivery notes for Tung Wui Estate, let's look	R
S	at S1, page 212.	S
T	A. Yes.	T
U	Q. This is a delivery note; do you see that?	U
V	A. Yes.	V
	Q. First of all, it's from Prosperity, the client name	
	Golden Day, co-ordinator Mr Chung and Mr Chau. So	
	Mr Chau is yourself. Was Mr Chung another worker?	
	A. Yes.	
	Q. He was staff of Golden Day; right?	

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A. Yes.

Q. You said that 99 per cent of the time, you were the receiving party. So this is your signature; right?

A. Yes.

Q. When you received the goods, for soldering materials, they would be delivered in boxes; right?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: On page 212, the third item, silver brazing strips, what are they used for?

A. For larger pipes of at least 3 inches, this would be used.

CHAIRMAN: And for this item --

A. They would be used for bigger pipes.

CHAIRMAN: Do you know what they contain?

A. No. I only heard they would be used for silver brazing.

CHAIRMAN: Do you know they contain silver?

A. Yes. I knew both items can be used.

CHAIRMAN: Do you know if it contains lead?

A. No, I don't know that.

CHAIRMAN: For WL50D, do you know what it contains?

A. I have not seen that at that time. I only knew they were soldering strips.

CHAIRMAN: In other words, you didn't know what the "L" stands for, but for the silver brazing strips you knew that it contains silver.

A. Yes, right.

MR KHAW: Now let's look at page 210. Mr Chau, can I put it to you that generally speaking you only receive delivery notes but not invoices?

A. Yes.

Q. Now let's look at this invoice. At the top it says "UK WL50D solder strips", so generally speaking, if there's a delivery note, there should be an invoice. That's our understanding. So, when you receive the delivery notes for Tung Wui Estate, you would take a quick look at the note; right?

A. I would check the quantity, for example the number of boxes, for solder strips.

Q. All right. Now, for page 212, when the delivery note arrived, you would check the items on the delivery notes before you signed; right?

A. Yes.

Q. What I want to know is, when you signed the delivery notes for Tung Wui Estate, do you remember that some of the delivery notes contained the item WL50D solder strips?

A. No, I don't remember.

Q. Before you signed on these delivery notes, would you check the items being delivered?

A. Yes, I would. I would check the quantities.

Q. You would only check the quantities, in other words the number of boxes? You wouldn't check the actual items; right?

A. When the solder strips arrived, I would check the number of boxes.

MR KHAW: You wouldn't check the brands either; right?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: Now, for Tung Wui Estate, have you ever used both soldering strips and wires?

A. No. As far as I remember, we have always used solder strips, even for the sample flat.

MR KHAW: For Tung Wui Estate, have you personally carried out soldering?

A. Yes.

Q. What about for sample flats?

A. Yes.

Q. Apart from sample flats?

A. Yes, I did, for other parts.

Q. For the parts in which you were involved in soldering, you used silver soldering strips (indicating). Do you remember these boxes? Do you remember that there's a sticker, "WL50D solder strips", on the box?

A. I don't remember.

Q. But you remember these boxes; right?

A. Yes.

Q. If you open it, you will find solder strips. At the Tung Wui Estate site, had you ever seen these green reels of solder? (Indicating).

A. No.

Q. During the time you were with Golden Day, apart from Tung Wui Estate were you responsible for other public rental estate projects?

A. Yes.

Q. Can you name some of them?

A. Like Kwai Chung Estate, and some projects in Tuen Mun, and Fu Dei in Tuen Mun.

Q. For those two projects, had you seen these green reels of solder? You only saw silver solder strips; right?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: In other words, you last saw this green reel four to five years ago, in a private development. In your years with public rental estates, you have never seen that, even for sample flats?

A. Right. We have always used silver tin strips.

MR KHAW: You said that after the incident, Mr Yung called you once, and he visited one of the construction sites to discuss with you on the use of solder strips and wires.

Now, when you prepared your written submission, or before you prepared the submission, did you discuss the

issue of solder with anyone at Golden Day?

A. No.

Q. After preparing the submission and before you arrived at this Commission or Inquiry today, during this period, did anyone from the company discuss the differences between soldering strips and wires with you?

A. The boss did, Mr Cheung.

Q. Mr Cheung wanted to understand the situation; right?

A. Yes.

Q. You said the boss talked to you about this. Did it happen in the recent weeks?

A. Since problems were detected at Tung Wui Estate, we talked about it.

Q. So the discussion happened at a similar time as the one with Mr Cheung?

A. Yes.

Q. Now let's take it one by one. Mr Cheung discussed this with you by call.

A. Right.

Q. How many discussions have you had?

A. Around two or three times.

Q. When Mr Cheung called you, was he angry?

A. Yes. He blamed us for not using the proper material.

Q. So he scolded you; right?

A. Yes.

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Q. So what was your explanation?

A. I explained to him that we merely followed the sample submission, I don't know about that.

Q. You said he blamed you for using the wrong material. Now, at that time, did he explain to you that there was a sample submission and you had to follow the samples?

A. Yes, he did.

Q. So which material did he say you should use?

A. He said soldering strips.

Q. At that time, did he specifically mention lead-free soldering wire?

A. He only mentioned lead-free solder.

Q. Was he very angry at that time?

A. Yes.

Q. At that time, you explained that you didn't know the sample which was submitted. So what happened afterwards? What was his reaction?

A. He continued to blame us.

CHAIRMAN: What did he say?

A. He blamed me for not following the sample submission, and I said I didn't know the sample being submitted from the office. I was being straight. I told him what I knew.

MR KHAW: When Mr Cheung first called you and scolded you for ordering the wrong material, was it before the first

C conversation between you and Mr Cheung on the
differences between soldering strips and wires?

C

D A. Well, it was after that conversation.

D

E Q. After Mr Yung called you, when did Mr Cheung call you?

E

F A. It was more than a week, around that time.

F

G Q. So around the time Mr Yung approached you for the second
time at the site. So did Mr Cheung approach you before
or after Mr Yung approached you for the second time?

G

H A. I don't remember.

H

I Q. You said that over the phone you explained to Mr Cheung
that you didn't know that samples were submitted. What
was his answer?

I

K A. He was angry.

K

L Q. He still blamed you?

L

M A. Yes, he still scolded me.

M

N Q. So, at that time, did you wonder why the boss scolded
you, if you didn't know what happened at all? Was that
your feeling? You didn't know that samples were
submitted.

N

O A. I felt uneasy; I felt a bit uncomfortable.

O

Q Q. Did the boss scold you often, or was that one of the
rare times that he scolded you?

Q

R A. Yes.

R

S Q. So you felt uncomfortable. So, at that time, did you
feel the need to further clarify yourself? After you

S

T

T

U

U

V

V

explained yourself, the boss continued to blame you, so did you feel the need to clarify things further?

A. I told him that I ordered tin strips. I had some responsibility. That's what I felt at that time.

Q. Just hold on a second. You said you ordered solder strips, and there's no way back. What's done has been done.

A. Right.

Q. But for yourself, you didn't want the boss to think that you did something wrong.

A. Right.

Q. Because the boss seldom blamed you, it was one of the rare times he blamed you.

A. Correct.

Q. So did you feel the need to further clarify that you were blameless? Why didn't you do that?

A. "I ordered solder strips. I didn't know which samples you submitted. I only followed the orders."
I explained that to him.

Q. But before, you said you had some responsibility.

A. If the wrong orders were made, I had responsibility.

Q. So you felt you had a mistake as well. You felt you did something wrong?

A. Well, this happened, then I must have done something wrong.

Q. How come you didn't know what sample was submitted for soldering material and all along you were only aware of solder strips, so how come you felt you did something wrong?

A. When the excessive lead incident happened, there must be something wrong.

Q. Let's not say -- let's set aside whether the company was wrong or not. Did you feel that yourself were personally responsible?

A. I felt that I was responsible.

Q. Did you feel that you placed a wrong order?

A. Not back then, because in the trade solder strips were always used, and I felt that I didn't do anything wrong. I didn't do anything wrong.

Q. So you were sure. And you said that Mr Cheung called you, he was rather agitated, blaming you, and you explained to him you didn't know that sample was submitted for the material, and he didn't trust you, he continued to scold you, but you did nothing wrong. Didn't you feel that you had to explain to the boss further?

A. Well, he's the boss, I'm the subordinate. I only explained to him.

Q. So, even though the supervisor didn't accept your explanation, you would just swallow it?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. Yes, because I ordered solder strips.	C
	Q. You said that Mr Cheung called you a number of times.	
D	A. Right.	D
E	Q. We just talked about the first incident.	E
F	When was the second time he asked you about that again?	F
G	A. If I remember correctly, it was one week or so afterwards. In my memory, he called three times.	G
H	Q. Let's talk about the second time. What is the interval between the first and second calls?	H
I	A. A week or so. You know, the supervisor had a strong sense of responsibility. He had to sort it out.	I
J	Q. Let's go back to the first conversation, the first phone call. When he called you, can you remember, where were you?	J
K	A. At lunch.	K
L	Q. Also at site?	L
M	A. At the construction site.	M
N	Q. Noonish?	N
O	A. Yes, correct. Because when I was working, I would be walking around and may not be able to take a phone call, so it's usually at lunch.	O
P	Q. So the second call, were you also at the construction site, at around the same time?	P
Q	A. Around the same time.	Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Q. What happened at that time?

A. He asked me whether I could remember formally was it
solder strip or solder wire. He asked me three times.

Q. But on the first occasion you made it very clear to him
already?

A. Yes.

Q. And what was his tone? Was he in a temper?

A. He was milder. He tried to ascertain whether solder --
what material was used.

Q. So, in the second and third time, you toned down a bit,
so he still asked you whether solder strip or wire was
used. Did he mention lead-free again?

A. No, he just wanted to know what material was used.

Q. What was your answer?

A. Solder strip.

Q. And after that, did he follow up?

A. No.

Q. So the phone call was very short?

A. Around a minute only.

CHAIRMAN: Mr Chau, I apologise. There was no need for your
boss to ask you, frankly speaking. You had never used
metal wire for so long in Golden Day.

A. Well, you know, my boss had a strong sense of
responsibility. He wanted to find out things.

CHAIRMAN: But in your years of Golden Day, you have been

ordering the same material. You have never used solder wire so there was no need for him to ask you. All he needed was to ask the office ladies who placed the orders. It was useless to ask you. There is only one thing. What's the point of his asking you? There is no need. Right? There is only one thing used for so many years. You follow the company's practice, and all along you have been asking for the same material, always the same material, and there's never been any mistake.

There's nothing to ask.

A. Perhaps that was not his feeling.

CHAIRMAN: Okay. Please go on.

MR KHAW: The third call, how soon was it?

A. I think it's less than a week, after less than a week.

Q. Also at lunchtime?

A. Yes, at around lunchtime, usually at lunchtime.

Q. What was his tone? A milder tone?

A. Yes, much milder. For the second and third calls, the tone was more or less the same, more gentle.

Q. What did he ask?

A. The same question, whether that material was placed.

Q. All right. On the third occasion, did he mention solder strip or solder wire specifically?

A. He didn't.

Q. Can you recall what he said?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. He asked me, for Tung Wui -- no, it was not Tung Wui but	C
D	Tung Tau Estate -- can you remember for sure, was it	D
E	solder strip or solder wire? I said solder strip.	E
F	Q. But back then you said he didn't mention solder strip or	F
G	solder wire, and then you said that he asked you whether	G
H	it was solder strip or solder wire on the third	H
I	occasion.	I
J	A. On the third occasion, he wanted to sort out what	J
K	material was used. I told him solder strip.	K
L	Q. Did he tell you why he had to ask time and again?	L
M	A. No.	M
N	Q. And you gave him the same answer?	N
O	A. The same answer on three occasions, and then he hung up.	O
P	Q. Anything more?	P
Q	A. No.	Q
R	Q. You are here to give evidence. Before that, have you	R
S	tried to find out with the procurement department,	S
T	Ms Lam, what was the situation back then?	T
U	A. No.	U
V	Q. Not even one sentence?	V
	A. No.	
	Q. For sure?	
	A. No.	
	Q. What about Ms Mok?	
	A. No.	

Q. Apart from your discussion with Mr Yung on two occasions, before you came to give your statement today, have you discussed with Mr Yung again regarding soldering materials?

A. No.

Q. Do you know whether there was someone in the company who presented four forged invoices?

A. No. I only heard before coming today.

Q. After that, did you try to ascertain with anyone from the company?

A. No. Well, for our class, we will not talk about those things.

MR KHAW: Okay. No more questions.

CHAIRMAN: Any further questions?

COMMISSIONER LAI: I have one question.

Mr Chau, you said that in private developments done for Golden Day, metal wires were used. Do you know what is the reason for that?

A. Well, I called back office. I also asked for solder wires.

COMMISSIONER LAI: So it is for the company to decide whether solder strips or solder wire should be used?

A. We only place orders. So you just deliver according to samples submitted.

COMMISSIONER LAI: Have you used solder wire yourself?

C A. Yes, all sorts of soldering materials in recent years. C

D COMMISSIONER LAI: When it comes to use, are the two
different? D

E A. Well, strips and wires are not very different. One will
run more easily, and metal wire, less wastage. For
F solder strip, the temperature could be lower. F

G COMMISSIONER LAI: Thank you. G

H CHAIRMAN: I would like to ask a follow-up. Please allow me
to go first. H

I You answered Mr Lai's question and you said that in
J private projects, you would call your company, and you
also ordered solder strips, but these rolls of solder
K wires were delivered. K

L A. Yes. So, when it was delivered, I called and asked, and
the company said such a sample was submitted. L

M CHAIRMAN: So the company told you that because such
N a sample is submitted, so although you ordered solder
O strip, solder wire was delivered, and for a PRH project
you also ordered solder strip, but then, instead of
P rolls of solder wire, boxes of solder strips were
delivered; is that the case? P

Q A. Yes. Recently, in recent years, solder wires are being
R used. R

S CHAIRMAN: So you saying that whether it be a private or PRH
T project, you never know what samples have been submitted T

to the main contractor, as far as you are concerned. So every time, it is for the company to order from the supplier?

A. Yes, depending on the sample used.

CHAIRMAN: So, as far as you are concerned, you only want to know the quantity of solder strips you want?

A. Yes, correct.

MR KHAW: You told us that in private projects you saw this (indicating yellow can). I would like to know, in that private project, you have seen these green wires (indicating) and solder strips simultaneously?

A. No, it's either one. In recent years, the material approved will be used. There won't be both. So we only use what's ordered and delivered by the company.

Q. In other PRH projects, have you seen both solder strips and solder wires being used?

A. Not for projects I was involved in.

Q. Not for projects you were involved in?

A. No.

Cross-examination by MR LAM

MR LAM: I have a few questions. May I refer you to exhibit P1, page 242.

Mr Chau, here are pictures of work processes taken at sample flats. Please look at pictures (21), (23), (25). Can you see them?

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C A. Yes. C

D Q. Can you see that worker holding -- I don't know whether D
it is solder strip or solder wire, but it was cut up.

E Can you see it? E

F A. Yes. F

G Q. In a private project, when solder wire is used, it would G
also be cut up like this? It's just a simple procedure,

H so the workers are wearing gloves as insulation. H
Whether you use solder strip or solder wire, it has to

I be cut up for convenience sake? I

J A. Yes. J

K MR LAM: I have no further questions. K

L CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr Chau. You have completed L
evidence-giving. You may leave.

M Any other witnesses? M

N MR KHAW: Patrick Wong from Golden Day. N

O CHAIRMAN: We will take a break of ten minutes first. O
(12 noon)

P (A short adjournment) P

Q (12.17 pm) Q

R MR WU: Mr Chairman and Commissioner, I now summon R
Mr Patrick Wong, who is the engineering staff of

S Golden Day. S

T

U

V

MR PATRICK WONG KAM MAN (affirmed)

CHAIRMAN: Please be seated.

Examination-in-chief by MR WU

MR WU: Mr Wong, in bundle L1, page 134, you gave a written statement. I now read out to you your written statement:

"1. I am an engineering staff of Golden Day, mainly responsible for liaising with relevant departments of the project and also submitting payrolls, and I am also responsible in the daily office work in the office.

2. I completed form 5. I joined Golden Day in 1996. Sometimes I would help Ms Lam Lai King or Ms Mok Wai Yin to take phone calls for order of materials from foremen of construction sites, and I would then relay the requests of construction site forum to Ms Lam or Ms Mok, for them to place orders with the relevant suppliers. I am not responsible for procuring plumbing materials from suppliers.

3. Phase 2 Hung Hom Estate, Tung Wui Estate and Wing Cheong Estate ('the three affected housing estates'), for the soldering materials of the plumbing works, I was not responsible for procuring them from Prosperity Development. The correspondences and invoices between Golden Day and Prosperity had my name added in order to provide an additional contact person

for liaison purpose, but as far as my memory serves me, in fact I have not placed any orders or procured any solder materials with Prosperity Development.

4. Before this incident, I did know that for soldering materials of water supply systems, they should be lead-free.

5. Mr Hui Wang San and Mr Chau See Ming did not place any order for soldering materials with me for the three affected housing estates. I am not sure about the exact instructions given by Mr Hui and Mr Chau in this regard.

6. I am not responsible for procuring soldering materials from Prosperity Development and therefore I don't know about the procurement details.

7. As I said in paragraph 6, I don't know the details.

8. I don't know why Prosperity Development has been chosen as the solder material supplier of Golden Day. I only know that Prosperity development is one of the suppliers of metal fillers for Golden Day.

9. I understand that when the procurement department of Golden Day has placed order with Prosperity Development the latter would directly liaise with the site foremen for arrangement of transportation or delivery to the site.

10. Before this incident, I was not aware of this brand UK WL50D and Prosperity Development has also not recommended this brand to me.

11. I was not involved in this incident so I don't know about the details.

12. Before this incident, I didn't know that there was UK WL50D. I didn't know its composition and whether it is lead.

13. Mr Hui Wang San and Mr Chau See Ming have not placed orders for soldering materials for these three affected housing estates with me and it is not my responsibility to procure the materials from Prosperity Development and therefore I don't know the details.

For the email dated 17 July 2015, there were four documents. They were delivery notes to Paul Y. I remember that Mr Yung Kwok Choi was not at the office on that day. He called me and said some documents had to be submitted to Paul Y and he instructed me to scan a few documents on his desk, for them to be sent by email to Paul Y. I was not involved in the relevant communications beforehand and back then I didn't know the source of the documents and the purpose for requesting these documents by Paul Y, and I didn't care about the content of the document. I was only sending the documents at the request of Mr Yung Kwok Choi."

This is your statement dated 23 December 2015. Do you have any supplement to make?

A. No.

Q. So are you willing to accept this written statement as your statement, evidence to the COI?

A. I agree.

Q. I have a couple of questions, Chairman.

First, Mr Wong, can you tell us whether you are aware of the existence of leaded solder material in the market?

A. Yes.

Q. A few days ago, Mr Yung Kwok Choi in his evidence said that documents or materials were submitted to the HD through you, materials list was done through you. In bundle L1 -- may I refer you to page 155 of bundle L1. On pages 155 to 156, is that the materials submission schedule you prepared for Hung Hom Estate Phase 2?

A. Yes.

Q. Mr Yung Kwok Choi asked you to prepare the material submission schedule for approval by the HD?

A. Yes.

Q. Here we have the materials required for Phase 2 of Hung Hom Estate. On the far right-hand column, you see "Approval Date"; do you see it?

A. Yes.

Q. Is it the date when -- is that for Mr Yung Kwok Choi to tell you that a certain material was already approved by the HD and then you fill in the approval date?

A. Yes.

Q. Page 161. Pages 161 to 163, is that the material submission schedule for Wing Cheong Estate?

A. Yes.

Q. Thank you. Please take a look at pages 164 to 166. Can you confirm whether this is the material submission schedule for Tung Wui Estate?

A. Yes.

MR WU: Chairman, I have no further questions.

Cross-examination by MR KHAW

MR KHAW: Mr Wong, you joined Golden Day in 1996?

A. Yes.

Q. So you have been with the company for about 20 years?

A. Yes, about 20 years.

CHAIRMAN: So, in addition to completing secondary education, did you take any further education?

A. No.

CHAIRMAN: So your qualification is up to form 5?

A. Yes.

MR KHAW: Have you taken courses on bookkeeping?

A. No.

Q. You joined Golden Day in 1996. Was that the first time

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* **A**

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 **B**

C you encountered plumbing works? **C**

D A. Yes. **D**

E Q. Before you joined Golden Day, did you know Mr Cheung Tat Yam? **E**

F A. No. **F**

G Q. Did you know Mr Yung Kwok Choi? **G**

H A. No. **H**

I Q. Ms Lam Lai King? **I**

J A. No. **J**

K Q. When you joined Golden Day in 1996, were you involved in clerical duties right from the beginning? **K**

L A. No. I started with payroll. **L**

M Q. Paying workers? **M**

N A. No, no, progress of construction sites. **N**

O Q. When did you start to be involved in procurement work? **O**

P A. Sorry, I didn't get your question. **P**

Q Q. When did you start formally in Golden Day to be responsible for procurement of materials? **Q**

R A. No, no, I am not involved. **R**

S Q. Not involved? In your written statement, you said "day-to-day office work". What does that include? **S**

T A. Liaison for Mr Yung, preparation of payroll, and typing of schedules. **T**

U

V

Q. Let's talk about the schedules. We talked about material submission schedules. You are responsible for compiling a schedule?

A. Yes.

Q. It is Mr Yung's evidence that you first prepare a schedule of materials where samples have to be submitted.

A. Yes.

Q. We just looked at L1, page 155. Let's take Hung Hom Estate as an example. Before submitting the materials to the main contractor, this table was compiled?

A. Yes.

Q. There would be one such table for each construction site?

A. Yes.

Q. For this table, on the materials used, the brands, origin, and so on, the expected use of these materials, and so on -- based on what kinds of material did you prepare this table?

A. Mr Yung told me -- he asked me to create a new table based on some old tables, and he told me how to do it. For example, the types of taps and origin and so on.

Q. You said you would take reference from old tables.

A. Yes.

Q. Are you referring to similar schedules in the past for

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	the Housing Department's housing projects?	C
	A. Yes, correct.	
D	Q. So who gave you those old tables?	D
	A. Mr Yung passed me those schedules.	
E	Q. So do you know who prepared the old schedules?	E
	A. I don't.	
F	Q. So, when you started creating this schedule, you took reference from the old schedules; right?	F
	A. Yes.	
G	Q. And Mr Yung would discuss with you the changes that needed to be made to the old schedules?	G
	A. Usually not. When I finish the schedule and pass it to him, he would tell me what changes I needed to make.	
H	Q. He said he would make changes to your draft schedule, or he would just tell you the changes to be made?	H
	A. (Chinese spoken).	
I	Q. Let's look at the schedule for Hung Hom Estate. Based on this schedule, did you include solder in this schedule?	I
	A. Are you referring to soldering material?	
J	Q. Yes, solder used for fresh water pipes.	J
	A. It's not specified here.	
K	Q. For the Hung Hom Estate project, do you remember that the Ma Hang Headland Park project took place at the same time? Apart from this material submission schedule for	K
L		L
M		M
N		N
O		O
P		P
Q		Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	Hung Hom Estate, would there be a similar schedule for Ma Hang Headland Park?	C
D	A. Yes, I remember there was one.	D
E	Q. Can you find that schedule?	E
F	A. I tried but I couldn't find it. This is the only one I found.	F
G	Q. Now let's look at the schedule for Hung Hom Estate. Apparently, this schedule did not list solder.	G
H	A. Yes.	H
I	Q. Now let's look at the schedule for Wing Cheong Estate, at page 161. You see the words "Sai Chuen Road", which is the Wing Cheong Estate project. Do you see any items for the copper fresh water pipes?	I
J	A. Yes.	J
K	Q. Where is it?	K
L	A. At item 38.	L
M	Q. Now let's look at the schedule for Tung Wui Estate. On lead-free soldering wire, it's number 43 on page 165.	M
N	A. Yes. Item 43.	N
O	Q. Before you prepared these schedules, had you ever personally seen samples of lead-free solder wire?	O
P	A. Yes, I have seen them. It's FRY.	P
Q	Q. When was the first time you saw this lead-free solder wire? (Indicating).	Q
R	A. Around? I cannot really remember. It was quite a long	R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	time ago.	C
D	Q. Was it ten years ago?	D
E	A. I think five to seven years, something like that.	E
F	Q. Did you first see this type of solder in a Housing Department project?	F
G	A. Yes, it was a Housing Department project.	G
H	Q. The first time you saw this material, did you know that it's lead-free?	H
I	A. Yes, I knew that.	I
J	Q. You were very sure that this type of solder is used for fresh water pipes?	J
K	A. Yes, I knew that.	K
L	Q. You also knew that the requirement of using lead-free solder is that lead is harmful to health. Were you aware of that?	L
M	A. Yes.	M
N	Q. Lead-free solder is used for fresh water pipes. It's to avoid the presence of lead in the drinking water. Is that correct, from a common-sense perspective?	N
O	A. I didn't pay much attention.	O
P	Q. So the first time you saw this material, you knew it was lead-free?	P
Q	A. Yes.	Q
R	Q. So you prepared these schedules, and you knew which materials to use, and after that, according to the	R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	statement from Mr Yung, you were responsible for	C
D	obtaining the samples and relevant documents from the	D
E	suppliers to pass on to the main contractor; do you	E
	agree?	
F	A. No, I don't.	F
G	Q. Now, you prepared this table, and you knew which samples	G
H	had to be submitted for which materials for the Housing	H
I	Department's approval. So where did you obtain those	I
	samples?	
J	A. I think they were from Prosperity.	J
K	Q. Who was responsible for approaching Prosperity to obtain	K
L	the samples?	L
	A. I think it was Mr Yung himself.	
M	Q. Were you ever involved in obtaining material samples	M
N	from Prosperity?	N
	A. Yes. Sometimes, Mr Yung was busy and he would call me	
O	and ask me to obtain certain items from Prosperity.	O
P	Q. For these three estates, Tung Wui Estate, Wing Cheong	P
Q	Estate and Hung Hom Estate, for these three estates, did	Q
	yourself or Mr Yung obtain samples from Prosperity?	
R	CHAIRMAN: What kind of samples are you talking about?	R
S	MR KHAW: Samples of solder.	S
	Do you remember who obtained such samples?	
T	A. I don't remember.	T
U	Q. So it could possibly be you or Mr Yung, one of the two?	U
V		V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A. Yes.

Q. Was Mr Yung responsible for submitting the solder samples to the main contractor?

A. Yes.

Q. Were you ever involved in this process?

A. I had passed on the samples for these three estates.

Q. Were you ever involved in submitting the samples to the main contractor?

A. I held the samples.

Q. So you wouldn't submit the samples to the main contractor yourself, by yourself alone; right?

A. No, I wouldn't.

Q. Subsequently, an approval was granted. Generally speaking, would the contractor send you a letter to notify you the materials or the samples that have been approved?

A. As I know, the main contractor would issue a memo, so there would be a bunch of approved documents, and they would be placed in some boxes at our site, and upon receiving them Mr Yung would update the schedule.

Q. So it's something like a pigeonhole?

A. Yes.

Q. Now let's look at an example. F2, page 972. Here's a memo, page 972. It's issued to you by China State Construction. This is about Hung Hom Estate Phase 2 and

Ma Hang Headland Park. Do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. It was sent to Golden Day. In the contents, it's on the sample submission and approval, and Powerflow flux and lead-free solder FRY was mentioned. So these are materials to be submitted and approved.

It says -- you see the tick -- next to the tick, you see "the above samples and materials were approved by the Housing Department"; do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. So this is the memo you mentioned. So there are different memos for different materials or samples.

These memos were sent to Golden Day. So how were they sent to you? Was it done by fax or delivered in person?

A. They would notify Mr Yung. There wouldn't be any faxes or emails.

Q. Would they inform you yourself?

A. No.

Q. So you only knew about it after it was sent to Mr Yung.

A. Yes.

Q. So would Mr Yung tell you every time he receives an approval?

A. He would tell me that a list of materials had been approved and he asked me to update the schedule.

Q. These documents would be returned to you; right?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. Yes.	C
D	Q. Based on the information in these forms, or information on memos, you would follow up on your own form, for instance, the approval date for the samples?	D
E	A. Yes, correct.	E
F	Q. They would also provide the date of approval?	F
G	A. Yes.	G
H	Q. For the schedule, where would they be stored in the office?	H
I	A. Usually, I would return it to Mr Yung.	I
J	Q. Is Mr Yung your supervisor?	J
K	A. Yes.	K
L	Q. So, under the company's hierarchy, Mr Cheung is the boss; right?	L
M	A. Right.	M
N	Q. And Mr Yung is your supervisor.	N
O	A. Right.	O
P	Q. What about Ms Lam; is Ms Lam your supervisor?	P
Q	A. Yes, probably.	Q
R	Q. What about Ms Mok?	R
S	A. No, no.	S
T	Q. So, if you are to take instructions, you would listen to Mr Yung and Ms Lam?	T
U	A. Usually, Mr Yung.	U
V	Q. What about Mr Cheung himself? Did he often issue direct	V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

instructions to you?

A. No. Most instructions came from Mr Yung.

Q. Now, after preparing the schedules, you would pass them on to Mr Yung. Do you know where he will put that schedule?

A. He would usually submit it to the main contractor.

Q. Why has it to be submitted to the main contractor?

A. Because right from the beginning we have to know what materials to procure, so I believe Mr Yung will submit it to them.

Q. No, I'm saying after you have read that memo, you knew what materials and when they were approved, you would update them on the computer, in your schedule, and after that schedule is completed, will you submit it to Mr Yung?

A. Yes.

Q. And where will he place it?

A. There is no need for him to give it to the main contractor, given that the materials are passed.

Q. Where will he place the schedule?

A. Perhaps on his desk. I don't know what he will do with it.

Q. You are mainly in the office; right?

A. Correct.

Q. Do you have to conduct site inspection?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. No.	C
D	Q. So, of the three projects concerned, you have never visited the sites?	D
E	A. No.	E
F	Q. When working for the company, have you seen approved schedules -- have you seen any?	F
G	A. Yes, yes, yes.	G
H	Q. Where can you see it in your company?	H
I	A. On my desk.	I
J	Q. On your desk. After you have prepared the schedules for submission to Mr Yung, will you tell anyone in your company that this schedule is completed, "please note materials approved"? Will you do that?	J
K	A. No, I will only tell Mr Yung.	K
L	Q. So you rely on Mr Yung?	L
M	A. Yes.	M
N	Q. Do you know, a schedule with approved dates, whether Ms Lam is aware of the existence of that schedule?	N
O	A. I don't think so. She shouldn't know.	O
P	Q. Why would you say she shouldn't know?	P
Q	A. Because after updating a schedule, I put it on my desk. I don't know whether she could see it or not. I for sure would not tell her.	Q
R	Q. Would you agree if I say this: you are responsible for preparing this kind of schedule, so you have to spend	R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

time. Every time there is a memo telling you when and what materials have been approved, you have to check those memos first, before you can confirm the schedule.

Do you think the purpose of the schedule is to let colleagues of the company, of the procurement department in particular, know what orders to place and materials to order?

A. I disagree.

Q. Then what is the significance of this schedule?

A. It's done for Mr Yung. I report to Mr Yung, to let him know items approved, and I think Mr Yung will decide what to do.

Q. You have been with this company for almost 20 years.

Such a schedule would not have been prepared for no reason. There must be a reason.

A. Yes, yes.

Q. One of the contents in your schedule is materials submitted, approved, and the approval date. This is important information; right?

A. Yes.

Q. You have been with the company for close to 20 years. Would you agree that such a schedule, the information therein is for the company to understand what materials should be procured in a large quantity? Would you agree with me?

A. I have not thought of it in this way.

Q. All right. As I said, the schedule would not have been compiled for no reason. So what do you think the schedule is for?

A. I think because Mr Yung has to know what materials have been approved and when they can be delivered.

Q. So you believe that Mr Yung has to know materials that have been approved? So it's just common sense.

Although I don't work in your company, the purpose is to let people in the company know what materials have been approved and are to be used. The procurement department must know what materials to use before they can place orders. There is no reason for the procurement division to place orders with no knowledge.

A. That I don't know. Perhaps Mr Yung has told them.

Q. You yourself know very clearly materials that are approved?

A. Yes, correct.

Q. There's no doubt over this?

A. Yes.

Q. Have you yourself personally discussed with Ms Lam the content of these schedules?

A. No, never.

Q. Not even once, for so many years?

A. No.

Q. Then you are of the view that if Ms Lam wants to know the content of the schedule, she has to go through Mr Yung?

A. Yes.

Q. You have been in this office for so many years. Have you seen Mr Yung telling Ms Lam materials approved?

A. Not that I have noticed.

Q. Never?

A. Never.

Q. Have you noticed Mr Yung and Ms Mok discussing materials approved?

A. No.

Q. In the office, have you ever heard Mr Yung mention anything about approved materials?

A. Not that I have noticed.

Q. For these orders, we have heard the evidence of a few witnesses. We understand that back then, your site foremen would call the office to place orders for solder materials, so the construction site foremen would place orders with your office staff. For these three construction sites, have you received any phone calls from the site foremen regarding orders for solder materials?

A. I can recollect some.

Q. Who told you?

A	<i>Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation</i>	A
B	Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water	B
	Day 35	
C	A. Who? Then I cannot recall.	C
	Q. Could it be Mr Hui Wang San?	
D	A. Possibly.	D
	Q. Could it be Mr Chau?	
E	A. Possibly.	E
	Q. So it's usually these two?	
F	A. Most of the time.	F
	Q. Who else would place orders?	
G	A. Other construction site foremen.	G
	Q. Who else are there, that you know, apart from Mr Chau	
H	and Mr Hui?	H
	A. As far as I can remember, no more. I have only heard of	
I	these two.	I
	Q. So it's either Mr Hui or Mr Chau?	
J	A. Right.	J
	Q. Mr Hui, when Mr Hui placed orders with you, how would he	
K	put it, for solder materials?	K
	A. He would usually say he wanted solder strips or solder	
L	wire or solder materials.	L
	Q. You said he would say both solder wire and solder	
M	strips?	M
	A. Yes.	
N	Q. If you heard him say solder strips, what solder would	N
	you think of?	
O	A. FRY.	O
P		P
Q		Q
R		R
S		S
T		T
U		U
V		V

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* **A**

B Commission of Inquiry into Day 35 **B**
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water

C Q. And what about solder strips? **C**

A. Also FRY.

D Q. So, while he used two different names, you would not **D**

think he was talking about two different things? **E**

A. No. **E**

F Q. Why? **F**

A. Because there is only one type, FRY. **G**

H Q. According to your understanding? **H**

A. Yes. **H**

I Q. What about Mr Chau? How would he put it when he placed **I**

an order? **J**

A. He would say solder materials and solder wires, solder **J**

strips, or the like. **K**

L Q. So, when they place orders, when it comes to the **L**

quantity they want, what would be the unit? **L**

M A. They usually ask for a box or a carton, how many boxes. **M**

N Q. How many boxes? **N**

A. Yes. **N**

O Q. You said -- solder strips and solder wires are two **O**

different terminologies. How many years have you heard **P**

these two terms in the company? **P**

Q A. For many years. For four or five years, I very often **Q**

heard him using these terms. **R**

S Q. So you heard solder strips or solder wires, and that **S**

made no difference to you; it would always be FRY? **T**

T **T**

U **U**

V **V**

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into
Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C A. Correct. C

D Q. And after -- because you are not from the procurement D
department, so would you relay or pass that message to
E Ms Lam or Ms Mok, that the construction site foreman has E
placed an order?

F A. Correct. F

G Q. And what would be your message relayed to Ms Lam? G

H A. I would follow what they said. If they said solder H
strips, I said solder strips. If they said solder
I wires, I said solder wires. I

J Q. Would you say FRY? J

K A. No, I have not mentioned that. K

L Q. Did you mention lead-free? L

M A. No. M

N Q. In your discussion with Ms Lam, for instance, you know N
about the quantity of solder materials ordered -- has
O Ms Lam ever mentioned the brand FRY? O

P A. No. P

Q Q. What about WL50D? Q

R A. No. R

S Q. WL50D flat strip? S

T A. No. T

U Q. The same for Ms Mok? U

V A. The same. V

Q. Do you know, every time soldering materials were

delivered to a construction site, the supplier would
send invoices to your company?

A. Yes.

Q. You have had the opportunity to read those documents?

A. Never.

Q. Not talking about detailed scrutiny, but what about
bills and invoices from Prosperity? You would glance at
them?

A. No, never.

Q. How did you know that invoices would be sent to your
company?

A. From time to time, I could see delivery notes put in
an envelope, in a bundle, to our company.

Q. You have seen such things and you have seen them marked
"Delivery notes"?

A. Yes.

Q. But you would not read the details?

A. No, I won't.

Q. Do you know for how long would company documents or
records be kept?

A. I don't know.

Q. In her evidence, Ms Lam said that for company records,
usually, after the accounting audits were done, they
would be disposed of. Do you know this?

A. No.

Q. After the incident, in July 2015, did your boss discuss with you, "Could it be that we ordered the wrong materials?"

A. After July, I think he was not in Hong Kong for a while. He did not mention such things. In fact, I didn't meet him.

Q. You didn't meet him? All right. Since July to now?

A. I think he asked me once. I think he asked me once.

Q. When did he ask you?

A. In the company.

Q. Was it in around July last year?

A. I cannot recall. He came back, he asked me a couple of things.

Q. So you knew, after the lead in water incident, he was not in Hong Kong. Do you know where he was?

A. No.

Q. For how long was he away?

A. I didn't know this. I cannot recall.

Q. You said he had a discussion with you afterwards. So it was in around July?

A. Yes.

Q. How did Mr Cheung ask you?

A. He asked me whether samples were submitted for soldering materials, and my answer was "yes".

Q. When he asked you, he didn't even know whether soldering

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

material samples had to be submitted?

A. Yes, that was what he asked.

Q. What was your answer?

A. I said yes, and he asked whether Mr Yung knew. I said yes, I had submitted a schedule to Mr Yung.

Q. He asked specifically whether Mr Yung knew?

A. Yes.

Q. Did he ask any other staff in the company?

A. No. As far as I know, he only asked me -- he only asked about Mr Yung.

Q. What was the answer?

A. I said, "Well, Mr Yung should know, because I have given him the schedule; Mr Yung should know."

Q. Since last July to now, has Mr Yung only asked you once?

A. Yes, once.

Q. At that time, did he say that you were at fault? What was his attitude at that time?

A. He sounded very tired, and he asked me if samples were submitted.

Q. Did he call you?

A. No, he told me in the office.

Q. When he asked you the question, was anyone else here?

A. No, only myself and him were there.

Q. Where was everyone else at that time?

A. Well, he called me into his room.

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

Q. How long was the chat?

A. Very short, one or two minutes.

Q. At that time, did Mr Yung tell you that he was being asked by the contractor and it was being investigated?

A. No, he didn't mention that to me at all.

Q. Since July, has Mr Yung ever talked to you about the purchase of solder?

A. No, not at all.

Q. Did you feel the need to follow up with Mr Yung? Given that he knew the materials, including solder, that were approved, didn't you feel there was a need to do so?

A. No, I didn't see the need to do so.

Q. What about Ms Lam? Since July, did Ms Lam also ever talk to you about this?

A. No, not at all.

Q. What about Ms Mok?

A. No.

Q. When you prepared your witness statement or before you prepared your statement, did you ever try to find out more about the incident with anyone at your company, so that you would be better positioned to prepare this statement?

A. No.

Q. On 16 July, in Mr Yung's witness statement, and it was mentioned in Ms Lam's witness statement as well -- let's

look at your witness statement first. Your witness statement is at page 135 of L1. Do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. You said:

"For the four delivery notes sent by myself by email to Paul Y on 17 July 2015, I remember that Mr Yung Kwok Choi was not in the office at that time. He called me and told me that some documents had to be submitted to Paul Y, and he instructed me to scan the records on his table and send them to the staff of Paul Y by email. Prior to that, I wasn't involved in the correspondence and I didn't know the origin of the records, as well as the purposes of requesting for such documents for Paul Y, and I didn't pay attention to the content of the records."

So that happened on 17 July?

A. Yes.

Q. Mr Yung called you and he asked you to provide some records to Paul Y?

A. Correct.

Q. That's what Mr Yung said in his witness statement.

Page 145. Page 145, paragraph 6. Let's look at this part.

Again, it's on the same day, 17 July. He said he was somewhere else, handling enquiries, he wasn't in the

office. So this is consistent with what you said. He said:

"I don't tend to use emails and Golden Day Engineering Co Ltd only has a single email address", which is the one shown here. "At that time, John Ma from Paul Y sent an email to this email address of Golden Day's. At that time, I wasn't in the office. Mr Patrick Wong saw John Ma's email and he told me that John Ma requested for papers by email, and he asked if I should send the documents on my table to John Ma."

That's what he said, and he said, "The papers on my desk were prepared by Ms Lam for Paul Y, so I instructed Patrick Wong to send these documents to Paul Y."

According to Mr Yung, at the time you received an email from John Ma, and he wasn't in the office at that time, and you called him and you told him that you received this email, and he asked you to provide those documents.

Now, first of all, let's look at page 1194. Let's look at the signatory. The email was sent around 2:41 pm on 17 July. It says:

"Dear Mr Yung,

As spoke, could you please furnish us records of the captioned for our information in response to the recent HD concern."

Do you see that?

A. Yes.

Q. "Thanks!

John".

You said in your statement that this is Paul Y's
email. That was the email you received that day.

A. Mr Yung told me that there was an email, and I saw it.

Q. How did Mr Yung tell that there was an email? Because
he wasn't in the office.

A. He called and told me that John Ma sent him an email, so
maybe John Ma called him. That's my guess.

Q. So, in your version, in your witness statement, there's
a little difference with Mr Yung's. First of all,
Mr Yung said you read this email at that time and you
called him, asking him to deal with those documents, but
in your version, Mr Yung told you that some documents
had to be submitted to Paul Y. So, according to him,
you called him, and according to your version, he called
you. So, after reading both versions, can you tell us
who called who?

A. As I remember, he called me and he told me to do it.

Q. So, first of all, when he called you, was it in the
afternoon?

A. Yes, probably.

Q. Did it probably take place at around 2.41 pm or

thereafter?

A. Yes, probably.

Q. You said he called you, and he had some documents which needed to be submitted to Paul Y. That's what you said in your witness statement. But you told us earlier that before he called you, he knew that he received an email.

When he called you --

A. I only knew about it when he called me.

Q. He called you and told you to submit some documents to Paul Y. Did you tell him that you received an email from John Ma?

A. Yes.

CHAIRMAN: How many calls did you receive that day? How many times did Mr Yung call you that day?

A. Many times.

MR KHAW: In your witness statement, you said he called you and asked you to provide some documents to Paul Y. Was it the first call he made?

A. No, he made some calls earlier.

CHAIRMAN: This call was made just at around 9 pm or sometime just before that?

A. He called me many times.

CHAIRMAN: We know that the email was sent after 9 pm, and he told you that there were certain papers on the table and he asked you to send them. So when did he make the

call? Was it just before 9 pm?

A. He called me before 6 pm. I was in the office at that time.

CHAIRMAN: So were you in the office between 6 to 9 pm?

A. Yes.

MR KHAW: He called you before 9 pm?

A. Yes.

Q. And that means, at that time, you knew that some papers were placed on the table, so, after around 6 pm, you knew that this had to be sent to Paul Y?

A. Yes.

Q. After you knew about that, did Mr Yung tell you that these documents must be submitted to Paul Y urgently or imminently?

A. No, he never mentioned anything like that.

Q. Did he mention the lead in water incident?

A. No, not at all. No, nothing at all.

Q. And after 6 pm you knew about these documents, and you knew they had to be submitted to Paul Y. Why did you only submit them after 9 pm?

A. I was very busy that day. I probably forgot to submit them, and I only remembered to email those documents after 8 pm. That's why I sent them after 9 pm.

Q. At that time, Mr Yung asked you to submit those documents to Paul Y. Did he ask you to email them or

A *Annex: Realtime English Transcription based on floor / Simultaneous Interpretation* A

B Commission of Inquiry into Excess Lead Found in Drinking Water Day 35 B

C use another channel? C

D A. He didn't ask me to relay those documents. He only D
asked me to email the documents on his table.

E Q. He never mentioned the urgency of such records; right? E

F A. No, he didn't. F

G Q. Was that why you almost forgot about it? G

H A. Yes. H

I Q. After you emailed those documents, did you inform I
Mr Yung that you had emailed the documents?

J A. No. J

K Q. Did Mr Yung follow up on that, to see if you had sent K
those documents?

L A. No, not at all. There's no follow-up at all. L

M Q. So, after those documents were emailed out, where did M
you place the documents?

N A. At the desk of Mr Yung, the original place. N

O Q. These documents were sent. Would Mr Yung and yourself O
have communicated about them? Have you let other people

P know that you have sent these documents to Paul Y? P

Q A. No. Q

R Q. Absolutely no? R

S A. No. S

T Q. Ms Lam? T

U

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A. No.

Q. When the documents were sent, you would have looked --
you would have seen what they were?

A. Yes.

Q. After these documents were sent, until now -- up to now,
it's been five or six months -- have you discussed with
anyone in your company in relation to the sending of
these documents?

A. No.

Q. You knew that four delivery notes were forged -- did you
know that?

A. No, I didn't.

Q. Not even now?

A. When I prepared the written statement, I came to know.

Q. You came to know back then. Who told you that there
were forged invoices or delivery notes? Who told you?

A. The lawyer. The lawyer told me that I had to answer
these questions.

Q. Then you would have seen those forged documents?

A. No, I didn't.

Q. But the lawyer did tell you that there were four; you
know there were four forged delivery notes?

A. Yes.

Q. Then the documents were not shown to you?

A. No. I was only asked whether I have seen them.

Q. So you knew that there were four forged delivery notes.

Did you somehow realise that they were related to the documents you sent to Paul Y?

A. Well, that didn't come to my mind.

Q. The lawyer told you that there were forged delivery notes. Now, at this moment, up to this moment, do you know that these forged delivery notes are the four documents you sent to Paul Y?

A. No, I don't.

Q. Not even now?

A. No.

Q. After you learned about the forged delivery notes, do you know whether your company has investigated into the case?

A. No. I don't know whether there's been any investigation.

Q. So, after you learned that there were forged delivery notes, did you discuss with anyone in your company, say the lawyer told you that there were forged delivery notes?

A. No, never.

Q. The lawyer didn't tell you that the forged delivery notes could possibly be the documents you sent to Paul Y? Did he mention this?

A. Not that I can remember. Not that I can remember.

Q. So, when you prepared the witness statement, you didn't know at all that the forged delivery notes -- or, rather, you didn't know that the four documents you submitted to Paul Y could be forged?

A. I didn't know.

Q. Can I refer you to your own witness statement, page 135, the very last paragraph. Here you mention in particular the delivery notes emailed to Paul Y on 17 July 2015. What was the reason for you to mention this in particular in your statement?

A. Because I saw "Delivery note" on the very top.

Q. But was there any special reason for you to make special mention of the delivery notes to Paul Y, on 17 July -- why did you mention this incident in particular?

A. Because Mr Yung asked me to email him delivery notes and also some documents from WSD, and then on the very top, at the very top, it says "Delivery note", and that's why I said "delivery note".

MR KHAW: I have no other questions.

CHAIRMAN: Any other questions? No.

Thank you very much. You may leave. Thank you.

(The witness withdrew)

We will call it a day and we will re-convene tomorrow.

(1.21 pm)

C (The hearing adjourned until 10.00 am the following day)

C

D

D

E

E

F

F

G

G

H

H

I

I

J

J

K

K

L

L

M

M

N

N

O

O

P

P

Q

Q

R

R

S

S

T

T

U

U

V

V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H
I
J
K
L
M
N
O
P
Q
R
S
T
U
V

INDEX

PAGE

MR HUI WANG SAN (on former affirmation)1
Cross-examination by MR KHAW (continued)1
(The witness withdrew)35
MR CHAU SEE MING (affirmed)35
Examination-in-chief by MR WU35
Cross-examination by MR KHAW39
Cross-examination by MR LAM66
MR PATRICK WONG KAM MAN (affirmed)68
Examination-in-chief by MR WU68
Cross-examination by MR KHAW72
(The witness withdrew)102